| 1 | UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT | | | | | | |
|----|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| 2 | CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA | | | | | | |
| 3 | | | | | | | |
| 4 | | | | | | | |
| 5 | THE HONORABLE STEPHEN V. WILSON, U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE PRESIDING | | | | | | |
| 6 | | | | | | | |
| 7 | ARUTYUN DEMIRCHYAN,) | | | | | | |
| 8 | Petitioner,) | | | | | | |
| 9 | vs.) No. CV 08-3452-SVW | | | | | | |
| 10 | ALBERTO R. GONZALEZ,) | | | | | | |
| 11 |)) | | | | | | |
| 12 | Respondent.) | | | | | | |
| 13 | / | | | | | | |
| 14 | | | | | | | |
| 15 | | | | | | | |
| 16 | REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS | | | | | | |
| 17 | LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA | | | | | | |
| 18 | WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 24, 2012 | | | | | | |
| 19 | | | | | | | |
| 20 | EVIDENTIARY HEARING | | | | | | |
| 21 | | | | | | | |
| 22 | | | | | | | |
| 23 | DEBORAH K. GACKLE, CSR, RPR United States Courthouse | | | | | | |
| 24 | 312 North Spring Street, Room 402A Los Angeles, California 90012 | | | | | | |
| 25 | (213) 620-1149 | | | | | | |

| 1 | APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL: | | | | | | |
|----|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| 2 | | | | | | | |
| 3 | | | | | | | |
| 4 | For the Petitioner: | | | | | | |
| 5 | | | | | | | |
| 6 | | | | | | | |
| 7 | Ira J Kurzban | | | | | | |
| 8 | Geoffrey A Hoffman Kurzban Kurzban Weinger Tetzeli & Pratt PA | | | | | | |
| 9 | 2650 SW 27th Avenue Suite 200 Miami, FL 33133 | | | | | | |
| 10 | 305-444-0060 Fax: 305-444-3503 | | | | | | |
| 11 | Email: ira@kkwtlaw.com | | | | | | |
| 12 | | | | | | | |
| 13 | | | | | | | |
| 14 | | | | | | | |
| 15 | For the Respondent: | | | | | | |
| 16 | ANDRE BIROTTE, JR. | | | | | | |
| 17 | UNITED STATES ATTORNEY BY: CAROL CHEN | | | | | | |
| 18 | ASSISTANT UNITED STATES ATTORNEY 1400 United States Courthouse | | | | | | |
| 19 | 312 North Spring Street Los Angeles, California 90012 | | | | | | |
| 20 | | | | | | | |
| 21 | ALSO PRESENT: JILLIAN WOODS, ICE SENIOR ATTORNEY | | | | | | |
| 22 | | | | | | | |
| 23 | | | | | | | |
| 24 | | | | | | | |
| 25 | | | | | | | |

| 1 | | INDEX | | | |
|----|-------------------------|--------|-------|----------|----------|
| 2 | | | | | |
| 3 | PETITIONER'S WITNESSES: | DIRECT | CROSS | REDIRECT | RECROSS |
| 4 | | | | | |
| 5 | DEMIRCHYAN, ARUTYAN | | 9 | 34 | |
| 6 | DEMIRCHYAN, SUSANNA | | 43 | 60 | |
| 7 | GUYUMJYAN, ASATUR | | 89 | 110 | |
| 8 | HOVANISYAN, ZARA | | 118 | 128 | |
| 9 | | | | | |
| 10 | | | | | |
| 11 | | | | | |
| 12 | | | | | |
| 13 | <u>E 2</u> | KHIBIT | S | | |
| 14 | | | | | |
| 15 | PETITIONER'S | | | | RECEIVED |
| 16 | | | | | |
| 17 | 109 | | | | 133 |
| 18 | 130 | | | | 142 |
| 19 | 1 - 6 | | | | 145 |
| 20 | | | | | |
| 21 | | | | | |
| 22 | RESPONDENT'S | | | | RECEIVED |
| 23 | 2 | | | | 21 |
| 24 | 3 | | | | 44 |
| 25 | | | | | |

```
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA; WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 24, 2012;
 1
                              9:45 A.M.
 3
 4
 5
               THE CLERK: Item 1, CV 08-3452-SVW, Arutyan
 6
     Demirchyan v. Alberto R. Gonzalez.
 7
               Counsel, please state your appearances.
 8
               MS. CHEN: Good morning, Your Honor. Carol Chen for
 9
     the respondent. Also present at counsel's table is ICE Senior
10
     Attorney Jillian Woods.
11
              MR. KURZBAN: Good morning, Your Honor. Ira Kurzban
12
     and Geoffrey Hoffman for the plaintiff, Mr. Demirchyan.
13
               THE COURT: All right. This is the time for further
14
    hearing in this matter. The court issued a minute order on
15
     October 18th which outlines the nature of the proceedings.
16
               So the plaintiff -- the petitioner has augmented the
17
     record, and do you wish to cross-examine -- Paul, do you have a
18
     schedule?
19
               Ms. Chen, do you wish to cross-examine?
20
              MS. CHEN: I do, Your Honor.
21
               THE COURT: Which witness do you wish to examine
22
     first?
2.3
              MS. CHEN: I believe, Your Honor, the petitioner
24
    himself.
25
               THE COURT: All right.
```

```
1
               MS. CHEN: And, Your Honor, I believe the parties
     agree that all the other witnesses should be excluded for
 3
     this --
 4
               THE COURT: All right. Anyone who is going to be a
 5
     witness in the case should leave the courtroom and remain in
 6
     the witness room across the hall.
 7
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, should the petitioner take the
 8
     stand?
 9
               THE COURT: Yes.
10
               MS. CHEN: Thanks, Your Honor.
               THE CLERK: Please step forward. Stand behind the
11
12
     court reporter. Raise your right hand.
13
               (Witness sworn)
14
               THE WITNESS: I do.
15
               THE CLERK: Please be seated.
16
               MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor, we have an objection at
17
     this point.
18
               THE COURT: What was that?
19
               MR. HOFFMAN: Our understanding is that we would be
20
     doing a direct examination, and then Ms. Chen would get a
21
     chance to cross-examine.
               THE COURT: The procedure is, in a court proceeding,
22
2.3
     that the declaration is the direct examination, and then you're
     allowed to redirect following cross-examination.
24
25
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
```

```
1
               THE CLERK: Please state your full name and spell it
     for the record.
 3
               THE WITNESS: Arutyun Demirchyan, A-r-u-t-y-u-n, last
 4
     name, Demirchyan, D-e-m-i-r-c-h-y-a-n.
 5
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, since his declaration will be
 6
    his direct, may I approach the clerk to give two copies, one to
 7
     the court and one to the witness?
 8
               THE COURT: Yes.
 9
               MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.
10
               THE CLERK: Exhibit A placed before the witness.
11
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, may I begin?
12
               THE COURT: Yes, please.
13
               MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.
14
     ARUTYUN DERMIRCHYAN; PETITIONER'S WITNESS, SWORN, TESTIFIED:
15
                  DIRECT EXAMINATION BY DECLARATION
16
                          CROSS-EXAMINATION
17
    BY MS. CHEN:
18
        Mr. Demirchyan, I'm going to ask you to look at the
19
     document that was placed before you.
20
               Do you recognize it?
21
         Yes, it's my affidavit.
     Α.
22
          I'm going to ask you specifically to turn to the last
23
    page. And do you recognize, sir, that signature as being
24
    yours?
25
        Yes, ma'am.
     Α.
```

- 1 Q. And did you sign that after reviewing the entirety of this
- 2 document?
- 3 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 4 Q. All 33 paragraphs, correct?
- 5 A. That's correct.
- 6 Q. Including paragraph 33 which says, "You are declaring
- 7 under penalty of perjury"?
- 8 A. That is correct.
- 9 Q. Let me ask you to turn first to paragraph 16 of that
- 10 document. Please let me know when you are there.
- 11 THE COURT: The declarations should be perhaps
- 12 referred to by exhibit numbers. So I'll call his -- Arutyun
- 13 Demirchyan's Declaration Exhibit 1.
- MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 15 BY MS. CHEN:
- 16 Q. Mr. Demirchyan, do you see paragraph 16 of Exhibit 1?
- 17 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 18 Q. And in that paragraph, you state that Asatur Guyumjyan --
- 19 for the court reporter, the name is spelled A-s-a-t-u-r, first
- 20 name, last name is G-u-y-u-m-j-y-a-n.
- 21 Sir, you declare in paragraph 16 that that individual
- 22 | obtained a 1997 birth certificate for you after being sent a
- 23 power of attorney.
- Do you see that?
- 25 A. Yes, ma'am.

- 1 Q. And does Mr. -- is that a male?
- 2 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 3 Q. Does Mr. Guyumjyan go by any other name?
- 4 A. I don't think so.
- 5 Q. And, sir, you state that he was a neighbor, correct?
- 6 A. He was an old neighbor, yes.
- 7 O. In Armenia?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. He is not a relative?
- 10 A. No, he is not.
- 11 Q. Did you recall your deposition being taken in this case?
- THE COURT: When?
- MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 14 Q. Do you remember your deposition being taken on May 12th,
- 15 2009?
- 16 A. I don't remember the exact date, but sometime around 2009
- 17 there was a deposition, yes.
- 18 Q. You remember coming to my office, there was a court
- 19 reporter?
- 20 A. Yes, I remember.
- 21 MS. CHEN: And, for the record, Your Honor, I believe
- 22 | the entirety of that deposition transcript was admitted into
- 23 evidence at the prior evidentiary hearing.
- 24 THE COURT: All right.

```
BY MS. CHEN:
 1
     Q. Sir, do you remember that during that deposition, you
 3
     stated that a cousin, Hovaans Khahyan -- and again for the
 4
     court reporter, spelled, first name, H-o-v-a-a-n-s, last name,
 5
     K-h-a-h-y-a-n -- was the individual who picked up the birth
 6
     certificate?
 7
               MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor, may we have the page and
 8
     what she is referring to?
 9
               MR. HOFFMAN: Deposition.
10
               THE COURT: Do you have --
              MS. CHEN: I do, Your Honor. Pages 143 to 144.
11
12
               And, Your Honor, may I, at this time, approach the
13
     court clerk to give copies of the deposition transcript?
14
               THE COURT: Yes.
15
               Why do you have to approach him? Why can't you just
16
     read the part?
17
               MS. CHEN: Sure, I can, Your Honor.
18
               THE COURT: Yes. Page and line number.
19
              MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
20
               For the record, will be pages 143, line 12, to page
21
     144, line three, and it reads as follows:
22
               "Question: But you eventually did get a birth
2.3
               Certificate in 1997, but you believe that was from
24
               Another request by your mom to get the birth
25
               Certificate rather than from this attempt in 1992?
```

```
1
               "Answer: My mom made several requests. That's
               Correct.
 3
               "Question: And this person who brought it, can you
               describe this person for me?
 5
               "Answer: Well, the person just -- just -- he was
               just a carrier. He just carried it from the airport
 6
 7
               to LAX and to give it to somebody, to give to my mom,
 8
               To her friend, that that person did not go pick it up
 9
               At the government office. My cousin did.
10
               "Question: Who is your cousin?
11
               "Hovaans, H-o-v-a-a-n-s, Khahyan, K-h-a-h-y-a-n.
12
               "Question: So it is your understanding your cousin
13
               Picked it up from the government building?
14
               "Answer: Yes."
15
               MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor, I object. It's not
16
     impeachment.
17
               THE COURT: I think it may be, so your objection is
18
     overruled.
19
    BY MS. CHEN:
20
         Sir, do you recall that in yet another document you signed
21
     under penalty of perjury you stated that a neighbor by the name
22
     of Lucy had faxed you the 1997 birth certificate?
2.3
         I don't understand the question.
     Α.
24
       Do you recall, sir, ever stating, under a penalty of
25
     perjury, that another individual, not Asatur Guyumjyan, not
```

```
1
     Hovaans Khahyan, had, in fact, brought the 1997 birth
     certificate to you?
 3
          I don't recall.
    Α.
 4
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, may I approach the clerk to
    provide documents to refresh -- provide two documents to
 5
 6
    provide the witness's --
 7
               THE COURT: What are they?
 8
               MS. CHEN: There are interrogatories as well as the
 9
     petitioner's own responses which were --
10
               THE COURT: Why don't you just read those? I mean --
              MS. CHEN: I can, Your Honor.
11
12
               THE COURT: Now, the question regarding these
13
     interrogatories, in his answers -- you're first questioning
14
     about them, and then offering them as exhibits in evidence?
15
               MS. CHEN: I was going to refresh his recollection,
16
     but I can -- I can --
17
               THE COURT: Do you want to refresh his recollection
18
     first? Is that what you're --
19
              MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. But either -- whatever
20
     the court would like for me to do, Your Honor.
21
               THE COURT: I'm not trying this matter, so you have
22
    to proceed, and I'll rule.
2.3
              MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
24
     Q. Just to clarify, Mr. Demirchyan, you were once represented
25
     by Mr. Rosenberg, James Rosenberg; is that correct?
```

A. That's correct.

- 2 Q. Do you recall during the litigation of this case that the
- 3 United States propounded what were called "interrogatories" to
- 4 you, they were questions to be answered by you?
- 5 A. I don't remember.
- 6 Q. Do you recall signing what is called a "verification,"
- 7 | saying that you had read the responses which were subsequently
- 8 given to the government, that you knew the contents to be true
- 9 and correct?
- 10 A. May I see it?
- MS. CHEN: Your Honor, may I approach?
- 12 THE COURT: Yes. And what you're showing him should
- 13 be marked for identification. Let's say this is Exhibit 2.
- 14 What is the date of the interrogatories?
- MS. CHEN: Your Honor, the actual set of
- 16 | interrogatories is dated December 22nd, 2008. And the
- 17 | petitioner's responses, verified responses, signed under
- 18 penalty of perjury, is dated January 26, 2009.
- 19 THE COURT: And these interrogatories and answers
- 20 have not been filed with the court, correct?
- 21 MS. CHEN: That's correct, Your Honor.
- 22 THE COURT: All right.
- 23 The interrogatory and the response is Exhibit 2.
- 24 BY MS. CHEN:
- 25 Q. Mr. Demirchyan, may I ask you to first turn to the

- document entitled, on the first page, "Respondent's First Set
- 2 of Interrogatories," which again is marked for identification
- 3 as Exhibit 2.
- 4 A. I'm looking at it.
- 5 Q. Do you see that, sir?
- 6 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 7 Q. I'm going to ask you to turn to page five, and
- 8 | specifically what is marked as interrogatory No. 19.
- 9 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 10 Q. And I'm going to ask you just to read along with me.
- 11 Please read along with me.
- 12 "Please list and describe what information and
- Documents you or someone on your behalf provided
- 14 Armenian authorities in order to register your birth
- For the birth certificate purported to have been
- Registered on July 30th, 1997[sic] and issued on
- November 23rd, 2000, registration No. 9725; the
- 18 Birth certificate purported to have been issued on
- 19 July 23rd, 1988, registration No. 4-12697; the birth
- 20 Certificate purported to have been registered on
- 21 April 29th, 1997, registration No. 975; and the
- 22 Birth certificate purported to have been issued on
- 23 December 23rd, 2000, registration No. 1775."
- Do you see that, sir?
- 25 A. Yes, I see it.

- MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor, objection to the reading.
- 2 Ms. Chen misstated. She said 1997. I believe she meant 1977.
- 3 July 30th, 1977.
- 4 MS. CHEN: Your Honor, if I stated that, my
- 5 apologies, it is 1977.
- 6 THE COURT: All right. Then with that correction,
- 7 you can proceed.
- 8 BY MS. CHEN:
- 9 Q. Mr. Demirchyan, do you see the one that says -- the third
- 10 one that says, "The birth certificate purported to have been
- 11 registered on April 29th, 1997, registration No. 975"?
- 12 A. Yes, I see it.
- 13 Q. And is it your understanding that that is what you are
- 14 attempting to introduce into evidence today as a birth
- 15 | certificate that you had -- you or your mom had obtained in
- 16 1997?
- 17 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 18 Q. And it purportedly evidences a 1977 birth certificate --
- 19 birth year, correct?
- 20 A. That is correct.
- 21 Q. I'm going to ask you now to turn to the document that's
- 22 | entitled "Petitioner's Responses to First Set of
- 23 | Interrogatories, " the second document that is marked for
- 24 identification as Exhibit 2. And, sir, I'm going to ask you to
- 25 turn to page nine.

- 1 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 2 Q. Do you see that, sir?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And so there is a subsection -- it says question 19 on
- 5 line -- between line, I guess, 21 and 22.
- Do you see that?
- 7 A. Okay. I'm on page nine, line 20 to 21?
- 8 Q. Yes. Just to clarify, sir, you see question -- it says
- 9 question 19?
- 10 A. Yes, I see it.
- 11 Q. You see subsection a, subsection b?
- 12 A. Uh-huh.
- 13 Q. I'm going to ask you to turn to the next page, which is
- 14 page ten.
- 15 Sir, do you see subsection c?
- 16 A. Yes, I see it.
- 17 Q. And it says, "This was faxed to us from Armenia by a woman
- 18 who used to be our neighbor. Her name was Lucy and she is now
- 19 deceased, " correct?
- 20 A. That's correct. I see it.
- 21 Q. I'm going to ask you to turn one more page, sir. It's not
- 22 | numbered, but the next page --
- MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor, I'm sorry to interrupt.
- 24 THE COURT: Just make an objection and give me the
- 25 legal grounds.

```
1
               MR. KURZBAN: If this is meant for impeachment --
 2
               THE COURT: Just -- objection, legal grounds, what
 3
     are they?
 4
               MR. KURZBAN: Nothing else, Your Honor.
 5
               THE COURT: Did you make an objection?
 6
               MR. KURZBAN: Yes.
 7
               THE COURT: What was the objection?
 8
               MR. KURZBAN: Improper examination.
 9
               MR. HOFFMAN: Compound question.
10
               THE COURT: Improper examination is not an objection.
11
     What are the legal grounds for the objection?
12
               MR. KURZBAN: The legal grounds is that this is being
13
     used for impeachment, it's not impeachment.
14
               THE COURT: Improper impeachment?
15
               MR. KURZBAN: Yes, Your Honor.
16
               THE COURT: Overruled.
17
               Proceed.
18
               MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.
19
          Sir, I'm going to ask you again to turn to the next page.
20
     It's unnumbered, but it should be the one after page nine.
21
     Α.
          After page nine, I have page ten.
22
          I'm sorry. You are right. The page after page ten. I
23
     apologize.
24
               THE COURT: Is that page 11?
25
                          It's actually unnumbered, Your Honor, but
               MS. CHEN:
```

```
1
     it is the page after page ten.
               THE COURT: Is that the way it's reflected in the
 3
     document?
 4
               MS. CHEN: It is, Your Honor.
 5
               THE COURT: An unnumbered page following page ten.
 6
               And what's the next numbered page?
 7
               MS. CHEN: There is actually the next -- there is no
 8
     next numbered page, Your Honor. After that is a Proof of
 9
     Service that is also unnumbered.
10
               THE COURT: So for identification purposes, what is
11
     the first line on that unnumbered page?
12
               MS. CHEN: It says "VERIFICATION" in bold caps.
13
               THE COURT: All right.
14
     BY MS. CHEN:
15
         Mr. Demirchyan, are you on that same page?
     Q.
16
     Α.
        Yes, ma'am.
17
          And, Mr. Demirchyan, do you see that -- do you recognize
18
     that signature on that page?
19
          Yes, ma'am.
     Α.
20
          Is that your signature?
     Q.
21
     Α.
          Yes, ma'am.
22
          And do you see that it states, above that signature, that
23
     you are the petitioner?
24
          That is correct.
     Α.
```

It also states that you have read the foregoing responses

25

Q.

```
1
     to the first --
          Yes, ma'am.
 3
          And you know its contents to be true and correct?
     Q.
 4
          Yes, ma'am.
     Α.
 5
          Do you recognize this document then?
     Q.
 6
          I don't remember the document specifically, that's what
 7
     you're asking me, but it's my signature on the document.
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, at this time the government
 8
 9
     does move to admit into evidence the two documents marked for
10
     identification as Exhibit 2.
11
               THE COURT: You mean the interrogatory and the
12
     responses?
13
               MS. CHEN: Correct, Your Honor.
14
               THE COURT: They're received.
15
               (Respondent's Exhibit 2 received in evidence.)
16
     BY MS. CHEN:
17
     Q. Mr. Demirchyan, I'm going to ask you to turn back to your
18
     declaration, which has been marked as Exhibit 1, and ask you
19
     specifically to --
20
               THE COURT: And that declaration is dated
21
     August 22nd, 2011; is that right? Or what is the date?
22
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. I believe it was signed
23
     August 22nd, and it was filed with the court August 24th, 2011.
24
               THE COURT: All right.
25
     ///
```

- 1 BY MS. CHEN:
- 2 \mid Q. Mr. Demirchyan, ask you to move on to paragraph 17.
- 3 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 4 Q. And in that paragraph, you describe that your mother
- 5 traveled to Armenia to get the 1997 birth certificate we've
- 6 just been talking about. She went there to get it
- 7 authenticated, correct?
- 8 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 9 THE COURT: Went where? Where did you say the
- 10 mother went?
- MS. CHEN: Oh, I'm sorry, Your Honor.
- 12 Q. You stated in your -- in paragraph 17, Mr. Demirchyan,
- 13 that your mother went to Armenia to get the 1997 birth
- 14 certificate authenticated, correct?
- 15 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 16 Q. In your declaration, paragraph 17, which again is
- 17 Exhibit 1 marked for identification, you stated it had to be, I
- 18 | believe, re-issued in -- with a 2000 issue date, correct?
- 19 A. I'm sorry? Go again.
- 20 Q. Sure. I'm just asking you, sir, to look at your own
- 21 paragraph 17 in your declaration.
- 22 A. Okay.
- 23 Q. Correct me if my understanding is incorrect, but you state
- 24 that your mother went to Armenia with the 1997 birth
- 25 | certificate in question, and to get it authenticated, correct?

- 1 A. That is correct.
- 2 Q. You also state in this paragraph that they re-issued it
- 3 | with a 2000 issue date, correct?
- 4 A. That is correct.
- 5 Q. But you actually did not go to Armenia with her on that
- 6 trip, correct?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 Q. In fact, as you state in paragraph 17, you were already in
- 9 immigration detention; is that correct?
- 10 A. That is correct.
- 11 Q. So you have no personal knowledge of the process by which
- 12 | she got this 1997 birth certificate re-issued with a 2000 year
- 13 date; is that correct?
- 14 A. That is correct.
- MS. CHEN: Your Honor, the government moves to strike
- 16 paragraph 17 for lack of personal knowledge and lack of
- 17 foundation.
- THE COURT: But, I mean, why is that necessary?
- 19 | Can't I just receive it for its value?
- MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 21 THE COURT: It's not necessary to strike it; I can
- 22 consider it in context.
- MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
- Q. Mr. Demirchyan, I'm going to ask you now to turn to
- 25 | paragraph 32 of your declaration, which is the last page which

- 1 also is unnumbered, but I believe it's page seven of seven on
- 2 top.
- 3 A. Thirty-two?
- 4 Q. Yes, sir.
- 5 A. Okay. I'm here.
- 6 Q. You state in that paragraph, sir, that at all times in
- 7 | your life, you've known that you were born in 1977, correct?
- 8 A. That's correct.
- 9 Q. That understanding is based on what other people have told
- 10 you, correct?
- 11 A. That is correct.
- 12 Q. And you state also in this paragraph that, "Growing up
- 13 Armenia I was in the correct grade for that year of birth."
- 14 Again, that is based on what other people have told
- 15 you, correct?
- 16 A. Yes, my teachers and all, yes.
- 17 Q. Do you also recall, sir, that when I asked you in your
- 18 deposition what grade you were when you left Armenia, you
- 19 stated that you didn't remember?
- 20 A. I don't remember.
- 21 Q. Do you remember that you stated, in fact, asking you what
- 22 grade you were in when you left Armenia in 1998, it was similar
- 23 to asking you what you had to eat for that day? Do you
- 24 remember saying that?
- MR. KURZBAN: Objection, Your Honor.

```
1
               THE DEFENDANT: I don't remember.
 2
               MR. KURZBAN: Improper impeachment. We have to know
 3
     the line and part of --
 4
               THE COURT: Is this from the deposition?
 5
              MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
               THE COURT: Give us a page and line.
 6
 7
              MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
 8
               I'm sorry, Your Honor. May I have a moment?
 9
               THE COURT: Yes.
10
               MS. CHEN: It would be page 75, lines 10 through 16.
     Again, page 75, lines 10 through 16. It reads:
11
12
               "Question: When you left Armenia in 1988, what
13
               Grade were you in, do you know?
14
               "Answer: I have no idea. It's like asking me what
15
               I had to eat that day. I don't know. Nothing, zero.
16
               "Question: Really? Is that similar to what you
17
               Think about?
18
               "Answer: Think about it.
19
               "Question: As to what grade you were in?"
20
               MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor, in completeness, may she
21
     read the next -- oh, I guess Your Honor has it. I'm sorry.
22
    BY MS. CHEN:
2.3
     Q. Mr. Demirchyan, you have two perjury convictions, correct?
24
              MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor, objection. The objection
25
     is based on the rule that provides -- 609 that provides for the
```

```
1
     fact that there cannot be any admission of convictions if
     they're more than ten years old.
 3
               THE COURT: Are these -- the rule says that
 4
     convictions aren't useable for impeachment if they're more than
 5
     ten years old unless they involve a crime involving moral
 6
     turpitude and dishonesty --
 7
               Do these crimes, in your view, meet that category?
 8
               MS. CHEN: They certainly do, Your Honor.
 9
               THE COURT: What are the crimes?
10
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, the only two I would like to
     use today are the perjury, and which Mr. Demirchyan has stated
11
12
     under penalty of oath in a deposition, one was for using false
13
     name on a DMV application of Juan Manual Ayala.
14
               THE COURT: What date was that conviction?
15
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, if I may have a moment?
16
               THE COURT: Yes.
17
              MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor, if I may respond just to
18
     clarify?
19
               THE COURT: Let her first give me the information.
20
               MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, sir.
21
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I believe the two perjury
22
     convictions were previously in the government's trial exhibit
2.3
     binder 18 and 19, and they both are from 1998, Your Honor.
24
               THE COURT: What is the objection? Counsel, what is
25
     the objection?
```

- MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor, these do not -- should not be admitted, Your Honor, because 609(b) specifically requires that if they are more than ten years old, the court must determine the probative value of the conviction supported by specific facts and circumstances substantially outweighs its
- THE COURT: I find that if there is a conviction for perjury, which is lying under oath, there couldn't be any type of conviction more pertinent to impeach. So the objection is overruled.
- 11 Proceed.

prejudicial effect.

- MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 13 Q. Mr. Demirchyan, you've been convicted of perjury twice,
- 14 correct?

- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Including for lying about your age?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. And also for -- specifically for lying about your age on a
- 19 DMV application to get a fake I.D. card; is that correct?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Also for lying about how many different names or aliases
- 22 | you have used on a DMV application; is that correct?
- 23 A. That's correct.
- 24 Q. I'm going to ask you now to turn to, once again, your
- 25 declaration, sir, starting -- the paragraphs I want to talk

- 1 about are paragraphs six through 12, but you can just first
- 2 | turn to page -- paragraph six.
- 3 A. I don't have paragraph six on this copy.
- 4 Q. Sir, just to clarify, this is your own declaration which
- 5 | is marked for identification as Exhibit 1, and again, it's the
- 6 August 22nd, 2011 declaration.
- 7 You do not have a paragraph six?
- 8 A. No, I don't.
- 9 Q. The top of the page should read, "The scrivener's error on
- 10 | the copy of my birth certificate."
- 11 THE CLERK: Paragraph six placed before the witness.
- 12 THE WITNESS: Okay. I have it, Your Honor.
- 13 BY MS. CHEN:
- 14 Q. Sir, I'm going to briefly ask you to just look at that
- 15 first -- at the top of that page. It says, "The scrivener's
- 16 | error on the copy of my birth certificate."
- Do you see that?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And paragraphs six through 12 of your declaration, is it
- 20 fair to say that those paragraphs describe what you call the
- 21 | process by which you came from Armenia to United States and
- 22 | this scrivener's error you talk about?
- 23 A. If you have a moment, I could read it.
- MS. CHEN: Of course.
- MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor, may I? I'm going to object

- to the scope of this. My understanding of this hearing -
 THE COURT: What is the objection, to the scope of
- 4 MR. KURZBAN: Yes, and if I may --
- 5 THE COURT: Overruled.
- 6 THE WITNESS: Yes, ma'am.
- 7 BY MS. CHEN:

the examination?

- 8 Q. Sir, now having reviewed paragraphs six through 12 for the
- 9 record, is it your understanding those paragraphs describe the
- 10 process by which you and your family came from Armenia to the
- 11 United States?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And it's labeled, "Scrivener's error on the copy of my
- 14 birth certificate, " correct?
- 15 A. That is correct.
- 16 Q. I'm going to ask you to look at specifically paragraph
- 17 | eight, sir.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Let me ask -- I'm going to direct you to the second
- 20 sentence. It says, "I still recall all nine of us going to a
- 21 | typist to help type up copies of these translations."
- Do you see that?
- 23 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 24 Q. Did any of you actually help type up those copies?
- 25 A. No, we did not help. No.

- 1 Q. How long did the process of typing up the copies take?
- 2 A. I don't know.
- 3 Q. Was it days?
- 4 A. What I've heard and what I know, several times.
- 5 Q. I'm sorry. Did it take one day or did it take more than
- 6 one day?
- 7 A. Several days.
- 8 Q. And were you there -- were you present on all those days
- 9 when it was being typed up?
- 10 A. Not all those days.
- 11 Q. Did you -- I'm sorry, sir.
- Did you at any point watch this person type up any of
- 13 the documents?
- 14 A. Yes, I remember when I was a kid, I saw the person typing.
- 15 Q. And you -- it's your position that out of all nine of you,
- 16 | none of you looked at the papers to make sure that there were
- 17 | any -- there were no mistakes, correct?
- 18 A. I don't understand the question, ma'am.
- 19 Q. Sure. Is it your understanding that nobody in your family
- 20 caught this mistake until you got to Moscow?
- 21 THE COURT: That's what the declaration says, isn't
- 22 it?
- MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 24 THE COURT: So why -- I mean, you can question him
- 25 about the circumstances of the document being prepared. He's

1 testified to that, and you've asked him some questions. But he stated that's what happened. 3 MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor. Yes, Your Honor. 4 During -- you just stated, sir, under oath that you Q. 5 remember seeing a person type up some of these documents, 6 correct? 7 I stated, yes. Α. 8 Do you recall on pages 72 to 77 of your deposition, do you 9 recall during that deposition you stated that you didn't 10 remember the process very well, that you didn't remember seeing 11 anybody typing up the papers? 12 Α. When? 13 I'm going to read -- direct your -- I'm going to, for the 14 record, deposition again of May 12th, 2009, which was taken 15 under penalty of perjury, specifically page 88, line five to 16 line eight: 17 "Question: Sitting here actually, you don't remember 18 the process that was involved. In other words, you 19 Don't recall seeing a Bob or somebody typing this up, 20 Do you? 21 "Answer: No." 22 Mr. Demirchyan, in fact, during the deposition, you 23 admitted that your belief that a mistake had occurred during 24 the typing process, that was based on what other people had

25

told you, correct?

- 1 Part of it. Α. Your deposition, page 88, the following line, nine through 3 11: 4 "Question: Were you piecing it -- but you're 5 Piecing it together based on what you've asked other 6 People? 7 "Answer: Exactly." 8 Is that a question? Α. 9 Sir, I'm going to ask you to look at the binder in front Q. 10 of you. 11 A. Okay. 12 THE COURT: Is that -- is it agreed that's what the 13 deposition says? 14 MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. I read it from the 15 deposition transcript. I'm happy to give a copy --16 THE COURT: Well, if it's agreed that that's what the 17 deposition says, then it's admissible. 18 MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. 19 Sir, I'm going to ask you, do you see the black binder in 20 front of you? 21 Α. Yes, ma'am. 22 Q. Before I ask you to turn to anything in that binder, 23 you're aware that all of your family's entry papers -- or let 24 me be more specific.

You're aware that your own entry papers all list the

```
birth year of 1976, correct?
 1
          I'm sorry? I don't understand the question.
 3
               THE COURT:
                          It's not helpful to me. I've outlined
 4
     what I concluded was required given the 9th Circuit order in
 5
     the prior proceedings, and you're using this witness to sort of
 6
     argue your whole case. So that's not helpful to me.
 7
              MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
 8
               THE COURT: I have to make some specific findings
 9
     regarding this 1997 birth certificate and that's what is most
10
     critically before me. So unless you have something that
11
     specifically relates to that, I would like you to conclude your
12
     examination.
13
              MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. Your Honor, my
14
     understanding is petitioner's exhibit list, 110 and 111, I
15
     believe are from a U.S. passport. I would like to just ask one
16
     or two questions of petitioner regarding that.
17
               THE COURT: What are these exhibits?
18
              MS. CHEN: I believe it's petitioner's exhibit list,
19
     Your Honor. 110 and 111 are pages from a U.S. passport that he
20
     was issued after the initiation of removal proceedings. My
21
     understanding is also they were revoked. He was asked about it
22
     in deposition.
2.3
               THE COURT: What is the significance of it?
24
               MS. CHEN: The point the government is trying to make
25
     is that he applied for them after the proceedings were
```

```
initiated against him and they were, in fact, revoked. They
 1
     are trying to introduce it into evidence apparently.
 3
               THE COURT: But what is the significance of it? I'm
     focused on the 1997 birth certificate. What is the
 4
 5
     significance or relevance of what you're trying to introduce?
 6
               MS. CHEN: There's no significance in the
 7
     government's mind, Your Honor.
 8
               THE COURT: Well, then let's pass on it.
 9
              MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. The government has no
10
     further questions, Your Honor.
11
               THE COURT: All right. Redirect.
12
               Redirect should only encompass matters that were
13
     raised on cross-examination.
14
                         REDIRECT EXAMINATION
15
    BY MR. KURZBAN
16
     Q. Mr. Demirchyan, I'd like you to take a look at
17
     Exhibit 109. It's not in the book, it's in the separate
18
    documents that we filed today.
19
               THE COURT: Now, Exhibit 9, then, should be an
20
     Exhibit 9 in these proceedings too, correct?
21
               MR. KURZBAN: I'm sorry, Your Honor. I said 109.
               THE COURT: Oh, 109. Then 109 will be as it is
22
23
     received in this proceeding.
24
               MR. KURZBAN: Yes. And it's the 1997 birth
25
     certificate.
```

- THE COURT: Okay. Well, then, that's the certificate at issue, and whether it is received will require some probing. So it will be marked for identification, Exhibit 109. MR. KURZBAN: Thank you, Your Honor. Mr. Demirchyan, Ms. Chen asked you about the manner in Q. which this document was obtained, and I think the point was that there may have been some inconsistency between who obtained it and how it was brought to the United States. I would like you to explain to the court, to the best of your knowledge, what happened with respect to this document. That is, No. 1, who obtained the document? THE COURT: You know something, if it's going to be helpful to me, that type of question doesn't really enable me to make the finding that I have to because the question inherently doesn't call for a foundation. And what he may have heard or learned or discussed with others is not helpful to me. It's what he can testify to regarding what he saw, what he heard and so forth. So the form of the question is unhelpful. MR. KURZBAN: I'm sorry, Your Honor. Okay. Mr. Demirchyan, have you ever seen this document Q. before? Yes, I have. Α.
- 22
- 23 Did you ever have possession of the original of that
- document? 24

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

25 Yes, I have. Α.

- Q. Okay. When did you have possession of the original of
- 2 that document?
- 3 A. In 1997.
- 4 Q. And how did you get possession of that document?
- 5 A. My mother gave it to me.
- 6 Q. Okay. And to your knowledge, where did your mother get
- 7 | it?

- 8 A. From --
- 9 THE COURT: I mean, you're doing that again. To your
- 10 knowledge, where did she get it? I mean, that's not something
- 11 that is helpful to me.
- 12 MR. KURZBAN: I understand --
- 13 THE COURT: Don't ask questions like that because I
- 14 | have to make an important determination here, and you're just
- 15 garbling things up. So ask better questions, sir.
- 16 MR. KURZBAN: Okay. Sorry, Your Honor.
- 17 Q. When you issued that document, what did you do with the
- 18 document?
- 19 A. I attempted to correct my birth date.
- 20 Q. And how did you attempt to correct it?
- 21 A. First I went to the DMV and I showed it to them, and the
- 22 DMV had told me that you need to go -- you need to have
- 23 | something on immigration document, you need to go to
- 24 immigration first.
- Q. Okay. After you got that information from DMV, what did

- you do with the document?
- 2 A. I went to the Los Angeles immigration office, and I took
- 3 | my mother along with me. And after a number was called, we
- 4 approached the gentleman, I presented this document, and at
- 5 | that time he said he doesn't accept anything here. If I were
- 6 to -- he give me an address with the blue form --
- 7 MS. CHEN: Objection, Your Honor, hearsay.
- 8 THE COURT: That's not hearsay. I mean he can
- 9 testify as to what someone told him. It's not being offered
- 10 for the truth, it's just being offered for the fact that it was
- 11 said.

- 12 Overruled. Proceed.
- 13 BY MR. KURZBAN
- 14 Q. Continue, Mr. Demirchyan.
- 15 A. So he had given me an address with a blue form and an
- 16 | address on it, and I have asked him to -- I need to send this
- 17 | to this address. We don't accept documents here.
- 18 Q. Okay. And what action did you take?
- 19 A. I took the document, sometime in 1997, right after that,
- 20 and I sent a copy to INS, the address the INS worker had given
- 21 | me at that time.
- 22 | Q. And what did you do with the original of the document?
- 23 A. The original of the document, it was at my house.
- Q. Okay. And when was the next time you saw that document?
- 25 A. Next time I saw the document was in 2000. Proceedings

- 1 against me in immigration courts in Arizona. In 2000,
- 2 | immigration proceedings in Arizona in the courtroom.
- 3 Q. How did that document get into the proceedings in Arizona?
- 4 A. The original document?
- 5 Q. Yes.
- 6 A. It was brought by my mother and given to my attorney at
- 7 the time.
- 8 Q. Who was your attorney at the time?
- 9 THE COURT: How is he -- what's the foundation for
- 10 this? You're doing the same thing again. I mean, did he --
- 11 did his mother tell him she got it from the attorney, did she
- 12 give it to the attorney, was he there? It helps me to know how
- 13 these things happen so I can make a proper assessment.
- 14 BY MR. KURZBAN
- 15 Q. Okay. With respect to the document being brought to
- 16 Arizona, did you give any instructions to your mother about the
- 17 document?
- 18 A. I had told her when I was in proceedings, over the phone,
- 19 that my attorney asked for this document. It's sitting -- it's
- 20 | in a certain place in my house at the time, if she could reach
- 21 it for me.
- 22 Q. Okay. And did you ask your mother to get that document?
- 23 A. Yes, I did.
- 24 Q. And did you ask her to bring it to Arizona?
- 25 A. Yes, I did.

- 1 Q. And did she do that?
- 2 A. Yes, she did.
- 3 Q. Okay. And did you ask her to give it to your attorney?
- 4 A. Yes, I did.
- 5 Q. At the time of -- while you were incarcerated, did you
- 6 | ever speak with your attorney?
- 7 A. Yes, I did.
- 8 Q. Did you learn from your conversations that he obtained the
- 9 original document from your mother?
- 10 A. Yes, he did.
- 11 Q. Okay. Are you aware or did you give him any instructions
- 12 as to what he should do with that document?
- 13 A. Other than show to the court, give it to the judge, no.
- 14 Q. Okay. Now, you were in a court proceeding when that
- 15 document appeared, correct?
- 16 A. That's correct.
- 17 Q. Can you explain to Judge Wilson what happened in the
- 18 course of that proceeding.
- 19 THE COURT: I take it that there's no transcript of
- 20 that hearing?
- 21 MR. KURZBAN: There is a transcript.
- 22 THE COURT: Then why should I hear his description of
- 23 what happened and why shouldn't I be focused on what actually
- 24 did happen?
- MR. KURZBAN: May I have a moment, Your Honor?

- 1 THE COURT: Yes.
- MR. KURZBAN: Apparently, Your Honor, we had
- 3 submitted it to Your Honor.
- 4 THE COURT: You can reference it and argue from it at
- 5 | the appropriate time. His general description of what happened
- 6 is not helpful.
- 7 MR. KURZBAN: Okay.
- 8 Q. Subsequent to the hearing, do you know if your mother --
- 9 did you have any discussions with your mother about what to do
- 10 | with the original document?
- 11 A. I'm sorry. I don't understand the question.
- 12 Q. During the course of the hearing, and subsequent to the
- 13 hearing, do you know what happened to that document?
- 14 A. Yes. My mother -- the judge extracted my mother's ticket
- 15 to Armenia to have it authenticated.
- 16 Q. And did your mother take it to Armenia?
- 17 A. Yes, she did.
- 18 Q. And do you know what happened in Armenia?
- 19 A. What I've heard. I don't know exactly what happened.
- MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor, we'll bring in other
- 21 witnesses with respect to that.
- I'm sorry, Your Honor. Okay.
- 23 Q. Again, Ms. Chen had asked you, and I'd like you to turn
- 24 | again to Interrogatory No. 19, which is on page nine. Your
- 25 | answer to Interrogatory No. 19 on page nine of the document

- 1 | marked "Petitioner's Responses to First Set of
- 2 Interrogatories."
- 3 Can you look at that?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. And there is an a, b, and then on the next page, at page
- 6 ten, there is a c and d.
- 7 A. That is correct.
- 8 Q. Were you referring to the 1997 birth certificate or a
- 9 different birth certificate there, or to the 2000 birth
- 10 certificate?
- 11 A. The 2000 birth certificate.
- 12 Q. Just one other matter.
- 13 Ms. Chen asked you and impeached you on the issue of
- 14 who actually obtained this birth certificate.
- Were you aware of who obtained the 1997 birth
- 16 certificate?
- 17 A. Yes, I was aware.
- 18 Q. And who was that person?
- 19 A. It's two persons actually.
- 20 Q. Okay. Can you explain what you mean.
- 21 A. She had told our neighbor Asatur to retrieve this document
- 22 | from the Armenian -- whatever -- the city hall, whatever, to
- 23 | get it from.
- Q. And who was that? What is his name?
- 25 A. Asatur Guyumjyan.

- 1 Q. Okay. Can you spell it for the court reporter, please.
- 2 \mid A. A-s-a-t-u-r, and then the last name, I believe, is
- 3 G-y-u-m-j-y-a-n[sic].
- 4 Q. Okay. Go ahead. Continue.
- 5 A. I believe that Asatur has retrieved the actual document,
- 6 and my cousin, Hovhanness, had assisted him by bringing the
- 7 document, sending a document to the United States.
- 8 Q. Okay. So when you said in your deposition that your
- 9 cousin had assisted you or obtained it, what exactly were you
- 10 referring to?
- 11 A. I was referring to that he went with Asatur -- along with
- 12 Asatur had sent a document to my mother because my mother
- 13 | had -- he knew a person that he was coming to the United States
- 14 and so he could bring the document.
- 15 Q. Okay.
- 16 MR. KURZBAN: I have no further questions.
- 17 Thank you, Your Honor.
- 18 THE COURT: Thank you, sir. You may step down.
- 19 Call the next witness.
- MS. CHEN: Your Honor, the government calls Susanna
- 21 Demirchyan, very briefly.
- THE COURT: Okay.
- 23 MS. CHEN: While Ms. Demirchyan is coming to the
- 24 stand, may I approach your court clerk to give copies of the
- 25 declaration?

```
1
               THE COURT:
                           Yes.
               The Susanna Demirchyan declaration will be Exhibit 3.
 3
               (Interpreter sworn.)
 4
               THE INTERPRETER: Z-a-r-r-e-h, M-a-r-t-i-n.
 5
     Languages are Armenian.
 6
               MR. HOFFMAN: Before we begin, Your Honor,
 7
     Ms. Demirchyan wanted us to advise the court about a medical
 8
     issue, and she cannot turn her head fully. And so if she can't
 9
     address the court, she wanted me to bring that to the court's
10
     attention.
11
               THE COURT: All right. Thank you.
12
               THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand.
13
               (Witness sworn through the interpreter)
14
               THE WITNESS: Yes.
15
               THE CLERK: Please state your full name and spell it
16
     for the record.
17
               THE WITNESS: Susanna, S-u-s-a-n-n-a, Demirchyan,
18
     D-e-m-i-r-c-h-y-a-n.
19
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, may I proceed?
20
               THE COURT: Yes.
21
        SUSANNA DEMIRCHYAN, DEFENSE WITNESS, SWORN, TESTIFIED:
22
                  DIRECT EXAMINATION BY DECLARATION
2.3
                           CROSS-EXAMINATION
24
    BY MS. CHEN:
25
         Mrs. Demirchyan, I'm going to ask you to look at the
```

```
document in front of you, your declaration which has been
 1
    marked for identification as Exhibit 3.
               THE COURT: It's received.
 3
 4
            (Respondent's Exhibit 3 received in evidence)
 5
               MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.
               THE COURT: It's in evidence.
 6
 7
    BY MS. CHEN:
 8
       Mrs. Demirchyan, can you turn to the last page of your
 9
     declaration.
10
               MS. CHEN: And, Your Honor, just for the record, I
11
     believe my copy was the one that was filed with the court by
12
     petitioner. I believe it's actually not signed by
13
    Mrs. Demirchyan. It's page five of 18 on the top of the
14
     docket.
15
               MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor, it was signed in the
16
     original Armenian, signed.
17
               THE COURT: So, in other words, the declaration in
18
     the Armenian language is signed but not in the English
19
     translation.
20
               MR. HOFFMAN: That's correct, Your Honor.
21
               THE COURT: And is it understood that the English
22
     translation is also adopted by her?
2.3
               MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, that's my understanding.
24
               THE COURT: All right.
25
              MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.
```

- 1 Q. Mrs. Demirchyan, I'm going to ask you to turn to
- 2 paragraph 20 of that declaration, and you can look at the
- 3 Armenian copy. It should be page nine of 18 on the top.
- 4 MR. HOFFMAN: Four of 18 -- it's four of 18.
- 5 MS. CHEN: I'm referring to the top of the -- page
- 6 nine of 18 on the docket, going across the top of the document.
- 7 I'm referring her to the Armenian version.
- 8 MR. HOFFMAN: Oh, okay. Thank you.
- 9 THE INTERPRETER: Paragraph again?
- MS. CHEN: Twenty.
- 11 Q. Mrs. Demirchyan, you can review for me paragraph 20, and
- 12 | when you're done, you can look up.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Ma'am, in that paragraph, you describe a former neighbor
- 15 from Armenia by the name of Asatur Guyumjyan getting the birth
- 16 certificate for you after you sent him a power of attorney,
- 17 correct?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And, ma'am, you remember coming to my office on multiple
- 20 times in the year of 2009 to have your deposition taken,
- 21 correct?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. You remember there was a court reporter there?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Various different Armenian translators at each of the

```
1
     sessions?
          Yes.
     Α.
 3
          Most importantly, do you remember testifying under penalty
     Q.
     of perjury during each of those sessions, correct?
 5
         Yes.
     Α.
 6
          And you remember on March 5th, 2009, in one of those
 7
     sessions, under penalty of perjury, that you testified that a
 8
     cousin by the name of Hovaans Khahyan had, in fact, gotten the
 9
     birth certificate for you in 1997, correct?
10
               MR. HOFFMAN: Objection. We would like the page
11
     number, please.
12
               THE COURT: Yes. You are not giving us references,
13
     so do that.
14
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
15
               Your Honor, would the court like for me to pass out
16
     the deposition?
17
               THE COURT: No. Just tell us what page and line
18
    you're relying on.
19
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. The deposition
20
     transcript pages 218 to 224, specifically question and answer.
21
               THE COURT: What date is the deposition?
               MS. CHEN: March 5th, 2009, Your Honor.
22
23
               THE COURT: Whatever you feel is relevant, read it to
24
     her and ask her if she gave those answers to those questions.
25
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
```

```
1
         Mrs. Demirchyan, I'm going to read you a relatively long
     Q.
     narrative, pages, again, 218 to 224. I will reference a
 3
     specific line, but also 235 to 236, and again, this is from the
    March 5th, 2009 deposition.
 4
 5
         Yes.
     Α.
 6
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, if I may have one moment?
 7
               THE COURT: Okay.
 8
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, if I may read from the
 9
     deposition?
10
               THE WITNESS: The last page is the birth certificate
11
    here, written in Russian.
12
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I'll ask to move to strike.
13
     There was no pending question.
14
               THE COURT: Motion to strike is granted.
15
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, if I may read from the
16
     deposition pages?
17
               THE COURT: Read it.
18
               MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.
19
               Starting from page 218, line 12:
20
               "Question: Now, if I remember correctly, it was only
21
               1997 or 1998, one of those years, that you actually
22
               Got some documents from Armenia?
2.3
               "Answer: '97.
24
               "Question: Do you recall if it was later part of
25
               '97, early part of '97?
```

| 1 | "Answer: Spring of '97. |
|----|--|
| 2 | "Question: Okay. And do you recall before we talk |
| 3 | About the actual documents, do you recall how you |
| 4 | Got the documents? Is it by mail? Did somebody |
| 5 | Bring it to you? |
| 6 | "Answer: A tourist who had come to the States |
| 7 | Brought it with them. |
| 8 | "Question: Okay. When you say 'tourist,' you mean |
| 9 | Like a friend who was coming to visit? |
| 10 | "Answer: No, it's just like someone who is coming |
| 11 | From Armenia to the States. So they'll give this |
| 12 | Person whatever the item or document may be with a |
| 13 | Phone number here in the States, and we tell they |
| 14 | Tell the person, 'When you get to the States, call |
| 15 | This number, tell them you have these things, they |
| 16 | Will come and pick it up.' |
| 17 | "Question: So you didn't actually know this person |
| 18 | Yourself? |
| 19 | "Answer: Correct. |
| 20 | "Question: Did the person work for the Armenian |
| 21 | Government? |
| 22 | "Answer: Which person? |
| 23 | "Question: The person who brought the documents. |
| 24 | "Answer: I have no idea what the person did for a |
| 25 | Living. He was just asked to do a favor. |

```
1
               "Question: Do you remember who asked him to do this
               Favor?
 3
                        When that woman passed away -- that woman
               "Answer:
               Passed away, she didn't obviously have the time to
 5
               Do what I had asked her to do" --
               THE REPORTER: Can you slow down for me?
 6
 7
               MS. CHEN: I apologize.
 8
               "When that woman passed away -- that woman passed
 9
               Away, she didn't obviously have the time to do what
10
               I had asked her to do. So our relatives there had
11
               Asked these other people. Someone went to the
12
               Archives and was able to find those documents and
13
               Eventually gave it to the tourist, and the tourist
14
               Brought it over."
15
               MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor, we would object to this
16
     point because it's not impeachment. She is not contradicting
17
     anything that is said.
18
               THE COURT: Is that the objection, no -- improper
19
     impeachment?
20
              MR. HOFFMAN: It's outside the scope.
21
               THE COURT: What is the objection, legal objection?
22
               MR. HOFFMAN: Two objections: It's outside the scope
2.3
     of the direct examination, which is the discussion in the
24
     affidavit, and it's also not -- improper impeachment.
25
               THE COURT: Overruled.
```

```
1
               Proceed.
               MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor. Your Honor, just
 3
     for the record, that was pages two --
 4
               THE COURT: You keep saying "for the record," is
 5
     there something going on here that's not on the record?
 6
               MS. CHEN: No, Your Honor.
 7
               THE COURT: I mean, someone reading the transcript
 8
     here may think that we're having a private discussion.
 9
     Everything is on the record.
10
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
               THE COURT: All right.
11
12
               MS. CHEN: What I just read, Your Honor, was
13
     pages 218, lines 12 through, I believe, line 24. I'm going to
14
     skip, just for efficiency sake, to page 220, line 16, starting
1.5
     there:
16
               "Question: Okay. So it just so happens that the
17
               Documents were ready at that time, and the person
18
               Was coming here anyway? So they gave the documents
19
               To this person, correct?
20
               "Answer: Yes.
21
               "Question: Okay. In other words, the documents
22
               Weren't obtained much, much earlier, and you were
2.3
               Just waiting for somebody to come to the United
24
               States and bring it, correct?
25
               "Answer: While we were told they were able to find
```

```
1
               The documents, some time passed, and then the tourist
               Came, and it's not like you have tourists coming here
 3
               Every day or all the time."
 4
               Your Honor, for efficiency, without -- unless the
 5
     other side has objection, I would like to move to page 22 -- I
 6
     apologize -- page 221, lines -- starting from line 12.
 7
               MR. HOFFMAN: I have another objection, Your Honor.
 8
     We were never given an opportunity to object to the questions
 9
     themselves during the deposition.
10
               THE COURT: Well, she was -- was she represented?
11
               MS. CHEN: She was, Your Honor.
12
               THE COURT: Well, that's an improper objection. She
13
     was represented.
14
               What rule of law says that trial counsel has to be
15
     present at a deposition if she was previously represented? Do
16
     you know of such a proposition?
17
               MR. HOFFMAN: No, Your Honor.
18
               THE COURT: That's a frivolous objection, wasn't it?
19
               MR. HOFFMAN: No, Your Honor.
20
               THE COURT: What is your authority for making an
21
     objection of that sort?
22
               MR. HOFFMAN: My authority is that I would like to
23
     object to some of the questions.
24
               THE COURT: No. You said your objection was that you
25
     were not present, and the fact is she was represented at the
```

```
1
     deposition, and your objection on that basis is frivolous,
     isn't it?
 3
               MR. HOFFMAN: No, Your Honor, because she was
 4
     disbarred. Ms. Rosenberg was disbarred.
 5
               THE COURT: So are you saying that if someone is
     represented at a deposition, and that person is later
 6
 7
     disbarred, then the deposition has no value?
 8
               MR. HOFFMAN: Not that it has no value, Your Honor,
 9
     but it's ineffective assistance of counsel, and so I think
10
     there should be something --
               THE COURT: So ineffective of counsel, and that is a
11
12
     different matter, isn't it? I mean, ineffective assistance of
13
     counsel is an objection that overlays all the proceedings;
14
     isn't that correct?
15
               MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor --
16
               THE COURT: Ineffective assistance of counsel, unlike
17
    most civil proceedings, does have a place in these types of
18
    proceedings, does it?
19
               MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor, I --
20
               THE COURT: Does it?
21
               MR. HOFFMAN: I'm sorry.
22
               THE COURT: Does ineffective assistance, as a matter
23
     of law, have a place in a civil proceeding such as this?
     Because, generally, ineffective assistance of counsel is not
24
25
     appropriate in a civil proceeding, only in a criminal
```

```
1
     proceeding. It may have some place in these proceedings, I
     don't know. If it does, it's measured in terms of the
 3
     proceeding as a whole, and not this specific instance.
 4
               So in any event, the objection is overruled.
 5
               MR. HOFFMAN: I misstated --
               THE COURT: Overruled. Be seated, sir.
 6
 7
               MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, sir.
 8
               THE COURT: Proceed.
 9
              MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.
10
               Just very quickly, the last portion would be, again,
     from the March 5th, 2009 deposition of Mrs. Demirchyan,
11
12
     page 235, starting from line 23, and just going to page 236,
13
     line No. 4, which is:
14
               "Question: Okay. Do you recall the names of the
15
               Relatives who had helped you obtain the birth
16
               Certificate in 1997?
17
               "Answer: Yes.
18
               "Question: And what were their names?
19
               "Answer: I haven't seen any documents from this
20
               Person to be able to spell the name, but the name is
21
               Hovhannes Kachanyan."
22
          Mrs. Demirchyan, I'm going to ask you to turn to
23
     paragraph 21 of your declaration. Again, you can refer to the
     Armenian version.
24
25
               THE INTERPRETER: For clarification, same page?
```

```
1
               MS. CHEN: I believe it is on page -- the same page,
     I believe, page nine of 18 at the top.
 3
               THE INTERPRETER: Thank you.
 4
               THE WITNESS: Yes.
 5
     BY MS. CHEN:
 6
     Q. And, ma'am, in that paragraph, again, which is
 7
    paragraph 21, you describe bringing a copy of that 1997 birth
 8
     certificate to INS the fall of 1997 to try to get your son's
 9
    birth year changed, correct?
10
          Yes.
     Α.
11
         But again, in your deposition, you stated to me that you
     Q.
12
     never actually did anything yourself to try to change your
13
     son's birth year; isn't that correct?
14
               MR. KURZBAN: Objection. Line and page, please, Your
15
     Honor.
16
               THE COURT: What is the line and page?
17
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. It is deposition
18
    page 227, starting at line 15.
19
               And, Your Honor, I did have a question to her as to
20
     whether or not she remembers it. Should I have her answer
     that?
21
               THE COURT: Don't ask me for advice.
22
2.3
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
24
               THE COURT: I'm not an advocate here. Just ask
25
     questions and I'll make the rulings when asked.
```

1 MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. Ma'am, do you remember stating in your deposition that you 3 never did anything yourself to try to change your son's birth 4 year? 5 Yes. Α. 6 You stated that you just gave the birth certificate to 7 your son and didn't know what he did with it; isn't that right? 8 MR. KURZBAN: Improper. THE WITNESS: Yes. 9 10 THE COURT: Well, you know, you read from the deposition before, as you've referenced the pages and lines. 11 12 You never asked her were those her answers to those questions 13 at the deposition. I mean, what's the point? Then you go to 14 the declaration. I mean, how am I to view the deposition? Is 15 the deposition in evidence? 16 MS. CHEN: Hers is not, Your Honor. 17 THE COURT: Then what evidentiary value does it have 18 unless she agrees that the questions that you asked and the 19 answers she gave, in fact, were her answers? 20 MS. CHEN: Then, Your Honor, at this time I would 21 like to approach the court and give her a copy of the 22 deposition transcript. 2.3 THE COURT: All right. 24 Generally speaking, in these kinds of matters, the 25 parties stipulate that the depositions are correct and

```
1
     accurate. Why hasn't there been such an agreement here?
 2
               MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor, in fact, we object to this
 3
     deposition.
               THE COURT: On the ground that you just gave?
 4
 5
               MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
               THE COURT: Well, other than that, is the transcript
 6
 7
     correct?
               MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor, I don't believe it's
 8
 9
     correct.
10
               THE COURT: All right. Then why isn't it correct?
     What basis do you have for believing the transcript is not
11
12
     correct other than your contention that she wasn't properly
13
     represented?
14
               MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor, I do not believe at this
15
     time that she was represented. I misspoke before. I believe
16
     her son was represented, I don't think she was represented.
17
     She is not a party.
               THE COURT: Well, even if she wasn't, why is that a
18
19
     basis to strike the deposition?
20
               MR. HOFFMAN: I have serious concerns about whether
21
     she understood the questions and about the translation.
22
               THE COURT: But there was a translator present,
2.3
     wasn't there?
               MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
24
25
               THE COURT: And then if there's an objection being
```

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

```
made to the authenticity of the deposition, then if -- and if
you're the proponent of the deposition, Ms. Chen, then you have
to introduce independent evidence that may allow foundation.
That would include the court reporter and the translator.
         MS. CHEN: Your Honor, if I may, I believe this
witness has agreed that she did state what I just said. So I
don't actually believe --
          THE COURT: When did she say that?
         MS. CHEN: I believe just on the stand, Your Honor.
I asked her during the deposition, isn't it true she stated she
did nothing to try to change her son's birth year, and I
believe her answer was yes. And I asked her isn't it a fact
that you just -- you stated you gave the birth certificate to
your son and didn't do anything with -- and don't know what he
did with it? She said yes. Based on that record, I don't
believe I need to actually introduce the deposition to see if
she --
          THE COURT: Well, if those are the points you feel
are germane, then absent a further foundation for the
deposition, I can accept her answers here, but I can't accept
her answers with regard to parts of the deposition for which
there is no foundation or testimony from her agreeing that she
said what you asked.
         All right. Proceed.
```

```
1
     BY MS. CHEN:
       Mrs. Demirchyan, do you have -- is there a cousin by the
 3
     name of Hovhannes Kachanyan?
               THE COURT: How do you spell that name?
 4
 5
              MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I believe it's H --
 6
               THE WITNESS: Yes --
 7
              MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I apologize. It's
 8
     H-o-v-h-a-n-n-e-s, K-a-c-h-a-n-y-a-n.
 9
               THE COURT: What is the question again?
10
               MS. CHEN: Was whether or not she had -- there was a
11
     cousin by that name in the family.
12
               THE WITNESS: Yes, there was.
    BY MS. CHEN:
13
14
     Q. And just finally, Mrs. Demirchyan --
15
               THE COURT: Can I have that spelling once again,
16
    please?
17
              MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. I believe this is the
18
     correct spelling: The first name is H-o-v-h-a-n-n-e-s, last
19
     name is K-a-c-h-a-n-y-a-n.
20
               THE COURT: Okay. All right.
21
    BY MS. CHEN:
     Q. Mrs. Demirchyan, just finally, just a few more questions,
22
23
     in your declaration, specifically paragraphs 23 to 25, you
     describe going to Armenia to get the 1997 birth certificate
24
25
     authenticated, correct?
```

- 1 A. No, I didn't go in '97.
- 2 Q. What year did you go? Was it 2000?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And you were asked to get it authenticated, correct?
- 5 A. Yes, to authenticate the '97 certificate.
- 6 Q. And you brought with you the original of that 1997 birth
- 7 | certificate, correct?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And again, this is the birth certificate that you obtained
- 10 from Armenia in 1997, correct?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And you state in your declaration -- correct me if I'm
- 13 wrong -- that when you went back to Armenia, they re-issued a
- 14 | new birth certificate with a 2000 year, correct?
- 15 A. How is that? Say it again, please.
- 16 Q. Sure. In paragraph 25 of your declaration, you state that
- 17 they took the old one --
- THE COURT: Who is "they"?
- 19 MS. CHEN: I believe, Your Honor, it's officials in
- 20 the --
- 21 THE COURT: Well, then --
- MS. CHEN: -- city hall.
- 23 THE COURT: -- specify whatever the party is.
- MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 25 Q. Mrs. Demirchyan, in paragraph 25 of your declaration, you

- 1 state that an official in the city hall in Yerevan took the old
- 2 one and told you that a new one needed to be re-issued; is that
- 3 correct?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. So, in other words, they took the original of the 1997 and
- 6 | re-issued a new one with the year 2000; is that correct?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I have no further questions.
- 9 THE COURT: All right. Any further questions?

10 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

- 11 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 12 Q. Good morning, Ms. Demirchyan.
- 13 A. Good morning.
- 14 Q. Now, Ms. Chen asked you several questions relating to the
- 15 affidavit that you filed.
- 16 Do you have a memory of the 1997 birth certificate?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. And what was your first attempt to try to obtain
- 19 that birth certificate?
- 20 A. My first attempt, that I called my neighbor in Armenia.
- 21 Q. Okay. What was the name of that neighbor?
- 22 A. Lusik, Lusine or Lusineh. We call her by those three
- 23 names.
- 24 Q. And how did you know this individual?
- 25 A. My neighbor across the way.

- 1 Q. Okay. And was she able to obtain that birth certificate?
- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. And why not?
- 4 A. There was an earthquake in the country. There was war in
- 5 | the country, and the Soviet Union had collapsed.
- 6 Q. And why did you wait until 1997 to get the birth
- 7 certificate?
- 8 A. I always wanted to change it. I was in touch. I called
- 9 once in awhile to have it changed.
- 10 Q. Okay. Why were you not able to get it before 1997?
- 11 A. In '95 or '96, between that time, I'm not sure, Lucy
- 12 committed suicide.
- 13 Q. And when she committed suicide, did you ask anyone else to
- 14 get the document?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Who else did you ask?
- 17 A. Our neighbor, Asatur Guyumjyan.
- 18 Q. And what exactly did you ask Mr. Asatur Guyumjyan?
- 19 A. I asked him, "Can you get my son's birth certificate from
- 20 the archive?"
- 21 Q. And why did you need the birth certificate from the
- 22 archive?
- 23 A. Because he had lost the original.
- Q. Okay. Did you give to Asatur anything to enable him to do
- 25 that?

- 1 A. I sent a power of attorney.
- 2 | Q. Okay. And then what did Asatur do with that power of
- 3 attorney?
- 4 A. He took it to our -- our area's registration and got the
- 5 birth certificate.
- 6 Q. Okay. Which office specifically, which office did he take
- 7 it to in Armenia?
- MS. CHEN: Objection, Your Honor --
- 9 THE COURT: You're asking hearsay questions. I mean,
- 10 you're asking her to relate what was told to her by Asatur
- 11 allegedly. So he's going to testify, isn't he?
- MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 13 THE COURT: Why don't we wait to hear what he has to
- 14 say.
- MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 16 Q. After Asatur obtained the document, what did he do with
- 17 it?
- 18 THE COURT: Well, it's the same line of questioning.
- 19 I mean, she has no firsthand knowledge of this.
- 20 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 21 Q. Well, let me ask: Did you instruct him to do anything
- 22 with it?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. What were your instructions?
- 25 A. Our relative over in Armenia said a tourist was coming,

```
1
     and we told Asatur to take it to him. So they send it via the
     tourist. It was an acquaintance of Hovhannes.
 3
     Q. Okay. Just so I understand, who contacted Hovhannes
     Kachanyan?
 5
               THE COURT: I mean, so you understand is not helpful
 6
     to me. I have to understand.
 7
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
 8
               THE COURT: And you're not laying a foundation.
 9
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
10
         Who did you instruct to bring the birth certificate to the
11
     United States?
12
               THE COURT: Isn't the question who did you tell
13
     Asatur to give the certificate to, to bring it to the United
     States? Isn't that what --
14
15
              MR. HOFFMAN: If anyone. Yes, Your Honor.
16
               THE COURT: All right.
17
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor. If I may rephrase the
18
     question?
19
               THE COURT: I'll let that question stand.
20
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
21
               THE COURT: Answer the question.
22
               THE WITNESS: Can you ask it one more time?
2.3
               THE COURT: Who did Susanna Demirchyan tell -- what
     name did she give to Asatur to deliver the birth certificate --
24
25
     to have the birth certificate delivered to the United States?
```

1 THE WITNESS: Hovhannes Kachanyan. THE COURT: All right. 3 MR. HOFFMAN: Thank you, Your Honor. 4 And what did Hovhannes do with it -- how did he get to the 5 United States ultimately? THE COURT: There is no foundation for that. You can 6 7 ask her whether Kachanyan gave her the birth certificate, but I 8 don't know how she can say whether she took a boat or a plane 9 or where she put it. So just ask. 10 BY MR. HOFFMAN: 11 Q. Did you receive the birth certificate from Hovhannes Kachanyan? 12 13 I got it from the tourist. 14 Q. Okay. And --15 THE COURT: Was it -- is the tourist someone other 16 than Kachanyan? 17 THE WITNESS: Person who was coming here. Kachanyan 18 stayed there. 19 THE COURT: So what I'm understanding, and ask her to 20 confirm, is that her testimony is that she gave a power of 21 attorney to Asatur to get the 1997 birth certificate; that 22 Asatur told her that he obtained it; that Asatur, at her 23 instruction, gave the birth certificate to someone named 24 Kachanyan, and Kachanyan gave it to a tourist who is coming to

the United States to deliver it to her.

```
1
               Is that what happened?
               THE WITNESS: I don't know who gave it to who. But
 3
     it was Hovhannes' acquaintance --
 4
               THE COURT: Let's call it Kachanyan.
 5
               THE WITNESS: Okay.
 6
               THE COURT: So why was Kachanyan necessary? Why
 7
     couldn't Asatur give it to the tourist? Why is Kachanyan a
 8
     necessary link?
 9
               THE WITNESS: At that moment, it was his acquaintance
10
     who was coming.
11
               THE COURT: It was Kachanyan's acquaintance.
12
               THE WITNESS: Yes.
13
               THE COURT: I see. So it went from Asatur to
14
     Kachanyan to the tourist?
15
               THE WITNESS: I don't know if together or he gave it
16
     to him. I don't know.
17
               THE COURT: I see.
               THE WITNESS: I wasn't there.
18
19
               THE COURT: But did the tourist give the certificate
20
     to her?
21
               THE WITNESS: Yes.
               THE COURT: And what was the name of the tourist?
22
2.3
               THE WITNESS: They didn't tell me their name.
               THE COURT: And where was the birth certificate
24
25
     delivered?
```

```
1
               THE WITNESS: They gave our name and our phone
     number. They called and brought it to us.
 3
               THE COURT: And is there testimony that this unnamed
 4
     tourist brought it to her house?
 5
               THE WITNESS: I don't know if we met someplace or
 6
     they came or I went.
 7
               THE COURT: She doesn't remember the circumstances of
 8
     getting the birth certificate?
 9
               THE WITNESS: No, I don't remember.
10
               THE COURT: Is that correct, she doesn't remember?
11
               THE WITNESS: Yes, I don't remember.
               THE COURT: All right. Okay. Thank you. Let's take
12
     the morning recess.
13
14
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
15
                               (Recess)
16
               THE COURT: So where were we? You had a few more
17
    questions.
18
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor. Just a few more
19
    questions.
20
     Q. So after you received the birth certificate, what did you
    do with it?
21
22
         I gave it to my son.
2.3
        Okay. And what did your son do with it?
     Q.
24
               THE COURT: Again, I mean, you have to lay a
25
    foundation. If she was present when he did something with it,
```

- 1 then she can testify; otherwise, it's not helpful.
- 2 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 3 Q. Did you -- did you personally do anything with the birth
- 4 | certificate with your son?
- 5 THE COURT: I don't know what that means, "anything."
- 6 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 7 | Q. Did -- what did you do with the birth certificate with
- 8 your son?
- 9 THE COURT: That assumes that she did something. She
- 10 said she gave the birth certificate to her son. Does she --
- 11 did she -- I mean, ask her a question, did she ever see the
- 12 birth certificate again.
- 13 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 14 Q. Did you ever see the birth --
- THE COURT: When was the next time she saw it?
- 16 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 17 Q. Did you ever see the birth certificate again?
- 18 A. At the time that I went with my son to immigration.
- 19 Q. Okay. And what happened at that point?
- THE COURT: When was that?
- 21 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- Q. When was that?
- 23 A. In '97.
- 24 Q. Okay. And --
- 25 THE COURT: What did you see your son do with the

```
1
     birth certificate, if anything?
               MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
 3
               THE WITNESS: He showed at immigration to the person
     at the front desk.
 4
 5
               MR. HOFFMAN: Okay.
               THE COURT: You were there?
 6
 7
    BY MR. HOFFMAN:
 8
          And you were present?
     Q.
 9
          I was next to him.
     Α.
10
               THE COURT: Did she hear what the person at the front
     desk said to her son, if anything? Yes or no?
11
12
               THE WITNESS: Yes.
13
               THE COURT: What did she hear him say?
14
               THE WITNESS: I didn't understand totally, but what I
15
     understood was that we are giving an address.
16
               THE COURT: Was the person speaking in English or in
17
     Armenian?
18
               THE WITNESS: English.
               THE COURT: And based upon the translator's presence
19
20
     here, does Susanna Demirchyan understand English?
21
               THE INTERPRETER: To my limited knowledge, I believe
     she has limited understanding.
22
2.3
               THE COURT: Is that what she is saying?
               THE INTERPRETER: I don't know.
24
25
               THE COURT: That is the question. Can she understand
```

```
1
     English?
               THE WITNESS: I don't understand --
 3
               THE COURT: All right.
               THE WITNESS: -- a hundred percent.
 5
              THE COURT: Okay.
 6
    BY MR. HOFFMAN:
 7
     Q. Mrs. Demirchyan, in your affidavit, paragraph 22, you say
     that you stood in a very long line and you discussed the trip
 8
    to the INS office.
10
        Yes.
     Α.
11
         And paragraph 22 says you did not get the original back
     Q.
     from INS until the 2000 immigration court hearing; is that
12
13
     correct?
14
               THE COURT: "The original" being the 1997
15
    certificate, correct?
16
              MR. HOFFMAN: Correct.
17
       Is that correct?
    Q.
18
     Α.
        No.
     Q. Okay. Can you explain why that may not be correct?
19
20
               THE COURT: What may not be correct, what she said in
21
    her declaration or --
22
              MR. HOFFMAN: Correct. I think there's a
23
    misunderstanding in the declaration --
24
               THE COURT: All right. Then if you want her to
25
     explain what she said in -- is it paragraph 22?
```

```
1
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
               THE COURT: Then she can do that.
 3
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
               THE WITNESS: Should I look at it now?
 4
 5
               THE COURT: Yes.
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, you may.
 6
 7
               THE WITNESS: Do I speak now?
 8
               THE COURT: Yes.
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes.
 9
10
               THE WITNESS: I'm going to speak?
               THE COURT: Yes.
11
12
               THE WITNESS: Explain it to me again, please. Again.
    BY MR. HOFFMAN:
13
14
       Paragraph 22 states that "We did not get the original back
15
    from INS until the 2000 immigration court hearing."
16
               Would you like to explain that?
17
        Not the original. Probably I meant the translation.
    Α.
18
          Okay. Did your son take --
     Q.
19
          The -- the translated certified.
     Α.
20
          Okay. Just for clarity, for the court to understand, did
     Q.
21
     your son take the original back in 1997?
               THE COURT: Back from where?
22
    BY MR. HOFFMAN:
2.3
24
    Q. From the INS officer, when he showed it to the INS
25
     officer.
```

```
1
               THE COURT: We're now focused on this event where the
     witness and her son are present --
 3
              MR. HOFFMAN: Correct.
 4
               THE COURT: -- and you're asking whether the son
 5
     received something back from the immigration officer.
 6
               MR. HOFFMAN: Correct, Your Honor.
 7
               THE COURT: Is that the question?
 8
               MR. HOFFMAN: Whether he received the original back
 9
     or he sent the original away in 1997. I just -- I think it's
10
     important for the court to understand the chain of custody of
11
     the original.
12
               THE COURT: I'm trying to understand that, and I'm
13
     trying to understand what part of it she witnessed and what she
14
     didn't. So thus far, I'm focused on that window at the
15
     immigration office --
16
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
17
               THE COURT: -- where she presented the 19 -- or son
18
     presented the 1997 birth certificate, and it wasn't received.
19
     That's what I understand, correct? It was not received.
20
     That's what she is saying.
21
              MR. HOFFMAN: That's correct.
22
               THE COURT: That's what she is saying?
2.3
              MR. KURZBAN: That's correct.
24
              MR. HOFFMAN: That's correct.
25
               THE COURT: Yes. So did your son leave that window
```

```
or that office with the 1997 birth certificate?
 1
               THE WITNESS: He left there -- there was also a blue
 3
     piece of paper with a -- with a birth certificate.
 4
               THE COURT: And so did she witness her son giving
 5
     that certificate to someone else or sending it to someone else?
 6
     Did she personally witness that, other than what her son told
 7
     her?
 8
               THE WITNESS: No, I didn't see him send the original
 9
     anywhere.
10
               THE COURT: All right.
               MR. HOFFMAN: Okay. Thank you, Your Honor.
11
12
          Did there come a time when your son asked you to provide
     Q.
13
     him with the original?
14
     Α.
          Yes.
15
     Q.
         And what happened?
16
         He had it translated in English to send it to the
17
     immigration -- some address at immigration.
18
         No, no. My question is: Did there come a time that your
19
     son asked you to provide the original to him?
20
               THE COURT: You know something --
21
               THE WITNESS: I gave it.
22
               THE COURT: One minute. You know, this is important
23
     for me to follow, and chronologically I can't follow it because
     the testimony from this witness is that when she left the
24
25
     immigration office with her son, after the immigration office
```

```
didn't accept the birth certificate, he maintained possession
 1
     of the birth certificate; is that true?
 3
              MR. HOFFMAN: Correct, Your Honor.
               THE COURT: Is that true?
 4
 5
               THE WITNESS: I don't know. He had to have it
 6
    translated. They didn't take --
 7
               THE COURT: I'm not talking about translating. When
 8
     she got the certificate -- when the certificate was not
 9
     accepted by immigration --
10
               THE WITNESS: Yes.
11
               THE COURT: -- who took the birth certificate back
12
     with them, her son or Mrs. Demirchyan?
13
               THE WITNESS: Well, we live together. It was in the
14
    box.
15
               THE COURT: So, is she saying that the birth
16
     certificate was placed in a box in her house?
17
               THE WITNESS: Yeah, we were living together.
18
               THE COURT: Is that where the birth certificate was,
     in a box in the house?
19
20
               THE WITNESS: Yes.
21
               THE COURT: All right. So what was the next
22
    question?
    BY MR. HOFFMAN:
2.3
24
    Q. When was the next time that you saw that birth
25
     certificate?
```

- A. When Arutyun was in proceedings in Arizona, immigration.
- Q. Did you give this document to anyone in Arizona?
- THE COURT: What year is that?
- 4 MR. HOFFMAN: Well, it's 2000, but I can ask her.
- 5 THE COURT: All right, 2000.
- THE WITNESS: 2000, yes.
- 7 BY MR. HOFFMAN:

- 8 Q. Did you ever give the document to anyone in 2000?
- 9 THE COURT: "Document" meaning the 1997 birth
- 10 certificate?
- MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 12 THE WITNESS: Gave it to our -- our lawyer, to
- 13 Mr. Crow.
- 14 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 15 Q. Okay. When is the next time you saw that birth
- 16 certificate?
- 17 A. When the judge during the hearing gave it to me.
- 18 Q. And why did he give it to you?
- 19 THE COURT: This is the immigration judge?
- MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 21 THE WITNESS: Immigration judge.
- 22 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 23 Q. And why did he give it to you?
- 24 A. He said take this and have it authenticated. It is not
- 25 authenticated.

- Q. Okay. And did you do that --
- THE COURT: Is this on the record?
- MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor. This is part of the
- 4 record and it's a --
- 5 THE COURT: If it's on the record, why do I have to
- 6 hear it from her? I mean, it was done. I accept that. Move
- 7 on.

- 8 MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 9 Q. Did you then take it and get it authenticated in Armenia?
- 10 A. Yeah.
- 11 Q. And what did you do in Armenia to get it authenticated?
- 12 A. First I went to the American consulate.
- MR. HOFFMAN: Can you repeat that, translator?
- 14 THE INTERPRETER: First I went to the American
- 15 consulate.
- 16 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 17 Q. Okay. And what did they tell you there?
- 18 A. They said you have to take it and have it apostilled.
- 19 Q. Okay. Where would she go to do that?
- 20 A. Ministry of Justice in Armenia.
- 21 Q. And did she go to Ministry of Justice?
- THE COURT: Did you, the witness.
- 23 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- Q. Did you, Mrs. Demirchyan, go to the Ministry of Justice?
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. In what city was that?
- 2 A. Yerevan.
- 3 Q. Okay. And at the Ministry of Justice in Yerevan, what did
- 4 they tell you?
- 5 A. They said this certificate is not from the central
- 6 | archives; you have to go to the central archives to get one.
- 7 Q. Okay. Why was it not from the central archives? Do you
- 8 know where it was from?
- 9 A. It was from our neighborhood -- it was received from
- 10 there.
- 11 Q. I'm sorry?
- 12 THE INTERPRETER: From our neighborhood thing, it was
- 13 received from there, the certificate.
- 14 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 15 Q. Okay. And they told you -- did you go to the central
- 16 archives?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. What happened at the central archives?
- 19 A. I said, "Please give me Demirchyan, Arutyan's, 1997 birth
- 20 certificate.
- 21 Q. Okay. What condition was this birth certificate in?
- THE COURT: You know, I can't follow -- one moment,
- one moment. I can't follow what you're trying to develop.
- MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor. I'm going to get
- 25 there.

1 THE COURT: I'm interested in knowing when she went to the archives, did she present this 1997 birth certificate. 3 MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor. 4 THE COURT: And the way you've asked the question, it 5 allows the inference that she just asked for a new birth 6 certificate. 7 MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor. 8 THE COURT: So it's unclear. 9 BY MR. HOFFMAN: 10 Q. Did you present --11 MR. HOFFMAN: Thank you, Your Honor. 12 Did you present the 1997 birth certificate at the central Q. 13 archives? 14 Α. Yes. 15 Q. Okay. And what did they tell you? 16 They gave me a new one. 17 Okay. And what happened to the old one? Q. They took it. 18 Α. 19 Why did they take it? Q. 20 Α. I don't know. 21 Okay. Did you have any idea why they took it? Q. 22 THE COURT: That's not a helpful question. 2.3 MR. HOFFMAN: Strike that. 24 What was the condition of the document? Q.

THE COURT: What document?

25

- 1 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 2 Q. What was the condition of the 1997 birth certificate?
- THE COURT: "Condition" meaning physical condition?
- 4 MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 5 THE WITNESS: It was a bit torn and it seemed like
- 6 | the stamp on it didn't appear clearly. It wasn't clear.
- 7 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 8 Q. Were you provided a choice to keep the document or did you
- 9 have to provide the 1997 birth certificate back to the central
- 10 archives?
- 11 A. They didn't tell me anything. They took it. I don't
- 12 know.
- 13 Q. Okay. Thank you.
- How many birth certificates did you request that day?
- 15 A. Two.
- 16 Q. Okay. Why did you request two?
- 17 A. Because I obtained it with such difficulty. I thought
- 18 | that let one stay with me.
- 19 Q. Okay. And what did you receive from the central archives
- 20 that day?
- 21 A. Two birth certificates. One is the birth certificate; one
- 22 | is a copy. Do they call it a copy -- a duplicate.
- 23 Q. Okay. I would like to show you Exhibit 108.
- MS. CHEN: Your Honor, the government does object.
- 25 That is an exhibit that's already been declared inadmissible by

```
1
     this court in its September 2011 findings of fact, conclusions
     of law.
 3
               THE COURT: What is Exhibit 108?
               MS. CHEN: I believe, Your Honor, it is a birth
 4
     certificate that was issued in 2000. Apparently it's the one
 5
 6
     that was reissued to her during this trip.
 7
               THE COURT: Well, I mean, she can testify to it. I
 8
    mean, the question of its authenticity remains, but she can
 9
     say, for whatever value it has, that she got this birth
10
     certificate.
11
              MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
12
               THE COURT: It's agreed that she got -- 108 is the
13
     birth certificate she received, so she testified --
14
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
               THE COURT: -- in Armenia in 2000.
15
16
               MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor, and I would like her
17
     to look at it to make sure this is the one that the court has
18
     in its file and the one that she got from Armenia, because
19
     there's two.
20
               THE COURT: All right.
21
              MR. HOFFMAN: Does she have 108 in front of her right
22
     now? There was some confusion, Your Honor, because 108 was not
23
     part of our record that we have. And I think Ms. Chen doesn't
24
     have --
25
               THE COURT: What record? What record? Counsel, what
```

```
record are you talking about?
 1
 2
               MR. HOFFMAN: In the exhibit book it seems to stop at
 3
     107. So I'm not sure what the court reviewed.
 4
               THE COURT: What exhibit book? What hearing are you
 5
     referring to?
 6
              MR. KURZBAN: If I may explain, Your Honor. What
 7
     happened is apparently the last lawyers at the very end
 8
     provided you what did become Exhibit 108. You ruled on the
 9
     admissibility because you were concerned at that time that the
10
     document did not have the proper authentication and you ruled
11
     that it was not admissible. Ms. Chen had a copy of it this
12
     morning. We never got the copy. So we provided it this
13
     morning, and she has it in front of her. It's 108.
14
               THE COURT: So 108, as identified in these
15
     proceedings, is represented to be the birth certificate that
16
     this witness received from the archives in Armenia.
17
              MR. KURZBAN: That's correct, Your Honor.
18
               THE COURT: All right. Then she can look at it and
19
     say if it is.
20
               Now, is there any question about what 108 is? Do you
21
     want to see it?
22
              MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I did provide a copy.
23
               THE COURT: I see. So that she can look at it and
24
     say yes or no.
25
              MS. CHEN: And, Your Honor, just for clarity of the
```

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

12

15

16

19

20

- record, while counsel did say that they did not receive a copy, they did not receive a copy of that birth certificate labeled as Exhibit 108, but it was produced to them in discovery, including in a FOIA request production. THE COURT: All right. MR. HOFFMAN: That's correct. THE CLERK: Exhibit 108 placed before the witness. BY MR. HOFFMAN: Mrs. Demirchyan, are you looking at a birth certificate? Q. 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. Okay. Is the first page a general authentication certificate that you're looking at? 13 THE COURT: Actually, you're asking her legal 14 questions. Isn't the point just to say -- just to ask her whether, in looking at 108, she can say that is what she received from the archives; isn't that the point? 17 MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor, but 108 has several 18 pages. THE COURT: Then ask her if each of these pages is what she received. Don't ask her to describe the legal 21 significance of things. MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor. Did you receive the first page of this document entitled
- 22
- 23
- 24 "General Authentication Certificate"?
- 25 THE COURT: From the archives.

- 1 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 2 Q. Well, from the archives or from another office in Armenia?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. Okay. Just so we're clear, we're looking at the General
- 5 Authentication Certificate.
- 6 A. I got this one.
- 7 Q. Where did you -- what do you mean by "this one"?
- 8 A. The birth certificate written in Armenian.
- 9 Q. Okay. And what is the issuance date or the date of
- 10 registration?
- 11 A. November 23 or 20, it doesn't show -- or 29 or 23.
- 12 THE COURT: What year?
- THE WITNESS: 2000, November.
- MR. HOFFMAN: Okay.
- 15 Q. Do you have a translation in front of you?
- 16 A. No. It's Armenian.
- 17 Q. You don't have a translation in English?
- 18 A. There isn't a translation, yes.
- 19 Q. Okay. And so the date of -- what is the date of issue on
- 20 the translation?
- 21 A. Yeah, 23, November 23.
- MS. CHEN: Your Honor, objection. I believe the
- 23 | witness does not read English. So I would object based on lack
- 24 of personal knowledge.
- MR. HOFFMAN: She can read the numbers --

```
1
               THE COURT: Don't respond to each other. I mean, it
     is what it is. I mean, she is identifying it. If that's what
 3
     it says, it says it.
               THE WITNESS: November.
 5
               THE COURT: All right.
               MR. HOFFMAN: All right.
 6
 7
         Are there any other -- do the other pages in that
 8
     exhibit -- have you seen them before?
 9
          I have seen them; I haven't read them.
    Α.
10
     Q. Okay.
11
               THE COURT: Were the other pages in the exhibit,
12
     other than the birth certificate, pages that she received from
13
     the archives or some other office in Armenia in or about
14
    November 2000. That's the question.
15
               MR. HOFFMAN: That's the question.
16
     Q. Are the other pages that you --
17
               THE COURT: Don't ask the question because you'll
18
     confuse it.
19
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, sir.
20
               THE COURT: Answer my question.
21
               THE WITNESS: What do I answer?
22
               THE COURT: Read back my question.
2.3
               (Court's question read.)
               THE WITNESS: I'm talking about this one. I only got
24
25
     this one from the archive.
```

- 1 THE COURT: "This one" meaning only the birth
- 2 certificate?
- THE WITNESS: The birth certificate, yes.
- THE COURT: And have her identify, in Exhibit 108,
- 5 | what page in that exhibit she is identifying by way of
- 6 consecutive pages.
- 7 THE WITNESS: Nine.
- 8 THE COURT: All right then. Page nine is the only
- 9 page -- the only part of that document that she received.
- 10 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 11 Q. Okay. What did you do with the birth certificate after
- 12 you received it from the central archives?
- 13 A. I took it to the justice ministry and had it
- 14 authenticated.
- 15 Q. Of which country?
- 16 A. In Armenia, Yerevan.
- 17 Q. Okay. And did they do that?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And where did you take it after that, if anywhere?
- 20 A. I took it to the consulate again, American.
- 21 Q. And is that reflected in any of these documents in
- 22 Exhibit 108?
- 23 A. One minute. It's right in here?
- 24 Q. Yes.
- 25 A. Here it says "Written consulate" here. Page 220.

```
1
               THE COURT: What page is she referring to?
               THE INTERPRETER: Page 220.
 3
               THE COURT: Page what?
               THE INTERPRETER: 220.
 5
               THE COURT: Of what exhibit? Exhibit 108?
 6
               THE INTERPRETER: 108, Your Honor.
 7
               THE COURT: Okay. So the answer to her question
 8
     regarding whether, what, she received something from the
 9
     American consulate?
10
               MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
11
               THE COURT: Her answer is yes, and it's reflected in
12
    page 220 of Exhibit 108.
13
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes.
14
               THE WITNESS: Yes.
15
               THE COURT: All right.
16
               MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor. Page 220 refers to
17
     the FOIA stamp -- Bates stamp at the bottom right-hand side of
18
     the page.
19
               THE COURT: Whatever it is, she's identified it.
20
               MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
21
         And last question, what did you do with these documents
22
     that you just identified after that?
2.3
               THE COURT: What documents?
24
    BY MR. HOFFMAN:
25
         What did you do with Exhibit -- the documents in
     Q.
```

```
Exhibit 108? What did you do with them at that point?
 1
               THE COURT: At what point -- one minute. At what
 3
     point?
    BY MR. HOFFMAN:
 5
     Q. After the embassy.
 6
               THE COURT: All right.
 7
               THE WITNESS: I brought it and presented it to the
 8
     judge in Arizona.
     BY MR. HOFFMAN:
 9
10
        And did he accept it?
     Q.
11
     A. Yes.
12
     Q. Okay.
13
              MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor, no further questions.
14
               THE COURT: All right. Any further questions?
15
              MS. CHEN: Not for this witness, Your Honor.
16
               THE COURT: I was interested in knowing whether there
17
     was any evidence, one way or the other, regarding her presence
18
     in Armenia at this time period. Is there? Has the plaintiff
19
     presented any evidence of her being in Armenia?
20
              MS. CHEN: Your Honor, we have not received any plane
     tickets or stubs or any travel documents to confirm that.
21
22
               THE COURT: What about passport references? Has that
23
     been presented?
24
              MS. CHEN: It has not, Your Honor.
25
               THE COURT: Isn't that a matter of some curiosity?
```

```
1
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
 2
               MR. HOFFMAN: Your Honor, we'll be happy to present
 3
     those documents. We looked for those --
 4
               THE COURT: I mean, it seems to me that that --
 5
               MR. KURZBAN: Let them check.
               THE COURT: -- would be helpful to your case to
 6
 7
     present some evidence that she was in Armenia at those times.
 8
               MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
 9
               THE COURT: And knows places. I'm surprised --
10
     actually, I'm surprised on -- with regard to both parties.
11
     Seems to me if there is evidence, the proponents would want to
12
     introduce it. If there isn't, the government would want to
13
     point that out or show that the passport doesn't confirm that
14
     she was there. The fact that no one has even explored this is
15
     surprising.
16
               All right. We'll take the lunch.
17
               Do you have any -- you have no further questions.
18
     Who is the next witness?
19
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I believe there's two
20
     witnesses left, including Asatur Guyumjyan.
21
               THE COURT: All right. Then have Asatur on the stand
22
     at 1:15. Take the lunch break.
2.3
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
24
              MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
25
               (Noon recess)
```

```
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA; WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 24, 2012;
 1
                               1:40 P.M.
 3
 5
               THE CLERK: Item 1, CV 08-3452-SVW, Arutyan
 6
     Demirchyan v. Alberto R. Gonzalez.
 7
               Counsel, please state your appearances.
 8
              MS CHEN: Once again, Carol Chen for the United
 9
     States. Also present at counsel's table is ICE senior attorney
10
     Jillian Woods.
11
               MR. HOFFMAN: Geoffrey Hoffman for the petitioner.
12
              MS. CHEN: We're ready with the next witness.
13
               I believe the next witness is Asatur Guyumjyan, and
14
     again for the court reporter, first name is A-s-a-t-u-r, last
15
     name is G-u-y-u-m-j-y-a-n.
16
               MR. HOFFMAN: We before take the next witness, may I
17
     raise an objection regarding exhibits?
18
               THE COURT: Not right now.
19
               MR. HOFFMAN: Thank you, Your Honor.
20
               MS. CHEN: I believe I did get two copies of
21
    Mr. Guyumjyan's declaration to your court clerk.
22
               THE COURT: Okay.
2.3
               THE CLERK: Please stand behind the court reporter.
               (Witness sworn through the interpreter)
24
25
               THE WITNESS: Yes.
```

```
1
               THE CLERK: Please be seated.
               State your full name and spell it for the record.
 3
               THE WITNESS: Asatur Guyumjyan, A-s-a-t-u-r, yeah,
 4
     and G-u-y-u-m-j-y-a-n.
 5
              MS. CHEN: May I proceed?
 6
               THE COURT: Yes.
 7
              MS. CHEN: Your Honor, by my calculation, his
 8
     declaration should be marked as Exhibit 4, I believe?
 9
               THE COURT: Yes.
10
               MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.
11
      ASATUR GUYUMJYAN; PETITIONER'S WITNESS, SWORN, TESTIFIED:
12
                  DIRECT EXAMINATION BY DECLARATION
13
                          CROSS-EXAMINATION
14
    BY MS. CHEN:
15
    Q. Mr. Guyumjyan, can you take a look at the document which
16
    has been marked for identification as Exhibit 4 in front of
17
    you.
18
       What is this?
19
          Do you recognize the two-paged document? Do you recognize
     Q.
20
     the signature on it on the second page?
    A. Yes.
21
       Is that your signature?
22
    Q.
2.3
        Yes.
    Α.
    Q. You are testifying today with an Armenian interpreter,
24
25
     correct?
```

1 Yes. Α. Are you able to read this two-page document which is in 3 the English language? You translated it for me. 4 Α. 5 Who translated for you? Q. 6 The interpreter. Α. 7 Is there --0. 8 I do note there's no interpreter or translation 9 attached to this document, Your Honor. This is the entire 10 document I received from -- off of what was filed from 11 petitioner. 12 THE COURT: Can the witness read this document, which 13 is in the English language? 14 THE WITNESS: Now this? No. 15 THE COURT: Is he able to read in the English 16 language? 17 THE WITNESS: I can read to a certain extent in 18 English. 19 THE COURT: Can he understand the affidavit he 20 submitted which is in the English language? 21 THE WITNESS: Yes, I understand the meaning. THE COURT: Does he understand the meaning because he 22 read the words and understands them or for some other reason? 2.3 24 THE WITNESS: Nothing complicated --25 THE COURT: Read the first paragraph.

```
1
               THE WITNESS: It's my name, last name, where I live.
               THE COURT: Read the second sentence.
 3
               THE WITNESS: It's my phone number, my address.
               THE COURT: Pretty obvious. Read paragraph -- read
 4
 5
     paragraph six.
 6
               THE WITNESS: I can't read it very well. That's
 7
     why ...
 8
               THE COURT: Read paragraph 11.
 9
               THE WITNESS: Eleven?
10
               THE COURT: Yes. Tell me what it says.
               THE WITNESS: I can understand what it is, but I
11
12
     can't read it.
13
               THE COURT: Well, I want him to read it.
14
               Tell me what it says.
15
               THE WITNESS: Eleven?
16
               THE COURT: Yes.
17
               Did you prepare this declaration in English?
18
               THE WITNESS: This declaration?
19
               THE COURT: Yes.
20
               THE WITNESS: Yeah, but they translated it for me,
21
     what is here.
               THE COURT: Where is the Armenian version of this?
22
2.3
              MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor, there is none. It was
     translated to him. In other words, the document was prepared;
24
25
     it was translated to him; he understood it; and he signed it.
```

- 1 It should have had -- I apologize. Obviously, it should have
- 2 had another line that said this document has been translated to
- 3 | me and in English from Armenian, but everything in it, as far
- 4 as we know, is accurate.
- 5 THE COURT: Well, then, he's here, so you can examine
- 6 him.
- 7 MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. Thank you.
- 8 Q. Sir, I want to be clear: So the second page, you do
- 9 recognize that as your signature, correct?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And your recollection is, again, that there was an
- 12 | interpreter in the -- who translated a document, a declaration
- 13 in the Armenian language for you?
- 14 A. Yes, because I signed it.
- 15 Q. You signed this document -- correct -- this two-page
- 16 document in the English language?
- 17 A. Yes, that's my signature.
- 18 Q. Did you ever sign a document in the Armenian language that
- 19 you understood to be this document?
- 20 A. I haven't seen an Armenian-language document.
- 21 Q. So let me ask you this, then. I'm going to ask you about
- 22 | specific paragraphs and have the interpreter today translate it
- 23 | for you. Now, I'm going to go to paragraph five.
- Ask, Your Honor, with the court's permission, to have
- 25 | the translator -- so there's no doubt -- have him translate it

```
1
     for the witness today?
               THE COURT: What was that?
 3
               MS. CHEN: I would like the interpreter to translate
 4
     on the record for the witness today paragraphs -- certain
 5
     paragraphs of his declaration.
 6
               THE COURT: Okay.
 7
     BY MS. CHEN:
 8
          The first paragraph is paragraph five.
     Q.
 9
               (Translator translates the document)
10
               THE WITNESS: Suicide, yes.
11
     BY MS. CHEN:
12
         Sir, is that -- based on what was just translated to you,
13
     is that truthful and accurate testimony based on your best
14
     recollection?
15
     A. Completely true.
16
               MS. CHEN: Ask the translator, with the court's
17
     permission, to translate paragraph six for the witness.
18
               (Translator translates the document)
19
               THE WITNESS: The mother, yes.
    BY MS. CHEN:
20
21
          Again, based on the interpreter's translation to you
22
     today, is that truthful and accurate testimony based on your
     best recollection?
2.3
24
     Α.
       Yes.
25
               MS. CHEN: Will the translator please translate
```

- 1 paragraph seven.
- 2 (Translator translates the document)
- 3 BY MS. CHEN:
- 4 Q. This is truthful and accurate testimony based on your best
- 5 | recollection; is that correct?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 MS. CHEN: Finally, ask the translator to translate
- 8 paragraph eight.
- 9 (Translator translates the document)
- MS. CHEN: Yes.
- 11 Q. Again, is this truthful and accurate testimony based on
- 12 your best recollection?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. In paragraph eight of the document marked for
- 15 | identification as Exhibit 4, you describe receiving a power of
- 16 attorney from Susanna, correct?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Can you describe what this power of attorney looked like.
- 19 A. A regular power of attorney indicated on it. I -- Susanna
- 20 Demirchyan, Susanna Demirchyan. I'm sorry.
- 21 Q. What language was this in?
- 22 A. At that time it was in English. We had it translated
- 23 there.
- 24 Q. Who is "we," sir?
- 25 A. Me.

- 1 Q. How did you get it translated?
- 2 A. You can do it in Armenia.
- 3 Q. Now, you state in your declaration that you went to the
- 4 | city hall in Yerevan, correct?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Did you live in Yerevan at that time?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 MS. CHEN: I'm going to ask the translator -- ask
- 9 the -- strike that.
- 10 Q. Sir, you also state in paragraph eight that you filled out
- 11 | some paperwork in order to obtain Mr. Demirchyan's birth
- 12 | certificate, correct?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. What kind of paperwork did you fill out?
- 15 A. My name, last name; where I live; the phone number of our
- 16 apartment, in order for them to get in touch with me after it's
- 17 prepared.
- 18 Q. Did you keep any copies of that paperwork?
- 19 A. No.
- 20 Q. Did they give you a receipt?
- 21 A. I didn't receive anything.
- 22 Q. Did you have to pay --
- 23 A. At that time there was no such receipts.
- Q. Did you have to pay for the birth certificate?
- 25 A. We paid but it was a trivial fee for the state fee.

- 1 MS. CHEN: I'm going to ask the translator to
- 2 translate for the witness paragraph nine.
- 3 (Translator translates the document)
- 4 THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 5 BY MS. CHEN:
- 6 Q. Ask you to turn to -- I believe there should be a copy at
- 7 | the witness stand -- what petitioner has labeled as
- 8 Exhibit 109.
- 9 A. What is this?
- 10 Q. Do you recognize -- it's a two-page document, correct?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Turning to the second page, sir, is that in the Armenian
- 13 language?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Is that the birth certificate you're referring to in
- 16 paragraph nine?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Is that the exact certificate, quote, unquote, which you
- 19 obtained from the city of Yerevan city hall?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. You state it's the exact certificate, correct?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Did you look at the document that you picked up from the
- 24 city hall?
- 25 A. Definitely, yes.

- 1 Q. Did you make a copy of it for yourself?
- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. And, sir, looking at the document again, this is the
- 4 Armenian version, you see that there's a number on the bottom,
- 5 correct?
- 6 A. I see that there's a number.
- 7 Q. And you also see that there's different lines of notations
- 8 | in the Armenian language; is that correct?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Did you jot down any of the numbers or the notations on
- 11 this document?
- 12 A. I did no notation.
- 13 Q. But you're sure this is the exact document you obtained in
- 14 | 1997, 15 years ago, correct?
- 15 A. It's in my memory because the stamp here is not complete,
- 16 and I asked them why isn't the stamp complete. They said
- 17 because the ink isn't dry. We don't have ink.
- 18 Q. Ask you to turn to the first page of that two-page
- 19 document, sir.
- 20 THE COURT: Before we proceed with the questioning, I
- 21 | observe in this affidavit, the alleged translation, there is no
- 22 date on the affidavit.
- 23 When was this affidavit prepared? When did you sign
- 24 this affidavit?
- THE WITNESS: Which one?

```
1
               THE COURT: The Exhibit 4, this declaration.
               THE WITNESS: I can't remember the date exactly.
 3
               THE COURT: How long ago?
               THE WITNESS: I can't remember.
 5
               THE COURT: Months ago?
               THE WITNESS: Probably a few months ago, but I can't
 6
 7
     say exactly.
 8
               THE COURT: Was it this year?
 9
               THE WITNESS: This year, yeah.
10
               THE COURT: How many months ago does he think it was?
               THE WITNESS: I don't want to make a mistake.
11
12
               THE COURT: He has no idea?
13
               THE WITNESS: Approximately -- probably five, six
14
    months ago.
15
               THE COURT: Okay. And before preparing this
16
     affidavit, when did you last see Exhibit 109?
17
               THE WITNESS: The last time today that I see it now.
18
     I hadn't seen it otherwise.
19
               THE COURT: Did he -- he saw the Exhibit 109 when he
20
    prepared this declaration; isn't that correct?
21
               THE WITNESS: Yes, because I saw this -- this is the
22
     document I sent, yes.
2.3
               THE COURT: But when did he see that document,
    Exhibit 104, before he saw it on the date that he signed the
24
25
     declaration? In other words, was it 15 years since he saw
```

```
1
     the ...
               THE WITNESS: I didn't see it beforehand. Why would
 3
     I see it beforehand?
 4
               THE COURT: Is the answer he hasn't seen it since he
 5
     obtained it in 2007 -- was it?
 6
               MS. CHEN: I believe it was 1997, Your Honor.
 7
               THE COURT: 1997.
 8
               THE WITNESS: No.
 9
               THE COURT: "No" meaning he hasn't seen it since
10
     1997?
11
               THE WITNESS: No.
12
               THE COURT: Okay. All right.
13
               MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.
14
          Staying on the same topic, sir, did you sign this
15
     English-language document in front of anybody?
16
     Α.
          The document I signed?
17
          That's correct, sir.
     Q.
18
     Α.
          Yes.
19
          Who did you sign it in front of?
     Q.
20
     Α.
        His mother was there; his brother was there.
21
               THE COURT: Anyone else?
               THE WITNESS: I don't remember. I don't remember.
22
23
     The same people were there, but I don't remember.
    BY MS. CHEN:
24
25
          Sir, do you remember where you signed this document at?
```

```
1
          Where I signed the document? I don't remember exactly
     Α.
     where it was.
 3
               THE COURT: Who prepared this document?
               THE WITNESS: I was trying to say what I remember
 4
 5
     this document --
 6
               THE COURT: Who wrote it out? This is a translation.
 7
     Who wrote it out in the Armenian language?
 8
               THE WITNESS: The notary.
 9
               THE COURT: The notary wrote out the declaration?
10
               THE WITNESS: It was all prepared. They brought it
11
     to -- I don't know how it was prepared.
12
               THE COURT: So, in other words, it was prepared for
13
    him to sign?
14
               THE WITNESS: Yeah. It was prepared. I don't know
15
     who prepared it.
16
               THE COURT: Did he discuss the contents of the
17
     declaration with anyone before he saw the declaration?
18
               THE WITNESS: Of course. I signed it. I have to
19
     know what I'm signing.
20
               THE COURT: Who did he discuss it with?
21
               THE WITNESS: Whoever translated the document to me.
22
               THE COURT: Who was that?
2.3
               THE WITNESS: Not a relative.
               THE COURT: Who is this -- do you know who Judith
24
25
     Prado is, the notary?
```

```
1
               THE WITNESS: No, I don't know the notary.
 2
               THE COURT: There is a facial suspicion about this
 3
     notary in that the -- a notary almost always says, This
 4
     document was signed and subscribed before me on a certain date.
 5
     That isn't present here in the stamp, and the declaration
 6
     itself is undated. So this declaration -- and I'm just making
 7
     the point for further comment -- is to me very suspicious.
 8
     This is not the way things are notarized, and declarations have
 9
     a date, and just putting a stamp on a document is not the way
10
     that notaries do things because the stamp means nothing. It's
11
     the notary's statement that the signature was signed and
12
     subscribed before me. So this declaration, to me, is, as the
13
     fact finder, is highly suspicious. That doesn't mean that I
14
     should necessarily reject the contents, but the declaration is.
15
               Go ahead.
16
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. Thank you.
               I'm going ask the translator to translate, while
17
18
     we're here, paragraph ten to the witness.
19
               (Translator translates the document)
20
               THE WITNESS: Yes.
21
     BY MS. CHEN:
22
        Does paragraph ten of the document marked for
23
     identification as Exhibit 4, is it your truthful and accurate
24
     testimony based on your best recollection?
25
          Yes.
     Α.
```

- 1 Q. Sir, did you in fact go to the city hall in Yerevan to go
- 2 | pick up the birth certificate?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Did you present any documentation to them to know that you
- 5 | were in fact the right person to give that birth certificate
- 6 to?
- 7 A. I showed my passport, my name and last name is written
- 8 there.
- 9 Q. At this point, had you already paid for the copy of the
- 10 birth certificate?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. You stated there were no receipts back then, correct?
- 13 A. Uh-huh.
- MS. CHEN: I'm going to ask the translator to
- 15 translate for the witness paragraph 11 of the document marked
- 16 for identification as Exhibit 4.
- 17 (Translator translates the document)
- THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 19 BY MS. CHEN:
- 20 Q. Again, paragraph 11, that's your entirely truthful and
- 21 | accurate testimony based on your best recollection?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Since it's the --
- 24 THE COURT: You're speaking too quickly.
- MS. CHEN: I apologize, Your Honor.

```
1
               Ask the translator to translate paragraph 12 or the
     witness.
 3
               (Translator translates the document)
 4
               THE WITNESS: How is that here?
 5
               THE INTERPRETER: Your Honor, may I read it again?
 6
     He is asking me to read it again.
 7
               THE COURT: Yes.
 8
               (Translator translates the document)
 9
               THE WITNESS: What is not written here: I went to
10
     see Hovhanness, his cousin. We went --
11
               THE COURT: No question pending. Just asked for --
12
     he translated paragraph 12. Now there should be a question, if
13
     you have one.
14
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
15
        Now that paragraph 12 has been translated for you, sir,
16
     does it represent your truthful and accurate testimony based on
17
     your best recollection?
18
          We sent it, yeah.
19
          Sir, so I understand your testimony, you obtained the
     Q.
20
     birth certificate that is Petitioner's Exhibit 109, correct?
21
     Α.
          Yes.
22
          You then found out about a person who was traveling to the
23
     United States, correct?
24
     Α.
          Yes.
```

What city was this person traveling to in the United

25

Q.

#:992

- 1 States?
- 2 A. From what I remember, United States -- they were going to
- 3 | come to Hollywood.
- 4 Q. How did you find out this person was coming to Hollywood?
- 5 A. At that time we were asking around who knows someone. At
- 6 | that time Arutyan's cousin, Hovhanness, he said there's someone
- 7 | who is going.
- 8 Q. Sir, just looking at your declaration -- again paragraphs
- 9 | 11 and 12 -- nowhere in there does it mention a cousin,
- 10 correct?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 Q. Sir, did you appear for this court appearance this
- 13 morning? In other words, did you come to this building this
- morning?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Have you spoken with any of the attorneys or any of the
- 17 | witnesses present prior to coming at 1:15?
- 18 MR. KURZBAN: Objection, Your Honor. It's vague. I
- 19 don't know if it means today or any time ever or ...
- THE COURT: What do you -- what is your question?
- 21 MS. CHEN: I'll clarify, Your Honor, hopefully.
- 22 Q. Between the time that you first came to the building this
- 23 morning and the time you took the stand today at 1:15, have you
- 24 spoken to anybody here in the courtroom, including
- 25 Mr. Demirchyan's attorneys, about your testimony you're

presenting right now?

- A. I haven't spoken to anything.
- 3 Q. Have you spoken to Mr. Demirchyan himself?
- 4 MR. KURZBAN: Objection, vague. Again, unless it
- 5 means today.

1

- THE COURT: Well, is that what you mean?
- 7 BY MS. CHEN:
- 8 Q. Again, Your Honor, between the time you came to the
- 9 building this morning and coming, sitting in the stand at
- 10 1:15 p.m., have you spoken with Mr. Demirchyan about your
- 11 | testimony you are presenting right now?
- 12 A. No.
- 13 Q. Paragraph 12, sir, states that soon after receiving the
- 14 birth certificate, you found out about this person coming to
- 15 Hollywood, correct?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Do you remember the name of this person, first of all?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. Can you describe this person?
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. Because it was 15 years ago?
- 22 A. It didn't -- not like that. It just didn't impress me.
- 23 Q. You stated in your paragraph 12 of your declaration that
- 24 you met this person at the airport, correct?
- 25 A. Not at the airport. At their home. We went to their home

1 as guests.

- 2 | Q. I'm sorry. You met this person at their home?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And do you recall where they lived?
- 5 A. Well, I remember, but now that street is torn down, there
- 6 are other buildings built.
- 7 Q. Was that the city of Yerevan, sir?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Sir, when did you first realize or know that
- 10 Mr. Demirchyan was in deportation proceedings? Were you aware
- 11 of that?
- 12 A. I don't remember. I don't remember the date or the time.
- 13 Q. And when were you first -- when did you first know you
- 14 | were going to be asked to testify today?
- 15 A. A few days ago.
- 16 MS. CHEN: I have no further questions, Your Honor.
- 17 THE COURT: When were present counsel retained in
- 18 this case?
- 19 MR. HOFFMAN: Two years ago, during the Ninth Circuit
- 20 case.
- 21 THE COURT: When was that?
- MR. HOFFMAN: That was -- do you have the exact date?
- 23 MR. KURZBAN: It was in 2011 sometime.
- 24 Your Honor, I can -- if Your Honor is interested, we
- 25 can proffer who -- it wasn't one of us who worked with him, but

```
1
     another attorney did speak with him about the background, and
     that attorney is present here today, if Your Honor had any --
 3
               THE COURT: Who is that person?
 4
               I'd like to interrupt this interrogation to ask that
 5
     lawyer some questions.
 6
               MR. KURZBAN: I'm sorry, Your Honor?
 7
               THE COURT: I want to interrupt, just for a moment,
 8
     to have the witness step down. I want that lawyer to take the
 9
     stand.
10
               THE WITNESS: Should I go outside?
11
               THE COURT: No.
12
               THE CLERK: Raise your right hand.
13
               (Witness sworn)
14
               THE WITNESS: I do.
15
               THE CLERK: State your full name and spell it for the
16
     record.
17
               THE WITNESS: My full name is Robert Perkins,
18
     P-e-r-k-i-n-s.
19
               THE COURT: Mr. Perkins, I want to ask you about the
20
     declaration of Asatur -- do I say his name is -- Guyumjyan, is
21
     that the way you say it, "Guyumjyan"?
22
               THE WITNESS: Guyumjyan, Your Honor.
2.3
               THE COURT: Guyumjyan.
24
               MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
25
               THE COURT: And that I think is Exhibit 4 in this
```

```
1
     case.
               Did you prepare this declaration?
 3
               THE WITNESS: I did, Your Honor.
               THE COURT: You did? Are you Armenian speaking?
 4
 5
               THE WITNESS: I'm not. I prepared it with the
 6
     assistance of a translator, Your Honor.
 7
               THE COURT:
                           I see. And the -- this translation which
 8
     is Exhibit 4, who did that translation? Was it the translator?
 9
               THE WITNESS: Into English, Your Honor?
10
               THE COURT: Yes.
               THE WITNESS: The way that I did it was I had asked
11
12
     the questions to the client, took notes in English, the
13
     translator translated the responses, and I sent the final
14
     version to the client in English to go over with the
1.5
     translator.
16
               THE COURT: And who was the translator?
17
               THE WITNESS: Her name is Angie Markosyan.
18
               THE COURT: And is she a professional translator? In
19
     other words, is she a certified translator?
20
               THE WITNESS: I know she is very fluent, Your Honor.
21
     I practice immigration law exclusively and the regulations are
22
     the person has to be -- has to certify that they are fluent in
2.3
     both languages.
24
               THE COURT: So she works as a translator?
25
               THE WITNESS: Her primary job is a hearing officer
```

```
1
     for the DMV, but she is very fluent, from what I understand.
               THE COURT: But you use her for translation purposes?
 3
               THE WITNESS: I used her in this case for several
     translations, Your Honor.
 4
 5
               THE COURT: I see. Now, there is a stamp of a
 6
     notary, Judith Prado. Do you know who that is?
 7
               THE WITNESS: I don't, Your Honor.
 8
               THE COURT: And when this document was signed, were
 9
     you present?
10
               THE WITNESS: I was not present, Your Honor.
               THE COURT: And when, approximately, was this
11
12
     declaration first prepared in the Armenian language?
13
               THE WITNESS: Your Honor, I prepared it in English
14
     with a bunch of them around August of, I believe, 2011, when we
15
     submitted several affidavits.
16
               THE COURT: All right. Let's have the other witness
17
     take the stand. What's his name?
18
              MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor?
19
               THE COURT: Yeah.
20
               MR. KURZBAN: I just want to point out one thing. On
21
     the declaration, as you know, under the federal rules, you
22
     don't need a notary. If you say, I declare under penalty of
23
     perjury the laws of the United States under 28 U.S.C. -- I
24
     think it's 14.
25
              MR. HOFFMAN: 1746.
```

1 Yeah. That that's sufficient. Now, I MR. KURZBAN: don't know if that's what happened and then it was notarized. 3 THE COURT: That may be, but this is highly 4 irregular, and, you know, sometimes you can do too much. That 5 affects your credibility. 6 Let's have the -- Asatur come back. 7 Do you have a few questions about this? 8 MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor. Because of the 9 court's concern with this document, I would like to take him 10 through some questions with the court's indulgence. 11 THE COURT: Okay. 12 ASATUR GUYUMJYAN; PETITIONER'S WITNESS, PREVIOUSLY SWORN, 13 TESTIFIED 14 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 15 BY MR. HOFFMAN: 16 Q. What is your relationship to Mr. Demirchyan? 17 Friends, neighbors. Α. 18 When you say neighbor, what do you mean by neighbor? Q. 19 We live next to each other. Α. 20 Q. Where? 21 Α. In Armenia. 22 Okay. Has anybody paid you anything to testify today? Q. 2.3 No. Α. 24 Did anybody pay you anything to write this affidavit? Q.

25

Α.

No.

- 1 Q. Or given you anything of value?
- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. Or promised you anything?
- 4 A. No, no.
- 5 Q. And what was your profession, your job in Armenia? What
- 6 was your job?
- 7 A. I worked for the police. The police officer.
- 8 Q. Okay. Now, do you see Exhibit 109? Do you have it in
- 9 front of you?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Okay. And do you recognize that document?
- 12 A. The first one or the one behind it?
- 13 Q. The actual Armenian document.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Okay. And that is the document that you obtained for
- 16 Mr. Demirchyan?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. And were you contacted by anyone to obtain that
- 19 document?
- 20 A. Whoever sent me the papers for me to go get Susanna.
- 21 Q. Okay. And what year was that when she contacted you?
- 22 A. Probably the winter of '96.
- Q. Okay. And did she contact anyone else, to your knowledge?
- 24 A. Yeah, before then, she contacted Lucine.
- 25 Q. Okay. And who is Lucine?

- 1 A. Another neighbor across the way.
- 2 Q. Okay. And what happened to Lucine?
- 3 A. Lucine hung herself.
- 4 Q. Okay. What was the reason given, if any, for needing the
- 5 document?
- 6 MS. CHEN: Objection, Your Honor, calls for hearsay.
- 7 THE COURT: Sustained.
- 8 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 9 Q. Okay. Did you know why you were told to obtain the
- 10 document?
- 11 A. Probably they lost it.
- 12 Q. Okay. Did you have any conversations with Lucine or
- 13 Lusineh?
- 14 A. Lucine was deceased already.
- 15 Q. Okay. Were you given any documents -- strike that.
- Were you provided any documents to enable you to
- 17 | obtain this birth certificate?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And what was that?
- 20 A. The power of attorney that was sent to me from the United
- 21 States by Susanna.
- Q. Okay. And what did you do with that document? I'm sorry.
- 23 What did you do with that power of attorney?
- 24 A. I took it to the city where you get the registration and
- 25 the certificate.

- 1 Q. Which city?
- 2 A. In Yerevan.
- 3 Q. Okay. And which particular location, which office?
- 4 A. The region of Shahumyan.
- 5 Q. What is the name of the office?
- 6 A. That's for marriage and birth. It's for the region of
- 7 Shahumyan, for that area.
- 8 Q. Okay. How long did it take you to get this document, the
- 9 1997 birth certificate?
- 10 A. I got it in '97 -- probably summer or spring -- I can't
- 11 remember the months.
- 12 Q. In what year?
- 13 A. '97.
- 14 Q. '97. Then what did you do with it after you obtained it?
- 15 A. I called Susanna.
- 16 Q. Okay. Then what happened?
- 17 A. I said I received it.
- 18 Q. What did you do with it?
- 19 A. I got the certificate. I went to Hovhannes to ask who we
- 20 can send it with as a tourist.
- 21 Q. Okay. Why did you contact Hovhannes?
- 22 A. Because Susanna had called --
- THE COURT: Who is Hovhannes again?
- MR. HOFFMAN: You want me to answer?
- THE COURT: Is that Khachanyan?

```
1
               MR. HOFFMAN:
                             Yes.
               THE COURT: Why don't we refer to someone of the same
 2
 3
     name consistently. These names are difficult enough as it is.
 4
               MR. HOFFMAN: My apologies.
 5
               THE COURT: Let's use the last name.
 6
               MR. HOFFMAN: I had trouble pronouncing the last
 7
     name, Your Honor, so I --
 8
               THE COURT: Isn't it Khanachyan?
 9
               MS. CHEN: I believe so, Your Honor.
10
               MR. HOFFMAN: Khachanyan?
11
               THE COURT: Khachanyan.
12
               MR. HOFFMAN: Okay. I apologize, Your Honor.
13
          Why did you contact Mr. Khachanyan?
     Q.
14
          Before that, Hovhannes -- had called Hovhannes for him to
15
     find someone.
16
               THE COURT: Hovhannes is Mr. Khachanyan, right?
     Speak to him in that way. Don't use his first name.
17
18
               THE WITNESS: Khachanyan.
19
              MR. HOFFMAN: Okay.
20
          So did you then contact Mr. Khachanyan?
     Q.
21
     Α.
          Yes.
         And did he then take that document somewhere?
22
     0.
2.3
               MS. CHEN: Objection, Your Honor, lack of personal
     knowledge, lack of foundation.
24
25
               THE COURT: Sustained.
```

```
1
               MR. HOFFMAN:
                             Okay.
          Did you provide any instructions to Mr. Khachanyan?
 3
          Mr. Khachanyan, we went and gave the paper to that person.
 4
          Okay. What do you mean by "that person"?
     Q.
 5
          To the person coming here, the tourist.
     Α.
 6
     Q.
          Okay.
 7
               MS. CHEN: Objection, Your Honor, move to answer --
 8
     move to strike the answer. Again based on hearsay.
 9
               THE COURT: Well, I think he's testified -- unless I
10
     misunderstood -- that he was present with Khachanyan when the
11
     papers were given to this unnamed tourist.
12
               Is that correct?
13
               THE WITNESS: How is that?
14
               THE COURT: That -- was Mr. Guyumjyan present with
15
     Mr. Khachanyan when Exhibit 109 was given to the tourist for
16
     transportation to the United States?
17
               THE WITNESS: Yeah, because Khachanyan had found the
18
     tourist.
19
               THE COURT: Was he present when the document was
20
     actually given to the tourist?
21
               THE WITNESS: Khachanyan and I went and handed over
22
     to the tourist. I was there.
2.3
               THE COURT: All right. That's what I understood.
```

Q. Did you confirm that it was received in the United States?

MR. HOFFMAN: That's my understanding.

24

25

```
1
          Susanna called and said thank you, that she had received
     Α.
     it. --
 3
               MS. CHEN: Objection, Your Honor, hearsay.
               THE COURT: Overruled.
 4
 5
              MR. HOFFMAN: Thank you, Your Honor. No further
 6
     questions.
 7
               THE COURT: I have one question: Has either side
 8
     introduced the power of attorney in evidence?
 9
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, we've never seen the power of
10
     attorney.
11
               THE COURT: Has the petitioner?
12
               MR. KURZBAN: I don't think there's any copy. He
13
     turned it in as part of the process of getting the birth
14
     certificate.
15
               THE COURT: So there is no copy of it?
16
              MR. KURZBAN: There is no copy.
17
               THE COURT: All right. You can step down -- do you
     have any further questions?
18
19
              MS. CHEN: For this witness, no, Your Honor.
20
               THE COURT: Thank you, sir.
21
               Call the next witness.
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I believe the last witness is
22
23
     Zara Hovanisyan. For the court reporter, it's Z-a-r-a, last
24
     name is H-o-v-a-n-i-s-y-a-n.
25
               Your Honor, while the witness is coming to the stand,
```

```
1
    may I give to your court clerk two copies of the declaration --
               THE COURT: Yes.
 3
               MS. CHEN: -- along with the exhibits, I believe,
 4
     attached to it?
 5
               THE COURT: Yes.
               MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.
 6
 7
               MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor --
 8
               THE COURT: Yes.
 9
               MR. KURZBAN: If I may, you know, prior to the break,
10
     you had raised a significant question about whether or not we
     had any secondary proof of Susanna's trip to --
11
12
               THE COURT: Right.
13
               MR. KURZBAN: -- and we found it. Apparently, we
14
    have a -- we have her ticket, her airline ticket, we have a
15
     letter from her -- the former lawyer for Mr. Demirchyan,
16
    Mr. Crow. I don't know how you want to handle that.
17
               THE COURT: Well, I quess unless those documents are
18
     contested, she ought to be recalled.
19
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, may I actually -- I've never
20
     seen these documents. May I take a look?
21
               THE COURT: Yes. You don't have to do it right now.
22
     Let's turn to this witness.
2.3
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
24
               THE COURT: The witness will please step forward and
25
     stand behind the court reporter.
```

1 Please raise your right hand. (Witness sworn) 3 THE WITNESS: Yes. THE CLERK: Please be seated. 4 5 State your full name and spell it for the record. 6 THE WITNESS: Zara Hovanisyan. Z-a-r-a, 7 H-o-v-a-n-i-s-y-a-n. 8 MS. CHEN: And, Your Honor, if I may have the --9 Ms. Hovanisyan's declaration along with what were attached to 10 it and submitted by petitioner marked for identification as 11 Exhibit 5, I believe. 12 THE COURT: Yes. 13 MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor. 14 ZARA HOVANISYAN; PETITIONER'S WITNESS, SWORN, TESTIFIED: 15 DIRECT EXAMINATION BY DECLARATION 16 CROSS-EXAMINATION 17 BY MS. CHEN: 18 Ms. Hovanisyan, can you read and write English? 19 A little. Α. 20 I'm going to ask you to turn to the first page that has 21 been marked for identification as Exhibit 5. Should I read? 22 Α. 23 Ma'am, do you recognize that document? 24 Yes. My signature is there. Α. 25 Ma'am, do you -- can you read that declaration which is in Q.

- 1 the English language?
- 2 A. Yes, I think so.
- 3 Q. Well, let me ask you this, ma'am: That you recognize that
- 4 | as your signature, correct?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And do you remember signing it on August 22nd, 2011?
- 7 A. Yes, last year.
- 8 Q. Did you sign this English-language document after reading
- 9 all six paragraphs listed in this document?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Did you have a translator translate it for you prior to
- 12 | signing this English-language document?
- 13 A. Yes.
- MS. CHEN: Your Honor, just for the record, this
- declaration suffers from the same issue as Mr. Guyumjyan's,
- 16 | which is there is no translator certificate, although
- 17 Ms. Hovanisyan has stated she can read some English.
- 18 THE COURT: Well, I recognize the deficiency, but
- 19 let's get to the substance of what she says.
- MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 21 Q. Ms. Hovanisyan, you recognize that paragraph six is a
- 22 declaration under penalty of perjury, correct?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. And based on your knowledge and ability to read English,
- 25 as well as your testimony today that this document was

- 1 translated to you in the Armenian language before you signed
- 2 | it, is it your understanding that what is contained in this
- 3 document is truthful and accurate testimony based on your best
- 4 recollection?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Now, in paragraph two of this document marked for
- 7 | identification as Exhibit 5, specifically the declaration, you
- 8 | state that you worked in the archives from 1978 to 1983,
- 9 correct?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And you've provided what you've described as a workbook,
- 12 correct?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. I'm going to ask you to turn to the second page of
- 15 Exhibit 5, which is the page after your declaration.
- 16 | Specifically, ma'am, the top of the page says "Workbook of Zara
- 17 | Hovanisyan, " correct?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. How did you obtain this workbook?
- 20 A. I work. You get a workbook for your work.
- 21 Q. And who issues this workbook to you?
- 22 A. The director of the division of the recorders.
- 23 Q. And looking at this document, ma'am, it says at the
- 24 | very -- it says, "Issue date of workbook: October 11th, 1971,"
- 25 correct?

- 1 A. 10/1/71, yes. That's the issue date.
- 2 Q. And, ma'am, looking at this document, on the right-hand
- 3 side, it starts off with information about work experiences.
- 4 Do you see that?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Do you see the second entry, ma'am, it says, from, to,
- 7 April 12th, 1978 to January 18th, 1983?
- 8 A. Yes, I see it.
- 9 Q. And that's the main Archival Department of Ministers of
- 10 Armenian SSR Limits.
- Is that the archives you're referencing in your
- 12 declaration to paragraph two?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. And who would have -- who completed entry No. 2 relating
- 15 to the archival portion of this document?
- 16 THE COURT: I don't understand the question.
- 17 MS. CHEN: I'll clarify, Your Honor.
- 18 Q. Ms. Hovanisyan, looking at the entry No. 2, again that
- 19 references your work experience with the archives; is that
- 20 correct?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. When was this entry completed?
- 23 A. From '78, 4/12/78.
- 24 Q. And who completed it?
- 25 THE INTERPRETER: Your Honor, may interpreter clarify

```
1
     a question with counsel?
               THE COURT: Yes.
 3
               THE INTERPRETER: I'm not sure what counsel means,
 4
     whether she means completed in the original book or workbook
 5
     or ...
 6
               THE COURT: I don't understand why there's a notary
 7
     stamp on here. Why is there a notary stamp on here? It makes
 8
     no sense at all. What is the notary notarizing? Is that your
 9
     signature on the bottom left-hand part of this document?
10
               THE WITNESS: No, this is not mine.
               THE COURT: Have you signed this document in any
11
12
    place?
13
               THE WITNESS: On this you mean?
14
               THE COURT: Has she signed this page?
15
               THE WITNESS: No.
16
               THE COURT: These are somewhat bizarre submissions
17
     with these strange notaries, which don't appear to be relevant
18
     or required. But why they're here -- I would like some
19
     explanation at some point. Maybe not right now.
20
               Now, so my understanding is that this exhibit, which
21
     is attached to -- which is part of Exhibit 5 following the
22
     one-page declaration, it's actually page two, is a workbook of
2.3
     Zara Hovanisyan.
24
               Did you prepare this document? This is page two of
25
     Exhibit 5.
```

```
1
                             The translation?
               THE WITNESS:
               THE COURT: Well, the document. This is a
 2
 3
     translation of something that was in Armenian, correct?
 4
               THE WITNESS: Yes, in Armenian.
 5
               THE COURT: Is the Armenian version of what is Page 2
 6
     of Exhibit 5 found somewhere in Exhibit 5?
 7
               THE INTERPRETER: Interpreter is having trouble.
                                                                 She
 8
     is very soft-spoken.
 9
               THE COURT: Yes. Speak up, ma'am.
10
               THE WITNESS: This is the document of the -- from '78
11
     to '83.
12
               THE COURT: This is Page 2 --
13
               THE WITNESS: The archive.
14
               THE COURT: -- on Exhibit 5, it's in the English
15
     language. My understanding is that this document is a
16
     translation from a document that was originally in the Armenian
17
     language; is that correct?
18
               THE WITNESS: Yes, Armenian.
19
               THE COURT: And is the version of Page 2 of Exhibit 5
20
     found somewhere in Exhibit 5 in the Armenian language?
21
               THE WITNESS: In Armenian?
22
               No, there isn't.
2.3
               THE COURT: Did you produce the workbook of Zara
     Hovanisyan as found in Page 2 of Exhibit 5?
24
25
               THE INTERPRETER: I'm sorry, Your Honor. Interpreter
```

```
1
     is having trouble hearing her.
               THE COURT: You have to speak up, ma'am. Now look at
 3
    me. We have to hear you. So you must speak up. You're
     ordered to speak up. Louder. Let me hear you speak louder.
 4
 5
               THE WITNESS: Okay.
               THE COURT: Louder.
 6
 7
               THE WITNESS: Okay.
               THE COURT: Where did this come from?
 8
 9
               THE INTERPRETER: Referring to Page 2, Your Honor?
10
               THE COURT: Yes.
               THE WITNESS: This is from the workbook?
11
12
               THE COURT: What workbook? I mean, where did it come
13
     from? Did she produce it?
14
               THE WITNESS: Yes. These are the copies, yes.
15
               THE COURT: Where did she get it from?
16
               THE WITNESS: The workbook?
17
               THE COURT: Yes.
18
               THE WITNESS: I got the workbook from the place where
19
     I work, the given place where I work.
20
               THE COURT: When did she get it?
21
               THE WITNESS: Eleven -- the tenth month in '71, 1971.
22
               THE COURT: As I read this workbook section of
23
     Exhibit 5, you worked in the Main Archival Department of
24
    Ministers of Armenian SSR Limits from April 12th, 1978 to
25
     January 18th, 1983; is that correct?
```

1 Witness is answering before the THE INTERPRETER: 2 interpreter can finish the interpretation, Your Honor. 3 THE COURT: Yes. So answer again. 4 THE WITNESS: Yes. From 1978 to 1983, I worked at 5 the archival administration. 6 THE COURT: And is your testimony today regarding 7 your familiarity with stamps of the ministry based upon your 8 work experience from that period, that is, 1978 to 1983? THE WITNESS: Yes. 9 10 THE COURT: All right. MS. CHEN: Your Honor, if I may proceed? 11 12 THE COURT: Yes. 13 MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor. 14 Ma'am, moving to paragraph three of your declaration, you 15 described your duties at the archives, and you state that 16 you're responsible for keeping official records of meetings, 17 orders and directives of the government and communist party; is 18 that correct? 19 Yes. Α. 20 You state later on, in paragraph three, the last sentence, 21 "The division which kept official records of births, deaths and 22 other vital statistics was in the same building as ours and 2.3 part of the archives as well." Is that accurate and truthful? 24

THE INTERPRETER: Your Honor, interpreter did not get

25

- 1 to finish -- witness answered and did not hear the last part of
 2 the counsel's question.
- THE COURT: I don't know why you ask that question.
- I mean, what is she supposed to answer, that she's lying? I
- 5 mean, what do you expect her answer to be?
- 6 MS. CHEN: I have a follow-up question.
- 7 THE COURT: Well, then, start with the follow-up.
- 8 MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 9 Q. Ma'am, you never actually dealt with birth certificates as
- 10 part of your duties; isn't that right?
- 11 A. I've had contact, but the birth certificates were in
- 12 another division.
- 13 Q. And you don't have -- you were never asked to authenticate
- 14 birth certificates as part of your duties; is that correct?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. You don't have any training in that; is that correct?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Now, turning to paragraph five, you state that you
- 19 recognize the 1997 birth certificate as consistent with the one
- 20 issued by the Armenian government.
- 21 And just to be clear we're talking about the same
- 22 one, I'm going to ask that you look at Petitioner's Exhibit
- 23 marked 109. That is a two-page document. I'm going to ask you
- 24 to turn to the second page.
- 25 A. May I answer? Can I answer?

Case 2:08-cv-03452-SVW-MAN Document 86 Filed 12/06/12 Page 124 of 200 Page 4D

- 1 Q. Ma'am, the question is: Do you recognize that document?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Is that the document you're referring to as a 1997 birth
- 4 certificate you believe to be consistent with ones issued by
- 5 the Armenian government?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Now, as you state in your declaration, the seal is faded,
- 8 correct?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. But you believe the shape of the marking is exactly the
- 11 type, I believe you stated, used by Armenian government,
- 12 correct?
- 13 A. Yes, its place and its form.
- 14 Q. And you state also that the symbols, the language and the
- 15 layout are all exactly the same as that used by the Armenian
- 16 government?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Aren't there, in fact -- isn't it actually true that there
- 19 | are a lot of different stamps used based on what province or
- 20 region the person is born in?
- 21 A. I didn't understand.
- 22 Q. Ma'am, is your daughter Angie Markosyan?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. She, in fact, lives with you, correct?
- 25 A. Yes.

Case 2:08-cv-03452-SVW-MAN Document 86 Filed 12/06/12 Page 125 of 200 Page 5D

#.1016

- 1 Q. And she is, in fact -- strike that.
- She, in fact, knows Mr. Demirchyan; isn't that right?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. In fact, she is dating Mr. Demirchyan; isn't that right?
- 5 A. As a friend.
- THE COURT: Is that the woman who was identified
- 7 before by Mr. Perkins?
- MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 9 THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 10 MS. CHEN: I have no further questions, Your Honor.
- 11 THE COURT: All right.
- 12 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 13 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 14 Q. Ms. Hovanisyan, what is your relationship to
- 15 Mr. Demirchyan?
- 16 A. Mr. Demirchyan is my former son-in-law's friend.
- 17 Q. Okay. And how long have you known the petitioner?
- 18 A. Close to two years.
- 19 Q. Okay. And who contacted you about this case?
- 20 A. Contacted me?
- 21 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. Demirchyan, Arutyun.
- 23 Q. Okay. And were you promised any payment for your
- 24 testimony today?
- 25 A. No, no.

- 1 Q. Were you promised any payment for your affidavit that you
- 2 wrote?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. Okay. Do you have the original of the workbook that
- 5 Ms. Chen asked you about? Did you bring that with you today?
- 6 A. Should I present -- yes, I have it.
- 7 Q. You have it here today with you?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And does that workbook -- is that photocopy in Exhibit
- 10 No. 5 that the court has identified?
- 11 THE COURT: That's what I asked her myself.
- MR. HOFFMAN: I didn't hear you ask her if it was an
- 13 original.
- 14 THE COURT: Yes, I did. I asked her if what was page
- 15 2 of Exhibit 5 in the English language was found in the
- 16 Armenian language in another part of Exhibit 5, and that's what
- 17 you're asking.
- 18 MR. HOFFMAN: I'm asking her whether -- it's a little
- 19 different what I'm asking, Your Honor. What I'm asking is the
- 20 original workbook that she is holding in her hand, I'm going to
- 21 ask is that reflective of the translation that we have here.
- 22 Because there may have been a problem with the photocopies. I
- 23 don't know why -- what her answer is going to be.
- THE COURT: Let's take ten minutes.
- 25 (Recess)

- 1 THE COURT: You may continue.
- MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 3 Q. At the time of your affidavit in August 2011, was your
- 4 daughter, at that time, in a personal relationship with
- 5 Mr. Demirchyan?
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. Okay. You testified about your experience. Can you be
- 8 | very specific, what experience do you have with Armenian
- 9 documents?
- 10 A. Experience?
- 11 Q. Can you testify about your work experience?
- 12 A. I worked as a preserver of -- the archival fund preserver.
- 13 Q. And what years was that?
- 14 A. From '78 to '83.
- 15 Q. Okay. And did you work in a particular suboffice in the
- 16 archives?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. And what did that suboffice do?
- 19 A. One minute.
- 20 We basically dealt with the maintenance of documents.
- 21 | We would record them or register them, and then transfer them
- 22 to the archives.
- Q. Okay. And what type of documents specifically did you
- 24 come into contact with?
- 25 A. We would also cultivate significant people's documents.

- 1 Q. Okay. For the court's clarification, what is a workbook?
- 2 A. In the workbook is written the years a person has worked
- 3 and -- may interpreter ask her to repeat the beginning?
- 4 THE COURT: Yes.
- 5 THE WITNESS: The positions the person had and where
- 6 they worked.
- 7 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 8 Q. And is that required of everyone?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Okay. Now, just to be clear, Ms. Chen asked you about
- 11 Page 2 of Exhibit 5.
- Just to be clear: Is that a translation of a portion
- of your workbook?
- 14 A. One minute.
- 15 Yes.
- 16 Q. Okay. And are the photocopies after that translation, do
- 17 | they relate to the periods when you were working in the
- 18 archives?
- 19 A. Yes. This is a copy of my basic workbook.
- 20 Q. Okay. And do you have the original today in case the
- 21 | court needs or the government needs to see the original?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Okay. Did you receive any special education or training
- 24 for that job in Armenia with the archives?
- 25 A. In the archives, we're dealing with documents with my work

1 experience. I acquired that during my work.

- Q. Okay. Did you have any education?
- 3 A. Yes. I studied at a vocational school. My specialized
- 4 education was a worker.
- 5 THE INTERPRETER: May interpreter clarify the term,
- 6 Judge?
- 7 THE COURT: Yes.
- 8 THE INTERPRETER: Thank you.
- 9 THE WITNESS: Where we organized the work of
- 10 documents -- working with documents.
- MR. HOFFMAN: Okay.
- 12 Q. Did you receive a degree for that?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Okay. I'd like to show you the 1997 birth certificate,
- 15 which is Exhibit 109.
- Have you seen that document before?
- 17 A. They showed me this last year.
- 18 Q. Okay. And does it appear to be a genuine document, in
- 19 your experience?
- MS. CHEN: Objection, Your Honor, calls for a legal
- 21 conclusion and expert testimony.
- THE COURT: Overruled.
- THE INTERPRETER: May interpreter have the question
- 24 again?
- MR. HOFFMAN: Yes.

Case 2:08-cv-03452-SVW-MAN Document 86 Filed 12/06/12 Page 130 of 200 Page 9D

- 1 Q. Does this appear to be a genuine document in your
- 2 experience?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Can you specifically tell me what you base that on?
- 5 A. This is a form of an Armenian birth certificate, Republic
- of Armenia, because it's only written in Armenian. There's the
- 7 | coat of arms of the country, of Armenia. The stamp, which
- 8 is -- doesn't show clearly, probably was dry, and the serial
- 9 number that has the -- the document has the number.
- 10 Q. Okay.
- 11 A. Can I say something else?
- 12 Q. Is she finished?
- 13 Are you finished?
- 14 A. No, not yet.
- And here it shows the place where it was issued and
- 16 by -- the signature by whom.
- 17 Q. Okay. What place was it issued?
- 18 A. City of Yerevan, the ZAGS Division.
- 19 Q. Okay. Does it have any official language certifying that
- 20 this was done according to Armenian law?
- MS. CHEN: Your Honor, objection, the document speaks
- 22 for itself.
- 23 THE COURT: Well, she's -- you're asking her --
- MR. HOFFMAN: In Armenian, not the translation, Your
- Honor.

- 1 THE COURT: All right. She can answer.
- THE INTERPRETER: May interpreter have the question
- 3 again, please?
- 4 MR. HOFFMAN: Yes.
- 5 Q. In Armenian, looking at the Armenian version, is there any
- 6 official language certifying or reciting that this is according
- 7 to law?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And can you -- looking at the Armenian, can you read that
- 10 or provide that language at this time?
- 11 A. Should I read the whole thing?
- 12 Q. No. The language that you just testified was an official
- 13 recitation.
- 14 A. City of Yerevan, Shahumyan area, ZAGS Division.
- 15 Certificate is issued in '97, April 29th. Civil residence, law
- 16 division head, and the serial number of the document.
- 17 Q. Okay. In Armenian, does it state that it's according to
- 18 law?
- 19 A. Here that it's written that the division head has signed
- 20 it.
- MS. CHEN: Your Honor, the government does object to
- 22 | this line of questioning on the grounds that there is an
- 23 | English translation of the Armenian --
- MR. HOFFMAN: I'm getting it. I'm getting it.
- 25 THE COURT: Well, then, why, if there is an English

1 translation, why is she translating the document? 2 MR. HOFFMAN: I'm getting to the English translation 3 because --THE COURT: Is there something about the English 4 5 translation that --6 MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor. 7 THE COURT: Why don't you get to that. 8 MR. HOFFMAN: I'll move to the English translation, 9 Your Honor. 10 THE COURT: Yes. 11 MR. HOFFMAN: Okay. 12 Now, if you would direct your attention to the English Q. 13 translation, which is the first page of Exhibit 209, please. 14 Okay. Having looked at the Armenian document, is 15 there anything wrong or incomplete about this English 16 translation? 17 Α. No. This corresponds completely. 18 Okay. Is there a signature on the English translation? Q. 19 Certified by the notary, there is. Α. 20 But besides the notary, is there a signature? Q. 21 Here it's only written "Department of Zaga," it's not Α. 22 indicated here. 2.3 It's not indicated -- what's not indicated? Q. 24 Only the signature. Α. 25 And can you tell who the signature is by in the original

Q.

#.102

1 Armenian?

- A. It's a very short signature. That's why it's not clear.
- 3 Q. But can you tell who it was by, the title of the person?
- 4 A. The ZAGS Division, head of ZAGS Division.
- 5 Q. The head of the ZAGS Division. Is that what she said?
- 6 A. Yes, whoever places the stamps, who stamps it.
- 7 Q. Okay. Now, you said it was issued April 29th, 1977. Is
- 8 | it unusual -- I'm sorry -- 1997, excuse me -- is it unusual to
- 9 have a later-acquired birth certificate?
- 10 MS. CHEN: Objection, Your Honor. Ambiguous
- 11 question. I'm not sure I understand what it means. And also,
- 12 | she lacks personal knowledge and --
- 13 THE COURT: No foundation, is that what you're
- 14 saying?
- MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 16 THE COURT: Sustained.
- MR. HOFFMAN: Okay.
- 18 Q. In your experience, is it unusual to have a birth
- 19 certificate that has an issue date after the birth date?
- 20 A. It's possible.
- 21 THE COURT: Why did you, Ms. Chen, object to the
- 22 | earlier question and not object to this question? I mean, just
- 23 | a matter of curiosity. Maybe you have a reason for doing that.
- 24 I don't understand. Are you listening to the question?
- MS. CHEN: I am, Your Honor.

```
1
                           I mean, can you explain why you made a
               THE COURT:
 2
     correct objection, and then when the question is re-asked
 3
     almost identically, you are sitting there talking to
 4
     co-counsel.
 5
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I do apologize. I would have
     objected, but I was also, frankly, interested in hearing the
 6
 7
     answer, too.
 8
               THE COURT: Oh, then, fine. Forgive me for
 9
     interrupting.
10
               Go ahead. You can answer the question.
11
               MR. HOFFMAN: Do you want me to re-ask the question?
12
          Is it unusual to have a birth -- an issue date that is
     Ο.
     after the birth date on an Armenian birth certificate?
13
14
               THE COURT: I can't understand the question. I have
15
     to essentially figure this out, so ask the question again.
16
               MR. HOFFMAN: Yes, Your Honor. Yes, Your Honor.
17
          In your experience, is it unusual for the date of issuance
     Q.
18
     to be after the birth date on a birth certificate?
19
          Yes.
     Α.
20
               THE COURT: Well, it has to be. I mean, to some
21
     extent. You can't issue you a birth certificate before someone
22
     is born. I mean, isn't that right?
2.3
               MR. HOFFMAN: That's true, Your Honor --
24
               THE COURT: The question is how long.
25
               MR. HOFFMAN: How long.
```

- 1 Q. Or is it unusual to have a length of time, such as in this
- 2 case, from 1977 to 1997? That's the question.
- 3 A. It's possible.
- 4 Q. And why would it be possible, if you know, in your
- 5 experience?
- 6 A. It was picked up later, it was applied for late.
- 7 Q. In your experience, why would somebody apply for it that
- 8 late?
- 9 MS. CHEN: Objection, Your Honor, calls for
- 10 speculation.
- 11 THE COURT: Sustained.
- MR. HOFFMAN: I'll withdraw the question.
- 13 Q. In your opinion, would you be able to tell if this was a
- 14 fraudulent document?
- MS. CHEN: Objection, Your Honor, calls for legal
- 16 expert opinion.
- 17 THE COURT: Sustained.
- 18 BY MR. HOFFMAN:
- 19 Q. In your experience and specialized knowledge, would you be
- 20 able to tell the court if there were any characteristics of
- 21 fraud exhibited in this document?
- MS. CHEN: Same objection, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Objection is what?
- MS. CHEN: As to calls for legal expert opinion based
- 25 on the fraud part.

1 Well, that's not a good objection. THE COURT: What about no foundation? 3 MS. CHEN: That, too, Your Honor. 4 THE COURT: And so the objection is sustained on that 5 ground. 6 BY MR. HOFFMAN: 7 Q. You testified previously that this was a genuine document 8 in your opinion. 9 Yes, I testified. Α. 10 Okay. So the information that made you come to that 11 conclusion -- strike that. 12 The characteristics that made you come to that 13 conclusion would be lacking if it was not genuine; is that 14 correct? 15 THE COURT: You're asking her now to sort of view the 16 matter from the opposite side. She's told you why she thinks it's a genuine document. There's nothing about her training 17 18 which would indicate she could be skilled in detecting the 19 forgery, and so it's for me to accept or reject her testimony, 20 along with all the other testimony, as to whether or not her --21 whether the document is genuine. MR. HOFFMAN: I'm going to ask -- can I ask one more 22 23 question, and that will be my final question, about that

24

25

education or training?

THE COURT: All right.

BY MR. HOFFMAN:

- Q. You testified earlier about your education or training.
- 3 Was there anything in that education or training that would
- 4 | allow you to evaluate this document as genuine?
- 5 A. Since I've had a lot of contact with documents, I find
- 6 that this is a real original Republic of Armenia birth
- 7 certificate.
- 8 MS. CHEN: Objection, Your Honor. Move to strike the
- 9 answer on the grounds that it constitutes a legal expert
- 10 opinion.

1

- 11 THE COURT: Well, look, I'm -- we're asking the same
- 12 thing in different ways. If she says she has this experience,
- 13 she's looked at Exhibit 109. She's identified certain earmarks
- 14 | which are the basis for her opinion that is genuine. That's
- 15 her testimony and it's to be accepted or rejected. That's it.
- 16 I don't know why we keep asking the same questions over and
- 17 over again.
- 18 MR. HOFFMAN: No further questions, Your Honor.
- 19 THE COURT: Anything else?
- Thank you.
- MS. CHEN: No, Your Honor.
- 22 THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am. You may step down.
- 23 MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor, I believe the last witness
- 24 is Mr. James Rosenberg.
- THE COURT: Okay.

```
1
                             That was someone I think you wanted to
               MR. KURZBAN:
    hear from.
 3
               THE COURT: All right. I forget exactly why I wanted
 4
     to hear from him but ...
 5
               MR. KURZBAN: He was the former attorney of
 6
    Mr. Demirchyan.
 7
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, the government actually is
 8
     prepared to accept Mr. Rosenberg's declaration without any
 9
     cross-examination other than the objection to paragraph five as
10
     it relates to lack of personal knowledge and foundation.
11
               THE COURT: What is paragraph five? Can I see his
12
     declaration?
13
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. May I approach the ...
14
               THE COURT: Yes.
               Paragraph five would be properly objected to in any
15
16
     event. So why can't we just accept his declaration with the
     exception of paragraph five? There's no evidentiary basis for
17
     Exhibit 5. It's just his opinion and a sum up, but paragraphs
18
19
     one through four I can accept.
20
               MR. KURZBAN: I agree, Your Honor.
21
               THE COURT: All right. Paragraphs one through four
22
     of the affidavit of James Rosenberg is accepted.
2.3
               And that would be Exhibit 6, correct?
24
               THE CLERK: Yes, Your Honor.
25
                           So -- yes. So the evidentiary part of
               THE COURT:
```

```
1
     the case is complete. Let me hear some argument, if you wish,
     from the petitioner, and then I'll hear from the government.
 3
              MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor, just before we do that, if
 4
     I may?
 5
               THE COURT: Yes.
 6
              MR. KURZBAN: I'd like to move into evidence at this
 7
     point Exhibits 108 to 133.
 8
               THE COURT: Have those been referenced?
 9
              MS. CHEN: I believe 108 has. I have no idea what
10
     the other --
11
               THE COURT: 109 has been --
12
              MS. CHEN: What is 109?
13
              MR. KURZBAN: I can go through them quickly.
14
               THE COURT: What are they?
15
              MR. KURZBAN: 108 is the 2000 birth certificate
16
     that --
17
               THE COURT: That can be received --
18
              MR. KURZBAN: I'm sorry?
19
               THE COURT: I mean, that -- I didn't say it could be
20
     received. That's the subject of an evidentiary objection.
21
              MR. KURZBAN: Right.
22
               THE COURT: So I can hear argument on that.
2.3
              MR. KURZBAN: Okay.
24
               THE COURT: 109 is received.
25
              MR. KURZBAN: 109 is the --
```

(Petitioner's Exhibit 109 received in evidence) 1 THE COURT: What are the other exhibits? There were 2 3 about 20 or so that I haven't heard any reference made to in 4 the hearing. 5 MR. KURZBAN: Right. One -- Exhibits 110 to 120 --6 7 THE COURT: Yeah. Just give me --MR. KURZBAN: Yeah. Exhibits 110 to 120 are exhibits 8 9 that came from the government's file. They are after -- I 10 won't say after acquired, but they are documents that indicate 11 that Mr. Demirchyan's birth was July 27th, 1977. They're from 12 the government's files, through the FOIA request, and that 13 relates directly to Mr. Rosenberg's affidavit where he says he 14 made the request. The government knows it -- the government 15 knows it came from their file, so there really shouldn't be any 16 issue as to authenticity. 17 The issue for Your Honor --18 THE COURT: Let's get through these exhibits; then we 19 can get -- turn back and see how they fit the dispute. 20 So 110 through 120 are exhibits that come from the 21 government's file as per the FOIA request. 22 MR. KURZBAN: Correct. THE COURT: Which have the birth date of the 23 24 petitioner as July 1977. 25 MR. KURZBAN: Correct.

```
1
               THE COURT: What about 120 to 133?
 2
              MR. KURZBAN: Okay. 121 -- that was 110 to 120, I'm
 3
     sorry. 121 to 127 are affidavits of other people, we wanted to
     call them as witnesses. You had excluded them. Our position
 4
 5
     obviously is, Your Honor, to preserve any appeal, if that
 6
     becomes necessary, that we believe that they were --
 7
               THE COURT: You made the offer, and now I'll rule
 8
     upon that. In effect, I have, but I'll confirm it one way or
 9
     the other in my findings.
10
               MR. KURZBAN: Thank you. 129 is just a duplicate.
     That's Rosenberg's affidavit, again, so ...
11
12
               THE COURT: We don't need that then. That's
13
     Exhibit 6 now.
14
              MR. KURZBAN: I'm sorry?
15
               THE COURT: What you have just described as
16
     Exhibit 129 is now Exhibit 6.
17
              MR. KURZBAN: Correct, Your Honor.
18
               THE COURT: Yes.
19
              MR. KURZBAN: And I take it 1 through 6, we'd move
20
     their admission, too.
21
               THE COURT: They're in evidence.
           (Petitioner's Exhibits 1-6 received in evidence)
22
              MR. KURZBAN: Other exhibits are 130 to 134. Those
23
     are the exhibits that come out of Your Honor's -- well, two of
24
25
     them. 130 to 131 are secondary proof of Susanna Demirchyan's
```

```
1
     trip in the year 2000 to Armenia. We have her airplane ticket,
     and we had something from a Mr. Crow --
 3
               THE COURT: Any objection --
 4
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, to the extent that it's
 5
     represented, it is a, I believe, an airline ticket issued to
 6
    Mrs. Demirchyan to Moscow, the government does not object to
 7
     that.
               THE COURT: Okay. So 130 and 130 -- what is it?
 8
 9
     One -- is that 130?
10
               MR. KURZBAN: Yeah. 130 is the ticket.
               THE COURT: All right. That's received.
11
12
           (Petitioner's Exhibit 130 received in evidence)
13
              MR. KURZBAN: 131 is a letter to, again, INS.
                                                              Again,
14
     it's also part of the FOIA. This was from John Crow, who was
15
     Mr. Demirchyan's lawyer, and it related to, again, the birth
16
     certificate and that she had brought it from Armenia and they
17
     were seeking to introduce it.
18
               THE COURT: This is just his argument based upon what
19
     his client told him. Why should this be evidence?
20
               MR. KURZBAN: Only because it's a contemporaneous
21
     record that the doc -- you know, that she had obtained the
22
     document.
2.3
               THE COURT: I don't follow. Are you saying that
     the -- that when a lawyer for a petitioner writes a
24
25
     self-serving letter and that letter is maintained in the
```

```
1
     government file, that becomes a document which then has
     trustworthiness because it's in a government's file?
 3
               MR. KURZBAN: Well, no.
               THE COURT: It means like you're saying.
 4
 5
               MR. KURZBAN: It's authentic because it's in the
 6
     government's file.
 7
               THE COURT: But it isn't authentic because it's in
 8
     the government's file. That's where your argument loses force.
 9
     In order for a document to be authentic, just like any other
10
     document, there -- a business record, it has to be a foundation
11
     established that the document is of the kind that's prepared by
12
     the government, relied upon the government for its
13
     trustworthiness and maintained by the government. This is a
14
     self-serving letter from a lawyer. I'm not going to accept
1.5
     131.
16
               MR. KURZBAN: Okay.
17
               And then 132 and 133 are the transcripts or parts of
18
     the transcripts that we had referenced before when you said we
19
     didn't need to examine the people, the transcript of the
20
     hearing --
21
               THE COURT: All right. Then those parts of the
22
     transcripts can be received.
2.3
               What about one -- what's the government's position
     with 110 through 120?
24
25
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, may I be heard briefly on each
```

```
1
     of those?
               THE COURT: Yes.
 3
              MS. CHEN: Your Honor, with respect to 110 and 111,
 4
     they are pages from U.S. passports which have been since
 5
     revoked. They were applied for by the petitioner after the
 6
     initiation removal proceedings. We do object to them on the --
 7
               THE COURT: What probative value do they have?
 8
              MS. CHEN: We don't believe there is any, Your Honor.
 9
               THE COURT: I mean, they're applications for
10
     passports in which he, what, includes the birth date of her
11
     son?
12
              MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I believe they're actually
13
     actual pages of passports. The first one, 110, it states an
14
     issue date of March 2002.
15
               THE COURT: What is the probative value? Does the
16
    mother in that application list the date of her son? What's
17
     the value of it?
18
              MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I believe that Mr. Demirchyan
19
     applied for these passports through the State Department, and
20
     it was issued 2002, after --
21
               THE COURT: So in those applications, he lists his
22
    birth date as 1977.
2.3
              MS. CHEN: That's correct, Your Honor. That's my
24
     understanding.
25
               THE COURT: I see. So, in other words, these are
```

```
1
     self-serving documents in the sense that the immigration
 2
    proceedings were ongoing and the issues known at the time he
 3
    made this application.
 4
               MR. KURZBAN: That's correct, Your Honor.
 5
               THE COURT: So they're not received.
               MS. CHEN: Exhibit 111, Your Honor, I believe, is the
 6
 7
     same. It's another page of an American passport. It looks
 8
     like the issue date is even later, February 2009.
 9
               THE COURT: Same objection?
10
              MS. CHEN: Exhibit 112 --
11
               THE COURT: Are you listening to me? Is it the same
12
     objection?
13
              MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
14
               THE COURT: All right.
15
              MS. CHEN: Exhibit 112 appears to be an Armenian
16
     passport; however, we do object on the grounds of lack of
17
     foundation.
18
               THE COURT: What date is it? It is after the --
19
     after the immigration proceedings -- was it after the issues,
20
     that is, the date of birth of the petitioner became at issue?
21
              MS. CHEN: Looking at Exhibit 111, Your Honor, it
22
     looks like it is after. Its issue date is April 3rd, 2007.
2.3
               THE COURT: All right. Then that's not received.
               MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor, in order to save Your
24
25
     Honor's time, and I thought I said this at the beginning, and I
```

```
1
     apologize, they're all after. So the question is whether --
     our review, obviously, is they're admissible, they're
 3
     authentic, the question is what weight do you want to give
     them?
 5
               THE COURT: Why are they admissible?
               MR. KURZBAN: Because they're authentic documents.
 6
 7
     There's no question about the authenticity.
 8
               THE COURT: What do you mean? I can't understand
 9
     that argument. In other words, because you, after this issue
10
     of the petitioner's birth became at issue, filed documents with
     the government, and you list his birth date as the date that
11
12
     you advocate, rather than the date the government advocates,
13
     it's your view that they've become authentic? Authentic what,
14
     government records?
15
              MR. KURZBAN: I'm not sure we're arguing over
16
     something different. Our view is they're admissible, and you
17
     can give them whatever weight you want. You feel that they
18
     have no weight, and I understand Your Honor's position. I
19
     don't agree, but I understand it, that you feel it has no
20
     weight because you think it's self-serving.
21
               THE COURT: I'm not admitting them, and even if they
     were admissible as being authentic, I find they have no
22
2.3
     evidentiary value given the time frame.
24
              MS. CHEN: Finally, Your Honor, just very briefly,
25
     with respect to Exhibits -- I believe it's 114 to 119.
                                                             They
```

```
1
     are basically printouts from, I think, the INS computer
 2
     database, as least they purport to be. We do object to it
 3
     based on authentication grounds. And, again, they all do
 4
     postdate the 2000 date.
 5
               THE COURT: What exhibits are these again?
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, again, it's 114 to 119, and
 6
 7
     from what I can tell, they are printouts from the INS database
 8
     called IBIS, is one --
 9
               THE COURT: Has there been any foundation laid for
10
     them except that they are pieces of paper?
11
              MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I will note for the record
12
     that there appears to FOIA-stamped pages. So they appear to
13
     have been produced pursuant to petitioner's FOIA request.
14
               THE COURT: And so what do they appear to be?
15
              MS. CHEN: They appear to show, again, I --
16
               THE COURT: What are they? Maybe I'll ask the
17
    proponent.
18
               MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor, they are different
19
     documents that came as a result of the FOIA request from the
20
     government's own file. They have the original file right
21
     there --
22
               THE COURT: But what are they?
23
              MR. KURZBAN: And they're documents that are
24
     generated by the computer system of immigration itself, and
25
     those documents indicate that the date of birth is 1977 versus
```

```
1
     '76.
          Now, again, they're all after 2000, so --
 2
               THE COURT: After issue was joined?
 3
              MR. KURZBAN: Right, after the issue was joined.
     But, in fact, they are the government's own documents saying
 4
 5
     that his birth date is 1977, not --
 6
               THE COURT: I'll reserve ruling on that. Is that it?
 7
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, just to clarify, one of the
 8
     documents in question does say 1976, 1977, question mark,
 9
     question mark, and that, again, is to represent all the
10
     different documents which have been submitted by the petitioner
     after initiation of the removal proceedings in 2000. But the
11
12
     last batch of exhibits are the declarations that counsel
13
     represented as being from people who have not testified today.
14
               THE COURT: I understand that.
               All right. Let's hear argument, if you wish.
15
16
              MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.
17
              MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor, our only other issue was on
18
     the witness list, which you've already ruled, but I just want
19
     to be clear on the record. We had on our witness list, witness
20
     No. 2, 4 through 10, 13 through 17 were --
21
               THE COURT: I issued a minute order, and obviously I
22
     considered that those declarations. And the purpose of the
23
     minute order of October 18, 2012, was to indicate, in light of
24
    my interpretation of the Ninth Circuit's order, what was still
25
     remaining and which witnesses would relate to that.
```

1 So let's proceed to argument. 2 MR. KURZBAN: Thank you, Your Honor, with that 3 limitation. 4 Now, our position here is that the evidence that Your 5 Honor heard today conclusively proves that Mr. Demirchyan's 6 date of birth is 1977, July 27th, and the reason for that is 7 simple --8 THE COURT: Let me ask you this question: Why do you 9 say conclusively proved? Is that your burden? Do you have --10 MR. KURZBAN: No --THE COURT: Do you have to show that the evidence --11 12 MR. KURZBAN: The greater --13 THE COURT: What is your burden? 14 MR. KURZBAN: Well, you know, that is -- you raised 15 that at the last hearing, and I think that is actually very, 16 very interesting and undecided question in this circuit and 17 every other, which is when a case comes on remand with respect 18 to the issue of citizenship, No. 1, who really does have the 19 burden? Does the individual have the burden or not? I don't 20 think it's actually very clear, or does the government have the 21 burden? Because, remember, this comes in the context --22 THE COURT: You started out by saying that you're 23 going to conclusively prove something. It sounds as though you 24 were creating a barrier higher than you need.

MR. KURZBAN: I agree.

1 Why do you have to conclusively prove THE COURT: 2 anything? 3 MR. KURZBAN: I don't. THE COURT: You don't even have to do that in a 4 5 criminal case. 6 MR. KURZBAN: Right. 7 THE COURT: All you have to do is meet whatever 8 burden is applicable. And so if you have a burden, it's by a 9 preponderance of the evidence. 10 MR. KURZBAN: Thank you. 11 THE COURT: So let's assume it's your burden and you 12 have to prove it by a preponderance of the evidence, not 13 conclusively. 14 MR. KURZBAN: Thank you, Your Honor. 15 THE COURT: Proceed. 16 MR. KURZBAN: Thank you for the correction. 17 The evidence here demonstrates the following, and I 18 think it's a very clear line: That Susanna Demirchyan 19 attempted, after she came to the United States, and after her 20 son's birth certificate was lost, she made attempts in the 21 early 1990s to obtain a new birth certificate, and she went 22 through one of her neighbors, who subsequently committed 2.3 suicide, and, therefore, obviously wasn't able to complete 24 whatever she had asked her to do. She then turned to --25 THE COURT: When did Susanna come to the United

```
1
     States again? What year?
               MR. KURZBAN: I'm sorry?
 3
               THE COURT: When did Susanna come to the United
 4
     States? What year was that?
 5
              MR. KURZBAN: '88, 1988. I'm sorry.
 6
               THE COURT: And so you say that she almost
 7
     immediately tried to get her son's birth certificate.
              MR. KURZBAN: No, I didn't say that.
 8
 9
               THE COURT: When did she try, first start to get
10
     her --
11
              MR. KURZBAN: Why didn't she try?
12
               THE COURT: When did she first start?
13
              MR. KURZBAN: I think in -- it appears from her
14
     testimony in the mid '90s.
15
               THE COURT: And when was she nationalized? When did
16
     she get her citizenship?
17
              MR. KURZBAN: '95. 1995, Your Honor.
18
               THE COURT: So was it before or after she obtained
19
     her citizenship that she tried to get a birth certificate for
20
     her son?
21
              MR. KURZBAN: I think that's unclear, and I don't
22
     want to misstate that to Your Honor. I mean, she is here, I
23
     guess we can ask her, but it was sometime in the mid 90s that
24
     she made that effort. The effort turned out to be
25
     unsuccessful.
```

he has no reason to lie about it or dissemble about it.

She then turned to another neighbor, Asatur, you've heard his testimony today. His testimony was that he did go down, he did obtain the 1997 birth certificate. He was not paid to do it, he was not paid for his testimony today. He was a neighbor, he was a police officer in Armenia. In our view,

And he then said that he, along with a cousin, whose last name -- Khachanyan, pardon me, Khachanyan both found someone -- which in my experience certainly is a very common practice -- to have someone take the birth certificate directly to the United States, someone who is coming here, was a tourist and so forth.

Mrs. Demirchyan's testimony was that she then received that. Asatur's testimony was he was thanked for it, and may have heard there was an acknowledgment that the document was actually received by Susanna Demirchyan. Susanna Demirchyan then said that she turned over the document to her son.

The government, I think, tried to demonstrate, and remember, this is 1997, 15 years ago, that when Mrs. Demirchyan said she gave it to her son and didn't do anything else, that somehow that she was subsequently lying, but the fact is her son testified that he asked his mother to go with him and to accompany him to the immigration office.

The testimony is also very clear that at the

#:1044

immigration office, they were told, both of them testified to this, they were told that immigration would not accept the document, that the -- that he was given what they call a blue slip, which was an address form, to mail the document into immigration.

Mr. Demirchyan then testified that he mailed a copy into immigration. He did not mail the original document into immigration, he kept the document at home. The next time that that document re-appears is when he is in deportation proceedings. He calls his mother from Eloy, which is the detention facility, and asks her to get his birth certificate to prove his citizenship.

She then takes that 1997 birth certificate, she brings it to Eloy, it is presented at the hearing through Mr. Crow, their attorney. And at that time, the judge -- and that's in the transcript -- turns and basically says, look, this document isn't authenticated. You have a document -- and I might add, the translation was made sometime later. I'm sure the government is going to bring this out.

If you look at Exhibit 109, there is the document in '97, and the translation is later on, apparently in 2000. I don't know why that's so. But the document was translated later on, and is presented, and the judge believes — and I think there is actually an issue of law there, because I think it was admissible, but he believed it was not admissible at the

time and that it needed all the bells and whistles, the authentication and so forth, and returns the document.

They first turned to the government and asked the government to authenticate it, and the government says it's going to take a long time. Mr. Demirchyan is still in detention. At that point, they all agree that Mrs. -- Susanna Demirchyan can take the document and get it authenticated.

Her testimony is that, in fact, she did take the document. She brought it to -- and this is now ultimately resulting in Exhibit 109, we now have the proof through her ticket, her airplane ticket, that, in fact, in November of 2000 she does return to Armenia and gets that 1997 document authenticated.

The 1997 document, you have heard testimony from a person we believe is an expert witness in this case, and she has testified that it's an authentic document. Has all the markings, based on her experience working in that agency, that it has all the markings of an authentic document.

Mrs. Demirchyan takes that document to the Department of Justice and they keep it, which is why we don't have the original document, and why under the Federal Rules of Evidence we believe the copy is admissible and valid evidence, because the original no longer exists and is now, I think, probative evidence to establish the validity of the copy and the original and what happened to it.

So at that point, the document is then taken to the 1 2 ministry; the ministry authenticates it properly. This is now 3 Exhibit 109. It's then authenticated by the United States 4 Consulate, and she returns with it. 5 The transcript that you have now, Exhibit 134, 6 indicates that the document, in fact, was returned, was 7 authenticated, and was admitted into evidence at the time. 8 that's document 108, and that was the document that previously 9 Your Honor had some, I think, questions about, previously not 10 admitting it. I think now we've established the chain of custody with respect to the document and the lawfulness of it, 11 12 and, of course, we'd ask Your Honor to reconsider Your Honor's 13 position with respect to Exhibit 108 in light of that. 14 We believe that based on all of this evidence, and, you know, these are events, of course, that occurred 15 years 15 16 ago, from 1997, and there may be glitches of people's memories. 17 You know, the government made an issue over was it the cousin 18 who gave the document to the person who was coming to the 19 United States versus Asatur giving the document or were they 20 both together when they gave the document --21 THE COURT: One moment. 22 MR. KURZBAN: Sure. 23 THE COURT: Can I see Exhibit 109 for a minute? Who has Exhibit 109? 24

What is the date of Exhibit 109? In other words,

```
1
     when was the certificate, birth certificate, the certified copy
     obtained?
 3
              MR. KURZBAN: In 1997, according to this. It was
 4
    April 29th, 1997.
 5
               THE COURT: When did she get the certification, the
 6
     2000? What date --
 7
              MR. KURZBAN: Oh, I'm sorry. You know, I may have
 8
     confused the numbers, Your Honor. The 2001 is Exhibit 108.
 9
               THE COURT: So that is the -- what is the date of
10
     108?
11
              Can I see 108, Paul?
12
               Yeah.
              MR. KURZBAN: 108 is 2000, I believe. We don't have
13
14
     a copy of 108.
15
               THE COURT: 108 is -- which is the certified copy
16
     that Susanna says she obtained on the trip to Armenia, is dated
17
     December 5, 2000.
18
              MR. KURZBAN: That's exactly right. Because the
19
     plane ticket was November --
20
               THE COURT: I have it.
21
              MR. KURZBAN: Okay.
22
               So -- and obviously, pursuant to Rule 901(b)(1) of
23
     the Federal Rules of Evidence, we believe that both the
     Exhibit 109, which is the 1997 document, and 108 may be
24
25
     admitted into evidence, and we'd point Your Honor to some
```

#:1048

cases -- okay. Primarily a case, Kahn v. Immigration and

Naturalization Service, which is 237 F.3d 1143, with respect to
the admission of the evidence and why Your Honor should
consider it.

So in the end, Your Honor, from our position, we know that obviously there were problems when they first came, obviously the different date was used, but there clearly came a time when they made efforts to get this all straightened out.

And I would point out, the government has always cast doubt on Mr. Demirchyan's credibility because of his perjury conviction. Your Honor has allowed them to the discuss that but --

THE COURT: Isn't it plural? I mean, doesn't he have two convictions that involve dishonesty?

MR. KURZBAN: Yes, there are two, but they all -- but they both, interestingly -- and we would ask Your Honor to consider this -- they both, interestingly, are convictions about getting a phony driver's license with a date that showed that he was older.

So and I understand that perjury convictions, and I understand the issue, but one of the things, since they're beyond ten years, it does require the court to look at the specifics and circumstances and so forth. And here, peculiarly enough, he's not lying about his age to be younger to get the benefit here, he is saying, you know, like many kids at the

time, wanted to get a phony driver's license to show he was 21.

That's the substance of the perjury convictions here.

And I'm not trying to minimize them, but it's one thing for a young man to try and show he is 21 because he either wants a drink or he wants to gamble or something of that nature, and that's the kind of perjury conviction this is, but it's one in which he is trying to make himself older, not younger, to get a benefit for purposes of naturalization.

THE COURT: Anything else to argue?

MR. KURZBAN: Just, Your Honor, in closing, Your Honor, real briefly.

I know that there was obviously some difficulty with these affidavits and the issue of were they in the proper form or not. And I don't want to belabor that point, I just want to point out to the court two things: One is, you heard the testimony. So whatever the ultimate determination is with respect to the validity of the affidavit, you actually heard the underlying testimony, and as you said yourself, and we fully agree, the issue is really the substance of the testimony, not the forms or the affidavit.

The second thing is, with respect to the expert, you heard her testimony. I know the government brought up what is normally a very, very sensitive issue, which is, you know, is there any personal relationship, and you heard her testimony that her daughter was not involved in a personal relationship

with Mr. Demirchyan at the time that this -- that she submitted the affidavit and the time we submitted it to the Court of Appeals.

And, again, just a final point: With respect to the standard, as to our standard, I think Your Honor may wind up writing an opinion for the first time on who really has the burden in this, but as Your Honor pointed out, if we do have the burden, it's only by the greater weight of the evidence. I honestly believe that the government may have the burden here, and if they do, they certainly have not established that burden. Thank you, Your Honor.

THE COURT: All right. Hear from the government.

MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.

First with respect to the burden of proof, the parties throughout this litigation have always agreed that the petitioner bears the burden of proof and it is a preponderance of the evidence, burden of proof regarding his citizenship.

And as the court is aware, this court did hold two evidentiary hearings in 2009, 2010, where it heard testimony from petitioner's brother, as well as the mother, and reviewed documentary evidence, and based on that, it did issue findings of fact, conclusions of law concluding that petitioner had not borne his burden of proof.

Subsequently thereafter, this case did go back up to the Ninth Circuit where petitioner filed a Motion to

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

2.3

24

25

Supplement. As a result of that motion, the Ninth Circuit remanded it back to this court so that it could hold further evidentiary hearing. It cannot be that just because it came down from remand, that somehow the government has now been shifted the burden of proof. The only thing the Ninth Circuit wanted this court to do was to hold further evidentiary hearing --THE COURT: But the petitioner maintains that as a matter of law, in the context of a petitioner challenging deportation, that the government has the burden of proof, and the petitioner argues that, at a minimum, the question is unsettled. So forgetting for the moment the history of the litigation, how do you address the plaintiff's contention regarding burden of proof? MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I believe the parties had previously submitted briefing on that issue. I don't have it available. THE COURT: I don't recall whether I ever did explicitly rule. Did I, on the burden? MS. CHEN: I don't believe at that time there was a dispute as to the burden of proof, Your Honor. The government is happy to go back and look at it and submit any supplemental briefing if the court --THE COURT: But, I mean, the first question, obviously, is who has the burden of proof and by what standard.

1 And the petitioner contends that it's the government's burden and not his. So other than what has been briefed so far, you 3 have no further input. MS. CHEN: I do not, Your Honor, simply because I did 4 5 not --6 THE COURT: All right. Then let's proceed with your 7 argument. 8 MS. CHEN: I just want to be very brief about this. 9 In terms of counsel got up here and talked about the government 10 taking issue with certain of the witnesses' testimonies based on the fact it was 15 years ago, or that we're trying to cast 11 12 doubt on petitioner's credibility simply because he has perjury 13 convictions. It goes beyond that. 14 With respect to 1997, there have been very many 15 different versions of the story as to how the birth certificate 16 was obtained. With respect to petitioner, as his testimony 17 revealed, he first, at the very beginning of this litigation, 18 in written responses which he signed under penalty of perjury, 19 first stated that it was faxed by a neighbor, Lucy, who is now 20 since deceased. 21 He then said in a deposition that, again, as part of 22 the record for this case, that a cousin, Hovanisyan Khachanyan, 23 was, in fact, the person who received the power of attorney,

obtained the birth certificate, and then sent it by messenger

or by courier or a tourist to him and his mother in 1997.

24

1 Then his declaration, which constitutes his direct 2 testimony today, all of a sudden points out to Asatur Guyumjyan 3 as actually being the person. Frankly, Asatur Guyumjyan has --4 THE COURT: Being the person for what? 5 MS. CHEN: As the person who obtained the power of attorney in 1997, Armenia, obtained the birth certificate in 6 7 question, and then sent it to the United States for --8 THE COURT: But today the testimony was that 9 Asatur -- what was his last name? 10 MS. CHEN: Guyumjyan, I believe, Your Honor. THE COURT: -- Guyumjyan and Khachanyan delivered the 11 12 passport to this unnamed tourist's home, and I thought there 13 was testimony in another proceeding, or maybe in this 14 proceeding, that Asatur delivered the passport to this unknown 15 tourist at the airport. 16 MS. CHEN: That's correct, Your Honor. I believe 17 Mr. Guyumjyan's declaration stated it was at an airport. In 18 his written declaration, however, on cross he then said that he 19 gave it to this tourist at the tourist's house, I believe. 20 With respect to the mother's testimony today, both in 21 her direct written declaration, as well as in her 22 cross-examination, again, in -- previously in a deposition, in 2.3 2009 she had stated that the cousin, Hovanisyan Khachanyan, had --24 25 THE COURT: I can't understand what you're saying.

1 These names are difficult and you're not saying them clearly. Start again. 3 MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. 4 With respect to the mother's testimony in the 5 deposition 2009, she had testified that a cousin by the name of 6 Hovanisyan Khachanyan had obtained the birth certificate for 7 her. 8 In her declaration, which was submitted as her direct 9 testimony, it now states that it was, in fact, Asatur 10 Guyumjyan. And then again on cross-examination, and on 11 redirect, it became Asatur Guyumjyan and this cousin together 12 who helped obtain the birth certificate. 13 With respect to the testimony of Asatur Guyumjyan, as 14 the court pointed out, there is no translation even though on 1.5 the stand he stated that he could not read English. 16 THE COURT: Translation for what? 17 MS. CHEN: For his English language declaration. 18 THE COURT: I know. But whatever is involved in that 19 question, the substance of his position was explored. 20 MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. 21 Subsequently thereafter --22 THE COURT: What about -- I find it interesting, 23 certainly not determinative, but curious, that the mother was able to produce an Aeroflot ticket of now 12 years ago, and she 24

hasn't produced this -- even a copy of this power of attorney.

1 MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Go ahead.

MS. CHEN: Thank you, Your Honor.

Just to finish up with respect to Mr. Guyumjyan's testimony, it came out on questioning with the attorney that's affiliated with Mr. Kurzban's firm that they had used a translator by the name of Angie Markosyan to help translate for Mr. Guyumjyan, and subsequently thereafter he signed the English language document as a result.

It's come out through testimony today that Angie
Markosyan is another witness's daughter by the name of Zara
Hovanisyan, the last witness the court heard. And as she
testified on cross-examination, her daughter is, in fact,
dating the petitioner, and while she may not have -- while her
daughter may not have been dating the petitioner when she
signed her declaration, which I believe was in August of last
year, I believe her testimony was that she has known the
petitioner for two years, Your Honor.

So we believe that all of the witnesses are somehow affiliated with the petitioner, either a relative, in the form of his mother, Mr. Guyumjyan, who had never appeared before this court or otherwise been referenced prior to the submission of his declaration, who also apparently was a family friend and a neighbor of the Demirchyans in Armenia, I believe he said for 12 years.

1 With respect to Ms. Hovanisyan, she has produced a workbook which shows that she worked for the archives. 2 3 However, in her own declaration, as well as on 4 cross-examination, she did admit that she worked in a different 5 division. I believe she stated that the division holding the official birth certificates were in the same building and she 6 7 had some sort of experience with birth certificates, but on 8 cross-examination she admitted that she has no training in 9 terms of authenticating birth certificates, she's never been 10 asked in her official duties at the archives to authenticate birth certificates. All her declaration says is that she 11 12 believes that the stamps are located in the exact right 13 locations where they should be on an Armenian birth certificate 14 based on the fact that she worked for the archives, I believe 15 from 1978 to 1983. 16 THE COURT: Which is 14 years before this 17 certificate; isn't that right? 18 MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor, I believe so. 19 And with respect, finally, to the 1997 birth 20 certificate again, the court had previously asked the 21 government --22 THE COURT: Isn't it true -- and isn't it, of 23 course -- there was some reference in the case, but it's 24 something the court can take notice of -- that when she worked 25 in the archives, she, herself, at least the work record

indicates she was working for the communist country at that point, Armenia was a communist country as part of the Soviet Union. And whatever bureaucratic system existed then, it could have been much different 14 years later when Armenia became a separate state, was not part of the Soviet Union, and the communist government no longer existed.

So what I'm suggesting is that it isn't so easy to accept that even if she did recognize something as looking authentic 14 or 15 years ago, the world changed dramatically at that point. And there's a serious question as to whether what she experienced in 1978 to 1983 was the same circumstance that existed in 1997.

MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.

With respect, again, to the 1997 birth certificate, what the testimony came out today was she somehow obtained the 1997 birth certificate from an individual traveling here, and obtained it and then was subsequently asked by the immigration court to get it authenticated.

The court previously, this court previously, Your
Honor, had ordered the government to investigate through a
search of the government's possession of petitioner's A File as
to when the government first came into the possession of the
1997 birth certificate in question, and I refer the court to
document Pacer No. 71, which was the government's brief which,
amongst other things, talked about it, and the record shows

```
1
     that the government first got possession or came in possession
     of a copy of this 1997 birth certificate in question through
     petitioner's then counsel, Mr. John Crow, during the removal
 3
 4
     proceedings.
 5
               THE COURT: What year was that?
               MS. CHEN: I believe, Your Honor, it was enclosed
 6
 7
     with an interoffice memorandum dated October 8th, 2000, and I
 8
     have submitted the relevant --
 9
               THE COURT: Is that what prompted the immigration
10
     judge to require the petitioner to get it authenticated?
               MS. CHEN: Yes, your Honor.
11
12
               THE COURT: And I don't think that is in dispute, or
13
     is it?
14
              MS. CHEN: I don't believe it is in dispute, Your
15
     Honor.
16
               THE COURT: Yeah. All right. You made it sound like
17
     it was in dispute.
18
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, the only other thing I wanted
19
     to talk about was in terms of the 1997 birth certificate is
20
     based on Mrs. Demirchyan's own testimony. She testified that
21
     she took a 1997 birth certificate to get authenticated in
22
     Armenia, and that the Armenian authorities, instead of
23
     authenticating the 1997 birth certificate itself, in actuality
     then re-issued it in the form of a 2000 birth certificate,
24
25
     which is, I believe, Exhibit 108, which petitioner had
```

```
1
     previously attempted to introduce and which this court found to
     be --
 3
               THE COURT: I can't understand what you're saying.
 4
    mean, it's your issue. You're not speaking clearly.
 5
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, let me try again.
               So the 1997 birth certificate in question, which is
 6
 7
     Exhibit 109 --
 8
                   (Discussion held off the record)
 9
               MS. CHEN: Exhibit 109, Your Honor, which is the 1997
10
     birth certificate, the petitioner's mother today testified that
     she had returned to Armenia in 2000 to get it authenticated
11
12
     because the immigration judge had asked her to do so.
13
               THE COURT: So that is not in dispute.
14
               MS. CHEN: That's not in dispute, Your Honor.
               She then went back -- it's also not in dispute that
15
16
     she did, in fact, take it back to go to -- she went back to
17
     Armenia to get authenticated. However, she was told, based on
18
     her testimony, that the Armenian officials believed that the
19
     1997 birth certificate was torn, was too old, in bad condition,
20
     and they actually never authenticated that 1997 birth
21
     certificate.
22
               Instead, they issued a new one in the form with a
23
     issue date -- issue year of 2000, which I believe is
     Exhibit 108. So Exhibit 109, which is a 1997 birth certificate
24
25
     in question, appears to have never been authenticated by the
```

1 Armenian officials, based on Mrs. Demirchyan's own testimony. 2 THE COURT: Well, why isn't the petitioner contending 3 that it was in the sense that it was a two-step process? 4 the 1997 birth certificate was presented, and because of its torn condition, it was then that -- and on the basis of the 5 6 1997 certificate, that a new certificate was issued. 7 MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor. 8 THE COURT: I mean, why is that so inconsistent? MS. CHEN: Your Honor, it's not inconsistent. 9 10 2000 birth certificate, which is Exhibit 108, which the court found inadmissible previously, I believe the court found it 11 12 inadmissible based on testimony that had -- that petitioner's 13 mother had already presented previously. She represented it 14 today in the form of describing the circumstances under which 15 she got the 2000 birth certificate reissued. 16 We believe that there's no reason to change the 17 court's previous finding that the birth certificate was 18 inadmissible. The new -- the information that she presented 19 today does not change the fact that it is hearsay, that it's 20 not a public record, so the government does believe that 21 Exhibit 108 --22 THE COURT: But we have to separate two evidentiary questions: One is whether the Exhibit 108 -- that's the 2000 23 24

certified copy of the birth certificate -- is self-authenticating or whether it is admissible through some

other foundation involving circumstantial evidence. So in terms of it being self-authenticating, it isn't.

But the hearing was regarding whether she can establish a foundation through circumstantial evidence, and you're saying that even as a foundational matter, her testimony that she received the certificate, as she described, cannot be considered as a foundational matter.

MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Why is that?

2.3

MS. CHEN: I believe, Your Honor, that the information contained in that record itself is still hearsay. The fact that the birth year says 1976, while it -- while she may have shown facts to prove that she had, in fact, gone to Armenia and received this document, the fact that she received the document itself does not attest to the veracity of the information contained on that birth certificate.

THE COURT: In other words, you're saying that even if it happened the way she described it, there's still a question as to whether the person who certified the birth certificate did that as an independent matter, that is, based upon records that existed within the ministry, or based upon something that was told or given to the authenticating person.

MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.

THE COURT: But why couldn't the petitioner argue that when she presented the 1997 certificate, birth

```
1
     certificate, Exhibit 109, that that's evidence that the
    ministry in 2000 recognized it as being authentic and just
     issued a new certificate with an authentication? If she's
 3
 4
     credited, wouldn't that be a foundation?
 5
               MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I think it would be a
 6
     foundation, and they probably are arguing that, but the
 7
     government's issue is that the 1997 certificate itself is not
 8
     authenticated. And so what the -- we just don't know, under
 9
     the circumstances, how the Armenian archives or office issued
10
     the 2000 birth certificate. In other words --
11
               THE COURT: But there was testimony from this last --
12
               MS. CHEN: Ms. Hovanisyan.
13
               THE COURT: From Ms. Hovanisyan, H-o-v-a-n-i-s-y-a-n?
14
               MS. CHEN: Yes, Your Honor.
15
               THE COURT: She said that she recognized the stamp on
16
     the 1997 certificate, correct?
17
               MS. CHEN: I believe she did, Your Honor.
18
               THE COURT: So the 1997 certificate was a duplicate;
19
     is that right?
20
               MS. CHEN: I believe so, Your Honor.
21
               THE COURT: Because how else would that be in
22
     evidence? I mean, I thought she turned that in.
2.3
               MS. CHEN: I believe the testimony, Your Honor, was
24
     that she took the original and they did take it and reissue the
25
     2000 one.
```

```
1
               THE COURT: So which is the -- so what is it that
 2
    Ms. Hovanisyan testified to? Was it the 1997 certificate or
 3
     the 2000 certificate? I mean, are they the same?
 4
              MS. CHEN: Your Honor, my recollection is she
 5
     testified that the 1997 one, all of the markings were
 6
     consistent with what she believed would be on an Armenian birth
 7
     certificate.
 8
               THE COURT: So the 2000 certification, does it -- is
 9
     it the same as the 1997 birth certificate?
10
              MS. CHEN: I don't believe so, Your Honor.
11
               THE COURT: There are two different documents,
12
     correct?
13
              MR. HOFFMAN: (Nodding head up and down)
               THE COURT: So Ms. Hovanisyan, she would have had to
14
     have seen a copy of the 1997 certificate, not the original.
15
16
              MS. CHEN: That's correct, Your Honor.
17
               THE COURT: Correct?
18
              MS. CHEN: Yes.
19
               THE COURT: I see. All right.
20
              MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I have nothing further.
21
              MR. KURZBAN: Your Honor, may I just --
22
               THE COURT: Yes, yes.
23
              MR. KURZBAN: One is, I'd like to point out to Your
24
     Honor a -- I think a very significant case, and I apologize for
```

not doing this before, Garcia v. Portuondo, 459 F. Supp. 2d

#:1064

267. It's the Southern District of New York case in 2006.

It's almost on -- directly on point on this issue of the document, only in the context of the Dominican Republic.

It says, "Any competent evidence probative of the fact that the documents were from a Dominican law enforcement agency likely would have sufficed. Upon hearing testimony that one of Garcia's friends or relatives retrieved the documents from a Dominican official, in a public office, where such documents are kept" -- and this was a jury trial -- "a reasonable juror could have concluded that the documents were authentic."

And then they quote later, "If a writing is claimed to be an official report or record of a public government agency, and is also proved to have come from the proper public office where such official papers are kept, it is generally agreed that this authenticates the offered document as general."

THE COURT: I'll look at the case certainly, but it does seem odd that a jury was making a determination regarding the authentication of a document because that almost always is a court question. So the case certainly has to be read carefully.

MR. KURZBAN: And, Your Honor, just two other quick points. First of all, Ms. Chen talked about the deposition that, as far as I know, is not in evidence, which is the

1 deposition of Susanna Demirchyan, and I'm not sure the 2 interrogatories are in evidence, but even if the 3 interrogatories --4 THE COURT: I thought the interrogatories were in 5 evidence, because I seem to recall, even at my prompting, that 6 a foundation be laid for them, and I think she -- Ms. Susanna 7 Demirchyan did say she signed the responses. So they're in 8 evidence. 9 MR. KURZBAN: Yes. 10 THE COURT: The deposition, is that in evidence? MS. CHEN: Your Honor, I believe petitioner signed 11 12 the interrogatory responses, and I believe they were in 13 evidence. Her -- Mrs. Demirchyan's deposition is not in 14 evidence. 15 THE COURT: Then why can't that be received? I mean, 16 did you -- unless you -- you want her to explain that? 17 MR. KURZBAN: Well, I mean, our position is simply 18 this, Your Honor: First of all, with respect to the deposition, she can't use it in a closing argument when it was 19 20 never in evidence and never received. You pointed out to her during the course of her cross-examining Susanna Demirchyan --21 and I know this is a bench trial -- but you pointed out to her 22 23 that she really didn't impeach in the proper way. As you know, and as you pointed out, when you impeach someone, you say, you 24

know, did you have a deposition on this day, did you ask this

1 question, did you give this answer, and so forth. 2 THE COURT: I agree with you that the usual format 3 wasn't observed. I don't recall the -- Ms. Chen asking those 4 questions, which were required unless there was a stipulation 5 between the parties that the deposition could be received. 6 There is no such stipulation. 7 MR. KURZBAN: No, there was no such stipulation --8 THE COURT: Then I don't think I can consider her 9 argument about any inconsistency with the deposition. 10 MR. KURZBAN: With respect to the interrogatories, Your Honor, the only thing I would point out is the 11 12 interrogatory that they used was a compound interrogatory. Why 13 no one objected to it, I have no idea. But if you look at the 14 interrogatory, it asks about all the birth certificates at 15 once. So when the answer comes down as an A, B, C, D, it's 16 almost impossible to tell what Susanna Demirchyan's answering 17 to. And I would just ask Your Honor, you know, to take a look 18 at that, and as to whether or not it's impeachment of any kind. 19 Thank you, Your Honor. 20 MS. CHEN: Your Honor, just for clarity of record, 21 it's actually petitioner's responses to interrogatories, not 22 Susanna Demirchyan's. 23 THE COURT: Oh. And just let me ask you one final question, because this is sort of the overlay to the whole 24

case, and this is not to infer that the court is disregarding

the explicit testimony and just painting the evidence with a broad brush.

But at the first cut, so to speak, it is a bit much to accept the petitioner's basic story and the story as regarding the certification of 2000, the -- no, no, strike that. I'm talking about the 1997 birth certificate.

Because understanding that Armenia is not a westernized country, and Armenia may be described by many as a third-world country, I think most people would describe it as an essentially poor, undeveloped third-world country. This is not to demean the culture or the people, but that's the fact.

And the looming question is why would the petitioner or his mother trust an unknown tourist — unnamed tourist to bring such a valuable document to their possession from Armenia? What was to prevent them putting it in the mail or some other resource, and I must assume, notwithstanding the third-world nature of the country, there was some other resource. And it is — and then to further compound that curiosity, it's in evidence that there was a duplicate of the 1997 birth certificate.

So in the event that it was mailed or sent and somehow lost, they had a duplicate. And the contortions that are described, forgetting for the moment an individualized assessment of credibility, are troublesome because the basic story is so unbelievable.

1 Well, Your Honor --MR. KURZBAN: THE COURT: I want to give you an opportunity to let 2 3 you respond to that. 4 MR. KURZBAN: Right. And I have to tell you, I 5 appreciate sincerely that you brought these two issues up. 6 I've been an immigration lawyer for over 30 years, and I can 7 tell you it is very common, and I would ask --8 THE COURT: When you tell me that is your personal 9 experience, I can't accept that. Now you're a witness and 10 I'm -- you have to put your lawyer hat on. You can't tell me 11 anecdotally. 12 MR. KURZBAN: Right. But I guess what I'm saying is I don't think Your Honor can, in all fairness to my client, 13 14 speculate because a document was --15 THE COURT: I'm not speculating. I want to make it 16 clear that I'm not. I'm just saying that this is not a normal 17 way of doing things under anyone's lifestyle, even in 1997, 18 even understanding that there may be some differences in the 19 way people do things in third-world countries. 20 I'm not saying, just for that reason, it couldn't 21 have happened, but I have to point out that the beginnings of 22 this story are difficult to accept.

guess my view is I respectfully disagree that this actually is

a common way in which people bring documents from third-world

MR. KURZBAN: And I appreciate that, Your Honor.

2.3

24

countries, that when they're not in business, when it's not a professional company engaging in business, that it actually is the most common --

THE COURT: Let's even accept that that is -- what you say is so. The other matter that is troublesome is that the mother, Susanna, never testified that she was told who the person was who was going to bring it, when they were going to bring it, and even today, she testified that, notwithstanding what she claims to be a pretty good memory about things, she didn't remember whether the document was brought to her house or whether she met the person somewhere else. Now, you know, this is a pretty important thing.

MR. KURZBAN: Yes.

THE COURT: And she can't remember who the person was, whether they brought it to her house, or whether she met them at a coffee shop. So that further concerns me.

And I'm only saying these things so that you have a fair opportunity to give me an argument against my inclination.

MR. KURZBAN: Right. I would acknowledge to Your
Honor that I think that is a hole in the evidence but I really
believe it's a small one when you look at the total picture.

That is, when you look at everyone else's evidence here, where
they did say they got the document, they did say what they did
with it, you would have to really disbelieve every single
witness that you heard today, I think, in order to reach the

conclusion that that document was never obtained and was never brought to her. THE COURT: Let me say this: I haven't reached a conclusion. I'm going to think about it, but it wouldn't be difficult to disbelieve every witness on the petitioner's behalf. It wouldn't be difficult. All right. Matter will stand submitted. MR. KURZBAN: Thank you, Your Honor. (Proceedings concluded at 5:00 p.m.)

| | #.1071 | |
|----|--|-------------------|
| 1 | CERTIFICATE | |
| 2 | | |
| 3 | I hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and | |
| 4 | correct transcript from the stenographic record of | |
| 5 | the proceedings in the foregoing matter. | |
| 6 | | |
| 7 | | November 23, 2012 |
| 8 | /S/ | |
| 9 | Deborah K. Gackle Official Court Reporter | Date |
| 10 | CSR No. 7106 | |
| 11 | | |
| 12 | | |
| 13 | | |
| 14 | | |
| 15 | | |
| 16 | | |
| 17 | | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |

| 78 (3) 118/23 120/10 127/14 88 (11) 15/16 88 (11) 15/16 88 (11) 15/16 88 (11) 15/16 89 (12) 15/14 15/15 (11) 15/15 89 (12) 15/14 15/15 (13) 15/14 1 | | 145 (1) 2/10 | 224 [2] 42/20 44/2 |
|--|---|--|--|
| 76 (1) 148/1 78 (3) 118/23 120/10 127/14 183 (2) 120/11 127/14 183 (2) 120/11 127/14 183 (2) 120/11 127/14 183 (2) 120/11 127/14 185 (2) 120/11 127/14 185 (2) 120/11 127/14 185 (2) 120/11 127/14 185 (2) 120/11 127/14 185 (2) 120/11 127/14 196 (2) 120/11 127/14 196 (2) 120/11 127/14 197 (2) 120/11 120/14 197 (2) 120/11 120/14 197 (2) 120/11 120/14 197 (2) 120/11 120/14 197 (2) 120/11 120/14 197 (2) 120/11 120/14 197 (2) 120/11 120/14 197 (2) 117/24 121/21 197 (3) 130/11 140/24 140/21 140/ | | | |
| Total 14891 1892 12901 12714 1871 1982 12916 1921 208 2016 18870 18871 1818 1818 1818 1818 1346 11 1802 1818 | 71-11-121/21 | 155/15 161/11/166/2 | 22nd [5] 12/16 18/21 18/23 25/6 116/6 |
| SS 12 12011 12714 14820 14820 1595 131515 1756 13105 1757 13 1323 1371 1319 1323 1371 1319 1323 1323 1311 1323 1323 1311 1323 1323 1311 1323 1323 1311 1323 1323 1311 1323 1323 1311 1323 1323 1311 1323 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1313 1311 1319 1313 1313 1311 1319 1323 1313 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1323 1311 1319 1311 1311 1323 1311 1319 1311 1311 1323 1311 1319 1311 | | 16 [6] 7/9 7/16 7/21 22/10 22/11 47/14 | 23 [7] 50/12 55/23 79/11 79/11 79/21 79/21 |
| 1746 11 106/25 1746 11 106/25 1746 11 106/25 1747 13473 1747 13473 1747 13473 1747 13473 1747 13473 1747 13473 1747 13473 1747 13473 | | | |
| 986 [1] 151/14 996 [2] 58/11 105/12 996 [2] 58/11 105/12 997 [12] 44/22 44/25 44/25 44/25 45/15 56/15 66/25 64/22 110/10 110/13 110/14 131/15 155/21 148/23 976 [1] 45/14 44/25 44/25 44/25 45/15 66/15 66/25 64/22 110/10 110/13 110/14 131/15 155/21 977 [1] 45/14 5/14 5/14 5/14 5/14 5/14 5/14 5/1 | | | |
| 98 [2] 88/11 151/17 99 [2] 88/11 10822 97 [12] 44/23 44/25 44/25 44/25 61/25 16/5 97 [12] 44/22 44/25 44/25 44/25 44/25 61/5 65/5 97 [12] 44/22 44/25 44/25 44/25 44/25 16/5 65/5 97 [12] 44/22 44/25 | | | |
| 99 [2] 88/11 108/22 97 [12] 44/23 44/25 44/25 45/1 56/1 56/5 64/23 110/10 110/13 110/14 131/15 153/21 1007 [1] 17/3 19/12 [1] 17/4 121/21 19/12 [1] 17/4 121/21 19/12 [1] 17/4 121/21 19/12 [1] 17/4 121/21 19/12 [1] 17/4 121/21 19/12 [1] 17/4 121/21 19/12 [1] 17/4 121/21 19/12 [1] 17/4 121/21 19/12 [1] 17/4 121/21 19/13 [1] 18/08 13/2 [1] 17/4 121/21 19/2 [1] 17/4 1 | | | |
| 6422 11070 11071 11074 13175 15371 1771 12717 12717 12717 12717 17718 1772 17718 1772 177 | | | = = |
| Value 11 45/8 145/8 | '97 [12] 44/23 44/25 44/25 45/1 56/1 56/5 | | |
| When | | | = = |
| 1976 [3] 39/1 1488 179/12 1977 [14] 142/ 143 145 1478 217 1337 135/1 149/11 149/6 | | | |
| 1977 14 142 143 145 148 147 1337 1376 10060 11 29 | viieii [1] 45/14 | | |
| 18/11 18/08 18/2 14/01 14/02 14/32 14/35 | / | | |
| 1978 71 1178 1187 12124 1224 1228 20 16 13 132 1471 131/15 1337 1566 1567 | /S [1] 180/8 | | |
| 1988 11 172 17 178 187 187 1274 1224 1228 1983 71 178 187 12725 1224 1228 1983 71 178 187 12725 1224 1228 1983 71 178 187 12725 1224 1228 1983 71 178 187 12725 1224 1228 1983 71 178 187 12725 1224 1228 1983 71 178 187 12725 1224 1228 1983 71 178 187 12725 1224 1228 1983 71 178 187 12725 1224 1228 1983 71 178 187 12725 1224 1228 1983 71 178 187 12725 1224 1228 1983 71 178 187 12725 1224 1228 1983 71 178 187 12725 1224 1228 1992 11 1925 1992 11 1517 1995 11 1 | 0 | | = = |
| 1983 17 1178 1187 121/25 122/4 122/8 123/4 122/8 123/4 123/8 131/9 22712 151/5 1998 13 131/9 22712 151/5 1998 13 131/9 22712 151/5 1998 13 131/9 22712 151/5 1998 13 131/9 22712 151/5 1998 13 131/9 22712 151/5 1998 13 131/9 22712 151/5 1998 13 151/7 1988 31 31/9 22712 151/5 1998 13 151/7 1998 13 151/7 1998 13 151/7 1999 13 7/22 9/23 10/22 11/1 131/6 13/23 13/9 131/3 131/3 131/9 131/3 131/9 131/3 131/9 131/3 131/9 131/3 131/9 131/3 131/9 131/3 131/3 131/9 131/3 131/3 131/9 131/3 131 | | | |
| 16 11 14 12 15 16 16 17 16 17 16 17 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 | | | |
| 1-6 11 141/22 10 13 22/10 22/11 148/20 10 13 22/10 22/11 148/20 10 10 171 171/3 104 11 195/21 108 130 75/23 76/3 76/12 76/22 77/8 77/13 77/4 177/13 77/4 177/20 78/3 78/7 78/15 | | | 3 |
| 1-6 11 141/22 190 3 121/0 2271 148/20 190/17 [1] 118/21 190 21 190 25 190 27 191 25 190 27 | 1 | | 30 [1] 177/6 |
| 10 31 22/10 22/11 148/20 1992 11 1925 130 | | | 305-444-0060 [1] 2/9 |
| 104 11 95/24 109/11 95/24 109/11 107/11 77/20 78/3 76/12 76/21 76/22 77/8 77/13 77/14 77/20 78/3 76/12 76/21 76/22 77/8 77/13 77/14 77/20 78/3 78/7 78/15 78/17 81/3 81/3 28 25/8 82/6 82/12 83/1 139/7 139/9 139/15 15/8 15/5/13 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 15/6/15 15/6/4 | | 1992 [1] 9/25 | |
| 107 11 77/3 108 363 75/23 76/3 76/12 76/21 76/22 77/8 77/13 77/14 77/20 78/3 78/7 78/15 78/17 81/4 81/22 82/5 82/6 82/12 83/1 139/7 139/1 39/15 158/8 158/13 156/8 156/10 156/11 156/13 156/14 156/15 156/24 167/25 168/24 94/12 159/15 169/23 109/13 37/3 73/17 31/21 31/22 31/22 31/23 159/38 139/5 137/13 139/11 139/12 139/24 139/25 140/1 153/20 154/10 155/3 158/23 155/24 155/25 156/24 168/7 168/9 168/24 171/1 161/13 73 30/14 30/19 140/6 140/8 140/20 141/1 141/2 146/25 147/6 143/11 17/24 122/13 169/25 147/6 143/11 17/24 122/13 169/25 147/6 143/11 17/24 122/13 169/25 147/6 143/14 143/24 144/25 144/3 144/13 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 | | | |
| 108 36 7523 763 76/12 76/21 76/22 77/8 77/13 77/14 77/20 783 787 7815 7817 7817 7817 7817 7817 7817 7817 78 | | | |
| 77/13 77/14 77/20 78/3 78/7 78/15 78/17 81/48 13/12 22/5 22/6 22/5 26/8 21/2 23/1 23/1 23/1 23/1 23/1 23/1 23/1 | | | |
| 81/4 81/2 82/5 82/6 82/12 83/1 139/7 139/9 139/15 158/5 155/6 156/6 156/12 156/14 156/13 156/14 156/15 156/24 167/25 168/24 169/10 169/21 169/23 93/8 95/16 95/19 100/20 108/8 112/15 93/13 3/17 31/7 31/2 31/22 31/22 32/3 93/8 95/16 95/19 100/20 108/8 112/15 123/33 129/15 137/13 139/11 139/12 139/24 139/25 140/1 153/20 154/10 155/3 155/24 155/24 155/25 156/24 168/7 168/9 168/23 155/24 155/25 156/24 168/7 168/9 168/23 155/24 155/25 156/24 168/7 168/9 168/23 155/24 155/25 156/24 168/7 168/9 168/23 155/24 155/25 156/24 168/7 168/9 168/23 155/24 155/25 156/24 168/7 168/9 168/23 155/24 155/25 156/24 168/7 168/9 168/23 157/2 114/10 143/16 143/15 11/2 143/25 147/6 114/3 11/3 17/24 12/2 114/2 143/24 12/2 12/24 144/3 144/3 12/2 13/39/2 144/14 144/3 12/2 13/39/2 144/2 144/3 12/2 144/2 144/3 144/3 12/2 144/2 144/3 144/3 12/2 144/2 144/3 144/3 12/2 144/2 144/3 144/3 12/2 144/2 144/3 144/3 12/2 144/2 144/3 144/3 144/3 12/2 144/2 144/3 144/3 144/3 12/2 144/2 144/3 144/3 144/3 12/2 144/2 144/3 1 | | | |
| 156/13 156/14 156/15 156/24 167/25 168/24 169/10 169/21 169/23 169/23 169/23 169/23 169/23 13/17 31/17 | 81/4 81/22 82/5 82/6 82/12 83/1 139/7 139/9 | | = = |
| 169/10 169/21 169/23 109/31 3/17 31/17 31/17 31/12 31/22 31/22 32/3 93/8 95/16 95/19 100/20 108/8 112/15 123/23 129/15 137/13 139/11 139/12 139/25 161/14 161/25 162/6 165/19 166/12 166/14 4/12/78 [1] 118/23 123/23 129/15 137/13 139/11 139/12 139/25 166/16 166/23 167/2 167/19 167/21 167/23 402.1 11/24 13/25 155/24 155/25 156/24 168/7 168/9 168/24 168/9 168/19 168/20 168/25 146/94 41/13 11 16 16/24 29/3 88/8 99/15 99/20 101/9 110 100 37 30/14 30/19 144/6 144/3 111 15 30/14 30/19 144/6 145/15 115 30/14 30/19 144/6 145/15 115 30/14 30/19 144/6 145/15 115 30/14 30/19 144/6 145/15 115 30/14 30/19 144/6 145/15 114 21 146/25 147/6 1143 11 125 114 21 146/25 147/6 1143 11 1724 20 15 15 / 13 12 146/25 147/6 1148 11 1724 20 15 15 / 13 12 146/25 147/6 110 11 1724 20 12 12 146/25 147/6 110 12 100/15 101/9 102/13 102/23 163/24 164/25 12 12 141/14 141/3 102/23 163/24 164/25 12 12 141/14 141/3 102/23 163/24 164/25 12 12 141/14 141/3 102/23 163/24 164/25 12 143/24 12 11 141/14 141/2 12 141/14 141/3 12 12 141/14 141/3 12 12 141/14 141/3 12 12 141/14 141/3 12 12 141/14 141/3 12 100/12 100/15 101/9 102/13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 13 148/20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 13 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 20 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 1 | | | |
| 109 331 31/17 31/17 31/21 31/22 31/22 32/3 93/8 95/16 95/19 100/20 108/8 112/15 13/12 139/11 139/12 139/14 139/12 139/14 139/12 139/14 139/14 149/14 | | | 3rd [1] 145/22 |
| 938 95/16 95/19 100/20 108/8 112/15 123/23 129/15 137/13 139/11 139/12 139/24 139/25 140/1 153/20 154/10 155/3 155/23 155/24 158/25 156/24 168/7 168/9 168/25 155/24 155/25 156/24 168/7 168/9 168/25 155/24 155/25 156/24 168/7 168/9 168/25 155/24 155/25 156/24 168/7 168/9 168/25 171/1 11 [6] 16/24 29/3 88/8 99/15 99/20 101/9 110 [10] 3/7 30/14 30/19 140/6 140/8 140/20 141/2 143/24 144/3 144/13 111 [5] 30/14 30/19 140/6 140/8 140/20 141/2 143/24 144/3 144/13 111 [5] 30/14 30/19 144/3 145/6 145/21 112 [2] 145/10 145/15 114 [2] 146/25 147/6 1143 [1] 157/2 118 [1] 3/8 119 [2] 146/25 147/6 11b [1] 117/24 12 [15] 9/20 25/1 25/19 26/8 44/19 47/13 48/6 100/1 100/12 100/15 101/9 102/13 102/23 163/24 164/25 120 [6] 140/6 140/8 140/20 141/1 141/2 143/24 121 [2] 141/2 141/3 120 [6] 140/6 140/8 140/20 141/1 141/2 133/8 129 [2] 141/10 141/6 128 [1] 3/8 129 [2] 141/10 141/6 128 [1] 3/8 129 [2] 141/10 141/6 128 [1] 3/8 129 [2] 141/10 141/6 129 [3] 21/22 23/23 44/21 130 [4] 8/14 28/14 118/7 121/24 131 [3] 141/25 142/3 142/5 142/8 142/8 132 [1] 143/17 134 [2] 141/23 145/5 15/5 134 [2] 141/23 145/5 15/5 134 [2] 141/23 145/5 15/5 134 [2] 141/23 145/5 15/5 134 [2] 141/23 145/5 15/5 134 [2] 141/23 145/5 142/8 142/8 134 [2] 141/23 15/5 134 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 120 108/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 1 | | | 4 |
| 123/23 129/15 137/13 139/11 139/12 139/12 13 | | | 4/12/78 [1] 118/23 |
| 139/25 140/1 153/20 154/10 155/3 155/23 168/6 168/9 168/19 168/20 168/20 168/20 168/20 169/20 13/24 15/25 15/26 15/24 15/25 15/26 | | | |
| 171/1 11 16 16/24 29/3 88/8 99/15 99/20 101/9 110 110 13/7 30/14 30/19 140/6 140/8 140/20 141/12 143/24 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 144/3 145/6 145/21 115 38 32 210/17 101/23 1:15 38/4/2 210/17 101/23 1:15 38/4/2 210/17 101/23 1:15 38/4/2 210/17 101/23 1:15 38/4/2 210/17 101/23 1:15 38/4/2 210/17 101/23 1:15 38/4/2 210/17 101/23 1:15 38/4/2 210/17 101/23 1:15 38/4/2 21/1 | | | |
| 11 [6 16/24 29/3 88/8 99/15 99/20 101/9 110 101 37 30/14 30/19 140/6 140/8 140/20 111 15 30/14 30/19 140/13 145/6 145/21 115 31 84/22 101/17 101/23 115 5.00 11 179/9 111 15 5.00 11 179/9 111 15 5.00 11 179/9 114 14/25 147/6 114 11 17/2 20 15 15/7 42/2 42/11 79/11 140/3 200 11 2/8 200 13 30/1 30/19 144/3 145/6 145/21 20 114 11 17/2 20 15 15/7 42/2 42/11 79/11 140/3 200 11 2/8 200 12 22/25 24/2 | | | |
| 110 10 377 30/14 30/19 140/6 140/8 140/20 141/2 143/24 144/3 144/13 134/13 131/13 | 1 Table 1 | | |
| 141/2 143/24 144/3 144/13 115 2007 [1] 102/10 1:40 P.M [1] 85/2 5th [4] 43/6 43/22 44/4 50/11 112 [2] 145/10 145/15 5th [4] 145/6 145/21 114 [2] 146/25 147/6 1143 [1] 157/2 200 [1] 2/8 2000 [13] 2/8 2000 [14] 13/8 2000 [15] 13/17 13/23 19/18 20/3 20/12 34/25 35/1 38/9 38/11 56/2 56/14 57/6 66/12 57/15 71/4 71/5 71/6 71/8 76/5 76/15 79/13 117/24 117/24 117/24 118/11 157/2 117/2 117/10 117/24 117/24 117/2 1141/3 117/24 118/2 119/2 | | | 5 |
| 111 30/14 30/19 144/3 145/6 145/21 | | | 5:00 [1] 179/9 |
| 112 [2] 145/10 145/15 114 [2] 146/25 147/6 1143 [1] 157/2 118 [1] 3/8 119 [2] 146/25 147/6 119 [2] 146/25 147/6 119 [2] 146/25 147/6 119 [2] 146/25 147/6 119 [1] 117/24 12 [15] 9/20 25/1 25/19 26/8 44/19 47/13 48/6 100/1 100/12 100/15 101/9 102/13 102/23 163/24 164/25 120 [6] 140/6 140/8 140/20 141/1 141/2 143/24 121 [2] 141/2 141/3 12697 [1] 13/19 127 [1] 141/3 128 [1] 3/8 129 [2] 141/10 141/16 129 [1] 148/20 130 [8] 3/18 141/23 141/25 142/8 142/8 142 [1] 143/17 133 [4] 3/17 139/7 141/1 143/17 133 [4] 141/25 155/5 134 [1] 143/17 135 [1] 143/17 136 [1] 143/17 137 [1] 141/3 138 [1] 141/25 155/5 132 [1] 143/17 133 [2] 141/23 155/5 132 [1] 143/17 133 [2] 141/23 155/5 134 [3] 141/25 155/5 135 [1] 143/17 14 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 143 [2] 9/11 9/20 20 [5] 15/7 42/2 42/11 79/11 140/3 200 [1] 12/8 2000 [1] 12/8 2000 [1] 12/8 2000 [1] 12/8 2000 [1] 12/8 2000 [1] 12/8 2000 [1] 13/8 15/6 15/6 15/6 15/6 15/6 15/6 15/6 15/6 | 111 [5] 30/14 30/19 144/3 145/6 145/21 | | |
| 1143 [1] 157/2 20 [5] 15/7 42/2 42/11 79/11 140/3 60 [1] 3/6 609 [2] 22/25 24/2 118 [1] 3/8 2000 [45] 13/17 13/23 19/18 20/3 20/12 620-1149 [1] 1/25 119 [2] 146/25 147/6 34/25 35/1 38/9 38/11 56/2 56/14 57/6 66/12 77 71 71/7 71/5 71/6 71/8 76/5 76/15 79/13 71 [2] 118/1 166/24 77 71 71/7 71/5 71/6 71/8 76/5 76/15 79/13 71 71 71 71 71 71 71 | | | 6 |
| 1149 11 1/25 200 12 18 2000 45 13/17 13/23 19/18 20/3 20/12 20/14/16 119 21 146/25 147/6 34/25 35/1 38/9 38/11 56/2 56/14 57/6 56/12 57/15 71/6 71/8 76/5 76/15 79/13 70/273 163/24 164/25 120 61 140/6 140/8 140/20 141/1 141/2 143/24 2001 12 155/8 2002 21 144/14 144/20 2001 11 15/8 2002 144/14 144/20 2006 11 173/1 2007 21 96/5 145/22 2008 11 12/16 2009 13 81/8 141/23 141/25 142/8 142/9 142/10 142/12 13/18 13/17 13/19 13/18 141/25 142/8 143/21 141/3 2007 22 96/5 145/22 2008 11 12/16 2009 13 8/15 8/16 12/18 28/14 42/20 43/22 44/4 50/11 145/8 159/19 162/23 163/5 31/13 141/25 142/8 143/8 2012 15 1/18 4/18/21 13/17 2016 13/17 2016 11 159/19 2016 13/17 | | | |
| 118 [1] 3/8 119 [2] 146/25 147/6 11th [1] 117/24 12 [15] 9/20 25/1 25/19 26/8 44/19 47/13 48/6 100/1 100/12 100/15 101/9 102/13 102/23 163/24 164/25 120 [6] 140/6 140/8 140/20 141/1 141/2 143/24 121 [2] 141/2 141/3 12697 [1] 13/19 127 [1] 141/3 128 [1] 3/8 129 [2] 141/10 141/16 121 [3] 8/14 28/14 118/7 121/24 13 [1] 148/20 13 [3] 318 141/23 141/25 142/8 142/8 142 [1] 13/17 13 [4] 317 139/13 143/15 13 [1] 148/20 13 [1] 148/20 13 [1] 148/20 13 [1] 148/20 13 [1] 141/3 13 [1] 148/20 13 [1] 148/20 13 [1] 141/3 13 [1] 148/20 13 [1] 141/3 13 [1] 148/20 13 [1] 141/3 13 [1] 148/20 13 [1] 141/3 13 [1] 148/20 13 [1] 141/3 155/5 13 [1] 148/10 13 [1] 141/3 155/5 13 [1] 148/10 13 [1] 141/3 155/5 13 [1] 141/3 155/5 13 [1] 141/3 155/5 13 [1] 141/3 155/5 13 [1] 141/3 155/5 13 [1] 141/3 155/5 13 [1] 141/3 155/5 13 [1] 141/3 155/5 14 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 14 116 61 13/17 15 12 181/13 166/24 17 10 11/25 17 12 118/1 166/24 167/15 71/6 71/8 76/5 76/15 79/13 18 (4) 11 156/6 156/13 156/17 167/7 18 (6/15 76/15 79/13 18 (4) 11 166/24 1706 [1] 180/10 1707 [2] 19/6 12 100 [1] 159/19 12 100 [1] 159/19 12 100 [1] 159/19 12 100 [1] 159/19 12 100 [1] 159/19 13 141/25 142/13 143/15 13 [1] 141/25 142/13 143/15 13 [1] 141/25 142/13 143/15 13 [1] 141/25 142/13 143/15 13 [1] 141/3 141/3 143/15 13 [1] 141/3 143/17 13 [1] 141/3 143/17 13 [1] 141/3 143/17 13 [1] 141/3 143/17 13 [1] 141/3 143/17 13 [1] 141/3 143/17 13 [1] 141/3 143 | | | |
| 119 2 146/25 147/6 | | | |
| 11th [1] 117/24 12 [15] 9/20 25/1 25/19 26/8 44/19 47/13 48/6 100/1 100/12 100/15 101/9 102/13 153/21 154/11 156/6 156/13 156/17 167/7 102/23 163/24 164/25 167/24 168/11 168/23 169/10 169/15 169/23 171/2 171/10 171/25 172/3 172/8 176/5 75 [2] 22/10 22/11 143/24 2001 [1] 156/8 2002 [2] 144/14 144/20 2005 [1] 173/1 2007 [2] 96/5 145/22 2008 [1] 173/1 2007 [2] 96/5 145/22 2008 [1] 12/16 2009 [13] 8/15 8/16 12/18 28/14 42/20 43/6 141/23 141/25 142/8 142/8 142/9 142/10 142/12 131 [3] 141/25 142/8 142/8 142/9 142/10 142/12 131 [3] 141/25 142/13 143/15 132 [1] 148/37 2017 [5] 1/18 4/1 85/1 148/23 180/7 2017 [5] 1/18 4/1 85/1 148/23 180/7 2017 [5] 1/18 4/1 85/1 158/4 218 [4] 43/20 44/2 44/19 47/13 218 [4] 43/20 44/2 44/19 47/13 218 [4] 43/20 44/2 44/19 47/13 22 [6] 15/5 48/5 66/7 66/11 66/25 67/14 220 [6] 47/14 81/25 82/2 82/4 82/12 82/16 141/2 11/2 141/2 11/20 221 [1] 48/6 | | | |
| 48/6 100/1 100/12 100/15 101/9 102/13 102/23 163/24 164/25 120 [6] 140/6 140/8 140/20 141/1 141/2 143/24 121 [2] 141/2 141/3 12697 [1] 13/19 127 [1] 141/3 128 [1] 3/8 129 [2] 141/10 141/16 13 [1] 148/20 13 [8] 3/18 141/25 142/8 142/8 142/9 142/10 142/12 13 [3] 141/25 142/13 143/15 132 [1] 143/17 133 [4] 3/17 139/7 141/1 143/17 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 134 [2] 141/23 158 135/21 154/11 156/6 156/13 156/17 167/7 167/24 168/11 168/23 169/10 169/15 169/23 171/2 171/10 171/25 172/3 172/8 176/5 2001 [1] 156/8 2002 [2] 144/14 144/20 2006 [1] 173/1 2006 [1] 173/1 2007 [2] 96/5 145/22 2008 [1] 12/16 2009 [13] 8/15 8/16 12/18 28/14 42/20 43/6 43/22 44/4 50/11 145/8 159/19 162/23 163/5 2010 [1] 159/19 2011 [8] 18/21 18/23 25/6 76/1 103/23 106/14 116/6 127/3 209 [1] 132/13 21 [7] 3/23 15/5 15/7 50/23 51/7 158/1 158/4 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 134 [4] 140/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 144 2[1] 3/18 220 [6] 47/14 81/25 82/2 82/4 82/12 82/16 221 [1] 48/6 | | 67/15 71/4 71/5 71/6 71/8 76/5 76/15 79/13 | - |
| 102/23 163/24 164/25 | | | |
| 120 [6] 140/6 140/8 140/20 141/1 141/2 | | | |
| 143/24 | | | |
| 121 [2] 141/2 141/3 12697 [1] 13/19 127 [1] 141/3 128 [1] 3/8 129 [2] 141/10 141/16 12th [4] 8/14 28/14 118/7 121/24 13 [1] 148/20 130 [8] 3/18 141/23 141/25 142/8 142/8 142/9 142/10 142/12 131 [3] 141/25 142/13 143/15 132 [1] 143/17 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 13 [4] 11/25 142/18 144/1 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 143 [2] 9/11 9/20 1200 [1] 13/18 2002 [2] 144/14 144/20 2006 [1] 173/1 2007 [2] 96/5 145/22 2008 [1] 12/16 2009 [13] 8/15 8/16 12/18 28/14 42/20 43/6 43/22 44/4 50/11 145/8 159/19 162/23 163/5 2010 [1] 159/19 2011 [8] 18/21 18/23 25/6 76/1 103/23 106/14 116/6 127/3 2012 [5] 1/18 4/1 85/1 148/23 180/7 209 [1] 132/13 2012 [5] 1/18 4/1 85/1 148/23 180/7 209 [1] 132/13 21 [7] 3/23 15/5 15/7 50/23 51/7 158/1 158/4 213 [1] 1/25 218 [4] 43/20 44/2 44/19 47/13 220 [6] 47/14 81/25 82/2 82/4 82/12 82/16 221 [1] 48/6 2002 [2] 144/14 144/20 2006 [1] 173/1 8 88 [2] 28/15 29/2 89 [1] 3/7 8th [1] 167/7 9 9 90012 [2] 1/24 2/19 901 [1] 156/22 90s [1] 151/23 9725 [1] 13/17 975 [2] 13/21 14/11 9:45 A.M [1] 4/2 9th [1] 30/4 A | | | |
| 12697 [1] 13/19 | | | |
| 127 11 141/3 2007 2] 96/5 145/22 2008 1] 12/16 2009 13 8/15 8/16 12/18 28/14 42/20 43/6 2009 13 8/15 8/16 12/18 28/14 42/20 43/6 2009 13 8/15 8/16 12/18 28/14 42/20 43/6 2009 13 8/15 8/16 12/18 28/14 42/20 43/6 2009 13 8/15 8/16 12/18 28/14 42/20 43/6 2009 13 8/15 8/16 12/18 28/14 42/20 43/6 2009 13 8/15 8/16 12/18 28/14 42/20 43/6 2009 13 8/15 8/16 12/18 2010 13 15/9/19 162/23 163/5 2010 13 159/19 2011 83 18/21 18/23 25/6 76/1 103/23 2011 83 18/21 18/23 25/6 76/1 103/23 2012 23 1/24 2/19 2011 23 13/17 2012 53 1/18 4/1 85/1 148/23 180/7 209 13 132/13 2012 53 1/3 1/3 2012 53 1/3 1/3 2012 53 1/3 1/3 2012 53 1/3 1/3 2012 1/3 2012 1/3 1/3 2012 1/3 1/3 2012 1/3 1/3 2012 1/3 1/3 2012 1/3 1/3 2012 1/3 1/3 2012 1/3 1/3 2012 1/3 1/3 2012 1/3 1/3 2012 1/3 1/3 2012 1/3 1/3 2012 1/3 1/3 2012 1/3 1/3 1/3 1/3 1/3 1/3 1/3 1/3 1/3 1/3 1/3 1/ | | 2006 [1] 173/1 | 8 |
| 129 [2] 141/10 141/16 12th [4] 8/14 28/14 118/7 121/24 13 [1] 148/20 130 [8] 3/18 141/23 141/25 142/8 142/8 142/9 142/10 142/12 131 [3] 141/25 142/13 143/15 132 [1] 143/17 133 [4] 3/17 139/7 141/1 143/17 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 14 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 142 [1] 3/18 143 [2] 9/11 9/20 2009 [13] 8/15 8/16 12/18 28/14 42/20 43/6 43/22 44/4 50/11 145/8 159/19 162/23 163/5 2010 [1] 159/19 2011 [8] 18/21 18/23 25/6 76/1 103/23 106/14 116/6 127/3 2012 [5] 1/18 4/1 85/1 148/23 180/7 209 [1] 132/13 2012 [5] 1/18 4/1 85/1 148/23 180/7 209 [1] 132/13 21 [7] 3/23 15/5 15/7 50/23 51/7 158/1 158/4 213 [1] 1/25 218 [4] 43/20 44/2 44/19 47/13 22 [6] 15/5 48/5 66/7 66/11 66/25 67/14 220 [6] 47/14 81/25 82/2 82/4 82/12 82/16 221 [1] 48/6 | | | |
| 12th [4] 8/14 28/14 118/7 121/24 13 [1] 148/20 130 [8] 3/18 141/25 142/8 142/8 142/9 142/10 142/12 131 [3] 141/25 142/13 143/15 132 [1] 143/17 133 [4] 3/17 139/7 141/1 143/17 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 14 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 142 [1] 3/18 143 [2] 9/11 9/20 8th [1] 167/7 9 90012 [2] 1/24 2/19 90012 [2] 1/24 2/19 9011 [1] 156/22 90s [1] 15/23 9725 [1] 13/17 975 [2] 13/21 14/11 9:45 A.M [1] 4/2 9th [1] 30/4 A | | | |
| 13 [1] 148/20 130 [8] 3/18 141/23 141/25 142/8 142/8 142/9 142/10 142/12 131 [3] 141/25 142/13 143/15 132 [1] 143/17 133 [4] 3/17 139/7 141/1 143/17 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 14 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 14 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 14 [2] 13/18 14 [2] 9/11 9/20 2010 [1] 159/19 2011 [8] 18/21 18/23 25/6 76/1 103/23 106/14 116/6 127/3 2012 [5] 1/18 4/1 85/1 148/23 180/7 209 [1] 132/13 2012 [5] 1/18 4/1 85/1 148/23 180/7 209 [1] 132/13 21 [7] 3/23 15/5 15/7 50/23 51/7 158/1 158/4 213 [1] 1/25 218 [4] 43/20 44/2 44/19 47/13 22 [6] 15/5 48/5 66/7 66/11 66/25 67/14 220 [6] 47/14 81/25 82/2 82/4 82/12 82/16 221 [1] 48/6 | | | |
| 130 [8] 3/18 141/23 141/25 142/8 142/8 142/9 142/10 142/12 131 [3] 141/25 142/13 143/15 132 [1] 143/17 133 [4] 3/17 139/7 141/1 143/17 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 14 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 142 [1] 3/18 143 [2] 9/11 9/20 2011 [8] 18/21 18/23 25/6 76/1 103/23 106/14 116/6 127/3 2012 [5] 1/18 4/1 85/1 148/23 180/7 209 [1] 132/13 2012 [5] 1/18 4/1 85/1 148/23 180/7 209 [1] 132/13 21 [7] 3/23 15/5 15/7 50/23 51/7 158/1 158/4 213 [1] 1/25 218 [4] 43/20 44/2 44/19 47/13 22 [6] 15/5 48/5 66/7 66/11 66/25 67/14 220 [6] 47/14 81/25 82/2 82/4 82/12 82/16 221 [1] 48/6 | | | |
| 142/9 142/10 142/12 106/14 116/6 127/3 90012 [2] 1/24 2/19 131 [3] 141/25 142/13 143/15 2012 [5] 1/18 4/1 85/1 148/23 180/7 901 [1] 156/22 132 [1] 143/17 209 [1] 132/13 90s [1] 151/23 133 [4] 3/17 139/7 141/1 143/17 21 [7] 3/23 15/5 15/7 50/23 51/7 158/1 158/4 9725 [1] 13/17 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 213 [1] 1/25 975 [2] 13/21 14/11 14 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 218 [4] 43/20 44/2 44/19 47/13 975 [2] 13/21 14/11 1400 [1] 2/18 22 [6] 15/5 48/5 66/7 66/11 66/25 67/14 96/1 [1] 30/4 142 [1] 3/18 220 [6] 47/14 81/25 82/2 82/4 82/12 82/16 143 [2] 9/11 9/20 221 [1] 48/6 | | | |
| 132 [1] 143/17 133 [4] 3/17 139/7 141/1 143/17 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 14 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 1400 [1] 2/18 142 [1] 3/18 143 [2] 9/11 9/20 209 [1] 132/13 209 [1] 132/13 209 [1] 132/13 21 [7] 3/23 15/5 15/7 50/23 51/7 158/1 158/4 213 [1] 1/25 218 [4] 43/20 44/2 44/19 47/13 22 [6] 15/5 48/5 66/7 66/11 66/25 67/14 220 [6] 47/14 81/25 82/2 82/4 82/12 82/16 221 [1] 48/6 | 142/9 142/10 142/12 | | |
| 133 [4] 3/17 139/7 141/1 143/17 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 14 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 1400 [1] 2/18 142 [1] 3/18 143 [2] 9/11 9/20 21 [7] 3/23 15/5 15/7 50/23 51/7 158/1 158/4 213 [1] 1/25 218 [4] 43/20 44/2 44/19 47/13 22 [6] 15/5 48/5 66/7 66/11 66/25 67/14 220 [6] 47/14 81/25 82/2 82/4 82/12 82/16 221 [1] 48/6 | | | |
| 134 [2] 141/23 155/5 14 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 1400 [1] 2/18 142 [1] 3/18 143 [2] 9/11 9/20 213 [1] 1/25 218 [4] 43/20 44/2 44/19 47/13 22 [6] 15/5 48/5 66/7 66/11 66/25 67/14 220 [6] 47/14 81/25 82/2 82/4 82/12 82/16 221 [1] 48/6 975 [2] 13/21 14/11 9:45 A.M [1] 4/2 9th [1] 30/4 A | | | |
| 14 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 14 [4] 106/24 165/16 166/4 166/9 1400 [1] 2/18 142 [1] 3/18 143 [2] 9/11 9/20 218 [4] 43/20 44/2 44/19 47/13 22 [6] 15/5 48/5 66/7 66/11 66/25 67/14 220 [6] 47/14 81/25 82/2 82/4 82/12 82/16 221 [1] 48/6 | | | |
| 1400 [1] 2/18 | | | |
| 142 [1] 3/18 143 [2] 9/11 9/20 | | | |
| 143 [2] 9/11 9/20 221 [1] 48/6 | 142 [1] 3/18 | | |
| | | | |
| 111 [2] 711 721 | 144 [2] 9/11 9/21 | | A-r-u-t-y-u-n [1] 0/3 |
| | | | |
| | | l | l |

A-s-a-t-u-r [4] \(\frac{7}{19}\) 39/2\(\frac{4}{85}\) 14\(\frac{86}{3}\) A.M [1] 4/2 ability [1] 116/24 able [11] 46/12 47/25 50/20 58/1 58/10 87/2 87/15 135/13 135/20 150/23 163/24 about [67] 11/14 19/6 22/17 22/18 24/16 24/18 24/21 25/1 25/22 27/25 30/21 32/5 35/16 37/9 40/7 45/3 53/20 53/21 70/7 77/1 77/20 80/13 80/24 83/22 89/21 98/2 100/22 101/25 102/10 102/14 104/1 104/19 107/7 114/10 118/3 123/21 125/19 126/5 127/7 127/11 128/10 132/4 132/15 136/2 136/17 136/23 137/2 140/3 141/1 143/23 146/7 152/6 152/6 155/9 157/18 157/24 161/8 161/9 163/22 166/25 167/19 173/24 175/9 175/14 176/6 178/9 179/4 above [1] 17/22 absent [1] 54/19 accept [18] 34/5 34/17 54/20 54/20 70/1 72/6 83/10 136/19 138/8 138/16 138/19 143/14 153/2 166/8 176/4 177/9 177/22 178/4 accepted [3] 70/9 137/15 138/22 accompany [1] 152/24 according [4] 130/20 131/6 131/17 156/3 accurate [11] 53/1 89/4 90/13 90/22 91/4 91/11 98/23 99/21 100/16 117/3 122/24 acknowledge [1] 178/19 acknowledgment [1] 152/15 acquaintance [4] 60/2 62/3 62/9 62/11 acquired [3] 129/1 133/9 140/10 across [4] 5/6 42/6 57/25 109/1 action [1] 34/18 actual [5] 12/15 39/5 45/3 108/13 144/13 actuality [1] 167/23 actually [33] 16/25 17/7 20/5 26/24 28/17 36/23 38/14 38/19 41/12 44/21 45/17 51/12 54/7 54/16 78/13 84/10 112/20 114/19 119/22 123/9 124/18 138/7 144/12 149/15 149/20 152/16 153/24 158/17 162/3 168/20 175/21 177/24 178/2 add [1] 153/18 address [11] 34/6 34/15 34/16 34/17 34/20 40/9 65/15 69/17 88/3 153/4 160/13 administration [1] 122/5 admissibility [1] 77/9 admissible [10] 29/17 77/11 146/2 146/5 146/16 146/22 153/25 153/25 154/22 169/25 admission [3] 23/1 141/20 157/3 admit [2] 18/9 165/4 admitted [6] 8/22 24/2 28/23 155/7 156/25 165/8 admitting [2] 146/21 155/10 adopted [1] 41/22 advice [1] 51/22 advise [1] 40/7 advocate [2] 51/24 146/12 advocates [1] 146/12 Aeroflot [1] 163/24 affects [1] 107/5 affidavit [19] 6/21 46/24 57/15 66/7 87/19 94/21 94/22 94/23 94/24 95/16 107/24 126/1 127/3 138/22 140/13 141/11 158/17 158/20 affidavits [3] 106/15 141/3 158/13 affiliated [2] 164/6 164/20 after [46] 7/1 7/22 16/20 16/21 16/22 17/1 17/8 30/20 30/25 33/25 34/3 34/19 42/16 59/16 63/20 69/25 81/11 81/19 82/22 83/5 92/16 102/13 110/14 116/8 117/15 128/16 133/19 134/13 134/18 140/9 140/10 144/5 144/20 145/18 145/19 145/19 145/22 146/1

146/9 148/1 148/2 148/3 148/11 150/19 150/19 151/18 26 Filed 12/06/12 again [70] 9/3 13/2 16/19 19/16 19/19 21/14 22/11 24/24 25/5 28/14 33/9 35/10 37/23 37/24 42/9 44/2 44/3 50/10 50/23 51/6 51/11 55/9 55/15 56/9 56/15 63/24 64/12 64/17 67/12 67/12 81/20 85/8 85/14 89/11 90/21 91/11 94/3 99/20 100/5 100/6 101/8 102/4 102/8 110/23 112/8 118/18 122/3 129/24 131/3 134/15 137/17 141/11 142/13 142/13 142/15 147/3 147/5 147/6 147/15 148/1 148/9 151/1 159/4 161/21 162/22 163/2 163/10 165/20 166/14 168/5 against [3] 31/1 35/1 178/18 age [3] 24/16 24/18 157/24 agency [3] 154/17 173/6 173/14 ago [14] 94/14 95/3 95/5 95/6 95/10 95/14 102/21 103/15 103/19 152/20 155/16 161/11 163/24 166/9 agree [7] 5/2 138/20 146/19 149/25 154/6 158/19 175/2 agreed [6] 29/12 29/16 54/6 76/12 159/15 173/16 agreeing [1] 54/22 agreement [1] 53/1 agrees [1] 52/18 ahead [4] 39/4 98/15 134/10 164/2 airline [2] 114/14 142/5 airplane [2] 142/1 154/11 airport [5] 10/6 102/24 102/25 162/15 162/17 ALBERTO [3] 1/10 4/6 85/6 aliases [1] 24/21 all [94] 4/13 4/25 5/2 5/4 7/4 8/24 12/22 14/6 17/13 18/24 21/6 21/16 26/20 27/8 27/10 27/15 29/23 29/25 31/11 40/11 41/24 47/11 48/3 49/13 52/23 53/10 54/24 55/20 57/9 60/16 61/2 63/12 66/3 66/24 69/10 70/21 71/5 76/20 77/18 78/5 80/5 80/6 81/8 82/15 83/6 83/14 84/16 84/21 96/12 97/10 102/17 106/16 112/23 113/17 116/9 119/8 122/10 124/15 125/11 131/1 136/20 136/25 138/3 138/21 142/11 143/21 145/14 145/23 146/1 147/3 148/1 148/9 148/15 150/7 154/1 154/6 154/16 154/18 155/14 157/8 157/15 159/12 161/6 162/2 164/19 165/11 167/16 172/5 172/19 173/24 174/18 175/14 177/13 179/7 alleged [1] 94/21 allegedly [1] 59/11 allow [2] 54/3 137/4 allowed [2] 5/24 157/11 allows [1] 74/5 almost [6] 98/3 134/3 151/6 173/2 173/20 175/16 along [8] 13/10 13/11 34/3 39/11 114/3 115/9 136/20 152/7 already [6] 20/8 75/25 99/9 109/14 148/18 169/13 also [27] 2/21 4/9 17/9 17/25 20/2 21/1 21/12 21/17 24/18 24/21 30/21 41/22 44/3 46/24 69/2 85/9 92/10 94/7 124/14 127/25 133/11 134/6 142/14 152/25 164/23 168/15 173/14 although [1] 116/16 always [5] 58/8 98/3 157/9 159/15 173/20 am [2] 52/14 133/25 Ambiguous [1] 133/10 American [5] 72/12 72/14 81/20 82/9 145/7 amongst [1] 166/25 ANDRE [1] 2/16 anecdotally [1] 177/11 ANGELES [6] 1/17 1/24 2/19 4/1 34/2 85/1 Angie [4] 105/17 124/22 164/7 164/10 another [14] 9/24 10/20 10/25 48/7 79/2 89/2

104/1 109/1 123/12 126/16 145/7 152/1 162/13 164/11 of 200 answer [44] 10/1 10/5 10/14 22/14 22/18 28/21 29/7 37/25 43/20 44/23 45/1 45/6 45/10 45/19 45/22 45/24 46/3 47/20 47/25 50/17 50/19 51/20 54/12 60/21 80/20 80/21 82/7 82/11 96/4 110/24 112/7 112/8 122/3 123/4 123/5 123/25 123/25 126/23 131/1 134/7 134/10 137/9 175/1 175/15 answered [2] 12/4 123/1 answering [2] 122/1 175/16 answers [8] 11/13 12/19 43/24 52/12 52/19 52/19 54/20 54/21 any [61] 8/3 23/1 24/8 26/24 27/12 27/12 27/17 35/16 36/11 37/9 50/4 50/19 57/9 74/21 77/20 80/7 81/21 83/14 83/17 83/19 83/20 83/21 84/17 92/18 94/10 99/4 101/16 101/16 101/19 104/2 109/4 109/12 109/15 109/16 112/2 113/12 113/18 114/11 119/11 123/16 125/23 126/1 128/23 129/2 130/19 131/5 135/20 138/8 138/15 140/3 140/15 141/5 142/3 143/9 144/8 147/9 158/24 160/22 173/4 175/9 175/18 anybody [5] 28/11 96/15 101/24 107/22 107/24 anyone [9] 5/4 58/13 60/15 71/2 71/8 96/21 97/17 108/18 108/23 anyone's [1] 177/17 anything [25] 29/22 34/5 46/17 51/12 52/3 54/14 58/24 59/21 64/3 64/5 65/1 65/11 75/11 92/21 102/2 107/22 107/24 108/1 108/3 132/15 137/3 137/19 150/2 152/21 158/9 anyway [1] 47/18 anywhere [2] 69/9 81/19 apartment [1] 92/16 apologies [2] 14/5 111/4 apologize [10] 16/23 46/7 48/6 55/7 89/1 99/25 111/12 134/5 146/1 172/24 apostilled [1] 72/18 apparently [7] 31/2 37/2 76/5 77/7 114/13 153/21 164/23 appeal [1] 141/5 Appeals [1] 159/3 appear [8] 75/6 101/12 119/17 129/18 130/1 147/12 147/14 147/15 appearance [1] 101/12 appearances [3] 2/1 4/7 85/7 appeared [2] 36/15 164/21 appears [5] 145/15 147/12 151/13 153/9 168/25 applicable [1] 150/8 application [5] 23/13 24/19 24/22 144/16 145/3 applications [2] 144/9 144/21 applied [4] 30/25 135/6 144/5 144/19 apply [1] 135/7 appreciate [2] 177/5 177/23 approach [8] 6/6 9/12 9/15 11/4 12/11 39/24 52/21 138/13 approached [1] 34/4 appropriate [2] 37/5 49/25 approximately [2] 95/13 106/11 April [8] 13/21 14/11 118/7 121/24 131/15 133/7 145/22 156/4 April 12th [2] 118/7 121/24 April 29th [5] 13/21 14/11 131/15 133/7 156/4 April 3rd [1] 145/22 archival [5] 118/9 118/15 121/23 122/5 archive [4] 58/20 58/22 80/25 120/13 archives [31] 46/12 73/6 73/6 73/7 73/16

160/1 160/8 160/21 161/15 161/16 161/21 archives... [26] 73/18 74/2 74/13 75/10 75/19 77/16 78/16 78/25 79/2 80/13 81/12 117/8 118/11 118/19 122/15 122/23 127/16 127/22 128/18 128/24 128/25 165/2 165/10 165/14 165/25 171/9 are [94] 7/6 7/10 11/7 11/8 14/13 16/3 16/11 16/22 17/15 17/23 23/3 23/9 23/11 23/23 24/3 25/1 30/15 30/17 30/19 31/2 36/11 40/5 43/12 49/5 52/25 54/18 54/19 65/15 68/2 77/1 77/4 78/9 80/7 80/16 86/24 87/2 98/8 102/11 103/6 105/4 105/21 105/22 111/3 114/17 119/16 121/14 124/15 124/19 128/16 130/13 133/24 134/3 137/14 139/14 140/2 140/8 140/9 140/10 140/20 141/3 141/23 141/24 141/25 142/23 143/17 144/4 144/25 145/11 146/5 147/1 147/5 147/7 147/10 147/16 147/18 147/22 147/23 148/4 148/12 155/15 157/15 157/17 163/1 164/19 165/12 171/6 172/3 172/11 173/9 173/15 174/2 176/23 176/24 177/22 area [2] 110/7 131/14 area's [1] 59/4 aren't [2] 23/4 124/18 argue [4] 30/6 37/4 158/9 170/24 argues [1] 160/11 arguing [2] 146/15 171/6 argument [11] 139/1 139/22 142/18 143/8 146/9 148/15 149/1 161/7 174/19 175/9 178/18 Arizona [8] 35/1 35/2 35/3 35/16 35/24 71/1 71/2 83/8 Armenia [59] 8/7 15/17 19/5 19/13 19/24 20/5 21/13 21/18 21/22 22/12 25/21 26/10 37/15 37/16 37/18 42/15 44/22 45/11 55/24 56/10 56/13 57/20 59/7 59/25 72/9 72/11 72/20 76/15 76/18 77/16 79/2 80/13 81/16 83/18 83/19 84/7 92/2 107/21 108/5 128/24 130/6 130/7 137/6 142/1 142/16 152/5 154/12 156/16 162/6 164/24 166/2 166/4 167/22 168/11 168/17 170/14 176/7 176/8 Armenian [61] 13/14 38/22 40/5 41/16 41/18 42/3 42/7 42/25 45/20 50/24 65/17 79/8 79/16 86/24 88/22 89/3 89/13 89/18 89/20 93/12 94/4 94/8 97/7 105/4 106/12 108/13 117/1 118/10 120/3 120/4 120/5 120/16 120/18 120/20 120/21 121/24 123/20 124/5 124/11 124/15 126/16 127/8 130/5 130/6 130/20 130/24 131/5 131/5 131/9 131/17 131/23 132/14 133/1 134/13 145/15 165/13 167/22 168/18 169/1 171/9 172/6 Armenian-language [1] 89/20 arms [1] 130/7 around [3] 8/16 101/5 106/14 ARUTYAN [3] 3/5 4/5 85/5 Arutyan's [2] 73/19 101/6 ARUTYUN [6] 1/7 6/3 6/14 7/12 71/1 125/22 as [121] 6/23 9/21 11/8 11/8 11/14 13/3 13/8 14/14 14/24 18/10 18/18 20/8 22/19 25/5 31/22 34/9 36/12 41/2 49/22 49/23 50/3 51/19 52/11 77/14 78/3 86/8 86/16 89/3 89/4 89/9 91/15 93/7 98/12 98/23 99/16 103/1 105/24 106/21 110/20 111/3 113/13 115/10 115/21 116/4 116/15 116/25 116/25 117/7 117/11 120/24 121/22 122/22 122/23 123/9 123/14 123/19 124/3 124/7 124/15 125/5

127/12 135/1 135/24 136/20 137/4 138/9

140/16 140/21 140/24 141/4 141/15 144/22

146/11 146/22 147/2 147/19 148/13 149/23

158/18 159/5 159/7 159/18 159/20 159/20

162/3 162/5 162/21 162/21 163/8 163/3 12 164/9 164/12 165/3 165/3 166/2 166/8 166/10 166/21 170/5 170/6 170/7 170/19 170/20 171/2 172/9 173/16 173/25 173/25 174/23 174/24 175/15 175/18 176/4 176/8 176/9 ASATUR [40] 3/7 7/18 10/25 38/21 38/25 39/5 39/11 39/12 42/15 58/17 58/18 58/24 59/2 59/10 59/16 60/1 60/13 60/24 61/21 61/22 61/22 62/7 62/13 84/20 84/21 85/13 86/3 86/11 104/20 107/6 107/12 152/1 155/19 162/2 162/3 162/9 162/14 163/9 163/11 163/13 Asatur's [1] 152/14 ask [87] 6/18 6/22 7/9 12/25 13/7 13/10 14/21 14/24 15/13 15/21 16/19 18/17 18/18 19/2 20/24 24/24 25/14 26/16 26/19 29/9 29/19 29/22 30/15 33/13 33/15 35/22 35/24 36/3 40/25 42/1 43/24 44/12 50/22 51/22 51/24 58/13 58/16 58/18 59/21 60/22 61/7 61/9 61/19 64/11 71/4 78/14 78/19 78/20 80/17 89/21 89/21 89/24 90/16 91/7 92/8 92/8 93/1 93/6 94/18 98/17 99/14 100/1 104/4 104/19 110/19 115/20 116/3 117/14 123/3 123/22 123/23 126/12 126/21 128/3 134/11 134/15 136/22 136/22 147/16 149/8 151/23 155/12 157/16 174/25 175/17 175/23 asked [44] 21/17 28/1 29/5 30/21 32/5 34/16 35/19 37/23 38/13 45/25 46/1 46/5 46/10 46/11 51/25 52/12 52/18 54/10 54/12 54/23 56/4 57/14 58/19 69/12 69/19 74/4 74/5 94/16 100/11 103/14 105/11 123/13 126/5 126/11 126/14 128/10 134/2 150/24 152/23 154/3 165/10 165/20 166/17 168/12 asking [20] 18/7 19/20 21/21 21/23 22/14 59/9 59/10 68/4 78/13 100/6 101/5 126/17 126/18 126/19 126/19 130/23 136/15 137/11 137/16 175/3 asks [2] 153/11 175/14 assessment [2] 35/13 176/24 assistance [6] 49/9 49/12 49/16 49/22 49/24 105/6 ASSISTANT [1] 2/17 assisted [2] 39/6 39/9 assume [2] 150/11 176/16 assumes [1] 64/9 at [148] 4/9 5/16 6/18 8/23 9/12 10/9 13/4 18/8 19/20 21/6 25/14 25/15 26/16 27/12 27/16 29/9 31/16 32/2 34/4 34/21 34/23 35/6 35/8 35/20 36/5 37/4 38/3 38/5 40/25 42/2 42/25 47/17 48/15 48/25 49/6 51/2 51/18 52/13 52/20 53/14 61/22 62/9 64/18 64/19 65/3 65/4 65/10 67/4 68/14 69/17 73/3 73/18 74/12 76/17 77/2 77/7 77/9 77/18 77/23 78/9 78/12 78/15 79/4 82/17 83/1 83/2 83/2 83/18 84/7 84/22 85/9 86/15 91/22 92/6 92/23 93/6 93/23 94/3 96/25 99/9 101/5 101/5 101/8 101/17 101/23 102/9 102/24 102/25 102/25 103/2 117/23 117/23 118/2 118/18 119/8 119/19 121/2 122/4 122/15 123/22 127/3 127/4 129/3 131/5 131/9 131/10 132/14 137/13 139/6 145/2 145/20 145/21 145/25 146/10 149/15 152/25 153/8 153/14 153/15 153/20 153/25 154/6 155/1 155/7 157/22 157/25 159/1 160/11 160/20 160/22 161/17 162/15 162/17 162/19 165/10 165/25 166/1 166/9 173/18 174/5 175/13 175/14 175/18 176/3 178/16 178/21 178/22 179/9 attached [4] 87/9 114/4 115/9 119/21 attempt [4] 9/25 33/20 57/18 57/20 attempted [3] 33/19 150/19 168/1

attempting [1] 14/14 attempts [1] 3150/29 00 attention [2] 40/10 132/12 Page ID attest [1] 170/15 attorney [32] 2/16 2/17 2/21 4/10 7/23 35/6 35/8 35/11 35/12 35/19 36/3 36/6 42/16 59/1 59/3 61/21 85/9 91/16 91/18 91/19 104/1 104/2 109/20 109/23 113/8 113/10 138/5 153/15 161/23 162/6 163/25 164/5 attorneys [2] 101/16 101/25 augmented [1] 4/16 August [8] 18/21 18/23 18/23 25/6 106/14 116/6 127/3 164/16 August 22nd [4] 18/21 18/23 25/6 116/6 August 24th [1] 18/23 authentic [13] 143/5 143/7 143/9 146/3 146/6 146/13 146/13 146/22 154/16 154/18 166/9 171/2 173/11 authenticate [4] 56/5 123/13 154/4 165/10 authenticated [24] 19/7 19/14 19/25 37/15 55/25 56/4 71/24 71/25 72/9 72/11 81/14 153/17 154/7 154/13 155/3 155/7 166/18 167/10 167/21 168/11 168/17 168/20 168/25 171/8 authenticates [2] 155/2 173/16 authenticating [5] 165/9 167/23 169/25 170/2 170/22 authentication [8] 77/10 78/11 78/24 79/5 147/3 154/2 171/3 173/20 authenticity [4] 54/1 76/8 140/16 146/7 authorities [2] 13/14 167/22 authority [2] 48/20 48/22 available [1] 160/17 Avenue [1] 2/8 aware [7] 29/23 29/25 36/11 38/15 38/17 103/10 159/18 away [5] 46/3 46/4 46/8 46/9 68/9 awhile [1] 58/9 Ayala [1] 23/13

B

back [20] 18/17 56/13 66/11 67/14 67/21 67/22 68/5 68/8 70/11 75/9 80/22 99/12 107/6 140/19 159/24 160/2 160/22 168/15 168/16 168/16 background [1] 104/1 bad [1] 168/19 barrier [1] 149/24 base [1] 130/4 based [36] 21/9 21/14 22/25 28/24 29/5 54/15 65/19 79/23 90/12 90/13 90/21 90/22 91/4 91/11 98/24 99/21 100/16 112/8 116/24 117/3 122/7 124/19 135/24 142/18 147/3 154/17 155/14 159/21 161/10 165/14 167/20 168/17 169/1 169/12 170/20 170/21 basic [3] 128/19 176/4 176/24 basically [3] 127/20 147/1 153/16 basis [6] 49/1 53/11 53/19 137/14 138/17 169/5 batch [1] 148/12 Bates [1] 82/17 be [106] 5/2 5/4 5/15 5/19 6/5 7/11 9/20 10/17 12/4 12/8 12/13 15/18 16/20 18/3 19/17 22/10 23/1 24/2 24/8 29/24 31/19 31/22 32/3 32/12 36/23 40/2 42/3 45/12 48/14 49/10 50/6 50/10 50/20 57/2 66/19 66/20 77/15 84/2 84/6 86/1 86/8 89/8 89/19 93/6 100/12 103/14 105/22 107/3 114/18 115/4 119/17 123/5 123/21 124/4 126/23 127/7 128/10 128/12 129/18 130/1 134/18 134/20 135/4 135/13 135/19 136/13 136/18 136/23 137/15 138/15 138/23 139/17 139/19 140/15 142/19 143/9 143/10 143/22 143/25

B be... [27] 945/15 147/2 147/14 148/19 151/24 155/16 156/24 157/24 160/3 161/8 165/13 168/2 170/6 171/4 171/5 171/21 172/6 173/13 173/21 174/6 174/15 175/5 176/8 177/18 178/9 179/4 179/6 bears [1] 159/16 became [4] 145/20 146/10 163/11 166/4 because [52] 24/2 32/14 33/13 39/12 46/16 49/3 49/24 58/23 69/23 75/17 76/18 76/22 77/9 80/17 87/22 89/14 94/15 94/17 95/21 98/10 102/21 107/8 110/22 112/17 126/22 130/6 132/3 142/20 143/2 143/5 143/7 146/6 146/9 146/20 149/21 153/24 154/22 156/18 157/10 158/4 160/3 161/4 161/12 168/12 169/4 171/21 173/20 174/5 175/24 176/7 176/24 177/14 become [2] 77/8 146/13 becomes [2] 141/6 143/1 been [34] 12/20 13/15 13/18 13/20 13/22 14/10 18/18 19/6 24/13 32/7 41/1 53/1 75/25 83/23 86/16 89/2 100/15 115/21 126/22 139/8 139/11 144/4 147/9 147/13 148/10 160/4 161/2 161/14 164/15 164/22 165/9 166/4 168/25 177/6 before [33] 6/10 6/19 25/11 29/22 30/10 32/21 40/6 45/2 52/11 53/15 58/10 78/7 80/8 85/16 94/20 95/15 95/24 97/17 98/4 98/12 108/24 111/14 117/1 122/1 125/7 129/16 134/21 139/3 143/18 151/18 164/21 165/16 172/25 beforehand [2] 96/2 96/3 begin [2] 6/11 40/6 beginning [3] 128/3 145/25 161/17 beginnings [1] 177/21 behalf [2] 13/13 179/6 behind [4] 5/11 85/23 108/12 114/25 being [19] 6/23 7/22 8/11 8/14 16/12 27/9 27/25 34/9 34/10 35/15 53/25 66/14 83/19 146/22 148/13 162/3 162/4 170/2 171/2 belabor [1] 158/14 belief [1] 28/23 believe [88] 4/23 5/1 8/21 9/23 14/2 18/22 19/18 21/1 23/21 30/15 30/18 39/2 39/5 41/11 41/12 47/13 51/1 51/2 53/8 53/14 53/15 54/5 54/7 54/9 54/12 54/16 55/5 55/17 56/19 65/21 76/4 79/22 84/19 85/13 85/20 86/8 93/6 96/6 106/14 111/9 113/22 114/3 115/11 124/4 124/10 124/11 137/23 139/9 141/6 142/5 144/8 144/12 144/18 145/6 146/25 154/15 154/22 155/14 156/13 156/23 159/9 160/15 160/20 162/10 162/16 162/19 164/16 164/17 164/19 164/24 165/5 165/14 165/18 167/6 167/14 167/25 168/23 169/11 169/16 169/20 170/10 171/17 171/20 171/23 172/10 174/11 174/12 178/21 believed [3] 153/25 168/18 172/6 believes [2] 153/23 165/12 believing [1] 53/11 bells [1] 154/1 bench [1] 174/22 benefit [2] 157/25 158/8 besides [1] 132/20 best [9] 32/9 90/13 90/23 91/4 91/12 98/24 99/21 100/17 117/3 better [1] 33/15 between [6] 15/5 32/7 58/11 101/22 102/8 beyond [2] 157/22 161/13 binder [4] 23/23 29/9 29/19 29/22

BIROTTE [1] 2/16

birth [194]

births [1] 122/21 bit [2] 75/5 176/36 Filed 12/06/12 bizarre [1] 119/1075 black [1] 29/16/1075 blue [4] 34/6 34/15 69/2 153/3 boat [1] 61/8 Bob [1] 28/19 bold [1] 17/12 book [4] 31/17 77/2 77/4 119/4 born [3] 21/7 124/20 134/22 borne [1] 159/23 both [10] 23/23 84/10 105/23 152/8 153/1 155/20 156/23 157/16 157/17 162/20 bottom [3] 82/17 94/4 119/9 box [3] 70/14 70/16 70/19 break [2] 84/22 114/9 brief [2] 161/8 166/24 briefed [1] 161/2 briefing [2] 160/16 160/23 briefly [5] 25/14 39/21 143/25 146/24 158/11 bring [14] 35/24 37/20 39/14 40/9 45/5 47/24 60/10 60/13 126/5 153/19 176/14 177/25 178/7 178/8 bringing [2] 39/6 51/7 brings [1] 153/14 broad [1] 176/2 brother [2] 96/20 159/20 brought [20] 10/3 11/1 32/8 35/6 35/15 45/7 45/23 46/14 56/6 63/2 63/4 83/7 97/10 142/16 154/9 158/22 177/5 178/10 178/15 179/2 brush [1] 176/2 building [6] 10/13 101/13 101/22 102/9 122/22 165/6 buildings [1] 103/6 built [1] 103/6 bunch [1] 106/14 burden [23] 149/9 149/13 149/19 149/19 149/21 150/8 150/8 150/11 159/7 159/8 159/9 159/11 159/14 159/16 159/17 159/23 160/5 160/10 160/14 160/19 160/21 160/25 161/1 bureaucratic [1] 166/3 business [3] 143/10 178/1 178/2 but [97] 8/16 9/22 9/23 11/16 11/19 15/22 16/20 16/25 18/7 19/23 20/5 20/18 21/1 25/1 28/1 29/4 31/3 41/18 44/3 49/9 50/20 51/11 53/22 54/20 61/7 62/2 62/19 65/14 71/4 76/8 78/3 78/17 88/11 88/20 89/3 92/25 94/13 95/6 95/23 96/23 98/14 103/5 103/25 106/1 106/2 107/3 116/18 119/18 123/11 124/10 132/20 133/3 134/6 138/4 138/18 140/10 141/8 143/7 146/19 147/22 148/4 148/11 148/18 151/23 152/22 153/22 153/25 157/7 157/12 157/15 157/15 157/21 158/3 158/6 159/7 160/8 160/24 162/8 163/18 163/23 165/7 165/23 169/22 170/3 170/24 171/6 171/11 173/18 174/2 174/22 175/13 176/3 176/11 177/12 177/21 178/20 179/4 calculation [1] 86/7

CALIFORNIA [6] 1/2 1/17 1/24 2/19 4/1 85/1 call [11] 7/12 25/20 32/15 39/19 45/14 57/22 62/4 75/22 113/21 141/4 153/3 called [11] 12/3 12/6 34/3 57/20 58/8 63/2 110/15 110/22 111/14 113/1 147/8 calls [7] 39/20 109/6 129/20 135/9 135/15 135/24 153/10 came [17] 25/21 26/10 48/2 63/6 101/22 102/8 140/9 140/15 147/19 150/19 157/6 157/7 160/3 164/5 166/15 166/22 167/1

can [90] 9/17 10/3 11/11 11/16 11/16 14/7 20/21 25/1-27/24 32/17 34/8 35/13 36/17 37/4 38/3 38/20 39/1 41/8 42/2 42/11 42/12 46/6 50/23 54/20 55/15 58/19 60/22 61/6 61/8 64/1 65/25 66/19 67/2 71/4 72/13 76/7 76/8 77/18 77/23 78/15 79/25 86/15 87/12 87/17 87/19 88/11 89/5 91/18 92/2 102/19 103/24 103/25 107/4 110/20 113/17 115/18 115/25 116/17 122/2 123/25 127/7 127/11 130/4 130/11 131/1 131/9 131/9 132/25 133/3 134/1 134/10 136/22 138/11 138/19 139/13 139/17 139/22 140/19 143/22 146/17 147/7 151/23 154/7 155/23 156/11 165/24 170/3 175/8 177/6 177/13 can't [24] 9/15 20/19 40/8 54/20 69/23 73/22 73/23 88/6 88/12 95/2 95/4 95/6 110/10 134/14 134/21 138/16 146/8 162/25 168/3 174/15 174/19 177/9 177/10 178/14 cannot [4] 23/1 40/8 160/3 170/6 caps [1] 17/12 card [1] 24/19 carefully [1] 173/22 CAROL [3] 2/17 4/8 85/8 carried [1] 10/6 carrier [1] 10/6 case [25] 5/5 8/11 12/2 30/6 84/6 103/18 103/20 105/1 106/3 125/19 128/20 135/2 139/1 149/17 150/5 154/15 157/1 159/24 161/22 165/23 172/24 173/1 173/18 173/21 175/25 cases [1] 157/1 cast [2] 157/9 161/11 category [1] 23/7 caught [1] 27/20 central [10] 1/2 73/5 73/6 73/7 73/15 73/18 74/12 75/9 75/19 81/12 certain [6] 35/20 87/17 90/4 98/4 137/13 161/10 certainly [6] 23/8 152/9 159/10 163/23 173/18 173/21 certificate [190] certificates [10] 75/14 75/21 123/9 123/11 123/14 165/6 165/7 165/9 165/11 175/14 certification [3] 156/5 172/8 176/5 certified [7] 67/19 105/19 132/19 156/1 156/15 169/24 170/19 certify [2] 105/22 180/3 certifying [2] 130/19 131/6 chain [2] 68/10 155/10 challenging [1] 160/9 chance [1] 5/21 change [6] 51/12 52/3 54/11 58/8 169/16 169/19 changed [3] 51/9 58/9 166/9 characteristics [2] 135/20 136/12 check [1] 84/5 CHEN [18] 2/17 4/8 4/19 5/20 14/2 32/5 37/23 38/13 54/2 57/14 76/23 77/11 85/8 126/5 128/10 133/21 173/24 175/3 choice [1] 75/8 chronologically [1] 69/23 circuit [6] 30/4 103/19 149/16 159/25 160/1 160/5 Circuit's [1] 148/24 circumstance [1] 166/11 circumstances [6] 24/5 27/25 63/7 157/23 169/14 171/9 circumstantial [2] 170/1 170/4 citizenship [5] 149/18 151/16 151/19 153/12 159/17 city [15] 38/22 56/22 57/1 73/1 92/4 93/19 93/19 93/24 99/1 100/25 103/7 109/24 110/1

130/18 131/14

 \mathbf{C} civii [4] 49/17 49/23 49/25 131/15V - WAN claimed [1] 173/12 claims [1] 178/9 clarification [2] 50/25 128/1 clarify [9] 11/24 15/8 23/18 25/4 101/21 118/17 118/25 129/5 148/7 clarity [3] 67/20 77/25 175/20 clear [12] 75/6 79/4 89/8 123/21 128/10 128/12 133/2 148/19 149/20 150/18 152/25 clearly [5] 75/6 130/8 157/7 163/1 168/4 clerk [6] 6/6 9/13 11/4 39/24 85/21 114/1 client [4] 105/12 105/14 142/19 177/13 Close [1] 125/18 closing [2] 158/10 174/19 co [1] 134/4 co-counsel [1] 134/4 coat [1] 130/7 coffee [1] 178/16 collapsed [1] 58/5 come [19] 45/6 45/16 47/23 69/12 69/18 101/3 101/13 107/6 121/8 121/12 127/24 136/10 136/12 140/20 141/24 150/25 151/3 164/10 173/14 comes [3] 149/17 149/21 175/15 coming [20] 8/18 39/13 39/23 42/19 45/9 45/10 47/18 48/2 59/25 61/17 61/24 62/10 101/4 101/17 102/9 102/14 112/5 113/25 152/11 155/18 comment [1] 98/7 committed [3] 58/12 58/13 150/22 common [4] 152/9 177/7 177/25 178/3 communist [4] 122/17 166/1 166/2 166/6 company [1] 178/2 competent [1] 173/4 complete [4] 94/15 94/16 139/1 150/23 completed [4] 118/14 118/22 118/24 119/4 completely [2] 90/15 132/17 completeness [1] 22/20 complicated [1] 87/24 compound [3] 16/9 175/12 176/18 computer [2] 147/1 147/24 concern [1] 107/9 concerned [1] 77/9 concerns [2] 53/20 178/16 conclude [1] 30/11 concluded [3] 30/4 173/10 179/9 concluding [1] 159/22 conclusion [5] 129/21 136/11 136/13 179/1 179/4 conclusions [2] 76/1 159/22 conclusively [5] 149/5 149/9 149/23 150/1 150/13 condition [7] 73/21 74/24 75/2 75/3 75/3 168/19 169/5 confirm [5] 61/20 83/21 84/13 112/25 141/8 confuse [1] 80/18 confused [1] 156/8 confusion [1] 76/22 consecutive [1] 81/6 consider [4] 20/22 157/4 157/17 175/8 considered [2] 148/22 170/7 consistent [3] 123/19 124/4 172/6 consistently [1] 111/3 constitutes [2] 137/9 162/1 consulate [6] 72/12 72/15 81/20 81/25 82/9 contact [7] 108/23 110/21 111/13 111/20 123/11 127/24 137/5 contacted [6] 60/3 108/18 108/21 108/24 125/19 125/20

contained [3] 117/2 170/11 170/16 contemporaneous [1] 142/20 12/06/12 contending [1] 169/2 contends [1] 161/176 contention [2] 53/12 160/13 contents [4] 12/8 18/3 97/16 98/14 contested [1] 114/18 context [4] 20/22 149/21 160/9 173/3 continue [3] 34/14 39/4 127/1 contortions [1] 176/22 contradicting [1] 46/16 conversations [2] 36/8 109/12 convicted [1] 24/13 conviction [6] 23/14 24/4 24/7 24/9 157/11 158/6 convictions [9] 22/23 23/1 23/4 23/22 157/14 157/17 157/20 158/2 161/13 copies [10] 6/6 9/13 26/21 26/24 27/1 39/24 85/20 92/18 114/1 121/14 copy [34] 25/3 25/10 25/16 26/13 29/15 34/20 41/11 42/3 51/7 52/21 75/22 75/22 77/11 77/12 77/22 78/1 78/2 93/6 94/1 99/9 113/12 113/15 113/16 128/19 153/6 154/22 154/24 156/1 156/14 156/15 163/25 167/2 169/24 172/15 correct [148] 7/4 7/5 7/8 8/5 10/2 11/25 12/1 12/9 12/20 12/21 14/19 14/20 15/19 15/20 17/24 18/3 18/13 19/7 19/14 19/18 19/23 19/25 20/1 20/3 20/4 20/6 20/7 20/9 20/10 20/13 20/14 21/7 21/8 21/10 21/11 21/13 21/15 22/23 24/14 24/19 24/22 24/23 26/14 26/15 27/17 28/6 28/25 30/1 31/20 33/19 33/20 36/15 36/16 38/7 41/20 42/17 42/21 43/4 43/9 45/19 47/19 47/24 49/14 51/9 51/13 52/25 53/7 53/9 53/10 53/12 55/18 55/25 56/4 56/7 56/10 56/12 56/14 57/3 57/6 63/10 66/13 66/15 66/16 66/17 66/19 66/20 66/22 68/3 68/6 68/19 68/21 68/23 68/24 70/3 77/17 78/6 86/25 89/9 89/15 91/5 91/16 92/4 92/12 93/10 93/21 94/5 94/8 94/14 95/20 96/17 99/12 100/20 100/23 101/10 101/11 102/15 102/24 112/12 116/4 116/22 117/9 117/12 117/17 117/25 118/20 120/3 120/17 121/25 122/18 123/14 123/16 124/8 124/12 124/24 134/2 136/14 138/23 140/22 140/25 141/17 144/23 145/4 162/16 171/16 172/12 172/16 172/17 180/4 correction [2] 14/6 150/16 correctly [1] 44/20 corresponds [1] 132/17 could [10] 25/23 35/20 39/14 136/18 139/19 160/2 163/15 166/3 173/10 175/5 couldn't [4] 24/8 62/7 170/24 177/20 counsel [19] 2/1 4/7 23/24 48/14 49/9 49/11 49/13 49/16 49/24 76/25 78/1 85/7 103/17 119/1 119/3 134/4 148/12 161/9 167/3 counsel's [3] 4/9 85/9 123/2 countries [2] 177/19 178/1 country [10] 58/4 58/5 81/15 130/7 166/1 166/2 176/8 176/9 176/10 176/17 courier [1] 161/25 course [8] 25/24 36/18 37/12 97/18 155/12 155/15 165/23 174/21 court [65] 1/1 4/14 5/12 5/22 6/7 7/19 8/18 9/4 9/13 11/20 12/20 18/23 24/3 32/9 36/13 36/14 39/1 39/24 40/7 40/9 41/11 42/23 43/15 52/21 54/4 66/12 67/15 67/20 68/10 76/1 76/17 77/3 85/14 85/21 85/23 101/12 113/23 114/1 114/25 126/10 128/21 135/20 157/22 158/15 159/2 159/18 159/18 160/2 160/6 160/23 163/14 164/12 164/22 165/20 165/24 166/18 166/19 166/19 166/23 168/1 169/10 169/11 173/21 175/25 180/9

court's [8] 40/9 80/23 89/24 90/16 107/9 107/10 128/169/1700 Courthouse [2] 1/23 2/18 Page ID courtroom [3] 5/5 35/2 101/24 courts [1] 35/1 cousin [18] 9/3 10/9 10/10 10/12 39/6 39/9 43/8 55/2 55/11 100/10 101/6 101/9 152/7 155/17 161/22 162/23 163/5 163/11 creating [1] 149/24 credibility [4] 107/5 157/10 161/12 176/24 credited [1] 171/4 crime [1] 23/5 crimes [2] 23/7 23/9 criminal [2] 49/25 150/5 critically [1] 30/10 cross [18] 3/3 4/17 4/19 5/21 5/24 6/16 31/13 40/23 86/13 115/16 138/9 162/18 162/22 163/10 164/13 165/4 165/8 174/21 cross-examination [12] 5/24 6/16 31/13 40/23 86/13 115/16 138/9 162/22 163/10 164/13 165/4 165/8 cross-examine [3] 4/17 4/19 5/21 cross-examining [1] 174/21 Crow [6] 71/13 114/16 142/2 142/14 153/15 167/3 CSR [2] 1/23 180/10 cultivate [1] 127/25 culture [1] 176/11 curiosity [3] 83/25 133/23 176/19 curious [1] 163/23 custody [2] 68/10 155/11 cut [1] 176/3 CV [3] 1/9 4/5 85/5

D D-e-m-i-r-c-h-y-a-n [2] 6/4 40/18 database [2] 147/2 147/7 date [51] 8/16 12/14 18/21 19/18 20/3 20/13 23/14 33/19 43/21 79/9 79/9 79/19 79/19 94/22 95/2 95/24 98/4 98/9 103/12 103/22 117/24 118/1 133/19 133/19 134/12 134/13 134/17 134/18 140/23 144/10 144/14 144/16 144/22 145/8 145/18 145/20 145/22 146/11 146/11 146/12 147/4 147/25 148/5 149/6 155/25 156/6 156/9 157/7 157/18 168/23 180/9 dated [5] 12/16 12/18 18/20 156/16 167/7 dating [3] 125/4 164/14 164/15 daughter [6] 124/22 127/4 158/25 164/11 164/13 164/15 day [8] 21/23 22/15 27/5 27/6 48/3 75/14 75/20 174/25 days [5] 27/3 27/7 27/8 27/10 103/15 dealing [1] 128/25 dealt [2] 123/9 127/20 deaths [1] 122/21 DEBORAH [2] 1/23 180/9 deceased [3] 15/19 109/14 161/20 December [3] 12/16 13/23 156/17 December 22nd [1] 12/16 December 23rd [1] 13/23 December 5 [1] 156/17 declaration [78] 5/23 6/5 6/15 7/13 18/18 18/20 19/16 19/21 20/25 24/25 25/4 25/6 25/19 27/21 39/25 40/2 40/22 41/1 41/9 41/17 42/2 50/23 52/14 55/23 56/12 56/16 56/25 66/21 66/23 85/21 86/8 86/12 88/17 88/18 89/12 90/5 92/3 95/1 95/20 95/25 97/9 97/17 97/17 98/5 98/6 98/12 98/14 101/8 102/23 104/20 105/2 106/12 106/21 114/1 115/9 115/15 115/25 116/15 116/22 117/7 117/15 118/12 119/22 122/14 124/7 138/8 138/12 138/16 162/1 162/17 162/18 162/21

D declaration... [6] 163/8 163/17 164/16 164/23 165/3 165/11 declarations [4] 7/11 98/8 148/12 148/22 declare [2] 7/21 106/22 declared [1] 75/25 declaring [1] 7/6 **DEFENSE [1] 40/21** deficiency [1] 116/18 Definitely [1] 93/25 degree [1] 129/12 deliver [2] 60/24 61/25 delivered [4] 60/25 62/25 162/11 162/14 demean [1] 176/11 DEMIRCHYAN [82] 1/7 3/5 3/6 4/6 4/12 6/3 6/4 6/18 7/16 11/24 12/25 14/9 17/15 17/17 18/17 19/2 19/12 20/24 22/23 23/11 24/13 28/22 31/16 32/5 32/20 34/14 39/21 39/23 40/2 40/7 40/17 40/21 40/25 41/8 41/13 42/1 42/11 44/1 50/11 50/22 55/2 55/14 55/22 56/25 57/12 60/23 65/20 66/7 70/12 72/24 73/19 78/9 85/6 91/20 91/20 102/3 102/10 103/10 107/16 108/16 114/15 125/2 125/4 125/15 125/16 125/22 127/5 138/6 142/6 144/18 150/18 152/16 152/17 152/20 153/6 154/5 154/7 154/19 159/1 174/1 174/7 174/21 Demirchyan's [14] 7/13 92/11 101/25 140/11 141/25 142/15 149/5 152/13 157/10 167/20 169/1 174/13 175/16 175/22 **Demirchyans** [1] 164/24 demonstrate [1] 152/19 demonstrates [1] 150/17 Department [5] 118/9 121/23 132/21 144/19 154/19 deportation [3] 103/10 153/9 160/10 deposition [60] 8/11 8/14 8/17 8/22 9/2 9/9 9/13 21/18 22/4 23/12 28/8 28/9 28/14 28/22 29/2 29/13 29/15 29/17 30/22 39/8 42/20 43/16 43/19 43/21 44/4 44/9 44/16 48/9 48/15 49/1 49/6 49/7 50/11 51/11 51/17 52/2 52/11 52/13 52/14 52/15 52/22 53/3 53/19 54/1 54/2 54/10 54/16 54/20 54/21 161/21 162/22 163/5 173/24 174/1 174/10 174/13 174/19 174/25 175/5 175/9 depositions [1] 52/25 DERMIRCHYAN [1] 6/14 describe [13] 10/4 13/12 19/4 25/20 26/9 42/14 51/7 55/24 78/20 91/15 91/18 102/19 described [7] 117/11 122/15 141/15 170/6 170/18 176/8 176/23 describing [1] 169/14 description [2] 36/22 37/5 desk [2] 65/4 65/11 detecting [1] 136/18 detention [3] 20/9 153/11 154/6 determination [3] 33/14 158/16 173/19 determinative [1] 163/23 determine [1] 24/4 develop [1] 73/23 did [241] didn't [30] 21/19 28/9 28/10 45/17 46/4 46/9 52/7 54/14 56/1 62/23 65/14 68/14 69/8 70/1 70/6 75/6 75/11 92/21 96/2 102/22 102/22 124/21 126/12 139/19 143/19 151/8 151/11 152/21 174/23 178/10 differences [1] 177/18 different [16] 24/21 38/9 42/25 49/12 94/7 124/19 126/19 137/12 146/16 147/18 148/10 157/7 161/15 165/4 166/4 172/11 difficult [5] 111/3 163/1 177/22 179/5 179/6

direct [15] 3/3 5/20 5/23 6/6 6/15-26/19/12 28/13 40/22 46/23 86/12 115/15 132/12 162/1 162/21 163/8 directives [1] 122/17 directly [3] 140/13 152/10 173/2 director [1] 117/22 disagree [1] 177/24 disbarred [3] 49/4 49/4 49/7 disbelieve [2] 178/24 179/5 discovery [1] 78/3 discuss [3] 97/16 97/20 157/11 discussed [2] 32/16 66/8 discussion [3] 46/23 47/8 168/8 discussions [1] 37/9 dishonesty [2] 23/6 157/14 dispute [8] 140/19 160/21 167/12 167/14 167/17 168/13 168/14 168/15 disregarding [1] 175/25 dissemble [1] 152/6 DISTRICT [4] 1/1 1/2 1/5 173/1 division [12] 117/22 122/21 123/12 130/18 131/14 131/16 131/19 133/4 133/4 133/5 165/5 165/5 DMV [7] 23/13 24/19 24/22 33/21 33/22 33/25 106/1 do [172] 4/17 4/17 4/19 4/20 4/21 5/14 6/20 6/23 7/16 7/24 8/14 9/2 9/10 9/11 9/15 10/20 10/24 11/17 11/20 12/2 12/6 13/5 13/24 14/9 15/2 15/6 15/15 17/17 17/17 17/22 18/5 21/17 21/21 21/23 22/13 23/7 23/8 24/1 25/7 25/17 26/22 28/8 28/8 28/20 29/19 33/17 34/1 34/22 36/1 36/12 37/8 37/9 37/13 37/18 43/3 43/13 44/24 45/2 45/3 45/25 46/1 46/1 46/5 46/5 46/9 46/10 48/15 50/14 52/2 53/11 53/14 54/14 55/2 55/4 57/16 58/24 59/2 59/16 59/21 61/4 63/21 63/23 64/3 64/7 64/25 67/2 67/7 72/1 72/5 72/11 72/19 73/7 75/22 77/20 79/7 79/15 80/7 80/21 81/11 81/17 82/21 82/25 83/1 84/17 86/19 86/19 87/8 89/8 92/2 93/10 96/25 97/24 98/10 101/20 102/17 103/4 103/22 104/14 104/20 106/6 107/4 107/7 107/18 108/8 108/8 108/11 109/22 109/23 110/14 110/18 112/4 113/17 114/21 115/23 115/25 116/6 118/4 118/6 123/5 124/1 126/4 127/8 127/18 128/16 128/20 134/5 134/11 139/3 144/6 144/7 145/16 146/3 146/8 147/2 147/3 147/14 149/8 149/9 149/11 150/1 150/4 150/7 150/24 152/4 152/21 159/7 159/10 160/6 160/13 161/4 168/12 177/19 doc [1] 142/21 docket [2] 41/14 42/6 document [196] documentary [1] 159/21 documentation [1] 99/4 documents [52] 11/5 11/5 13/13 18/9 27/13 28/5 31/18 34/17 44/22 45/3 45/4 45/23 46/12 47/17 47/18 47/21 48/1 50/19 81/21 82/21 82/23 82/25 83/21 84/3 109/15 109/16 114/17 114/20 127/9 127/20 127/23 127/25 128/25 129/10 129/10 137/5 140/10 145/1 146/6 146/10 147/19 147/23 147/25 148/4 148/8 148/10 172/11 173/5 173/7 173/9 173/10 177/25 does [38] 8/1 8/3 18/9 49/17 49/18 49/20 49/22 50/2 52/17 64/10 65/20 75/24 76/21 79/23 87/22 95/10 98/22 100/16 101/9 126/9 129/18 130/1 130/19 131/17 131/21 142/6 144/15 148/8 149/18 149/19 149/20 154/12 157/22 169/19 169/20 170/15 172/8 173/19 doesn't [11] 32/13 32/15 34/5 63/7 63/10 76/23 79/11 84/13 98/13 130/8 157/13

difficulty [2] 75/17 158/12

177/17 Page 186 of 200 Page ID Dominican [3] 173/3 173/5 173/8 don't [98] 8/4 8/16 10/23 11/3 11/10 12/5 18/6 21/20 22/1 22/15 25/3 25/8 27/2 27/18 28/17 28/19 30/2 33/13 34/17 37/11 37/19 50/2 51/22 53/8 53/16 54/7 54/14 54/15 59/13 61/8 62/2 62/15 62/16 63/5 63/9 63/11 64/5 65/24 66/2 70/5 74/20 75/11 78/20 79/17 80/1 80/17 94/17 95/11 96/22 96/22 96/23 97/1 97/11 97/14 98/1 101/19 103/12 103/12 106/7 106/22 107/2 111/2 111/17 113/12 114/16 114/21 118/16 119/6 119/17 123/3 123/13 123/16 126/23 132/7 133/24 137/16 141/12 142/23 144/8 146/19 149/19 150/3 150/4 151/21 153/22 154/20 156/13 158/14 160/16 160/18 160/20 167/12 167/14 171/8 172/10 175/3 175/8 177/13 done [3] 42/12 72/6 130/20 doubt [3] 89/25 157/10 161/12 down [11] 39/18 46/6 94/10 103/5 104/8 113/17 137/22 152/3 160/4 172/13 175/15 dramatically [1] 166/9 drink [1] 158/5 driver's [2] 157/18 158/1 dry [2] 94/17 130/8 duplicate [5] 75/22 141/10 171/18 176/19 176/22 during [16] 9/2 12/2 28/4 28/9 28/22 28/23 37/12 43/4 48/9 54/10 71/17 76/6 103/19 129/1 167/3 174/21 duties [4] 122/15 123/10 123/14 165/10 \mathbf{E} each [6] 42/25 43/4 78/19 80/1 107/19 143/25 earlier [3] 47/22 133/22 137/2 early [2] 44/25 150/21 earmarks [1] 137/13 earthquake [1] 58/4 easy [1] 166/7 eat [2] 21/23 22/15 education [6] 128/23 129/2 129/4 136/24 137/2 137/3 effect [2] 24/6 141/8 efficiency [2] 47/14 48/4 effort [2] 151/24 151/24 efforts [1] 157/8 eight [5] 26/17 28/16 91/8 91/14 92/10 either [4] 11/19 113/7 158/5 164/20 Eleven [3] 88/9 88/15 121/21 Eloy [2] 153/10 153/14 else [13] 16/4 58/13 58/16 69/5 69/5 96/21 108/23 130/11 137/19 152/21 158/9 171/21 178/11 else's [1] 178/22 Email [1] 2/10 embassy [1] 83/5 enable [3] 32/13 58/24 109/16 enclosed [1] 167/6 encompass [1] 31/12 end [2] 77/7 157/5 enforcement [1] 173/5 engaging [1] 178/2 English [42] 41/18 41/21 65/16 65/18 65/20 66/1 69/16 79/17 79/23 87/3 87/13 87/15 87/18 87/20 88/17 89/3 89/16 91/22 96/15 105/9 105/12 105/14 106/13 115/18 116/1 116/8 116/12 116/17 116/24 120/14 126/15 131/23 131/25 132/2 132/4 132/8 132/12 132/15 132/18 163/15 163/17 164/9 English-language [3] 96/15 116/8 116/12 enough [2] 111/3 157/24

doing [6] 5/20 33/9 35/10 133/23 172/25

 \mathbf{E} ase, 2:08-69-03452-SVW-MAN entire[1] 87/9 entirely [1] 99/20 entirety [2] 7/1 8/22 entitled [3] 13/1 14/22 78/23 entry [6] 29/23 29/25 118/6 118/14 118/18 error [4] 25/9 25/16 25/22 26/13 essentially [2] 134/15 176/10 establish [2] 154/24 170/4 established [3] 143/11 155/10 159/10 evaluate [1] 137/4 even [16] 53/18 84/14 145/8 146/21 150/4 163/14 163/25 166/8 170/5 170/17 174/2 174/5 177/17 177/18 178/4 178/8 event [4] 50/4 68/1 138/16 176/21 events [1] 155/15 eventually [2] 9/22 46/13 ever [11] 10/24 32/20 32/23 36/6 64/11 64/14 64/17 71/8 89/18 101/19 160/18 every [4] 48/3 149/17 178/24 179/5 everyone [2] 128/8 178/22 everything [2] 47/9 89/3 evidence [54] 8/23 11/14 14/14 18/9 18/15 31/2 41/4 41/6 52/15 54/3 83/17 83/19 84/7 84/11 113/8 139/6 140/1 141/21 141/22 142/12 142/19 149/4 149/11 150/9 150/12 150/17 154/21 154/22 154/24 155/7 155/14 156/23 156/25 157/3 159/8 159/17 159/21 170/1 170/4 171/1 171/22 173/4 173/25 174/2 174/5 174/8 174/10 174/13 174/14 174/20 176/1 176/19 178/20 178/22 evidences [1] 14/18 evidentiary [11] 1/20 8/23 52/17 138/17 138/25 139/20 146/23 159/19 160/3 160/6 169/22 exact [6] 8/16 93/18 93/21 94/13 103/22 165/12 exactly [11] 29/7 37/19 39/9 58/18 95/2 95/7 97/1 124/10 124/15 138/3 156/18 examination [27] 5/20 5/23 5/24 6/15 6/16 16/8 16/10 26/3 30/12 31/13 31/14 40/22 40/23 46/23 57/10 86/12 86/13 107/14 115/15 115/16 125/12 138/9 162/22 163/10 164/13 165/4 165/8 examine [6] 4/17 4/19 4/21 5/21 89/5 143/19 examining [1] 174/21 except [1] 147/10 exception [1] 138/17 excluded [2] 5/2 141/4 exclusively [1] 105/21 excuse [1] 133/8 exhibit [108] 6/10 7/12 7/13 7/16 12/13 12/23 13/3 14/24 18/10 18/15 18/18 19/17 23/22 25/5 30/14 30/18 31/17 31/19 31/20 32/3 40/2 41/2 41/4 75/23 75/25 76/3 77/2 77/4 77/8 78/3 78/7 80/8 80/11 81/4 81/5 81/22 82/5 82/5 82/12 82/25 83/1 86/8 86/16 91/15 93/8 95/1 95/16 95/19 95/24 98/23 99/16 100/20 104/25 105/8 108/8 112/15 115/11 115/21 117/7 117/15 119/20 119/21 119/25 120/6 120/6 120/14 120/19 120/20 120/24 121/23 123/22 126/9 126/15 126/16 128/11 129/15 132/13 137/13 138/18 138/23 140/1 141/13 141/16 141/16 142/12 145/6 145/10 145/15 145/21 153/20 154/10 155/3 155/5 155/13 155/23 155/24 155/25 156/8 156/24 167/25 168/7 168/9 168/24 168/24 169/10 169/21 169/23 171/1 Exhibit 1 [5] 7/13 7/16 18/18 19/17 25/5 Exhibit 104 [1] 95/24 Exhibit 108 [15] 75/23 77/8 78/3 78/7 81/4

81/22 82/12 83/1 155/13 156/8 167/25 168/24 169/10 169/21 169/23 12/06/12 Exhibit 109 1201 31/17 32/3 93/8 95/16 95/19 100/20 108/8 112/15 129/15 137/13 153/20 154/10 155/3 155/23 155/24 155/25 156/24 168/7 168/24 171/1 Exhibit 111 [2] 145/6 145/21 Exhibit 112 [2] 145/10 145/15 Exhibit 129 [1] 141/16 Exhibit 134 [1] 155/5 Exhibit 2 [5] 12/13 12/23 13/3 14/24 18/10 Exhibit 209 [1] 132/13 Exhibit 3 [2] 40/2 41/2 Exhibit 4 [7] 86/8 86/16 95/1 98/23 99/16 104/25 105/8 Exhibit 5 [16] 115/11 115/21 117/7 117/15 119/21 119/25 120/6 120/6 120/19 120/20 120/24 121/23 126/15 126/16 128/11 138/18 Exhibit 6 [3] 138/23 141/13 141/16 Exhibit 9 [2] 31/19 31/20 Exhibit A [1] 6/10 exhibited [1] 135/21 exhibits [17] 11/14 30/17 85/17 114/3 139/7 140/2 140/6 140/8 140/8 140/18 140/20 141/22 141/23 141/24 146/25 147/5 148/12 existed [4] 166/3 166/6 166/12 170/21 exists [1] 154/23 expect [1] 123/5 experience [19] 118/19 122/8 127/7 127/8 127/10 127/11 129/1 129/19 130/2 133/18 134/17 135/5 135/7 135/19 137/12 152/9 154/17 165/7 177/9 experienced [1] 166/11 experiences [1] 118/3 expert [6] 129/21 135/16 135/24 137/9 154/15 158/21 explain [10] 32/9 36/17 38/20 66/19 66/25 67/12 67/16 77/6 134/1 174/16 explanation [1] 119/19 explicit [1] 176/1 explicitly [1] 160/19 explored [2] 84/14 163/19 extent [3] 87/17 134/21 142/4 extracted [1] 37/14 F.3d [1] 157/2 facial [1] 98/2

facility [1] 153/11 fact [40] 11/1 20/8 21/21 23/1 28/22 31/1 34/10 43/8 48/25 52/19 53/2 54/12 76/1 84/14 98/13 99/1 99/5 124/18 124/24 125/1 125/2 125/4 148/4 152/22 154/8 154/11 155/6 159/22 161/11 161/23 163/9 164/13 165/14 168/16 169/19 170/12 170/13 170/14 173/5 176/11 facts [2] 24/5 170/13 faded [1] 124/7 fair [2] 25/20 178/18 fairness [1] 177/13 fake [1] 24/19 fall [1] 51/8 false [1] 23/12 familiarity [1] 122/7 family [4] 26/10 27/19 55/11 164/23 family's [1] 29/23 far [4] 68/14 89/3 161/2 173/25 favor [2] 45/25 46/2 Fax [1] 2/10 faxed [3] 10/22 15/17 161/19 February [1] 145/8 February 2009 [1] 145/8 federal [3] 106/21 154/21 156/23

fee [2] 92/25 92/25 feel [4], 43/23 54/18 146/17 146/19 few [6] 55/22 63/16 63/18 95/6 103/15 107/7 figure [1] 134/15 file [11] 76/18 140/9 140/15 140/21 143/1 143/2 143/6 143/8 147/20 147/20 166/21 filed [8] 12/20 18/23 31/18 41/11 57/15 87/10 146/10 159/25 files [1] 140/12 fill [1] 92/14 filled [1] 92/10 final [4] 105/13 136/23 159/4 175/23 finally [5] 55/14 55/22 91/7 146/24 165/19 find [8] 24/7 46/12 47/25 101/4 111/15 137/5 146/22 163/22 finder [1] 98/13 finding [2] 32/14 169/17 findings [4] 30/8 76/1 141/9 159/21 fine [1] 134/8 finish [3] 122/2 123/1 164/4 finished [2] 130/12 130/13 firm [1] 164/6 first [54] 4/22 7/9 7/19 9/4 11/13 11/18 12/25 13/1 13/1 14/22 17/11 18/1 23/19 25/1 25/15 33/21 33/24 38/1 55/18 57/18 57/20 72/12 72/14 78/11 78/23 85/14 87/25 90/8 94/18 101/22 102/17 103/9 103/13 103/13 106/12 108/12 111/17 115/20 132/13 144/13 151/9 151/12 154/3 157/6 159/6 159/14 160/24 161/17 161/19 166/22 167/1 173/24 174/18 firsthand [1] 59/19 fit [1] 140/19 five [11] 13/7 28/15 41/13 89/23 90/8 95/13 123/18 138/9 138/11 138/15 138/17 fluent [3] 105/20 105/22 106/1 focused [4] 31/4 36/23 68/1 68/14 FOIA [8] 78/4 82/17 140/12 140/21 142/14 147/12 147/13 147/19 FOIA-stamped [1] 147/12 follow [7] 69/23 69/23 73/22 73/23 123/6 123/7 142/23 follow-up [2] 123/6 123/7 following [5] 5/24 17/5 29/2 119/21 150/17 follows [1] 9/21 force [1] 143/8 foregoing [3] 17/25 180/3 180/5 forgery [1] 136/19 forget [1] 138/3 forgetting [2] 160/12 176/23 Forgive [1] 134/8 form [11] 32/18 34/6 34/15 124/13 130/5 153/4 158/13 164/20 167/24 168/22 169/14 format [1] 175/2 former [4] 42/14 114/15 125/16 138/5 forms [1] 158/20 forth [5] 32/18 152/12 154/2 157/23 175/1 forward [2] 5/11 114/24 found [12] 100/22 102/14 112/17 114/13 120/6 120/20 120/24 126/15 152/8 168/1 169/11 169/11 foundation [21] 20/17 32/15 35/9 54/3 54/19 54/22 60/8 61/6 63/25 111/24 133/13 136/2 138/10 143/10 145/17 147/9 170/1 170/4 171/4 171/6 174/6 foundational [2] 170/5 170/7 four [4] 42/4 42/4 138/19 138/21 frame [1] 146/23 frankly [2] 134/6 162/3 fraud [2] 135/21 135/25 fraudulent [1] 135/14 friend [5] 10/8 45/9 125/5 125/16 164/23

F friends [2] 107/17 173/72-5 VW-MAN frivolous [2] 48/18 49/1 front [12] 29/9 29/20 41/1 65/4 65/10 76/21 77/13 79/15 86/16 96/15 96/19 108/9 full [6] 6/1 40/15 86/2 104/15 104/17 115/5 fully [2] 40/8 158/19 fund [1] 127/12 further [21] 4/13 31/10 39/16 54/19 57/8 57/9 83/13 83/14 84/17 98/7 103/16 113/5 113/18 125/10 137/18 160/2 160/6 161/3 172/20 176/18 178/16 G G-u-y-u-m-j-y-a-n [3] 7/20 85/15 86/4 G-y-u-m-j-y-a-n [1] 39/3 GACKLE [2] 1/23 180/9 gamble [1] 158/5 garbling [1] 33/15 Garcia [1] 172/25 Garcia's [1] 173/7 gave [26] 33/5 43/24 46/13 47/18 52/6 52/19 53/4 54/13 61/7 61/20 61/23 61/24 62/2 62/15 63/1 63/22 64/10 69/21 71/12 71/17 74/16 112/3 152/21 155/18 155/20 162/19 general [5] 37/5 78/11 78/24 79/4 173/17 generally [3] 49/24 52/24 173/15 generated [1] 147/24 gentleman [1] 34/4 genuine [8] 129/18 130/1 136/7 136/13 136/17 136/21 137/4 137/14 Geoffrey [3] 2/7 4/12 85/11 germane [1] 54/19 get [60] 5/20 9/22 9/24 19/5 19/6 19/13 19/25 24/19 33/4 33/6 33/10 35/3 35/22 38/23 45/14 51/8 55/24 56/4 58/6 58/10 58/14 58/19 61/4 61/21 66/11 67/14 72/9 72/11 73/6 73/24 85/20 92/1 92/16 108/20 109/24 110/8 116/19 117/20 121/15 121/20 122/25 132/7 140/18 140/19 151/7 151/9 151/16 151/19 153/11 154/7 156/5 157/8 157/24 158/1 158/8 166/18 167/10 167/21 168/11 168/17 gets [1] 154/12 132/2 157/18 29/15 34/6 35/12 35/16 36/3 36/11 36/13

getting [7] 42/15 63/8 113/13 131/24 131/24

give [36] 6/6 9/13 10/7 10/7 15/24 22/6 23/19 39/24 45/11 52/21 58/24 60/13 60/24 62/7 62/19 71/2 71/8 71/18 71/23 73/19 92/20 99/5 114/1 140/7 146/3 146/17 175/1 177/2 178/18

given [16] 12/8 30/4 34/15 34/20 35/6 48/8 108/1 109/4 109/15 112/11 112/15 112/20 121/19 146/23 153/3 170/22

giving [4] 43/12 65/15 69/4 155/19

glitches [1] 155/16

go [30] 8/3 10/8 19/19 20/5 33/22 33/23 39/4 52/13 56/1 56/2 72/19 72/21 72/24 73/6 73/15 89/23 98/15 99/1 99/1 104/10 105/14 108/20 134/10 139/13 152/2 152/23 159/24 160/22 164/2 168/16

goes [1] 161/13

going [59] 5/4 6/18 6/22 11/15 13/7 13/10 14/21 14/24 15/13 15/21 16/19 18/17 20/24 24/24 25/14 25/25 26/16 26/19 26/20 28/13 28/13 29/9 29/19 32/12 40/25 42/1 42/6 44/1 47/5 47/13 50/12 50/22 55/24 59/11 67/10 73/24 89/21 89/23 92/8 93/1 98/17 99/14 101/2 101/7 103/14 115/20 117/14 123/22 123/23 126/20 126/23 136/22 143/14 149/23 153/19 154/5 178/7 178/7 179/4

gone [1] 170/13 GONZALEZ 133 4/10 4/6.85/61 2/06/12 good [6] 4/8 4/11 57/12 57/13 136/1 1/8/9 got [22] 20/12 27/20 33/25 35/11 44/22 45/4 59/4 61/13 70/8 76/9 76/12 76/18 77/12 79/6 80/24 110/10 110/19 121/18 161/9 167/1 169/15 178/23 gotten [1] 43/8

government [52] 10/9 10/13 12/8 18/8 20/15 30/24 31/9 39/20 45/21 75/24 84/12 122/17 123/20 124/5 124/11 124/16 128/21 131/21 138/7 139/2 140/14 140/14 142/6 143/1 143/12 143/12 143/13 146/11 146/12 146/14 149/20 152/19 153/19 154/3 154/4 154/4 155/17 157/9 158/22 159/9 159/12 160/4 160/10 160/21 161/9 165/21 166/6 166/20 166/22 167/1 169/20 173/13

government's [15] 23/22 31/7 140/9 140/12 140/21 143/2 143/6 143/8 143/23 147/20 148/4 161/1 166/21 166/24 171/7 grade [5] 21/13 21/18 21/22 22/13 22/19

granted [1] 44/14 greater [2] 149/12 159/8

ground [2] 53/4 136/5

grounds [8] 15/25 16/2 16/11 16/12 131/22 137/9 145/16 147/3

Growing [1] 21/12

guess [6] 15/5 22/21 114/17 151/23 177/12 177/24

guests [1] 103/1

GUYUMJYAN [28] 3/7 7/18 8/3 10/25 38/25 42/15 58/17 58/18 84/20 85/13 86/3 86/11 86/15 104/20 104/21 104/22 104/23 107/12 112/14 162/2 162/3 162/10 162/11 163/10 163/11 163/13 164/8 164/21

Guyumjyan's [4] 85/21 116/15 162/17 164/4

H-o-v-a-a-n-s [2] 9/4 10/11 H-o-v-a-n-i-s-y-a-n [3] 113/24 115/7 171/13 H-o-v-h-a-n-n-e-s [2] 55/8 55/18 had [78] 10/22 11/1 12/7 14/15 14/15 19/17 21/23 22/15 28/23 28/24 33/22 34/15 34/20 35/18 37/2 37/23 38/21 39/6 39/9 39/12 39/13 43/8 45/6 46/5 46/10 46/10 50/15 55/10 58/5 58/23 63/16 69/16 70/5 77/11 81/13 89/1 89/2 91/22 99/9 104/2 105/11 110/22 111/6 111/14 112/17 113/1 114/10 114/11 123/11 128/5 137/5 141/4 142/2 142/16 142/21 143/18 148/19 150/24 155/9 159/22 160/15 162/23 162/24 163/5 163/6 164/6 164/21 165/7 165/20 166/20 167/25 168/11 168/12 169/12 169/13 170/13 172/14 176/22

hadn't [1] 95/18

hall [8] 5/6 38/22 56/22 57/1 92/4 93/19 93/24 99/1

hand [8] 5/12 40/12 82/17 104/12 115/1 118/2 119/9 126/20

handed [1] 112/21

handle [1] 114/16

happen [2] 35/13 36/24

happened [20] 28/2 32/10 36/17 36/23 37/5 37/13 37/18 37/19 62/1 64/19 69/15 73/18 74/17 77/7 107/2 109/2 110/16 154/25

170/18 177/21 happens [1] 47/16

happy [3] 29/15 84/2 160/22

has [68] 4/16 18/18 22/21 23/11 31/9 39/5 41/1 48/5 48/14 49/7 49/8 54/6 59/13 59/19 65/22 76/9 76/17 77/13 78/17 83/18 83/22 83/24 84/14 86/16 89/2 93/7 95/12 100/15 105/22 105/22 107/22 113/7 113/11 115/20

116/17 119/14 126/10 128/2 130/9 130/9 131/19 133/19 134/30 137/13 139/9 139/11 143/1 143/10 146/19 147/9 152/6 154/16 154/16 154/18 155/24 157/9 157/11 159/6 160/4 160/10 160/25 161/2 161/12 162/3 164/17 165/1 165/8 173/21 hasn't [4] 53/1 96/4 96/9 163/25 hat [1] 177/10 have [212]

haven't [6] 50/19 80/9 89/20 102/2 140/3 179/3

having [5] 26/8 47/8 120/7 121/1 132/14 he [125] 8/5 8/6 8/9 8/10 10/5 10/6 28/1 30/19 30/21 30/25 32/15 32/17 32/17 32/17 34/5 34/5 34/6 34/8 34/15 35/9 35/10 35/12 36/8 36/10 36/12 39/11 39/13 39/13 39/14 45/25 52/7 54/14 58/23 59/4 59/6 59/11 59/13 59/16 61/4 61/22 62/15 63/25 65/3 67/24 68/8 68/9 69/2 69/16 70/1 70/5 71/18 71/23 71/24 83/10 87/15 87/19 87/19 87/22 87/22 88/25 88/25 95/10 95/12 95/19 95/19 95/19 95/23 95/24 95/24 95/25 96/4 96/4 96/9 97/16 97/17 97/20 100/6 100/12 101/6 111/22 112/10 112/19 113/12 138/5 140/13 140/13 144/10 144/21 145/2 152/2 152/3 152/3 152/4 152/4 152/5 152/6 152/7 152/7 152/14 152/23 153/3 153/6 153/7 153/8 153/9 153/10 153/25 157/13 157/19 157/25 158/1 158/4 158/4 158/5 158/7 161/12 161/17 161/18 161/21 162/18 162/18 163/15 163/15 164/8 164/24

he's [5] 27/25 59/11 89/5 112/9 157/24 head [6] 40/8 131/16 131/19 133/4 133/5 172/13

hear [16] 36/22 59/13 65/10 65/13 72/6 121/3 121/4 123/1 126/12 138/2 138/4 139/1 139/2 139/22 148/15 159/12 heard [17] 27/4 32/16 32/18 37/19 140/3

143/25 149/5 152/2 152/15 154/14 158/15 158/17 158/22 158/24 159/19 164/12 178/25 hearing [23] 1/20 4/14 8/23 26/1 36/20 37/8 37/12 37/13 66/12 67/15 71/17 77/4 105/25 121/1 134/6 140/4 143/20 149/15 153/14 160/3 160/7 170/3 173/6

hearings [1] 159/19

hearsay [8] 34/7 34/8 59/9 109/6 112/8 113/3 169/19 170/11

held [1] 168/8

help [4] 26/21 26/24 26/25 164/7 helped [2] 50/15 163/12

helpful [10] 30/3 30/6 32/13 32/16 33/11 37/6 60/5 64/1 74/22 84/6

helps [1] 35/12

her [138] 10/8 15/18 20/5 23/19 35/18 35/24 36/3 40/8 41/22 42/7 43/24 43/24 46/5 46/10 51/19 51/20 52/12 52/12 52/19 52/21 53/16 54/10 54/11 54/12 54/12 54/20 54/21 54/22 57/22 59/10 59/10 61/7 61/7 61/19 61/20 61/22 61/22 61/25 62/20 63/4 64/10 64/11 65/11 66/21 66/24 68/2 69/4 69/6 69/7 69/25 70/12 70/16 71/4 72/6 76/6 76/16 76/21 77/13 78/13 78/14 78/19 78/20 81/4 82/7 82/11 83/17 83/19 105/17 105/25 106/2 106/3 114/14 114/14 114/15 121/1 123/5 126/11 126/12 126/14 126/18 126/20 126/23 128/3 130/23 136/15 136/17 136/19 136/20 137/14 137/15 142/1 144/10 144/16 150/19 150/22 150/24 151/7 151/10 151/13 151/16 151/19 151/20 151/23 152/17 152/21 152/22 153/11 154/8 154/10 154/11 154/17 158/22 158/24 158/25 162/21 162/21 163/7 163/8 163/8 164/13 164/14 164/16 164/17 165/3

165/10 165/11 168/12 168/18 170/5 174/13

118/17 132/8 135/12 139/2 141/7 141/8 inconsistency [2] 32/7 175/9 H inconsistent 62 | 169/8 169/9 Page ID 147/16 148/6 173/48 Filed 12/06/12 rm [116] 6/18 6/22 11/21 13/4 13/7 13/10 14/21 14/24 15/7 15/13 15/21 15/23 16/19 ner... 181 174/16 174/20 174/21 174/22 175/8 178/10 178/15 179/2 independent [2] 54/3 170/20 here [49] 21/5 28/17 33/14 34/5 34/17 44/11 indicate [4] 136/18 140/10 147/25 148/23 16/22 18/17 19/11 19/19 19/20 20/24 21/5 45/13 47/5 47/8 47/18 48/2 51/24 53/1 54/20 indicated [4] 91/19 132/22 132/23 132/23 22/8 22/21 24/24 25/14 25/25 26/16 26/19 61/17 65/20 81/23 81/25 81/25 88/21 89/5 27/5 27/11 28/13 28/13 29/9 29/15 29/19 indicates [2] 155/6 166/1 individual [6] 7/21 9/5 10/25 57/24 149/19 94/15 98/5 98/18 100/4 100/9 101/24 104/2 30/2 31/3 31/21 32/19 37/11 37/22 40/25 112/5 119/7 119/7 119/18 126/7 126/21 42/1 42/5 42/7 44/1 47/13 49/21 50/22 51/24 166/16 130/15 131/19 132/21 132/22 149/4 150/17 56/12 58/11 61/19 67/10 68/12 68/12 68/14 individualized [1] 176/23 indulgence [1] 107/10 151/22 152/11 157/23 157/25 158/2 159/9 70/7 73/11 73/24 74/1 77/3 80/24 84/9 84/10 161/9 166/16 178/22 ineffective [6] 49/9 49/11 49/12 49/16 49/22 89/21 89/23 91/20 92/8 93/1 97/19 98/6 hereby [1] 180/3 98/17 99/14 103/2 104/6 105/5 109/22 49/24 Hers [1] 52/16 115/20 117/14 119/3 120/25 123/22 123/23 infer [1] 175/25 herself [2] 109/3 165/25 126/18 126/19 126/19 126/20 131/24 131/24 inference [1] 74/5 higher [1] 149/24 132/2 133/8 133/11 136/22 137/11 139/18 information [8] 13/12 23/19 33/25 118/3 highly [2] 98/13 107/3 136/10 169/18 170/11 170/16 141/2 141/14 143/14 146/15 146/21 151/2 him [38] 9/15 12/12 27/24 28/1 31/1 34/9 151/5 153/18 156/7 158/3 166/7 174/1 176/6 inherently [1] 32/15 34/16 35/11 36/11 39/6 42/16 46/1 58/19 177/10 177/12 177/15 177/16 177/16 177/20 initiated [1] 31/1 initiation [3] 30/20 144/6 148/11 58/24 59/21 60/1 62/16 65/9 65/13 69/8 178/17 179/4 69/13 69/19 88/13 88/24 88/25 89/6 89/25 I've [7] 27/4 30/3 37/19 114/19 123/11 137/5 ink [2] 94/17 94/17 97/13 103/25 104/1 107/9 111/14 111/17 177/6 input [1] 161/3 138/4 142/19 152/23 152/24 161/25 INS [11] 34/20 34/20 51/8 66/9 66/12 67/15 I.D [1] 24/19 himself [3] 4/24 102/3 158/7 IBIS [1] 147/8 67/24 67/24 142/13 147/1 147/7 his [50] 6/5 6/6 7/12 11/13 11/15 11/17 35/11 ICE [3] 2/21 4/9 85/9 instance [1] 50/3 36/22 37/5 38/24 62/9 86/7 90/5 96/20 96/20 idea [6] 22/14 45/24 74/21 95/12 139/9 instead [2] 167/22 168/22 100/10 104/20 106/17 111/17 138/11 138/16 175/13 instruct [2] 59/21 60/10 138/18 142/18 142/19 144/21 146/11 148/5 identically [1] 134/3 instruction [1] 61/23 instructions [4] 35/16 36/11 59/24 112/2 152/2 152/2 152/4 152/23 153/10 153/11 identification [16] 12/13 13/2 14/24 17/10 153/12 157/10 157/24 159/17 159/23 161/2 18/10 19/17 25/5 32/3 41/2 86/16 91/15 interested [4] 74/1 83/16 103/24 134/6 161/16 161/25 162/1 162/1 162/9 162/18 98/23 99/16 115/10 115/21 117/7 interesting [2] 149/16 163/22 163/17 163/19 164/21 164/23 176/13 interestingly [2] 157/16 157/17 identified [6] 77/14 82/19 82/22 125/6 history [1] 160/12 126/10 137/13 interoffice [1] 167/7 Hoffman [3] 2/7 4/12 85/11 identify [1] 81/4 interpretation [2] 122/2 148/24 hold [3] 159/18 160/2 160/6 identifying [2] 80/2 81/5 interpreter [18] 40/3 40/13 85/24 86/24 87/6 holding [2] 126/20 165/5 if [85] 14/4 16/1 19/23 23/1 23/4 23/15 23/17 87/8 89/12 89/22 90/3 118/25 120/7 120/25 hole [1] 178/20 24/3 24/7 25/23 26/4 29/16 32/12 34/5 35/20 122/2 122/25 128/3 129/5 129/23 131/2 Hollywood [3] 101/3 101/4 102/15 37/8 40/8 43/24 44/6 44/8 44/15 44/20 44/24 interpreter's [1] 90/21 home [5] 102/25 102/25 103/2 153/8 162/12 48/15 49/5 50/2 53/18 53/25 54/1 54/1 54/5 interrogation [1] 104/4 honestly [1] 159/9 54/16 54/18 56/12 60/15 60/17 62/15 63/5 interrogatories [14] 11/8 11/13 12/3 12/14 Honor [376] 63/25 65/1 65/11 66/24 72/5 77/6 77/19 12/16 12/19 13/2 14/23 38/2 174/2 174/3 Honor's [4] 141/24 145/25 146/18 155/12 78/19 80/2 81/19 84/11 84/12 100/12 101/19 174/4 175/10 175/21 HONORABLE [1] 1/5 103/24 104/2 106/22 107/2 109/4 114/9 interrogatory [9] 12/23 13/8 18/11 37/24 hopefully [1] 101/21 115/8 122/11 126/12 126/14 131/25 132/12 37/25 174/12 175/12 175/12 175/14 house [8] 34/23 35/20 63/4 70/16 70/19 135/4 135/13 135/20 136/13 137/12 139/1 interrupt [3] 15/23 104/4 104/7 interrupting [1] 134/9 162/19 178/10 178/15 139/3 141/5 146/21 148/15 150/8 153/20 Hovaans [4] 9/3 10/11 11/1 43/8 159/7 159/10 160/23 166/8 170/18 171/3 into [14] 8/22 14/14 18/9 31/2 35/3 105/9 HOVANISYAN [21] 3/8 113/23 115/6 173/12 174/2 175/13 127/24 139/6 153/4 153/7 153/7 155/7 115/14 115/18 116/17 116/21 117/17 118/18 immediately [1] 151/7 156/25 166/22 119/23 120/24 125/14 161/22 162/23 163/6 introduce [8] 14/14 31/2 31/5 54/3 54/16 immigration [35] 20/9 33/23 33/24 34/2 35/1 164/12 165/1 171/12 171/13 172/2 172/14 84/12 142/17 168/1 35/2 64/18 65/3 66/12 67/15 68/5 68/15 Hovanisyan's [1] 115/9 69/17 69/17 69/25 69/25 70/9 71/1 71/19 introduced [1] 113/8 Hovhannes [13] 50/21 55/3 60/2 60/3 61/1 71/21 105/21 145/1 145/19 147/24 152/24 investigate [1] 166/20 61/4 61/11 110/19 110/21 110/23 111/14 153/1 153/2 153/5 153/7 153/8 157/1 166/17 involve [2] 23/5 157/14 111/14 111/16 167/9 168/12 177/6 involved [3] 28/18 158/25 163/18 Hovhannes' [1] 62/3 impeach [3] 24/9 174/23 174/24 involving [2] 23/5 170/1 Hovhanness [3] 39/6 100/10 101/6 impeached [1] 38/13 ira [3] 2/7 2/10 4/11 how [34] 24/21 27/1 32/8 33/4 33/20 35/3 impeachment [11] 10/16 16/1 16/13 16/13 irregular [1] 107/4 35/9 35/12 45/3 52/14 55/4 56/15 57/24 61/4 16/14 22/2 23/4 46/16 46/19 46/24 175/18 is [585] 61/8 75/14 92/1 95/3 95/10 97/11 100/4 important [4] 33/14 68/10 69/22 178/12 isn't [37] 27/21 49/2 49/12 49/14 51/13 52/7 101/4 110/8 112/13 114/16 117/19 125/17 importantly [1] 43/3 53/10 54/10 54/12 59/11 60/12 60/14 78/14 134/24 134/25 140/19 160/13 161/15 171/9 impossible [1] 175/16 78/16 79/18 83/25 84/12 94/16 94/17 95/20 171/21 impress [1] 102/22 98/5 111/8 120/22 123/10 124/18 125/2 however [4] 145/16 162/18 165/3 168/17 improper [8] 16/8 16/10 16/14 22/2 46/18 125/4 134/22 143/7 153/17 157/13 165/17 huh [2] 15/12 99/13 46/24 48/12 52/8 165/22 165/22 166/7 169/2 170/2 hundred [1] 66/4 in [472] issuance [2] 79/9 134/17 issue [38] 19/18 20/3 32/2 38/13 40/8 79/19 hundred percent [1] 66/4 inadmissible [4] 75/25 169/11 169/12 169/18 hung [1] 109/3 incarcerated [1] 36/5 116/15 117/24 118/1 133/19 134/12 134/21 inclination [1] 178/18 140/16 140/17 144/14 145/8 145/20 145/22 include [1] 54/4 146/9 146/10 148/2 148/3 148/17 149/18 I'd [6] 31/16 37/23 104/4 129/14 139/6 includes [1] 144/10 153/24 155/17 157/21 158/13 158/19 158/23 including [5] 7/6 24/16 78/4 84/20 101/24 159/21 160/16 161/10 168/4 168/23 168/23

incomplete [1] 132/15

171/7 173/2

I'll [15] 7/12 11/22 44/12 51/25 60/19 101/21

justice [6] 72/20 72/21 72/24 73/3 81/13 law's [1] 125/16 havfulness 11 155/10 Page ID laws [1] 106/23 154/20 ment 86 Filed 12/06/12 issued [27] 4/14 13/16 13/18 13/22 19/18 K #:1081 20/2 20/12 30/20 33/17 56/13 57/2 57/6 76/5 lawyer [9] 71/12 104/5 104/8 114/15 142/15 123/20 124/4 130/15 130/17 131/15 133/7 K-a-c-h-a-n-y-a-n [2] 55/8 55/19 142/24 143/14 177/6 177/10 142/5 144/20 148/21 167/24 168/22 169/6 K-h-a-h-y-a-n [2] 9/5 10/11 lawyers [1] 77/7 Kachanyan [14] 50/21 55/3 60/4 61/1 61/7 171/3 171/9 LAX [1] 10/7 issues [4] 117/21 145/2 145/19 177/5 61/12 61/16 61/17 61/24 61/24 62/4 62/6 lay [1] 63/24 it [523] 62/7 62/14 laying [1] 60/8 Kachanyan's [1] 62/11 it's [124] 6/21 10/15 15/21 16/13 16/20 16/25 layout [1] 124/15 17/2 18/7 20/21 21/1 22/14 25/5 26/13 27/15 Kahn [1] 157/1 learn [1] 36/8 29/16 29/17 30/3 30/18 31/17 31/17 31/24 keep [5] 47/4 75/8 92/18 137/16 154/20 learned [1] 32/16 32/12 32/17 34/9 34/10 35/19 35/19 38/19 keeping [1] 122/16 least [2] 147/2 165/25 41/3 41/6 41/12 41/13 42/4 45/10 46/16 kept [4] 122/21 153/8 173/9 173/15 leave [2] 5/5 68/25 46/20 46/22 46/24 48/2 49/9 50/2 53/8 55/5 Khachanyan [19] 110/25 111/10 111/11 left [7] 21/18 21/22 22/12 69/2 69/24 84/20 55/7 56/19 59/18 64/1 68/9 71/4 72/4 72/5 111/13 111/16 111/18 111/20 112/2 112/3 119/9 74/8 76/5 76/12 77/13 79/16 81/23 82/11 112/10 112/15 112/17 112/21 152/8 152/8 left-hand [1] 119/9 88/1 88/3 92/16 93/10 93/21 94/15 98/10 161/22 162/11 162/23 163/6 legal [11] 15/25 16/2 16/11 16/12 46/21 99/23 101/18 106/24 110/6 113/23 119/22 Khahyan [4] 9/3 10/11 11/1 43/8 78/13 78/20 129/20 135/15 135/24 137/9 Khanachyan [1] 111/8 120/14 126/18 130/6 131/17 131/19 132/21 length [1] 135/1 132/21 132/23 133/2 133/2 133/20 135/3 kid [1] 27/14 let [18] 7/9 7/10 23/19 26/19 29/23 59/21 kids [1] 157/25 136/17 136/19 137/15 138/18 142/4 142/14 60/19 75/18 84/5 89/21 116/3 121/4 139/1 kind [4] 92/14 143/11 158/6 175/18 142/20 143/2 143/5 143/5 143/7 145/7 149/8 168/5 175/23 177/2 179/3 146/13 146/20 146/25 147/6 149/20 150/8 kinds [1] 52/24 let's [16] 12/13 31/8 62/4 63/12 106/16 107/6 150/11 150/18 154/4 154/16 155/3 158/3 kkwtlaw.com [1] 2/10 111/5 114/22 116/19 126/24 140/18 148/15 158/7 159/8 161/1 164/10 165/23 168/4 knew [2] 12/8 39/13 149/1 150/11 161/6 178/4 168/15 169/9 169/19 173/1 173/2 175/15 know [75] 7/10 18/3 22/2 22/13 22/15 27/2 letter [5] 114/15 142/13 142/25 142/25 27/4 32/12 35/12 37/8 37/13 37/18 37/19 175/18 175/21 176/19 178/1 178/21 143/14 item [3] 4/5 45/12 85/5 45/17 48/16 50/2 52/7 52/10 54/14 57/24 license [2] 157/18 158/1 its [11] 18/3 20/19 24/5 76/1 76/8 76/18 61/8 62/2 62/15 62/16 63/5 64/5 65/24 69/20 lie [1] 152/6 69/22 70/5 73/8 73/22 74/20 75/12 89/4 124/13 124/13 143/12 145/22 169/4 life [1] 21/7 itself [7] 98/6 130/22 147/24 167/23 170/11 97/11 97/14 97/19 97/24 98/1 99/4 101/19 lifestyle [1] 177/17 light [2] 148/23 155/13 170/15 171/7 103/9 103/13 105/20 106/6 106/21 107/2 107/4 109/9 114/9 114/16 123/3 126/23 like [36] 11/20 22/14 23/10 30/11 30/15 135/4 137/16 142/21 149/14 153/22 155/15 31/16 32/9 33/13 37/23 43/10 43/15 45/9 James [3] 11/25 137/24 138/22 155/17 156/7 157/5 157/25 158/12 158/22 45/10 48/2 48/5 48/22 52/21 67/16 75/5 January [3] 12/18 118/7 121/25 158/23 163/18 171/8 173/25 174/22 174/23 75/23 76/16 90/3 91/18 102/22 104/4 107/9 January 18th [1] 118/7 174/25 175/17 178/11 119/18 129/14 139/6 143/4 143/9 145/8 January 26 [1] 12/18 knowing [2] 74/1 83/16 145/22 157/25 167/16 172/23 JILLIAN [3] 2/21 4/10 85/10 knowledge [14] 20/11 20/16 32/10 33/6 likely [1] 173/6 job [4] 105/25 108/5 108/6 128/24 33/10 59/19 65/21 79/24 108/23 111/24 limitation [1] 149/3 John [2] 142/14 167/3 116/24 133/12 135/19 138/10 limited [2] 65/21 65/22 joined [2] 148/2 148/3 known [4] 21/7 125/17 145/2 164/17 Limits [2] 118/10 121/24 knows [5] 84/9 101/5 125/2 140/14 140/15 jot [1] 94/10 line [28] 9/18 9/20 9/21 15/5 15/5 15/7 17/11 JR [1] 2/16 Kurzban [4] 2/7 2/8 2/8 4/11 22/3 22/6 28/15 28/16 29/2 43/17 44/3 44/19 Juan [1] 23/13 Kurzban's [1] 164/6 47/13 47/14 48/6 50/12 50/13 51/14 51/16 judge [13] 1/5 36/13 36/17 37/14 71/17 71/19 51/18 59/18 66/8 89/2 131/22 150/18 71/21 83/8 129/6 153/15 153/23 167/10 lines [6] 22/10 22/11 47/13 48/6 52/11 94/7 labeled [3] 26/13 78/2 93/7 168/12 link [1] 62/8 Judith [2] 97/24 106/6 lack [7] 20/16 20/16 79/23 111/23 111/24 list [8] 13/12 29/25 30/14 30/18 144/16 July [6] 13/16 13/19 14/3 140/11 140/24 138/10 145/16 146/11 148/18 148/19 149/6 lacking [1] 136/13 listed [1] 116/9 July 1977 [1] 140/24 lacks [1] 133/12 listening [2] 133/24 145/11 laid [2] 147/9 174/6 July 23rd [1] 13/19 lists [1] 144/21 July 27th [2] 140/11 149/6 language [31] 41/18 87/3 87/13 87/16 87/20 litigation [4] 12/2 159/15 160/13 161/17 July 30th [2] 13/16 14/3 89/13 89/16 89/18 89/20 91/21 93/13 94/8 little [2] 115/19 126/18 live [5] 70/13 88/1 92/6 92/15 107/19 96/15 97/7 106/12 116/1 116/8 116/12 117/1 juror [1] 173/10 120/15 120/17 120/20 124/14 126/15 126/16 jury [2] 173/9 173/19 lived [1] 103/4 just [95] 9/15 10/5 10/5 10/6 10/6 11/10 130/19 131/6 131/10 131/12 163/17 164/9 lives [1] 124/24 11/24 13/10 15/8 15/24 16/2 19/6 19/20 languages [2] 40/5 105/23 living [2] 45/25 70/17 20/19 23/17 25/1 25/4 25/14 28/4 30/15 last [34] 6/3 6/22 7/20 9/4 20/25 39/2 41/8 located [1] 165/12 44/10 50/10 55/18 77/7 82/21 85/14 88/1 33/14 34/10 38/12 41/10 43/17 45/10 45/25 location [1] 110/3 47/2 47/12 47/14 47/16 47/23 50/10 50/12 92/15 95/16 95/17 99/7 111/5 111/6 113/22 locations [1] 165/13 51/24 52/6 53/4 54/6 54/9 54/13 55/14 55/22 113/23 116/7 122/20 123/1 129/17 137/23 long [9] 27/1 44/1 66/8 95/3 110/8 125/17 55/22 60/3 61/9 63/18 67/20 68/9 74/5 77/25 148/12 149/15 152/8 162/9 164/12 164/16 134/24 134/25 154/5 78/14 78/14 79/4 82/22 90/12 98/6 98/9 171/11 longer [2] 154/23 166/6 100/11 101/8 102/22 104/7 106/20 116/14 late [2] 135/6 135/8 look [29] 6/18 19/20 25/14 26/16 29/9 31/16 later [11] 44/24 49/6 122/20 133/9 135/6 123/21 128/10 128/12 131/12 133/22 138/16 38/3 40/25 42/2 42/12 67/4 76/17 77/18 138/18 139/3 140/7 141/10 141/15 142/18 145/8 153/18 153/21 153/23 166/4 173/12 77/23 86/15 93/23 114/20 121/2 123/22 143/9 146/24 148/7 148/18 158/10 158/14 later-acquired [1] 133/9 137/11 153/16 153/20 157/22 160/22 173/18 law [12] 48/14 49/23 76/2 105/21 130/20 159/4 160/3 161/8 164/4 171/2 171/8 172/21 175/13 175/17 178/21 178/22 173/23 175/17 175/20 175/23 176/1 177/16 131/7 131/15 131/18 153/24 159/22 160/9 looked [5] 27/16 84/3 91/18 132/14 137/13 177/20 173/5 looking [14] 13/4 78/9 78/12 78/15 79/4 94/3 looking... [8] 101/8 117/23 118/2 118/18 131/5 131/9 145/21 166/8 looks [2] 145/7 145/22 looming [1] 176/12 LOS [6] 1/17 1/24 2/19 4/1 34/2 85/1 Los Angeles [1] 34/2 loses [1] 143/8 lost [4] 58/23 109/11 150/20 176/22 lot [2] 124/19 137/5 louder [3] 121/4 121/4 121/6 Lucine [6] 108/24 108/25 109/2 109/3 109/12 109/14 Lucy [4] 10/22 15/18 58/11 161/19 lunch [2] 84/16 84/22 Lusik [1] 57/22 Lusine [1] 57/22 Lusineh [2] 57/22 109/13 lying [7] 24/8 24/16 24/18 24/21 123/4 152/22 157/24

 \mathbf{M} M-a-r-t-i-n [1] 40/4 ma'am [39] 6/25 7/3 7/17 7/25 8/2 13/6 13/9 14/17 15/1 17/16 17/19 17/21 18/2 18/4 19/3 19/8 19/15 26/6 26/23 27/18 29/21 42/14 42/19 51/6 52/2 115/23 115/25 116/3 117/16 117/23 118/2 118/6 120/9 121/2 122/14 123/9 124/1 124/22 137/22 made [15] 10/1 54/1 134/1 136/10 136/12 140/3 140/14 141/7 145/3 150/20 151/24 153/18 155/17 157/8 167/16 mail [4] 45/4 153/4 153/7 176/15 mailed [2] 153/6 176/21 main [2] 118/9 121/23 maintained [3] 70/1 142/25 143/13 maintains [1] 160/8 maintenance [1] 127/20 make [14] 15/24 16/5 27/16 30/8 30/24 32/14 33/14 35/13 51/25 76/17 94/1 95/11 158/7 makes [1] 119/7 making [3] 48/20 98/6 173/19 male [1] 8/1 man [1] 158/4 manner [1] 32/5 Manual [1] 23/13 many [6] 24/21 75/14 95/10 157/25 161/14 176/8 March [5] 43/6 43/22 44/4 50/11 144/14 March 2002 [1] 144/14 March 5th [4] 43/6 43/22 44/4 50/11 mark [2] 148/8 148/9 marked [20] 12/13 13/2 13/8 14/23 18/9 18/18 19/17 25/5 32/3 38/1 41/2 86/8 86/16 91/14 98/22 99/15 115/10 115/21 117/6 123/23 marking [1] 124/10 markings [3] 154/17 154/18 172/5 Markosyan [4] 105/17 124/22 164/7 164/11 marriage [1] 110/6 matter [15] 4/14 11/21 38/12 49/12 49/22 83/25 133/23 136/16 160/9 170/5 170/7 170/20 178/5 179/7 180/5 matters [2] 31/12 52/24 may [70] 6/6 6/11 8/14 9/7 9/12 10/17 11/4 12/10 12/11 12/25 22/8 22/20 23/15 23/17 25/25 26/4 28/14 32/7 32/15 36/25 39/18 39/24 40/19 44/6 44/8 44/15 45/12 47/8 50/1 54/3 54/5 60/17 66/19 66/20 67/6 77/6 85/16 86/5 100/5 107/3 114/1 114/9 114/19 114/20 115/8 118/25 122/11 123/25 126/22 127/1

139/4 143/25 152/15 155/16 156/7 156/24 2 159/5 159/9 164/14 164/15 170/13 172/21 176/8 177/18[#]: 1082 May 12th [2] 8/14 28/14 maybe [4] 119/19 133/23 147/16 162/13 me [89] 7/9 7/10 10/4 11/20 13/10 13/11 15/24 18/7 19/23 22/14 23/19 26/19 29/24 30/3 30/6 30/10 32/13 32/13 32/16 33/5 33/11 33/22 34/3 34/6 34/15 34/21 35/1 35/12 35/21 40/9 42/11 43/15 46/6 51/11 51/22 56/12 59/21 60/6 62/23 67/12 69/23 71/17 73/19 74/16 75/11 75/18 84/4 84/11 87/4 88/10 88/14 88/20 89/3 89/21 91/25 92/16 97/21 98/4 98/7 98/12 98/12 100/6 102/22 108/20 108/20 109/20 110/24 116/3 121/3 121/4 125/20 129/17 130/4 133/8 134/8 134/11 136/19 139/1 140/7 145/11 149/8 152/8 168/5 175/23 177/8 177/10 178/16 178/18 179/3 mean [50] 11/10 18/11 20/18 27/24 33/9 33/10 34/8 35/10 38/20 45/8 47/7 49/12 52/13 52/14 59/9 59/19 60/5 63/24 64/11 72/6 76/7 76/8 79/7 80/1 80/2 84/4 98/13 102/6 107/18 112/4 119/13 121/12 123/4 123/5 133/22 134/1 134/20 134/22 139/19 144/9 146/8 151/22 157/13 160/24 168/4 169/8 171/22 172/3 174/15 174/17 meaning [6] 71/9 75/3 81/1 87/21 87/22 96/9 means [8] 64/5 98/10 101/19 102/5 119/3 119/4 133/11 143/4 meant [3] 14/2 16/1 67/17 measured [1] 50/2 medical [1] 40/7 meet [2] 23/7 150/7 meetings [1] 122/16 memorandum [1] 167/7 memories [1] 155/16 memory [3] 57/16 94/15 178/9 mention [1] 101/9 messenger [1] 161/24 met [5] 63/5 102/24 103/2 178/11 178/15 Miami [1] 2/9 mid [2] 151/14 151/23 might [1] 153/18 mind [1] 31/7 mine [1] 119/10 minimize [1] 158/3 minimum [1] 160/11 Ministers [2] 118/9 121/24 ministry [10] 72/20 72/21 72/24 73/3 81/13 122/7 155/2 155/2 170/21 171/2 minute [9] 4/14 69/22 81/23 83/2 127/19 128/14 148/21 148/23 155/23 minutes [1] 126/24 misspoke [1] 53/15 misstate [1] 151/22 misstated [2] 14/2 50/5 mistake [3] 27/20 28/23 95/11 mistakes [1] 27/17 misunderstanding [1] 66/23 misunderstood [1] 112/10 mom [4] 9/24 10/1 10/7 14/15 moment [12] 22/8 23/15 25/23 36/25 44/6 62/9 73/22 73/23 104/7 155/21 160/12 176/23 month [1] 121/21 months [5] 95/5 95/6 95/10 95/14 110/11 moral [1] 23/5 more [12] 15/21 23/2 23/4 24/3 24/9 27/5 29/24 55/22 60/22 63/16 63/18 136/22 morning [11] 4/8 4/11 57/12 57/13 63/13 77/12 77/13 101/13 101/14 101/23 102/9

128/3 129/5 129/23 131/2 137/22 138/13

Moscow [2] 27/20 142/6 most [5] 39/9 43/3-49/17 176/9 178/3 mother [31] 19/4 19/10 19/13 19/24 33/5 33/6 34/3 35/6 35/11 35/16 35/22 36/9 37/8 37/9 37/14 37/16 39/12 39/12 90/19 96/20 144/16 152/23 153/10 159/20 161/25 163/23 164/21 168/10 169/13 176/13 178/6 mother's [3] 37/14 162/20 163/4 motion [3] 44/14 159/25 160/1 move [11] 18/9 19/2 44/12 48/5 72/6 112/7 112/8 132/8 137/8 139/6 141/19 moves [1] 20/15 moving [1] 122/14 Mr [11] 6/18 7/16 8/1 12/25 14/9 17/17 19/2 22/23 58/18 112/3 142/2 Mr. [60] 4/12 8/3 11/24 11/25 17/15 18/17 19/12 20/24 23/11 24/13 28/22 31/16 32/5 32/20 34/14 71/13 85/21 86/15 92/11 101/25 102/3 102/10 103/10 104/19 107/16 108/16 111/13 111/16 111/20 112/2 112/14 112/15 114/15 114/16 116/15 125/2 125/4 125/7 125/15 125/16 127/5 137/24 138/6 138/8 140/11 140/13 142/15 144/18 149/5 153/6 153/15 154/5 157/10 159/1 162/17 164/4 164/6 164/8 164/21 167/3 Mr. Crow [3] 71/13 114/16 153/15 Mr. Demirchyan [29] 4/12 11/24 17/15 18/17 19/12 20/24 23/11 24/13 28/22 31/16 32/5 32/20 34/14 102/3 102/10 103/10 107/16 108/16 114/15 125/2 125/4 125/15 125/16 127/5 138/6 144/18 153/6 154/5 159/1 Mr. Demirchyan's [6] 92/11 101/25 140/11 142/15 149/5 157/10 Mr. Guyumjyan [5] 8/3 86/15 112/14 164/8 164/21 Mr. Guyumjyan's [4] 85/21 116/15 162/17 164/4 Mr. James [1] 137/24 Mr. John [1] 167/3 Mr. Khachanyan [5] 111/13 111/16 111/20 112/2 112/15 Mr. Kurzban's [1] 164/6 Mr. Perkins [2] 104/19 125/7 Mr. Rosenberg [1] 11/25 Mr. Rosenberg's [2] 138/8 140/13 Mrs [23] 40/25 41/8 42/1 42/11 44/1 50/11 50/22 55/2 55/14 55/22 56/25 66/7 70/12 72/24 78/9 142/6 152/13 152/20 154/6 154/19 167/20 169/1 174/13 Mrs. [1] 41/13 Mrs. Demirchyan [1] 41/13 Ms [4] 39/23 49/4 57/12 171/13 Ms. [27] 4/19 5/20 14/2 32/5 37/23 38/13 40/7 54/2 57/14 76/23 77/11 115/9 115/18 116/17 116/21 118/18 125/14 126/5 128/10 133/21 165/1 171/12 172/2 172/14 173/24 174/6 175/3 Ms. Chen [15] 4/19 5/20 14/2 32/5 37/23 38/13 54/2 57/14 76/23 77/11 126/5 128/10 133/21 173/24 175/3 Ms. Demirchyan [1] 40/7 Ms. Hovanisyan [9] 115/18 116/17 116/21 118/18 125/14 165/1 171/12 172/2 172/14 Ms. Hovanisyan's [1] 115/9 Ms. Susanna [1] 174/6 much [5] 47/22 47/22 107/4 166/4 176/3 multiple [1] 42/19 must [3] 24/3 121/3 176/16 my [72] 6/21 8/18 10/1 10/7 10/9 14/4 18/7 19/23 21/16 25/10 25/16 26/1 26/13 30/13 30/20 33/5 33/19 34/3 34/23 35/6 35/6 35/19 35/20 37/14 37/14 39/6 39/12 39/12 41/11

110/5 111/3 111/5 111/7 111/17 113/24

115/5 152/8 162/9 163/5 164/7 164/11 named [1] 61/23 names [6] 24/21 50/14 50/18 57/23 111/3 163/1 narrative [1] 44/2 nationalized [1] 151/15 naturalization [2] 157/2 158/8 nature [3] 4/15 158/6 176/17 necessarily [1] 98/14 necessary [5] 20/18 20/21 62/6 62/8 141/6 need [10] 33/22 33/22 33/23 34/16 54/16 58/21 106/22 141/12 143/19 149/24 needed [2] 57/2 154/1 needing [1] 109/4 needs [2] 128/21 128/21 neighbor [17] 8/5 8/6 10/21 15/18 38/21 42/14 57/20 57/21 57/25 58/17 107/18 107/18 109/1 152/1 152/5 161/19 164/24 neighborhood [2] 73/9 73/12 neighbors [2] 107/17 150/22 never [18] 48/8 51/12 52/3 52/12 77/12 113/9 114/19 123/9 123/13 164/21 165/9 168/20 168/25 174/20 174/20 178/6 179/1 179/1 new [11] 56/14 57/2 57/6 74/5 74/16 150/21 168/22 169/6 169/18 171/3 173/1 New York [1] 173/1 next [23] 15/13 15/22 16/19 17/6 17/7 17/8 22/21 34/24 34/25 38/5 39/19 64/15 65/9 70/21 70/24 71/15 84/18 85/12 85/13 85/16 107/19 113/21 153/8 nine [16] 14/25 15/7 16/20 16/21 26/20 27/15 29/2 37/24 37/25 42/3 42/6 51/2 81/7 81/8 93/2 93/16 Ninth [5] 103/19 148/24 159/25 160/1 160/5 no [115] 1/9 8/10 17/7 20/11 22/14 25/8 26/25 26/25 27/17 28/21 31/6 31/9 36/13 36/19 39/16 43/17 44/13 45/10 45/24 46/18 47/6 48/17 48/19 48/24 49/3 49/7 49/8 54/22 56/1 57/8 58/2 59/19 61/6 63/9 65/11 66/18 69/8 69/18 69/18 77/24 79/3 79/16 83/13 84/14 84/17 87/8 87/14 89/25 92/19 92/23 94/2 94/12 94/21 95/12 96/8 96/9 96/11 98/1 99/12 100/11 102/12 102/18 102/20 103/16 104/11 107/23 107/25 108/2 108/4 108/4 113/5 113/15 113/16 113/19 116/16 119/8 119/10 119/15 120/22 125/10 125/25 125/25 126/3 127/6 130/14 131/12 132/17 133/13 136/2 137/18 137/21 138/17 139/9 143/3 146/7 146/18 146/19 146/22 149/10 151/8 152/6 154/23 161/3 163/14 165/8 166/6 169/16 175/6 175/7 175/7 175/13 175/13 176/5 176/5 180/10 No. [16] 13/8 13/17 13/19 13/21 13/23 14/11 32/11 37/24 37/25 50/13 118/14 118/18

No. 1/21 32/11 149/18 Filed 12/06/12 No. 17/5 [1] 13/23 S No. 19 [3] 13/8 34/24 37/25 No. 2 [3] 118/14 118/18 148/20 No. 4 [1] 50/13 No. 4-12697 [1] 13/19 No. 5 [1] 126/10 No. 71 [1] 166/24 No. 9725 [1] 13/17 No. 975 [2] 13/21 14/11 nobody [1] 27/19 Nodding [1] 172/13 none [2] 27/16 88/23 Noon [1] 84/25 normal [1] 177/16 normally [1] 158/23 North [2] 1/24 2/18 not [158] 8/9 8/10 10/8 10/15 10/25 10/25 11/21 12/20 15/21 16/10 16/13 20/5 20/21 24/1 24/1 25/7 26/25 27/10 30/3 30/6 31/17 32/16 33/10 34/8 34/9 37/6 41/12 41/18 43/12 46/16 46/16 46/24 47/5 48/2 48/25 49/8 49/24 50/3 51/20 51/24 52/16 53/11 53/14 53/17 55/10 58/3 58/10 58/11 60/5 60/8 64/1 66/11 66/19 66/20 67/14 67/17 68/19 70/7 70/8 71/24 73/5 73/7 74/22 76/22 77/3 77/10 77/11 78/1 78/2 79/23 83/15 83/20 83/24 85/18 94/15 97/23 98/8 98/9 100/9 102/22 102/25 105/5 106/10 114/10 119/3 119/10 119/19 122/25 123/1 130/14 130/24 132/21 132/23 132/23 133/2 133/11 133/22 136/1 136/13 136/20 142/6 143/14 145/5 145/23 146/15 146/21 148/5 148/13 149/19 150/12 152/3 152/4 153/2 153/7 153/25 155/9 157/24 158/3 158/7 158/14 158/20 158/25 159/10 159/22 161/2 161/4 161/5 163/1 163/15 163/23 164/14 164/15 166/5 168/4 168/13 168/14 168/15 169/9 169/19 169/20 170/15 171/7 172/15 172/25 173/25 174/1 174/13 175/18 175/21 175/25 176/7 176/11 177/15 177/16 177/16 177/20 178/1 178/1 notaries [2] 98/10 119/17 notarized [2] 98/8 107/2 notarizing [1] 119/8 notary [13] 97/8 97/9 97/25 98/1 98/3 98/3 106/6 106/22 119/6 119/7 119/8 132/19 132/20 notary's [1] 98/11 notation [1] 94/12 notations [2] 94/7 94/10 note [2] 87/8 147/11 notes [1] 105/12 nothing [7] 16/4 22/15 54/11 87/24 98/10 136/17 172/20 notice [1] 165/24 notwithstanding [2] 176/16 178/8 November [9] 13/17 79/11 79/13 79/21 80/4 80/14 154/11 156/19 180/7 November 2000 [1] 80/14 November 23 [2] 79/11 79/21 November 23rd [1] 13/17 now [56] 11/12 14/21 15/18 20/24 24/24 26/8 31/19 36/14 44/20 57/14 67/4 67/7 68/1 76/22 77/20 85/18 87/14 89/23 92/3 95/17 100/12 100/15 102/1 102/11 103/5 106/5 107/1 108/8 114/21 117/6 119/19 119/20 121/2 123/18 124/7 128/10 132/12 133/7 136/15 141/7 141/13 141/16 148/1 149/4 154/9 154/10 154/23 155/2 155/5 155/10 160/4 161/19 163/9 163/24 177/9 178/11 nowhere [1] 101/9

126/10 148/20 149/18 166/24

number [13] 9/18 34/3 43/11 45/13 45/15 63/2 88/3 92/15 94/4 94/6 130/9 130/9 131/16 1 9/2 15/2 17/6 17/8 numbers [4] 7/12 79/25 94/10 156/8

(

oath [3] 23/12 24/8 28/4 object [15] 10/15 25/25 46/15 48/8 48/23 53/2 75/24 79/23 131/21 133/21 133/22 142/6 144/6 145/16 147/2 objected [3] 134/6 138/15 175/13 objection [57] 5/16 10/17 14/1 15/24 16/2 16/5 16/7 16/10 16/11 21/25 22/24 22/24 23/24 23/25 24/9 26/2 34/7 43/10 46/18 46/21 46/21 48/5 48/7 48/12 48/18 48/21 48/24 49/1 49/13 50/4 51/14 53/25 59/8 79/22 85/17 101/18 102/4 109/6 111/23 112/7 113/3 129/20 130/21 133/10 134/2 135/9 135/15 135/22 135/23 136/1 136/4 137/8 138/9 139/20 142/3 145/9 145/12 objections [1] 46/22 observe [1] 94/21 observed [1] 175/3 obtain [11] 50/15 57/18 58/1 92/11 108/18 109/9 109/17 117/19 150/21 152/3 163/12 obtained [32] 7/22 14/15 32/6 32/8 32/11 36/8 38/14 38/15 39/9 47/22 56/9 59/16 61/22 75/17 93/19 94/13 96/5 100/19 108/15 110/14 142/21 151/18 156/2 156/16 161/16 161/24 162/5 162/6 163/6 166/15 166/17 179/1 obvious [1] 88/4 obviously [12] 46/4 46/9 89/1 141/5 146/2 148/21 150/23 156/22 157/6 157/7 158/12 160/25 occurred [2] 28/23 155/15 OCTOBER [7] 1/18 4/1 4/15 85/1 117/24 148/23 167/7 October 11th [1] 117/24 October 18 [1] 148/23 October 18th [1] 4/15 odd [1] 173/19 off [3] 87/10 118/3 168/8 offer [1] 141/7 offered [3] 34/9 34/10 173/16 offering [1] 11/14 office [20] 8/18 10/9 34/2 42/19 59/6 59/6 66/9 68/15 69/1 69/25 69/25 79/2 80/13 110/3 110/5 152/24 153/1 171/9 173/8 173/15 officer [6] 67/24 67/25 68/5 105/25 108/7 152/5 official [12] 57/1 122/16 122/21 130/19 131/6 131/12 165/6 165/10 173/8 173/13 173/15 180/9 officials [3] 56/19 168/18 169/1 oh [7] 19/11 22/21 31/22 42/8 134/8 156/7 175/23 okay [143] 15/7 19/22 21/5 25/12 29/11 32/1 32/20 33/1 33/6 33/16 33/25 34/18 34/24 35/15 35/22 36/3 36/11 36/14 37/7 37/22 38/20 39/1 39/4 39/8 39/15 39/22 42/8 44/7 45/2 45/8 47/16 47/21 50/14 55/20 57/18 57/21 58/1 58/10 58/24 59/2 59/6 60/3 61/14 62/5 63/12 63/23 64/19 64/24 65/5 66/5 66/19 67/18 67/20 69/11 71/15 72/1 72/17 72/19 73/3 73/7 73/15 73/18 73/21 74/15 74/17 74/21 75/13 75/16 75/19 75/23 78/11 79/4 79/9 79/14 79/19 80/10 81/11 81/17 82/7 83/12 85/22 90/6 95/15 96/12 107/11 107/22 108/8 108/11 108/15 108/18 108/21 108/23 108/25 109/2 109/4 109/9 109/12

149/20 151/18 152/6 155/19 158/5 158/5 1 158/14 158/20 167/11 161/25 161/25 162/13 164/22 166/9 167/1 967/12 169/25 170/21 okay... [46] 109/15 109/22 110/3 110/8 1 110/16 110/21 111/12 111/19 112/1 112/4 112/6 121/5 121/7 125/17 125/19 125/23 170/22 171/9 172/2 173/7 173/13 175/18 126/4 127/7 127/15 127/23 128/1 128/10 176/11 176/13 176/15 176/21 178/11 178/15 128/16 128/20 128/23 129/2 129/11 129/14 order [11] 4/14 13/14 30/4 92/11 92/16 143/9 129/18 130/10 130/17 130/19 131/17 132/11 145/24 148/21 148/23 148/24 178/25 132/14 132/18 133/7 133/17 136/10 137/25 ordered [2] 121/4 166/20 139/23 141/2 142/8 143/16 156/21 157/1 orders [1] 122/17 old [8] 8/6 23/2 23/5 24/3 56/17 57/1 74/17 organized [1] 129/9 168/19 original [37] 32/23 33/1 34/22 34/23 35/4 older [2] 157/19 158/7 36/9 37/10 41/16 56/6 57/5 58/23 66/11 on [155] 4/14 8/14 13/1 13/13 13/16 13/16 66/14 67/14 67/17 67/21 68/8 68/9 68/11 13/18 13/20 13/22 14/11 15/4 15/7 17/11 69/8 69/13 69/19 119/4 126/4 126/13 126/20 17/15 17/18 18/7 19/2 20/5 21/1 21/9 21/14 128/20 128/21 132/25 137/6 147/20 153/7 22/25 23/13 24/18 24/22 25/3 25/9 25/16 154/21 154/23 154/24 171/24 172/15 26/13 27/8 28/8 28/24 29/5 31/4 31/8 31/13 originally [1] 120/16 33/23 34/16 36/23 37/24 37/25 38/5 38/13 other [60] 5/2 8/3 21/9 21/14 28/18 28/24 41/13 42/3 42/6 42/19 43/6 43/18 47/5 47/5 29/5 36/13 37/20 38/12 41/17 46/11 47/21 47/9 49/1 51/1 53/4 54/9 54/15 68/1 68/14 48/5 53/6 53/12 57/5 61/15 69/6 80/1 80/7 72/2 72/5 72/7 75/6 77/8 79/19 79/23 84/10 80/7 80/11 80/12 80/13 80/16 83/17 87/23 84/21 86/20 86/20 90/4 90/12 90/13 90/21 88/24 95/25 97/12 101/13 103/6 105/19 90/22 91/4 91/11 91/19 94/4 94/10 94/22 106/16 107/19 122/22 136/20 138/9 139/10 140/2 141/3 141/9 141/23 143/9 144/25 95/24 96/14 98/4 98/9 98/24 99/21 100/16 106/20 112/8 116/6 116/24 117/3 118/2 146/9 148/17 149/17 155/25 161/2 166/25 119/7 119/7 119/9 119/13 120/14 122/20 167/18 170/1 170/17 171/10 173/23 176/16 124/19 130/4 131/22 132/18 134/13 134/18 176/17 178/5 135/25 136/4 137/9 139/22 143/25 144/6 others [1] 32/16 145/16 147/3 148/6 148/17 148/19 148/19 otherwise [3] 64/1 95/18 164/22 149/17 153/21 153/23 154/17 155/14 156/16 ought [1] 114/18 157/10 159/6 159/21 160/16 160/19 161/11 our [26] 5/19 15/18 38/21 46/10 58/17 59/4 161/12 162/18 163/10 163/10 163/14 164/5 59/4 59/25 63/1 63/1 71/12 71/12 73/9 73/12 164/13 165/3 165/7 165/13 165/14 167/20 76/23 92/15 141/4 146/2 146/16 148/17 168/17 169/1 169/5 169/12 170/16 171/15 148/19 149/4 152/5 157/5 159/5 174/17 172/6 173/2 173/2 173/2 174/25 177/10 ours [1] 122/22 out [32] 27/15 43/15 84/13 92/10 92/14 97/6 179/5 once [6] 11/24 24/24 55/15 58/9 85/8 175/15 97/7 97/9 100/22 101/4 102/14 106/20 one [78] 6/6 6/7 14/9 14/10 15/21 16/20 134/15 141/24 149/22 151/24 153/19 157/8 23/12 27/5 27/6 30/15 38/12 41/11 43/6 44/6 157/9 158/15 159/7 162/2 163/14 164/5 44/21 56/17 57/2 57/2 57/6 60/22 69/22 73/6 164/10 166/15 172/23 174/20 174/22 174/24 73/22 73/23 74/16 74/17 75/18 75/21 75/21 175/11 177/21 76/5 76/17 76/18 79/6 79/7 80/24 80/25 81/1 outlined [1] 30/3 81/23 83/2 83/17 84/14 94/25 100/13 103/25 outlines [1] 4/15 106/20 108/12 108/12 113/7 119/22 123/19 outside [3] 46/20 46/22 104/10 123/22 127/19 128/14 136/22 138/19 138/21 outweighs [1] 24/5 140/6 141/8 142/9 143/23 144/13 147/8 over [11] 35/18 46/14 59/25 105/14 112/21 148/7 150/22 155/21 157/21 158/3 158/7 137/16 137/17 146/15 152/17 155/17 177/6 158/15 168/22 169/23 171/25 172/5 172/23 overlay [1] 175/24 173/7 175/13 175/23 178/21 overlays [1] 49/13 one-page [1] 119/22 overruled [10] 10/18 16/16 24/10 26/5 34/12 ones [1] 124/4 46/25 50/4 50/6 113/4 129/22 ongoing [1] 145/2 own [9] 11/9 19/20 25/4 29/25 147/20 148/4 only [19] 23/10 31/12 44/20 49/25 80/24 81/1 165/3 167/20 169/1 81/8 81/9 130/6 132/21 132/24 142/20 P 148/17 159/8 160/5 167/18 173/3 175/11 P-e-r-k-i-n-s [1] 104/18 p.m [3] 85/2 102/10 179/9 opinion [8] 135/13 135/16 135/24 136/8 137/10 137/14 138/18 159/6 PA [1] 2/8 opportunity [3] 48/8 177/2 178/18 Pacer [1] 166/24 page [101] 6/23 9/7 9/18 9/20 13/1 13/7 opposite [1] 136/16 or [115] 13/13 14/15 18/21 24/21 27/5 28/19 14/25 15/7 15/13 15/14 15/21 15/22 16/19 29/23 30/16 31/5 32/16 32/16 36/11 38/8 16/20 16/21 16/21 16/22 16/22 16/24 17/1 38/9 39/9 44/21 45/12 48/3 51/20 54/22 17/1 17/5 17/5 17/6 17/8 17/11 17/15 17/18 55/10 57/22 58/11 61/8 61/9 62/15 63/5 63/6 20/25 21/1 22/6 22/10 22/11 25/2 25/9 25/15 65/11 65/16 66/21 68/9 68/17 69/1 69/5 28/15 29/2 37/24 37/25 38/5 38/5 41/8 41/13 70/12 75/8 77/24 79/2 79/9 79/11 79/11 42/3 42/5 43/10 43/17 44/10 44/19 47/14 79/11 80/13 80/13 83/17 83/21 83/21 84/13 48/5 48/6 50/12 50/12 50/25 51/1 51/1 51/2 87/8 87/23 94/10 100/1 101/16 101/19 51/14 51/16 51/18 78/11 78/23 81/5 81/8 101/19 103/9 103/12 108/1 108/3 108/12 81/9 81/25 82/1 82/2 82/3 82/12 82/16 82/18 109/12 110/10 114/10 119/4 119/5 119/18 86/20 87/2 89/8 89/15 93/10 93/12 94/18

124/19 127/21 128/21 128/23 131/6 131/10

132/15 135/1 136/19 136/20 136/24 137/2

 \mathbf{O}

137/3 137/15 140/3 141/8 143/17 149/19

94/18 115/20 117/14 117/15 117/16 119/14

119/22 119/22 119/24 120/5 120/12 120/19

120/24 121/9 123/23 123/24 126/14 128/11 Page 132/13 145/3 of 200 Page ID page 227 [1] 51/18 page 235 [1] 50/12 paged [1] 86/19 pages [20] 9/11 9/20 28/8 30/19 43/20 44/2 44/16 47/3 47/13 52/11 78/18 78/19 80/7 80/11 80/12 80/16 81/6 144/4 144/13 147/12 pages 218 [1] 47/13 paid [5] 92/25 99/9 107/22 152/4 152/4 painting [1] 176/1 paper [3] 69/3 112/3 147/10 papers [7] 27/16 28/11 29/23 29/25 108/20 112/11 173/15 paperwork [3] 92/11 92/14 92/18 paragraph [67] 7/6 7/9 7/16 7/18 7/21 19/2 19/4 19/12 19/16 19/21 20/2 20/8 20/16 20/25 21/6 21/12 25/2 25/3 25/7 25/11 26/16 42/2 42/9 42/11 42/14 50/23 51/6 51/7 56/16 56/25 66/7 66/11 66/25 67/14 87/25 88/4 88/5 88/8 89/23 90/8 90/8 90/17 91/1 91/8 91/14 92/10 93/2 93/16 98/18 98/22 99/15 99/20 100/1 100/12 100/15 102/13 102/23 116/21 117/6 118/12 122/14 122/20 123/18 138/9 138/11 138/15 138/17 paragraph 20 [1] 42/2 paragraph 21 [2] 50/23 51/7 paragraphs [15] 7/4 24/25 25/1 25/19 25/20 26/8 26/9 55/23 89/22 90/4 90/5 101/8 116/9 138/18 138/21 pardon [1] 152/8 part [23] 9/16 22/3 29/1 44/24 44/25 68/13 72/3 76/23 81/9 113/13 119/9 119/21 122/23 123/1 123/10 123/14 126/16 135/25 138/25 142/14 161/21 166/2 166/5 particular [2] 110/3 127/15 parties [6] 5/1 52/25 84/10 159/15 160/15 175/5 parts [3] 54/21 143/17 143/21 party [3] 53/17 56/23 122/17 pass [2] 31/8 43/15 passed [5] 46/3 46/4 46/8 46/8 48/1 passport [9] 30/15 30/19 83/22 84/13 99/7 145/7 145/16 162/12 162/14 passports [4] 144/4 144/10 144/13 144/19 Paul [2] 4/17 156/11 pay [3] 92/22 92/24 107/24 payment [2] 125/23 126/1 peculiarly [1] 157/23 penalty [11] 7/7 10/21 10/24 12/18 23/12 28/15 43/3 43/7 106/22 116/22 161/18 pending [2] 44/13 100/11 people [13] 21/9 21/14 28/24 29/6 46/11 96/23 141/3 143/19 148/13 176/9 176/11 177/19 177/25 people's [2] 127/25 155/16 per [1] 140/21 percent [1] 66/4 perhaps [1] 7/11 period [2] 83/18 122/8 periods [1] 128/17 perjury [20] 7/7 10/21 10/25 12/18 22/23 23/11 23/21 24/8 24/13 28/15 43/4 43/7 106/23 116/22 157/10 157/20 158/2 158/6 161/12 161/18 Perkins [3] 104/17 104/19 125/7 permission [2] 89/24 90/17 person [53] 10/3 10/4 10/5 10/8 27/12 27/14 28/5 38/18 39/13 45/12 45/14 45/17 45/20 45/22 45/23 45/24 47/17 47/19 49/6 50/20 61/17 65/3 65/10 65/16 99/5 100/22 100/25 101/4 102/14 102/17 102/19 102/24 103/2 104/3 105/22 112/3 112/4 112/5 124/20

P person... [14] 128/2 128/5 133/3 154/15 155/18 161/23 162/3 162/4 162/5 170/19 170/22 178/7 178/11 178/14 personal [10] 20/11 20/16 79/24 111/23 127/4 133/12 138/10 158/24 158/25 177/8 personally [2] 64/3 69/6 persons [1] 38/19 pertinent [1] **24/9** petitioner [38] 1/8 2/4 4/16 4/23 5/7 17/23 30/16 41/12 85/11 87/11 93/7 113/11 115/10 125/17 139/2 140/24 142/24 144/5 145/20 148/10 159/16 159/22 159/25 160/8 160/9 160/11 161/1 161/16 164/14 164/15 164/18 164/20 167/10 167/25 169/2 170/24 174/11 petitioner's [28] 3/3 3/15 6/14 11/9 12/17 14/22 30/14 30/18 38/1 86/11 100/20 107/12 115/14 123/22 140/1 141/22 142/12 146/10 147/13 159/20 161/12 166/21 167/3 168/10 169/12 175/21 176/4 179/5 phone [5] 35/18 45/13 63/1 88/3 92/15 phony [2] 157/18 158/1 photocopies [2] 126/22 128/16 photocopy [1] 126/9 physical [1] 75/3 pick [3] 10/8 45/16 99/2 picked [4] 9/5 10/13 93/23 135/6 picture [1] 178/21 piece [1] 69/3 pieces [1] 147/10 piecing [2] 29/4 29/5 place [10] 35/20 49/17 49/23 50/1 119/12 121/18 121/19 124/13 130/15 130/17 placed [5] 6/10 6/19 25/11 70/16 78/7 places [2] 84/9 133/6 plaintiff [3] 4/12 4/16 83/18 plaintiff's [1] 160/13 plane [3] 61/8 83/20 156/19 please [26] 4/7 5/11 5/15 6/1 6/12 7/10 13/11 13/12 39/1 40/12 40/15 43/11 51/14 55/16 56/15 67/12 73/19 85/7 85/23 86/1 90/25 114/24 115/1 115/4 131/3 132/13 plural [1] 157/13 point [31] 5/17 27/12 30/24 32/6 46/16 52/13 64/19 78/14 78/16 83/1 83/2 83/3 84/13 98/7 99/9 106/20 119/19 139/7 154/6 155/1 156/25 157/9 158/14 158/15 159/4 166/2 166/10 172/23 173/2 175/11 177/21 pointed [5] 159/7 163/14 174/20 174/22 174/24 points [3] 54/18 162/2 173/24 police [3] 108/7 108/7 152/5 poor [1] 176/10 portion [3] 50/10 118/15 128/12 Portuondo [1] 172/25 position [9] 27/15 141/4 143/23 146/18 149/4 155/13 157/5 163/19 174/17 positions [1] 128/5 possession [9] 32/23 33/1 33/4 70/1 166/21 166/22 167/1 167/1 176/14 possible [3] 133/20 135/3 135/4 postdate [1] 147/4 power [15] 7/23 42/16 59/1 59/2 61/20 91/15 91/18 91/19 109/20 109/23 113/8 113/9 161/23 162/5 163/25 practice [2] 105/21 152/10 Prado [2] 97/25 106/6 Pratt [1] 2/8 prejudicial [1] 24/6 prepare [3] 88/17 105/2 119/24 prepared [16] 27/25 88/24 92/17 94/23

105/5 106/12 106/13 138/8 143/11 preparing [1]_{#9}5/15 preponderance [3] 150/9 150/12 159/16 presence [2] 65/19 83/17 present [26] 2/21 4/9 27/8 48/15 48/25 53/22 63/25 65/8 68/2 74/2 74/10 74/12 84/2 84/7 85/9 98/5 99/4 101/17 103/17 104/2 106/9 106/10 112/10 112/14 112/19 126/6 presented [12] 34/4 68/17 68/18 83/7 83/19 83/23 153/14 153/23 169/4 169/13 169/18 170/25 presenting [2] 102/1 102/11 preserve [1] 141/5 preserver [2] 127/12 127/12 PRESIDING [1] 1/5 pretty [3] 88/4 178/9 178/12 prevent [1] 176/15 previous [1] 169/17 previously [14] 23/22 48/15 107/12 136/7 155/8 155/9 160/16 162/22 165/20 166/19 166/19 168/1 169/11 169/13 Primarily [1] 157/1 primary [1] 105/25 printouts [2] 147/1 147/7 prior [6] 8/23 30/5 101/17 114/9 116/11 164/22 private [1] 47/8 probably [8] 67/17 95/6 95/13 108/22 109/11 110/10 130/8 171/6 probative [5] 24/4 144/7 144/15 154/23 173/4 probing [1] 32/2 problem [1] 126/22 problems [1] 157/6 procedure [1] 5/22 proceed [15] 11/22 14/7 16/17 24/11 34/12 40/19 47/1 50/8 54/24 86/5 94/20 122/11 149/1 150/15 161/6 proceeding [10] 5/22 31/23 36/14 36/18 49/23 49/25 50/1 50/3 162/13 162/14 proceedings [25] 1/16 4/15 30/5 30/20 30/25 31/20 34/25 35/2 35/3 35/18 49/13 49/17 49/18 50/1 71/1 77/15 103/10 144/6 145/2 145/19 148/11 153/10 167/4 179/9 180/5 process [9] 20/11 25/21 26/10 27/1 28/10 28/18 28/24 113/13 169/3 produce [3] 120/23 121/13 163/24 produced [4] 78/3 147/13 163/25 165/1 production [1] 78/4 profession [1] 108/5 professional [2] 105/18 178/2 proffer [1] 103/25 promised [3] 108/3 125/23 126/1 prompted [1] 167/9 prompting [1] 174/5 pronouncing [1] 111/6 proof [13] 17/8 114/11 141/25 154/10 159/14 159/16 159/17 159/23 160/5 160/10 160/14 160/21 160/25 proper [5] 35/13 77/10 158/13 173/14 174/23 properly [3] 53/12 138/15 155/2 proponent [2] 54/2 147/17 **proponents** [1] 84/11 proposition [1] 48/16 propounded [1] 12/3 prove [5] 149/23 150/1 150/12 153/12 170/13 proved [2] 149/9 173/14 proves [1] 149/5 provide [9] 11/5 11/5 11/6 69/12 69/19 75/9 77/22 112/2 131/10

95/20 97/3 97/10 97/11 97/12 97/14 97/15

provided [6] 13/13 75/8 77/8 77/12 109/16 Page 194 of 200 Page ID provides [2] 22/25 22/25 province [1] 124/19 public [4] 169/20 173/8 173/13 173/14 purport [1] 147/2 purported [5] 13/15 13/18 13/20 13/22 14/10 purportedly [1] 14/18 purpose [1] 148/22 purposes [3] 17/10 106/2 158/8 pursuant [2] 147/13 156/22 put [2] 61/9 177/10 putting [2] 98/9 176/15

O

question [110] 9/22 10/3 10/10 10/12 10/23 11/12 15/4 15/8 15/9 16/9 19/25 22/12 22/16 22/19 27/18 27/24 28/17 29/4 29/8 30/2 32/13 32/14 32/18 37/11 43/20 44/13 44/20 44/24 45/2 45/8 45/17 45/20 45/23 46/1 47/16 47/21 50/14 50/18 51/19 55/9 60/12 60/18 60/19 60/21 64/11 65/25 68/7 69/18 70/22 74/4 74/22 76/8 77/20 80/14 80/15 80/17 80/20 80/22 80/23 82/7 82/21 100/11 100/12 101/20 113/7 114/10 118/16 119/1 123/2 123/3 123/6 124/1 129/23 131/2 133/11 133/22 133/22 133/24 134/2 134/10 134/11 134/14 134/15 134/24 135/2 135/12 136/23 136/23 146/1 146/3 146/7 148/8 148/8 148/9 149/8 149/16 160/11 160/24 162/7 163/19 166/10 166/23 167/2 168/6 168/25 170/19 173/21 175/1 175/24 176/12 questioning [5] 11/13 59/18 94/20 131/22 questions [38] 12/4 28/1 30/16 31/10 33/13 33/15 39/16 43/24 48/8 48/23 51/25 52/12 52/18 53/21 55/22 57/8 57/9 57/14 59/9 63/17 63/19 78/14 83/13 83/14 84/17 103/16 104/5 105/12 107/7 107/10 113/6 113/18 125/10 137/16 137/18 155/9 169/23 175/4 quick [1] 173/23 quickly [3] 50/10 99/24 139/13 quote [2] 93/18 173/12

R

raise [5] 5/12 40/12 85/17 104/12 115/1 raised [3] 31/13 114/10 149/14 rather [2] 9/25 146/12 re [10] 19/18 20/2 20/12 56/13 57/2 57/6 134/2 134/11 153/9 167/24 re-appears [1] 153/9 re-ask [1] 134/11 re-asked [1] 134/2 re-issued [7] 19/18 20/2 20/12 56/13 57/2 57/6 167/24 reach [2] 35/20 178/25 reached [1] 179/3 read [48] 9/16 11/10 12/7 13/10 13/11 17/25 22/21 25/9 25/23 28/13 29/14 43/23 44/1 44/8 44/15 44/17 47/12 52/10 79/23 79/25 80/9 80/22 80/23 87/2 87/12 87/15 87/17 87/23 87/25 88/2 88/4 88/4 88/6 88/8 88/12 88/13 100/5 100/6 115/18 115/22 115/25 116/17 116/24 121/22 131/9 131/11 163/15 173/21 reading [3] 14/1 47/7 116/8 reads [2] 9/21 22/11 ready [2] 47/17 85/12 real [2] 137/6 158/11 realize [1] 103/9 really [9] 22/16 32/13 140/15 149/18 158/19 159/6 174/23 178/20 178/24 reason [7] 87/23 109/4 133/23 149/6 152/6

R reason... [2] 169/16 177/20 5 V VV - VI AN reasonable [1] 173/10 recall [19] 8/11 10/20 10/24 11/3 12/2 12/6 21/17 26/20 28/8 28/9 28/19 44/24 45/2 45/3 50/14 103/4 160/18 174/5 175/3 recalled [1] 114/18 receipt [1] 92/20 receipts [2] 92/23 99/12 receive [9] 20/19 61/11 75/19 78/1 78/2 78/23 92/21 128/23 129/12 received [47] 3/15 3/22 18/14 18/15 31/23 32/2 41/3 41/4 63/20 68/5 68/8 68/18 68/19 73/9 73/13 76/13 77/16 78/16 78/20 80/12 81/9 81/12 82/8 83/20 87/10 110/17 112/25 113/1 139/17 139/20 139/24 140/1 141/22 142/11 142/12 143/22 145/5 145/23 152/14 152/16 161/23 170/6 170/14 170/14 174/15 174/20 175/5 receiving [2] 91/15 102/13 recess [4] 63/13 63/15 84/25 126/25 recitation [1] 131/13 reciting [1] 131/6 recognize [16] 6/20 6/23 17/17 18/5 86/19 86/19 89/9 93/10 108/11 115/23 116/3 116/18 116/21 123/19 124/1 166/8 recognized [2] 171/2 171/15 recollection [12] 11/15 11/17 89/11 90/14 90/23 91/5 91/12 98/24 99/21 100/17 117/4 172/4 reconsider [1] 155/12 record [40] 4/17 6/2 8/21 9/20 26/9 28/14 40/16 41/10 47/3 47/4 47/5 47/9 54/15 72/2 72/4 72/5 76/23 76/25 76/25 77/1 78/1 86/2 90/4 104/16 115/5 116/14 127/21 142/21 143/10 147/11 148/19 161/22 165/25 166/25 168/8 169/20 170/11 173/13 175/20 180/4 recorders [1] 117/22 records [4] 122/16 122/21 146/14 170/21 **RECROSS** [1] 3/3 redirect [9] 3/3 5/24 31/11 31/12 31/14 57/10 107/14 125/12 163/11 refer [3] 50/23 111/2 166/23 reference [4] 37/4 44/2 140/3 165/23 referenced [4] 52/11 139/8 143/18 164/22 references [3] 43/12 83/22 118/19 referencing [1] 118/11 referred [1] 7/12 referring [11] 9/8 38/8 39/10 39/11 42/5 42/7 77/5 82/1 93/15 121/9 124/3 refers [1] 82/16 reflected [3] 17/2 81/21 82/11 reflective [1] 126/21 refresh [3] 11/5 11/15 11/17 regard [2] 54/21 84/10 regarding [13] 11/12 30/9 30/16 32/17 82/8 83/17 85/17 122/6 159/17 160/14 170/3 173/19 176/5 region [3] 110/4 110/6 124/20 register [2] 13/14 127/21 registered [3] 13/16 13/20 14/11 registration [8] 13/17 13/19 13/21 13/23 14/11 59/4 79/10 109/24 regular [1] 91/19 regulations [1] 105/21 reissue [1] 171/24 reissued [2] 76/6 169/15 reject [2] 98/14 136/19 rejected [1] 137/15 relate [3] 59/10 128/17 148/25 related [1] 142/15 relates [3] 30/11 138/10 140/13

relationship [5] 887/16-125/14-127/4-158/24 158/25 relative [4] 8/9 59/25 97/23 164/20 relatively [1] 44/1 relatives [3] 46/10 50/15 173/7 relevance [1] 31/5 relevant [3] 43/23 119/17 167/8 relied [1] 143/12 relying [1] 43/18 remain [1] 5/5 remaining [1] 148/25 remains [1] 76/8 remand [2] 149/17 160/4 remanded [1] 160/2 remember [47] 8/14 8/16 8/18 8/20 9/2 12/5 18/6 21/19 21/20 21/21 21/24 22/1 27/14 28/5 28/10 28/10 28/17 42/19 42/23 43/3 43/6 44/20 46/1 52/2 63/7 63/9 63/10 63/11 95/2 95/4 96/22 96/22 96/23 96/25 97/1 97/4 101/2 102/17 103/5 103/12 103/12 110/11 116/6 149/21 152/20 178/10 178/14 remembers [1] 51/20 removal [4] 30/20 144/6 148/11 167/3 repeat [2] 72/13 128/3 rephrase [1] 60/17 report [1] 173/13 reporter [12] 5/12 7/19 8/19 9/4 39/1 42/23 54/4 85/14 85/23 113/23 114/25 180/9 REPORTER'S [1] 1/16 represent [2] 100/16 148/9 represented [14] 11/24 48/10 48/13 48/15 48/25 49/6 53/13 53/15 53/16 53/16 77/15 142/5 148/13 169/13 Republic [3] 130/5 137/6 173/3 request [9] 9/24 75/14 75/16 78/4 140/12 140/14 140/21 147/13 147/19 requests [1] 10/1 require [3] 32/2 157/22 167/10 required [4] 30/4 119/18 128/8 175/4 requires [1] 24/2 reserve [1] 148/6 residence [1] 131/15 resource [2] 176/16 176/18 respect [24] 32/10 35/15 37/21 144/3 146/25 149/17 155/11 155/13 157/2 158/17 158/21 159/4 159/14 161/14 161/16 162/20 163/4 163/13 164/4 165/1 165/19 166/14 174/18 175/10 respectfully [1] 177/24 respond [3] 23/17 80/1 177/3 respondent [3] 1/12 2/14 4/9 RESPONDENT'S [4] 3/22 13/1 18/15 41/4 response [1] 12/23 responses [13] 11/9 12/7 12/17 12/17 14/22 17/25 18/12 38/1 105/13 161/18 174/7 174/12 175/21 responsible [1] 122/16 result [3] 147/19 160/1 164/9 resulting [1] 154/10 retained [1] 103/17 retrieve [1] 38/21 retrieved [2] 39/5 173/7 return [1] 154/12 returned [2] 155/6 168/11 returns [2] 154/2 155/4 revealed [1] 161/17 review [2] 42/11 146/2 reviewed [3] 26/8 77/3 159/20 reviewing [1] 7/1 revoked [3] 30/21 31/1 144/5 right [92] 4/13 4/25 5/4 5/12 8/24 12/22 14/6 16/22 17/13 18/21 18/24 31/11 34/19 40/11

relating [2] 57/14 118/14

40/12 41/24 47/11 52/7 52/23 53/10 54/24 55/20,57/9,69/16,61/2,63/12,66/3,66/24 69/10 70/21 71/5 76/20 76/21 77/18 78/5 80/5 80/6 81/8 81/23 82/15 82/17 83/6 83/14 84/16 84/21 85/18 96/12 99/5 102/1 102/11 104/12 106/16 111/16 112/23 113/17 114/12 114/21 115/1 118/2 119/19 122/10 123/10 125/2 125/4 125/11 131/1 134/22 136/25 138/3 138/21 139/21 140/5 142/11 143/21 145/14 145/23 147/20 148/3 148/15 150/6 156/18 159/12 161/6 165/12 165/17 167/16 171/19 172/19 177/4 177/12 178/19 179/7 right-hand [2] 82/17 118/2 Robert [1] 104/17 room [2] 1/24 5/6 Rosenberg [5] 11/25 11/25 49/4 137/24 138/22 Rosenberg's [3] 138/8 140/13 141/11 RPR [1] 1/23 rule [7] 11/22 22/25 23/3 48/14 141/7 156/22 160/19 Rule 901 [1] 156/22 ruled [3] 77/8 77/10 148/18 rules [3] 106/21 154/21 156/23 ruling [1] 148/6 rulings [1] 51/25 Russian [1] 44/11 S S-u-s-a-n-n-a [1] 40/17

said [36] 14/2 31/21 34/5 34/11 39/8 46/17 48/24 54/6 54/15 54/23 59/25 64/10 65/11 66/20 66/25 71/24 72/18 73/5 73/19 89/2 94/16 101/6 110/17 113/1 133/5 133/7 143/18 145/25 152/7 152/17 152/21 158/18 161/21 162/18 164/24 171/15 sake [1] 47/14 same [22] 17/15 35/10 50/25 51/1 59/18 96/14 96/23 111/2 116/15 122/22 123/21 124/15 135/22 137/11 137/16 145/7 145/9 145/11 165/6 166/11 172/3 172/9 save [1] 145/24 saw [12] 27/14 32/17 34/24 34/25 64/15 70/24 71/15 95/19 95/21 95/24 95/25 97/17 say [35] 12/13 19/9 25/20 45/8 54/8 56/15 59/14 61/8 65/13 66/7 76/9 77/19 77/24 78/1 78/14 78/15 95/7 97/4 104/20 104/21 106/22 107/18 130/11 139/19 140/10 148/8 149/9 151/6 151/8 174/7 174/24 178/5 178/23 178/23 179/3 saying [23] 12/7 21/24 47/4 49/5 65/23 68/20 68/22 70/15 133/14 142/23 143/4 148/4 149/22 157/25 162/25 163/1 168/3 170/5 170/17 177/12 177/16 177/20 178/17 says [34] 7/6 14/9 14/10 15/4 15/8 15/17 17/12 23/3 25/15 26/20 27/21 29/13 29/17 48/14 66/11 80/3 80/3 81/25 88/10 88/14 98/3 116/19 117/16 117/23 117/24 118/6 137/12 140/13 153/16 154/4 156/16 165/11 170/12 173/4 schedule [1] 4/18 school [1] 129/3 scope [4] 26/1 26/2 46/20 46/22 scrivener's [4] 25/9 25/15 25/22 26/13 seal [1] 124/7 search [1] 166/21 seated [4] 5/15 50/6 86/1 115/4 second [10] 14/23 26/19 86/20 88/2 89/8 93/12 117/14 118/6 123/24 158/21 secondary [2] 114/11 141/25 section [1] 121/22 see [53] 7/16 7/24 12/10 13/5 13/24 13/25 14/9 14/12 15/2 15/6 15/8 15/10 15/11 15/15

174/7 174/11 somewhat [1] 119/16 significance [5] 30/23 21/3 31/5 31/6 78/21 significant [3], 114/10 127/25 17/2/24 signing [4] 12/6 97/9 116/6 116/12 somewhere [4] 111/22 120/6 120/20 178/11 son [30] 52/7 53/16 54/14 63/22 63/23 64/4 see... (39) 95/16 15/20 17/17 17/22 25/17 26/22 29/19 54/16 62/13 62/17 64/11 64/14 64/8 64/10 64/18 64/25 65/11 67/18 67/21 64/17 64/25 69/8 77/21 77/23 94/4 94/6 94/7 similar [2] 21/22 22/16 68/2 68/4 68/17 68/25 69/4 69/6 69/12 69/19 95/16 95/17 95/23 96/2 96/3 100/10 105/7 simple [1] 149/7 69/25 70/12 125/16 144/11 144/16 151/20 152/18 152/21 152/23 106/5 108/8 118/4 118/6 118/8 128/21 simply [3] 161/4 161/12 174/17 138/11 140/19 144/25 155/23 156/11 172/19 since [9] 6/5 95/25 96/4 96/9 99/23 137/5 son's [7] 51/8 51/13 52/3 54/11 58/19 150/20 seeing [3] 28/5 28/10 28/19 144/4 157/21 161/20 151/7 seeking [1] 142/17 sincerely [1] 177/5 son-in-law's [1] 125/16 seem [2] 173/19 174/5 single [1] 178/24 soon [1] 102/13 seemed [1] 75/5 sir [52] 6/23 7/21 8/5 9/2 10/20 10/24 13/5 sorry [28] 15/23 16/22 19/11 19/19 22/8 seems [3] 77/2 84/4 84/11 13/24 14/24 15/2 15/8 15/15 15/21 16/19 22/21 27/5 27/11 30/2 31/21 32/19 33/16 seen [12] 32/20 50/19 80/8 80/9 89/20 95/18 19/20 21/4 21/6 21/17 23/20 24/25 25/4 37/11 37/22 49/21 73/11 91/20 103/2 104/6 96/4 96/9 113/9 114/20 129/16 172/15 25/14 26/8 26/17 27/11 28/4 29/9 29/19 109/22 120/25 133/8 139/18 141/3 141/14 self [6] 142/25 143/14 145/1 146/20 169/25 33/15 39/18 50/6 50/7 80/19 89/8 90/12 151/2 151/5 156/7 91/24 92/10 93/12 94/3 94/19 96/14 96/17 sort [5] 30/5 48/21 136/15 165/7 175/24 self-authenticating [2] 169/25 170/2 96/25 99/1 100/15 100/19 101/8 101/12 sound [1] 167/16 self-serving [4] 142/25 143/14 145/1 146/20 102/13 103/7 103/9 113/20 sounds [1] 149/23 send [5] 34/16 60/1 69/8 69/16 110/20 sitting [4] 28/17 35/19 102/9 134/3 Southern [1] 173/1 sending [2] 39/7 69/5 six [12] 25/1 25/2 25/3 25/7 25/11 25/19 26/8 Soviet [3] 58/5 166/2 166/5 senior [3] 2/21 4/9 85/9 88/5 90/17 95/13 116/9 116/21 speak [11] 36/6 67/7 67/10 104/1 111/17 sense [3] 119/8 145/1 169/3 skilled [1] 136/18 120/9 121/2 121/3 121/4 121/4 176/3 sensitive [1] 158/23 speaking [5] 52/24 65/16 99/24 105/4 168/4 skip [1] 47/14 sent [14] 7/22 34/20 39/12 42/16 59/1 68/9 slip [1] 153/4 speaks [1] 130/21 95/22 100/18 105/13 108/20 109/20 161/24 special [1] 128/23 slow [1] 46/6 162/7 176/21 small [1] 178/21 specialized [2] 129/3 135/19 sentence [3] 26/20 88/2 122/20 so [146] 4/16 7/12 8/4 10/12 10/17 11/21 specific [7] 24/5 29/24 30/8 44/3 50/3 89/22 separate [3] 31/17 166/5 169/22 15/4 17/10 20/11 24/9 27/24 30/6 30/10 32/3 127/8 September [1] 76/1 32/18 32/18 33/15 34/15 35/13 39/8 39/14 specifically [16] 6/22 13/8 18/6 18/19 24/2 September 2011 [1] 76/1 40/8 41/17 43/13 45/11 45/17 46/10 47/16 24/18 26/16 28/15 30/11 43/20 55/23 59/6 serial [2] 130/8 131/16 47/16 47/18 49/5 49/9 49/11 50/4 54/6 57/5 117/7 117/16 127/23 130/4 serious [2] 53/20 166/10 59/11 60/1 60/3 60/5 61/9 61/19 62/6 62/13 specifics [1] 157/23 Service [2] 17/9 157/2 63/16 63/20 68/14 68/25 69/4 70/15 70/21 specify [1] 56/23 serving [4] 142/25 143/14 145/1 146/20 74/8 76/13 77/3 77/12 77/14 77/23 79/4 speculate [1] 177/14 sessions [3] 43/1 43/4 43/7 79/19 79/23 82/7 89/5 89/8 89/21 89/25 speculating [1] 177/15 set [4] 12/15 13/1 14/22 38/1 97/12 98/6 98/12 100/19 105/24 111/7 111/9 speculation [1] 135/10 seven [3] 21/1 21/1 91/1 111/20 113/15 116/2 119/20 121/3 122/3 spell [8] 6/1 39/1 40/15 50/20 55/4 86/2 several [7] 10/1 27/4 27/7 57/14 78/17 106/3 134/15 136/4 136/10 136/19 138/16 138/25 104/15 115/5 138/25 139/22 140/3 140/15 140/20 141/11 spelled [2] 7/19 9/4 Shahumyan [3] 110/4 110/7 131/14 142/8 144/21 144/25 145/5 146/1 147/12 spelling [2] 55/15 55/18 shape [1] 124/10 147/14 148/1 149/1 150/8 150/11 151/6 spoken [6] 101/16 101/24 102/2 102/3 she [236] 151/18 152/12 153/22 154/2 155/1 156/9 102/10 120/8 she's [8] 82/19 123/4 130/23 136/16 137/13 156/22 157/5 157/20 157/23 158/16 160/2 spring [4] 1/24 2/18 45/1 110/10 137/13 165/9 171/3 160/12 161/2 161/2 164/19 165/18 166/7 SSR [2] 118/10 121/24 stamp [13] 75/6 82/17 82/17 94/15 94/16 shifted [1] 160/5 166/7 168/6 168/12 168/13 168/24 169/8 shop [1] 178/16 169/20 170/1 171/8 171/18 171/20 172/1 98/5 98/9 98/10 106/5 119/7 119/7 130/7 short [1] 133/2 172/1 172/8 172/10 172/14 173/21 174/7 171/15 should [29] 5/2 5/5 5/7 7/11 12/12 16/20 24/1 175/1 175/15 176/3 176/21 176/25 178/5 stamped [1] 147/12 25/9 31/12 31/19 36/12 36/22 42/3 49/10 stamps [5] 122/7 124/19 133/6 133/6 165/12 178/16 178/17 51/20 67/4 86/8 89/1 89/1 93/6 98/14 100/12 soft [1] 120/8 stand [16] 5/8 5/11 39/24 54/9 60/19 84/21 104/10 115/22 126/6 131/11 142/19 157/3 soft-spoken [1] 120/8 85/23 93/7 101/23 102/9 104/9 106/17 165/13 some [32] 28/1 28/5 30/8 32/2 32/7 44/22 113/25 114/25 163/15 179/7 shouldn't [2] 36/23 140/15 48/1 48/23 50/1 69/17 76/22 80/13 83/25 standard [3] 159/5 159/5 160/25 show [10] 36/13 75/23 79/11 84/13 129/14 84/7 87/23 92/11 104/5 107/10 116/17 start [4] 123/7 151/9 151/12 163/2 130/8 147/15 149/11 158/1 158/4 119/18 119/19 134/20 139/1 155/9 156/25 started [1] 149/22 showed [6] 33/21 65/3 67/24 99/7 129/17 158/12 165/7 165/23 169/25 176/16 176/17 starting [6] 24/25 44/19 47/14 48/6 50/12 157/18 177/18 51/18 somebody [5] 10/7 28/19 45/4 47/23 135/7 showing [1] 12/12 starts [1] 118/3 shown [1] 170/13 state [31] 4/7 6/1 7/18 8/5 19/23 20/2 20/8 somehow [5] 152/22 160/4 164/19 166/15 shows [3] 130/15 165/2 166/25 21/6 21/12 40/15 54/6 56/12 56/16 57/1 85/7 sic [2] 13/16 39/3 someone [20] 13/13 34/9 45/10 46/11 47/7 86/2 92/3 92/10 92/25 93/21 104/15 115/5 side [5] 48/5 82/17 113/7 118/3 136/16 49/5 61/15 61/23 69/5 69/5 101/5 101/6 117/8 122/15 122/20 123/18 124/7 124/14 sign [7] 7/1 89/18 94/23 96/14 96/19 97/13 111/2 111/15 134/21 138/1 152/9 152/10 131/17 144/19 166/5 stated [25] 9/3 10/21 14/4 19/12 19/17 21/19 152/11 174/24 signature [19] 6/23 17/18 17/20 17/22 18/7 21/21 23/11 28/2 28/4 28/7 28/9 51/11 52/6 someplace [1] 63/5 something [21] 30/10 32/12 33/10 33/23 47/5 86/20 86/22 89/9 89/17 98/11 115/24 116/4 54/10 54/13 99/12 102/23 116/17 124/11 119/9 130/16 132/18 132/20 132/24 132/25 49/10 63/25 64/9 68/5 69/20 82/8 120/3 161/19 162/17 162/23 163/15 165/5 130/11 132/4 142/2 146/16 149/23 158/5 statement [1] 98/11 signed [27] 10/20 12/17 18/22 41/12 41/15 states [42] 1/1 1/23 2/16 2/17 2/18 12/3 17/22 165/24 166/8 170/22 41/16 41/18 88/25 89/14 89/15 95/24 96/16 sometime [5] 8/16 34/19 103/23 151/23 17/25 25/21 26/11 32/8 39/7 39/13 45/6 96/25 97/1 97/18 98/4 98/11 106/8 117/1 45/11 45/13 45/14 47/24 60/11 60/14 60/25 153/18 119/11 119/14 131/19 161/18 164/8 164/16 61/5 61/25 67/14 85/9 100/23 101/1 101/2 sometimes [1] 107/4

135/17 136/4 107/2 110/6 112/23 112/24 118/1 118/9 SW 11 28 1/1000 Filed 12/06/12 states... | 14 | 102/13 106/23 109/21 112/16 sworn [11] 5/13 6/14 40/3 40/13 40/21 85/24 112/25 144/13 150/19 151/1 151/4 152/11 155/3 155/19 162/7 163/9 86/11 104/13 107/12 115/2 115/14 stating [2] 10/24 52/2 symbols [1] 124/14 statistics [1] 122/22 system [2] 147/24 166/3 172/16 176/11 stay [1] 75/18 stayed [1] 61/18 Staying [1] 96/14 table [2] 4/9 85/9 stenographic [1] 180/4 take [39] 5/7 27/1 27/5 27/5 31/16 34/18 step [7] 5/11 39/18 104/8 113/17 114/24 36/19 37/16 59/6 60/1 63/12 67/18 67/21 137/22 169/3 70/6 71/24 72/9 72/18 74/19 81/19 84/16 **STEPHEN [1] 1/5** 84/22 85/16 86/15 104/8 106/17 107/9 110/8 still [5] 26/20 148/24 154/5 170/11 170/18 111/22 114/20 126/24 141/19 152/10 154/5 154/7 154/8 165/24 168/16 171/24 175/17 stipulate [1] 52/25 themselves [1] 48/9 stipulation [3] 175/4 175/6 175/7 taken [5] 8/11 8/14 28/14 42/20 155/1 takes [2] 153/13 154/19 stood [1] 66/8 taking [1] 161/10 stop [1] 77/2 story [5] 161/15 176/4 176/4 176/25 177/22 talk [4] 24/25 25/22 45/2 167/19 straightened [1] 157/8 talked [3] 161/9 166/25 173/24 talking [7] 19/6 70/7 77/1 80/24 123/21 strange [1] 119/17 street [3] 1/24 2/18 103/5 134/3 176/6 strike [13] 20/15 20/21 44/12 44/14 53/19 teachers [1] 21/16 74/23 92/9 109/15 112/8 125/1 136/11 137/8 tell [25] 35/11 43/17 45/13 45/14 45/15 60/12 176/5 60/23 62/23 72/17 73/4 74/15 75/11 88/10 stubs [1] 83/21 88/14 130/4 132/25 133/3 135/13 135/20 studied [1] 129/3 147/7 175/16 177/4 177/7 177/8 177/10 subject [1] 139/20 ten [13] 15/14 16/21 16/22 17/1 17/5 23/2 174/15 175/8 176/18 submission [1] 164/22 23/5 24/3 38/6 98/18 98/22 126/24 157/22 submissions [1] 119/16 tenth [1] 121/21 term [1] 129/5 submit [1] 160/22 submitted [11] 37/3 87/20 106/15 115/10 terms [5] 50/2 161/9 165/9 167/19 170/2 148/10 159/1 159/2 160/16 163/8 167/8 testified [27] 6/14 28/1 40/21 43/7 76/13 179/7 86/11 107/13 112/9 115/14 127/7 131/12 suboffice [2] 127/15 127/18 136/7 136/9 137/2 148/13 152/23 153/1 subscribed [2] 98/4 98/12 153/6 154/16 163/5 164/13 167/20 168/10 subsection [4] 15/4 15/11 15/11 15/15 172/2 172/5 178/6 178/8 subsequent [2] 37/8 37/12 testify [8] 32/17 34/9 59/11 64/1 76/7 103/14 subsequently [7] 12/7 150/22 152/22 159/24 107/22 127/11 163/21 164/8 166/17 testifying [2] 43/3 86/24 substance [4] 116/19 158/2 158/19 163/19 testimonies [1] 161/10 substantially [1] 24/5 testimony [58] 54/22 61/20 63/3 69/24 90/13 90/22 91/4 91/11 98/24 99/21 100/16 100/19 such [11] 48/16 49/23 53/1 75/17 92/23 135/1 173/8 173/15 175/6 175/7 176/14 101/25 102/11 116/25 117/3 122/6 125/24 sudden [1] 162/2 129/21 136/19 136/20 137/15 151/14 152/2 suffers [1] 116/15 152/2 152/4 152/13 152/14 152/25 154/8 sufficed [1] 173/6 154/14 158/16 158/18 158/20 158/22 158/24 159/19 161/16 162/2 162/8 162/13 162/20 sufficient [1] 107/1 suggesting [1] 166/7 163/4 163/9 163/13 164/5 164/10 164/17 suicide [4] 58/12 58/13 90/10 150/23 166/15 167/20 168/18 169/1 169/12 170/5 171/11 171/23 173/6 176/1 Suite [1] 2/8 166/10 169/16 170/18 sum [1] 138/18 Tetzeli [1] 2/8 than [15] 9/25 23/2 23/4 24/3 27/5 36/13 summer [1] 110/10 therefore [1] 150/23 Supp [1] 172/25 53/6 53/12 61/16 69/6 80/12 138/9 146/12 Supplement [1] 160/1 149/24 161/2 supplemental [1] 160/22 thank [47] 6/9 6/13 7/14 16/18 24/12 28/3 32/4 39/17 39/18 40/11 41/5 41/25 42/8 supported [1] 24/4 44/18 47/2 50/9 51/3 61/3 63/12 69/11 74/11 supposed [1] 123/4 75/13 85/19 86/10 89/7 96/13 98/16 113/1 sure [15] 9/17 19/20 27/16 27/19 56/16 58/11 178/17 76/17 77/3 94/13 119/3 133/11 146/15 113/5 113/20 114/6 115/13 122/13 129/8 153/18 155/22 174/1 137/20 137/22 141/10 148/16 149/2 150/10 150/14 150/16 159/11 159/13 164/3 175/19 surprised [2] 84/9 84/10 179/8 surprising [1] **84/15** SUSANNA [29] 3/6 39/20 40/2 40/17 40/21 thanked [1] 152/14 60/23 65/20 91/16 91/19 91/20 108/20 Thanks [1] 5/10 109/21 110/15 110/22 113/1 141/25 150/18 that [805] 150/25 151/3 152/16 152/16 154/6 156/16 that's [81] 7/5 10/1 12/1 12/21 14/21 15/20 18/6 21/8 24/23 27/21 28/2 29/12 29/16 30/6 174/1 174/6 174/21 175/16 175/22 178/6 30/9 32/1 33/10 34/8 36/16 41/20 41/23 47/5 Susanna's [1] 114/11 suspicion [1] 98/2 48/12 48/18 68/19 68/20 68/21 68/22 68/23 suspicious [2] 98/7 98/13 68/24 74/22 75/25 77/17 78/6 80/2 80/14 sustained [6] 109/7 111/25 133/16 135/11 80/15 88/6 89/17 96/17 99/20 101/11 107/1 153/1 153/2 153/3 154/3 154/6 154/20

126/11 126/16 133/2 134/23 135/2 136/1 137/14 137/15 139/20 141/11 141/12 142/11 143/8 143/11 144/23 144/23 145/4 145/23 151/21 153/16 153/22 155/8 156/18 158/2 158/6 162/16 164/5 168/14 169/23 171/1 their [9] 50/18 62/23 102/25 102/25 103/2 140/15 141/20 153/15 176/14 them [37] 11/14 11/14 30/25 33/21 45/7 45/15 70/12 78/3 80/8 80/9 80/9 83/1 84/5 87/23 92/16 94/16 99/4 106/14 127/21 127/21 127/21 139/13 141/4 141/4 141/25 144/6 146/4 146/17 146/21 147/10 153/1 157/11 158/3 163/1 174/6 176/15 178/16 then [81] 5/20 5/23 11/14 14/6 18/5 29/17 31/8 31/19 31/22 32/1 36/22 38/5 39/2 48/1 49/7 52/13 52/17 52/20 53/10 53/25 54/1 54/2 54/19 56/21 59/2 64/1 66/24 67/2 72/9 77/18 78/19 81/8 84/21 89/5 89/21 99/12 100/22 107/2 108/24 110/14 110/16 111/20 111/22 123/7 127/21 131/25 134/2 134/8 139/2 140/18 141/12 143/1 143/17 143/21 145/23 150/24 152/1 152/7 152/13 152/17 153/6 153/13 155/1 155/3 161/6 161/21 161/24 162/1 162/7 162/18 163/10 166/3 166/17 167/3 167/24 168/15 169/5 173/12 there [126] 7/10 8/17 8/18 11/8 15/4 17/7 17/7 19/6 23/1 24/7 24/8 27/8 27/16 27/17 32/7 35/12 36/21 38/5 38/6 38/9 42/23 42/23 44/13 46/10 47/5 47/15 49/10 53/1 53/22 53/23 54/22 55/2 55/10 55/12 58/4 58/4 61/6 61/18 62/18 63/3 65/6 69/2 69/2 69/12 69/18 72/17 73/10 73/13 73/25 76/22 77/20 79/18 80/7 83/16 83/18 84/11 84/12 84/14 87/7 88/23 89/11 91/23 92/23 93/6 94/21 96/20 96/20 96/23 98/2 99/8 99/12 100/12 101/9 103/5 106/5 112/22 113/15 113/16 115/24 116/16 119/7 120/22 124/18 124/18 126/22 131/5 131/22 131/25 132/4 132/15 132/18 132/19 132/20 134/3 135/20 137/3 140/2 140/15 143/10 144/8 147/9 147/12 147/21 152/15 153/20 153/24 153/24 155/16 157/6 157/7 157/15 158/12 158/24 160/20 161/14 162/12 163/14 165/23 171/11 172/11 175/4 175/6 175/7 176/17 176/19 177/18 there's [21] 31/6 36/19 53/25 66/22 76/19 84/19 87/8 89/25 94/4 94/6 94/7 101/6 113/12 119/6 130/6 136/17 138/17 146/7 thereafter [3] 159/24 163/21 164/8 these [33] 11/12 12/19 23/3 23/7 24/1 26/21 28/5 30/17 31/20 35/13 45/15 46/11 49/17 50/1 52/24 77/14 78/19 81/21 82/21 111/3 114/20 119/16 119/17 121/14 140/18 144/19 144/25 147/5 155/15 158/13 163/1 177/5 they [111] 11/7 12/4 16/3 20/2 23/5 23/8 23/23 24/3 30/21 31/1 31/1 45/13 45/15 47/18 47/25 56/13 56/17 56/18 57/5 60/1 62/23 63/1 63/2 63/6 70/6 72/17 72/18 73/4 73/5 73/15 74/15 74/16 74/18 74/19 74/21 75/11 75/11 75/22 78/1 78/2 81/17 88/20 92/20 94/16 97/10 101/2 103/4 105/22 109/11 128/6 128/17 129/17 139/14 140/9 140/10 140/19 141/6 142/16 144/4 144/5 144/7 146/5 146/17 146/21 146/22 146/25 147/2 147/3 147/7 147/10 147/12 147/14 147/15 147/16 147/18 147/20 147/22 148/4

 \mathbf{T} they...[27] 155/19 155/26 157/6 157/8 157/15 157/16 157/17 158/13 159/10 159/10 168/19 164/6 165/13 168/20 168/22 171/6 171/24 172/3 173/12 174/12 175/12 176/22 178/7 178/15 178/23 178/23 178/23 178/23 they'll [1] 45/11 they're [19] 18/14 23/2 23/4 119/18 140/11 141/21 144/9 144/12 145/5 146/1 146/2 146/2 146/6 146/16 147/23 148/1 157/21 174/7 178/1 they've [1] 146/13 thing [11] 35/10 73/12 106/20 131/11 137/12 158/4 158/21 160/5 167/18 175/11 178/12 things [13] 33/15 35/13 45/15 78/21 98/8 98/10 157/21 158/15 166/25 177/17 177/19 178/9 178/17 think [42] 8/4 10/17 22/17 22/18 32/6 47/8 49/9 53/16 66/22 68/9 76/23 95/10 104/25 106/24 112/9 113/12 116/2 138/1 146/20 147/1 149/15 149/20 150/18 151/13 151/21 152/19 153/24 153/24 154/23 155/9 155/10 159/5 167/12 171/5 172/24 174/6 175/8 176/9 177/13 178/20 178/25 179/4 thinks [1] 136/16 third [6] 14/9 176/9 176/10 176/17 177/19 177/25 third-world [5] 176/9 176/10 176/17 177/19 177/25 Thirty [1] 21/3 Thirty-two [1] 21/3 this [276] those [28] 11/10 25/20 26/9 26/24 27/8 27/10 153/22 43/4 43/6 43/24 43/24 44/21 46/12 52/12 52/12 54/18 57/22 84/3 84/3 84/7 114/17 139/8 141/23 143/21 144/1 144/21 147/25 148/22 175/3 though [2] 149/23 163/14 thought [5] 75/17 145/25 162/12 171/22 174/4 three [4] 9/21 57/22 122/14 122/20 through [29] 22/10 22/11 25/1 25/19 26/8 29/2 40/13 47/13 85/24 107/10 138/19 138/21 139/13 140/12 140/18 140/20 141/19 143/24 144/19 148/20 148/20 150/22 153/14 154/10 164/10 166/20 167/2 169/25 170/4 throughout [1] 159/15 thus [1] 68/14 ticket [10] 37/14 114/14 114/14 142/1 142/5 142/10 154/11 154/11 156/19 163/24 tickets [1] 83/21 time [58] 4/13 9/12 18/8 34/5 34/21 34/24 34/25 35/7 35/8 35/20 36/5 37/5 46/4 46/9 47/17 48/1 48/3 52/20 53/15 58/11 60/22 64/15 64/18 69/12 69/18 70/24 71/15 77/9 83/18 91/22 92/6 92/23 95/17 101/5 101/6 101/19 101/22 101/23 102/8 103/12 127/3 127/4 131/10 135/1 145/2 145/25 146/23 153/8 153/15 154/1 154/5 155/7 157/8 158/1 159/1 159/2 159/6 160/20 times [4] 21/6 27/4 42/20 84/7 title [1] 133/3 today [35] 14/14 23/11 31/18 86/24 89/22 90/1 90/4 90/22 95/17 101/19 101/23 102/5 103/14 104/2 107/22 116/25 122/6 125/24 126/5 126/7 128/20 148/13 149/5 152/2 152/4 162/2 162/8 162/20 164/10 166/15 168/10 169/14 169/19 178/8 178/25 together [6] 29/5 62/15 70/13 70/17 155/20 163/11 told [22] 21/9 21/14 28/25 33/22 34/9 35/18

38/21 47/25 57/2 59/10 60/1 61/22 69/6

73/15 109/9 136/16 142/19 153/1 153/2 168/17 170/22 178/6 Filed 12/06/12 160/17 13/20 9922 107/4 134/7 136/3 141/20 168/19 #:1089 took [18] 34/2 34/19 56/17 57/1 57/5 59/4 61/8 70/11 74/18 74/21 75/11 81/13 81/20 101/23 105/12 109/24 167/21 171/24 top [9] 21/2 25/9 25/15 41/13 42/3 42/5 42/6 51/2 117/16 topic [1] 96/14 torn [4] 75/5 103/5 168/19 169/5 total [1] 178/21 totally [1] 65/14 touch [2] 58/8 92/16 tourist [27] 45/6 46/13 46/13 48/1 59/25 60/2 61/13 61/15 61/24 62/7 62/14 62/19 62/22 63/4 110/20 112/5 112/11 112/15 112/18 112/20 112/22 152/11 161/25 162/15 162/19 176/13 176/13 tourist's [2] 162/12 162/19 tourists [1] 48/2 training [7] 123/16 128/23 136/17 136/24 137/2 137/3 165/8 transcript [15] 1/16 8/22 9/13 29/15 36/19 36/21 43/20 47/7 52/22 53/6 53/11 143/19 153/16 155/5 180/4 transcripts [3] 143/17 143/18 143/22 transfer [1] 127/21 translate [12] 89/22 89/25 90/3 90/17 90/25 91/7 93/2 98/17 99/15 100/1 116/11 164/7 translated [19] 67/19 69/16 70/6 87/4 87/5 88/20 88/24 88/25 89/2 89/12 90/12 91/22 92/1 97/21 100/12 100/15 105/13 117/1 translates [9] 90/9 90/18 91/2 91/9 93/3 98/19 99/17 100/3 100/8 translating [2] 70/7 132/1 translation [34] 41/19 41/22 53/21 67/17 79/15 79/17 79/18 79/20 87/8 90/21 94/21 97/6 105/7 105/8 106/2 120/1 120/3 120/16 126/21 128/12 128/16 130/24 131/23 132/1 132/2 132/5 132/8 132/13 132/16 132/18 153/18 153/21 163/14 163/16 translations [2] 26/21 106/4 translator [32] 53/22 54/4 72/13 89/25 90/9 90/16 90/18 90/25 91/2 91/7 91/9 92/8 93/1 93/3 98/17 98/19 99/14 99/17 100/1 100/3 100/8 105/6 105/8 105/13 105/15 105/16 105/18 105/19 105/24 116/11 116/16 164/7 translator's [1] 65/19 translators [1] 42/25 transportation [1] 112/16 travel [1] 83/21 traveled [1] 19/5 traveling [3] 100/22 100/25 166/16 trial [4] 23/22 48/14 173/9 174/22 tried [3] 151/7 151/19 152/19 trip [6] 20/6 66/8 76/6 114/11 142/1 156/16 trivial [1] 92/25 trouble [3] 111/6 120/7 121/1 troublesome [2] 176/24 178/5 true [10] 12/8 18/3 54/10 70/2 70/4 90/15 124/18 134/23 165/22 180/3 trust [1] 176/13 trustworthiness [2] 143/2 143/13 truth [1] 34/10 truthful [9] 90/13 90/22 91/4 91/11 98/23 99/20 100/16 117/3 122/24 try [9] 51/8 51/12 52/3 54/11 57/18 151/9 151/11 158/4 168/5 trying [11] 11/21 30/24 31/2 31/5 68/12 68/13 73/23 97/4 158/3 158/7 161/11 turn [26] 6/22 7/9 12/25 13/7 14/21 14/25

15/13 15/21 16/19 18/17 20/24 24/24 25/2 39/22 37/23 40/8/44/8 42/1 50/22 93/6-94/18 114/22 115/20 117/14 123/24 140/19 turned [7] 113/13 150/24 151/24 152/1 152/17 154/3 171/22 turning [2] 93/12 123/18 turns [1] 153/16 turpitude [1] 23/6 Twenty [1] 42/10 twice [1] 24/13 two [41] 6/6 11/5 18/9 21/3 22/23 23/10 23/21 30/16 38/19 46/22 47/3 75/15 75/16 75/21 76/19 84/19 85/20 86/19 87/2 89/15 93/10 94/18 103/19 114/1 117/6 118/12 119/22 119/24 123/23 125/18 141/24 157/14 157/15 158/15 159/18 164/18 169/3 169/22 172/11 173/23 177/5 two-page [5] 87/2 89/15 93/10 94/18 123/23 two-paged [1] 86/19 two-step [1] 169/3 type [8] 24/8 26/21 26/24 27/12 28/5 32/13 124/11 127/23 typed [1] 27/9 types [1] 49/17 typing [5] 27/1 27/14 28/11 28/19 28/24 typist [1] 26/21

U.S [4] 1/5 30/15 30/19 144/4 U.S.C [1] 106/23 Uh [2] 15/12 99/13 Uh-huh [2] 15/12 99/13 ultimate [1] 158/16 ultimately [2] 61/5 154/9 unbelievable [1] 176/25 unclear [2] 74/8 151/21 undated [1] 98/6 undecided [1] 149/16 under [19] 7/7 10/21 10/24 12/17 23/12 24/8 28/4 28/15 43/3 43/7 106/21 106/22 106/23 116/22 154/21 161/18 169/14 171/8 177/17 underlying [1] 158/18 understand [37] 10/23 27/18 30/2 33/12 37/11 60/3 60/5 60/6 65/14 65/20 65/25 66/2 67/20 68/10 68/12 68/13 68/19 87/19 87/21 87/22 88/11 100/19 106/1 118/16 119/6 124/21 133/11 133/24 134/14 146/8 146/18 146/19 148/14 157/20 157/21 162/25 168/3 understanding [20] 5/19 10/12 14/13 19/23 21/9 26/1 26/9 27/19 30/14 30/21 41/23 61/19 65/22 112/24 117/2 119/20 120/15 144/24 176/7 177/18 understands [1] 87/23 understood [6] 41/21 53/21 65/15 88/25 89/19 112/23 undeveloped [1] 176/10 unhelpful [1] 32/18 Union [3] 58/5 166/3 166/5 UNITED [32] 1/1 1/23 2/16 2/17 2/18 12/3 25/21 26/11 32/8 39/7 39/13 47/23 60/11 60/13 60/25 61/5 61/25 85/8 100/23 100/25 101/2 106/23 109/20 112/16 112/25 150/19 150/25 151/3 152/11 155/3 155/19 162/7 unknown [2] 162/14 176/13 unless [9] 23/5 30/10 48/4 52/18 102/4 112/9 114/17 174/16 175/4 unlike [1] 49/16 unnamed [4] 63/3 112/11 162/12 176/13 unnumbered [6] 16/20 16/25 17/5 17/9 17/11 21/1 unquote [1] 93/18 unsettled [1] 160/12 unsuccessful [1] 151/25

 \mathbf{U} until (4) 27/20/58/6 66/12/67/15 VV - IVIAIN unusual [6] 133/8 133/8 133/18 134/12 134/17 135/1 up [31] 9/5 10/8 10/13 21/12 26/21 26/24 27/1 27/9 27/12 28/5 28/11 28/19 33/15 42/12 93/23 99/2 120/9 121/2 121/3 121/4 123/6 123/7 135/6 138/18 158/22 159/5 159/24 161/9 164/4 172/13 177/5 up.' [1] 45/16 upon [8] 65/19 122/7 141/8 142/18 143/12 170/21 170/21 173/6 us [8] 15/17 22/6 26/20 40/7 43/12 43/17 63/2 103/25 use [5] 23/11 106/2 111/5 111/17 174/19 useable [1] 23/4 used [10] 15/18 16/13 24/22 106/3 124/11 124/15 124/19 157/7 164/6 175/12 using [2] 23/12 30/5 usual [1] 175/2

17

vague [2] 101/18 102/4 valid [1] 154/22 validity [2] 154/24 158/17 valuable [1] 176/14 value [11] 20/19 24/4 49/7 49/8 52/17 76/9 108/1 144/7 144/15 144/17 146/23 Various [1] 42/25 veracity [1] 170/15 verification [2] 12/6 17/12 verified [1] 12/17 version [8] 42/7 50/24 88/22 94/4 105/14 120/5 120/19 131/5 versions [1] 161/15 versus [2] 147/25 155/19 very [27] 28/10 39/21 50/10 66/8 77/7 88/6 98/7 105/20 106/1 117/24 120/8 127/8 133/2 146/24 149/15 149/16 149/20 150/18 152/9 152/25 158/23 158/23 161/8 161/14 161/17 172/24 177/7 via [1] 60/1 view [7] 23/7 52/14 136/15 146/13 146/16 152/5 177/24 visit [1] 45/9 vital [1] 122/22 vocational [1] 129/3

W

wait [2] 58/6 59/13 waiting [1] 47/23 want [26] 11/17 24/25 66/24 77/21 84/11 84/12 88/13 89/8 95/11 104/7 104/8 104/19 106/20 110/24 114/16 134/11 146/3 146/17 148/18 151/22 158/14 158/14 161/8 174/16 177/2 177/15 wanted [9] 40/7 40/9 58/8 138/1 138/3 141/3 158/1 160/6 167/18 wants [2] 158/5 158/5 war [1] 58/4 was [328] wasn't [10] 48/18 53/12 53/18 53/23 62/18 68/18 75/6 103/25 150/23 175/3 watch [1] 27/12 way [17] 17/2 57/25 74/4 81/5 83/17 98/8 98/9 104/21 105/11 109/1 111/17 141/8 170/18 174/23 177/17 177/19 177/25 ways [1] 137/12 we [92] 5/16 5/19 9/7 22/2 26/25 31/18 34/3 34/17 37/2 40/6 43/10 45/2 45/13 46/15 47/25 48/8 53/2 57/22 59/13 60/1 63/5 63/16 65/15 67/14 70/13 70/17 76/23 77/12 77/12 83/20 84/3 85/16 89/4 91/22 91/24 92/25

94/17 94/20 100/10 100/18 101/5 102/25 103/24 106/14 167/19 110/19 111/2 112/3 114/10 114/13 114/13 114/14 114/14 121/3 126/21 127/20 127/21 127/25 129/9 137/16 138/16 139/3 140/18 141/3 141/6 141/12 142/1 142/2 143/18 143/18 144/6 144/8 145/16 147/2 148/19 151/23 154/10 154/15 154/20 154/22 155/14 156/13 156/23 157/5 157/16 158/18 159/2 159/7 164/19 169/16 169/22 171/8 we'd [3] 141/19 155/12 156/25 we'll [3] 37/20 84/2 84/16 we're [11] 47/8 68/1 79/4 79/4 85/12 98/18 123/21 128/25 137/11 146/15 161/11 we've [3] 19/5 113/9 155/10 WEDNESDAY [3] 1/18 4/1 85/1 weight [5] 146/3 146/17 146/18 146/20 159/8 Weinger [1] 2/8 well [46] 10/5 11/8 28/10 29/16 31/8 32/1 48/10 48/12 52/10 53/6 53/18 54/18 56/21 59/18 59/21 70/13 71/4 76/7 79/2 88/6 88/13 89/5 102/6 103/5 112/9 114/17 116/3 116/18 116/25 120/2 122/23 123/7 130/23 131/25 134/20 136/1 137/11 141/24 143/3 149/14 159/20 162/21 165/3 169/2 174/17 177/1 went [26] 19/6 19/9 19/10 19/13 19/24 33/21 34/2 39/11 46/11 56/13 62/13 63/6 64/18 72/12 72/14 74/1 92/3 100/9 100/10 102/25 110/19 112/3 112/21 150/21 168/15 168/16 were [89] 11/9 11/24 12/3 12/4 12/7 20/8 21/7 21/18 21/22 22/13 22/19 23/22 27/8 27/8 27/16 27/17 29/4 30/21 30/25 31/1 31/12 34/5 36/5 36/14 38/8 38/15 39/9 47/17 47/22 47/25 47/25 48/8 48/25 50/18 52/12 52/19 56/4 58/10 59/24 63/16 65/6 65/8 70/17 75/8 77/9 80/11 96/23 99/5 99/12 101/2 101/5 103/10 103/13 103/14 103/17 106/8 108/18 109/9 109/15 109/16 112/11 115/9 123/11 123/13 125/23 126/1 128/17 135/20 140/2 141/6 142/17 144/5 145/2 146/22 148/20 149/24 153/1 153/2 155/19 157/6 158/13 165/6 172/5 173/5 173/10 174/4 174/12 175/4 178/7 Weren't [1] 47/22 westernized [1] 176/8 what [294] what's [7] 17/6 35/9 52/13 106/17 132/23 143/23 144/16 whatever [14] 11/19 38/22 38/22 43/23 45/12 56/23 76/9 82/19 146/17 150/7 150/24 158/16 163/18 166/3 when [89] 7/10 8/12 21/17 21/18 21/22 22/12 27/9 27/14 28/12 33/1 33/17 34/24 35/18 36/14 39/8 42/12 45/8 46/3 46/8 51/25 54/8 56/13 58/13 63/25 64/15 64/20 64/22 67/24 69/12 69/24 70/7 70/8 70/24 71/1 71/15 71/17 74/1 94/23 94/23 95/16 95/19 95/23 103/9 103/13 103/13 103/17 103/21 106/8 106/11 106/14 107/18 108/21 112/10 112/15 112/19 118/22 121/20 128/17 134/2 142/24 143/18 149/17 150/25 151/3 151/9 151/12 151/15 151/15 152/20 153/9 155/20 156/1 156/5 157/6 157/8 164/15 165/24 166/4 166/22 170/25 174/19 174/24 175/15 177/8 178/1 178/1 178/7 178/21 178/22 where [40] 19/9 19/9 33/6 33/10 61/9 62/24 63/16 67/22 68/1 68/17 70/18 72/19 73/8 79/7 81/19 88/1 88/22 92/15 96/25 97/1 97/2 103/4 107/20 109/24 121/8 121/12 121/15 121/18 121/19 128/5 129/9 130/15 140/13 143/8 159/19 159/25 165/13 173/8 173/15 178/22 whether [28] 32/2 51/20 53/20 55/10 61/7

61/8 68/4 68/8 78/15 82/8 83/16 114/10 319/4 126(18 136/29 136/21 146/1 160/18 166/10 169/23 169/25 170/3 170/19 175/18 178/10 178/11 178/15 178/15 which [90] 4/15 4/21 7/6 11/9 12/7 13/2 15/13 18/18 19/16 20/11 20/25 20/25 23/11 24/8 25/4 25/21 26/10 28/14 32/6 37/24 41/1 45/22 46/23 50/13 51/6 54/21 59/6 59/6 81/15 86/15 87/2 87/12 87/20 93/18 94/25 105/7 110/1 110/3 110/3 115/25 116/16 117/15 119/17 119/20 119/21 122/21 129/15 130/7 132/13 136/18 137/14 140/23 143/1 144/4 144/10 148/10 148/18 148/25 149/17 152/9 153/4 153/10 154/20 156/15 156/24 157/2 158/7 158/23 161/18 162/1 163/8 164/16 165/2 165/16 166/24 166/24 167/25 167/25 168/1 168/6 168/9 168/23 168/24 169/10 169/10 169/14 172/1 173/25 175/4 while [10] 36/5 39/23 47/25 78/1 98/17 113/25 164/14 164/14 170/12 170/12 whistles [1] 154/1 who [84] 5/4 9/5 10/3 10/10 15/18 32/7 32/11 35/8 38/14 38/15 38/18 38/24 45/6 45/9 45/10 45/23 46/1 50/15 56/18 58/16 60/3 60/10 60/12 60/23 61/17 61/24 62/2 62/2 62/10 70/11 84/18 87/5 89/12 91/24 96/19 97/3 97/6 97/7 97/15 97/20 97/22 97/24 97/24 100/22 101/5 101/7 103/25 103/25 104/3 105/8 105/16 106/6 108/25 110/19 110/23 117/21 118/14 118/14 118/24 125/6 125/19 132/25 133/3 133/6 142/14 148/13 149/18 150/22 152/11 155/18 155/18 155/23 159/6 160/25 161/19 161/23 162/5 163/12 164/21 164/23 170/19 178/6 178/7 178/14 whoever [3] 97/21 108/20 133/6 whole [4] 30/6 50/3 131/11 175/24 whom [1] 130/16 whose [1] 152/7 why [66] 9/15 9/15 11/10 20/18 27/24 36/22 36/23 53/1 53/10 53/18 58/3 58/6 58/10 58/21 59/13 62/6 62/6 62/7 66/19 71/18 71/23 72/5 73/7 74/19 74/21 75/16 88/7 94/16 96/2 109/9 110/21 111/2 111/13 119/6 119/7 119/18 123/3 126/23 131/25 132/1 132/7 133/2 133/21 134/1 135/4 135/7 136/16 137/16 138/3 138/16 142/19 146/5 149/8 150/1 151/11 153/22 154/20 154/21 157/3 169/2 169/8 170/9 170/24 174/15 175/12 176/12 will [13] 6/5 9/20 31/22 32/2 32/3 40/2 44/2 45/16 90/25 114/24 136/23 147/11 179/7 WILSON [2] 1/5 36/17 wind [1] 159/5 window [2] 68/14 68/25 winter [1] 108/22 wish [5] 4/17 4/19 4/21 139/1 148/15 withdraw [1] 135/12 within [1] 170/21 without [2] 48/4 138/8 witness [60] 4/21 5/5 5/6 5/13 6/7 6/10 6/14 25/11 30/5 39/19 40/13 40/21 54/6 68/2 69/4 69/6 69/24 72/22 77/16 78/7 79/23 83/15 84/18 85/12 85/13 85/16 85/24 86/11 87/12 90/1 90/4 90/17 93/2 93/7 98/18 99/15 100/2 104/8 104/13 106/16 107/12 113/19 113/21 113/22 113/25 114/22 114/24 115/2 115/14 122/1 123/1 137/23 148/18 148/19 148/19 154/15 164/12 177/9 178/25 179/5 witness's [2] 11/6 164/11 witnessed [1] 68/13 witnesses [8] 3/3 5/2 37/21 84/20 101/17 141/4 148/25 164/19

W witnesses [1] 161/10⁴⁵²⁻⁵

woman [6] 15/17 46/3 46/3 46/8 46/8 125/6

won't [1] 140/10

WOODS [3] 2/21 4/10 85/10 words [15] 28/18 41/17 47/21 57/5 87/23 88/24 95/25 97/12 101/13 105/19 144/25 146/9 155/25 170/17 171/10

work [14] 45/20 117/20 117/20 118/3 118/19 121/19 121/19 122/8 127/11 127/15 128/25 129/1 129/9 165/25

workbook [22] 117/11 117/16 117/19 117/20 117/21 117/24 119/4 119/22 120/23 121/11 121/12 121/16 121/18 121/22 126/4 126/9 126/20 128/1 128/2 128/13 128/19 165/2 worked [12] 103/25 108/7 117/8 121/23

122/4 127/12 128/2 128/6 165/2 165/4 165/14 165/24

worker [2] 34/20 129/4 working [4] 128/17 129/10 154/17 166/1

works [1] 105/24

world [6] 166/9 176/9 176/10 176/17 177/19 177/25

would [58] 5/19 5/20 11/20 22/10 23/10 30/11 30/15 32/9 43/10 43/15 46/15 48/5 48/22 50/10 52/20 54/4 67/16 72/19 75/23 76/16 79/23 84/6 84/11 84/12 90/3 96/2 107/9 118/14 119/18 127/21 127/25 132/12 134/5 135/4 135/7 135/13 135/19 136/13 136/18 137/3 138/15 138/23 148/25 153/2 157/9 157/16 171/5 171/21 172/6 172/14 173/6 175/11 175/17 176/9 176/12 177/7 178/19 178/24

wouldn't [3] 171/4 179/4 179/6

write [2] 107/24 115/18

writes [1] 142/24

writing [2] 159/6 173/12

written [12] 44/11 79/8 81/25 99/7 100/9 128/2 130/6 131/19 132/21 161/18 162/18 162/21

wrong [2] 56/13 132/15 wrote [4] 97/6 97/7 97/9 126/2

veah [17] 70/17 72/10 79/21 86/3 88/20 95/9 97/14 100/18 106/19 107/1 108/24 112/17 140/7 140/8 142/10 156/12 167/16 year [27] 14/19 20/12 21/13 30/1 42/20 51/9 51/13 52/4 54/11 56/2 56/14 57/6 71/3 79/12 95/8 95/9 108/21 110/12 116/7 129/17 142/1 151/1 151/4 164/17 167/5 168/23 170/12 years [22] 23/2 23/5 24/3 44/21 94/14 95/25 102/21 103/19 125/18 127/13 128/2 152/20 155/15 157/22 161/11 163/24 164/18 164/25 165/16 166/4 166/9 177/6 Yerevan [12] 57/1 73/2 73/3 81/16 92/4 92/6 93/19 99/1 103/7 110/2 130/18 131/14 yes [352] yet [2] 10/20 130/14 York [1] 173/1 you [767] you'll [1] 80/17 you're [44] 5/23 11/13 11/18 12/12 18/7 29/4 29/23 29/25 30/5 31/5 33/9 33/14 35/10 42/12 43/18 54/2 59/9 59/10 60/8 68/4 73/23 78/12 78/13 93/15 94/13 99/24 101/25 118/11 121/3 122/16 124/3 126/17 130/23 133/13 136/15 143/4 149/22 162/25 163/1 168/3 168/4 170/5 170/17 177/9 you've [10] 21/7 24/13 28/1 29/5 52/11 74/4 117/11 117/11 148/18 152/1 young [1] 158/4

younger [2] 157/24 158/8 Filed 12/06/12 Page 200 of 200 Page ID yourself [5] 45/18 51/12 52/3 94/1 158/18

Z-a-r-a [2] 113/23 115/6 Z-a-r-r-e-h [1] 40/4 Zaga [1] 132/21 ZAGS [5] 130/18 131/14 133/4 133/4 133/5 ZARA [8] 3/8 113/23 115/6 115/14 117/16 119/23 120/23 164/11 zero [1] 22/15